Clim. Past Discuss., 11, C2274–C2276, 2015
www.clim-past-discuss.net/11/C2274/2015/

Climate of the Past Discussions

Interactive comment on "7300 years of vegetation history and climate for NW Malta: a Holocene perspective" *by* B. Gambin et al.

L. SADORI (Referee)

laura.sadori@uniroma1.it

Received and published: 10 November 2015

It is a great pleasure to see a new pollen record from Malta island and the related climate reconstruction. The Maltese archipelago is in fact in a strategic position in the Mediterranean basin and the new pollen studies will provide a whole range of insights into the study of vegetation and climate dynamics in the Mediterranean. The MS by Gambin et al. is well written and carefully illustrated. I recommend publication with minor corrections. I have some minor comments and points, the last ones included in the attached manuscript's pdf.

I totally agree with the other reviewers in saying that in such environment it is not correct trying to establish a detailed chronology for the whole record. In the pollen diagram I would prefer to see radiocarbon dates instead of a chronological scale that could be a

Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

source of inaccuracies, due to rapid changes in sedimentation rates. I also ask to add a column with lithology before the depth scale. If you decide to keep this chronological interpretation, please be more clear in saying it was just a trial.

The bibliografy used is quite accurate, but in my opinion the authors could also consider these articles, most of which were recently published: Florenzano et al. 2015. Are Cichorieae an indicator of open habitats and pastoralism in current and past vegetation studies? Plant Biosyst. 149, 154-165. Mercuri, 2014. Genesis and evolution of the cultural landscape in central Mediterranean: the 'where, when and how' through the palynological approach. Landsc. Ecol. 29, 1799-1810. Mercuri et al. 2013. Olea, Juglans and Castanea: the OJC group as pollen evidence of the development of human-induced environments in the Italian peninsula. Quat. Int. 303, 24-42. Mercuri et al. 2015. Pollen and macroremains from Holocene archaeological sites: a dataset for the understanding of the biocultural diversity of the Italian landscape. Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol. 218, 250-326. Sadori et al. 2015. Climate driven past fires in central Sicily. Plant Biosyst. 149, 166-173. Sadori et al. 2015. Climate, environment and society in southern Italy during the last 2000 years. A review of the environmental, historical and archaeological evidence. Quaternary Science Reviews, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2015.09.020 Zanchetta et al. 2013. The transition from natural to anthropogenic-dominated environmental change in Italy and the surrounding regions since the Neolithic. Quat. Int. 303, 1-9. Zielhofer, Faust, 2008. Mid and Late Holocene fluvial chronology of Tunisia. Quat. Sci. Rev. 27, 580-588.

The authors have to add citation for: Lago Battaglia (mentioned in the text) Caroli, Caldara, 2007. Vegetation history of Lago Battaglia (Eastern Gargano coast, Apulia Italy) during the middle-late Holocene. Veg. Hist. Archaeobot 16, 317-327.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/11/C2274/2015/cpd-11-C2274-2015-supplement.pdf

CPD
11, C2274–C2276, 2015

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 11, 4505, 2015.