

## ***Interactive comment on “Relationship between climate change and wars between nomadic and farming groups from the Western Han Dynasty to the Tang Dynasty period” by Y. Su et al.***

**L. Xiao**

xlingbo1@163.com

Received and published: 13 September 2015

As discussed in this paper, although how climate change impacted the war between nomadic and farming groups in history of China was a fascinating subject; there is a lack of reconstruction of long-term, continuous community group relation sequences with high resolution. In this paper, an 1112-year series of agro-pastoral war has been quantitatively reconstructed, and the relationship between climate and war has been discussed in several aspects. Especially, the location (latitude) of battlefields was used as a proxy indicator, which was very interesting. 1. Page 3568, line9, “the battlefields were mostly in the southern regions”. The meaning of “southern region” is not clear.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



In fact, it's in north China, but south to the farming-grazing transitional zone. 2. There are several references which could be cited in this paper. Zheng JY, Xiao LB, Fang XQ et al. How climate change impacted the collapse of the Ming dynasty. *Climatic Change* (2014) 127:169–182. (In this paper, climatic impacts on the conflicts between Ming dynasty and Mongol/Manchu have been discussed). Wang XM, Chen FH, Zhang JW, et al. Climate, Desertification, and the Rise and Collapse of China's Historical Dynasties. *Hum Ecol* (2010) 38:157–172. 3. Page 3576, line 18, “We divided the changes in the frequency of war into three periods based on the frequency of war in different dynasties”. The standard for classification is not clear here because there are not significant differences in the frequency among three periods. The more important standard was the location of battlefields. 4. Page 3577, 3.2. In this section, many important places in China have been mentioned (such as Hexi Corridor, Taihang Mountains) but they are not charted in Fig.1 or Fig.3. More detailed figure might be necessary for better understanding. 5. Page 3574. The climate change sequences used in this paper were Ge et al. (2003, 2010) (temperature) and Zheng et al. (2006) (precipitation). The reconstructions covered the eastern China; however, the most area on the north of farming-grazing transitional zone where the nomadic groups lived was not covered. It might be more tellingly to add some reconstructions covering the Mongolian Plateau and other inner Asian areas and also longer precipitation sequences (Zheng's sequence just covered 500AD to 2000AD).

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 11, 3567, 2015.

**CPD**

11, C1633–C1634, 2015

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper