

***Interactive comment on* “The influence of tropical volcanic eruptions on the climate of South America during the last millennium” by C. M. Colose et al.**

C. M. Colose et al.

ccolose@albany.edu

Received and published: 2 November 2015

This review does not pertain to the manuscript submitted. Reviewer 3 openly admits to not having carefully read our manuscript, so there is nothing substantive that we can address in this review.

To the point about resubmission, however, we wish to clarify a few aspects that have been misconstrued by reviewer 3. This paper was indeed previously submitted to J. Climate. Two reviews were fair critiques, but reviewer 3 was not constructive and the tone, unfortunately, was accusatory in nature. The editor at J. Climate offered that we resubmit the paper with different reviewers. We decided, however, that an open-format

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



[Interactive
Comment](#)

journal, where the reviews themselves undergo scrutiny would better protect the peer-review process. After making further revisions to the text, we therefore resubmitted to *Climate of the Past Discussions* (CPD). The editor of CPD was notified of the history of this research in our cover letter. It is completely reasonable for authors to revise and resubmit work in the same or another journal after a recommendation of moderate to major revisions.

We feel that ‘anonymous reviewer 3’ has violated ethical guidelines as spelled out by the publisher of *J. Climate* by publishing private conversations between the authors, editors, and reviewers without prior notification or permission.

<https://www2.ametsoc.org/ams/index.cfm/publications/editors-and-reviewers/obligations-of-editors-and-reviewers-in-the-ams-scientific-publication-process/>

“10. Reviewers should not use or disclose unpublished information, arguments, or interpretations contained in a manuscript under consideration, except with the consent of the author.”

We anticipate that ‘anonymous reviewer 3’ will be internally identified within COPERNICUS and AMS journals to avoid further such violations.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, 11, 3375, 2015.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)