Replies to Reviewer 1

Rev1-1: The dynamic analysis is the weakest part of the manuscript, but I believe that is more the consequence of the reconstructions that the author characterizes. <u>I think this point could be made more strongly.</u> There is just little agreement in some of these dynamic mode reconstructions and it is not a surprise that little can be determined conclusively from their joint analysis.

Reply: The Appendix A analyses of the PDO, AMO, and ENSO reconstructions were done mainly to see if there was any evidence of Fig. 4's Active-Dormant-Active variability pattern. Also, it seemed like a natural thing to check out given Hidalgo's (2004) earlier work citing the influence of the AMO and PDO over the interior western U.S. It turns out, as pointed out by others (Mantua and Hare 2002, D'Arrigo and Wilson 2006), the PDO reconstructions were in pretty clear disagreement. Given these basically negative results I was weighing whether to include the dynamic analyses in the paper, but in the spirit of full disclosure decided to include them in an appendix. I note they disagree, but I'm unsure how the point could be made more strongly. I've considered some reasons why they might disagree (see Reply to Rev1-2), but I'd rather not dig into it in this paper. This might be a topic for another paper, but I think it would be a diversion here.

I agree we can't draw much from the Appendix A results, but I was surprised that the PDO reconstructions were so dissimilar. In principle, they should agree with one another. They each claim to reconstruct PDO variation – which is a known climate signal during the instrumental period, and is assumed to have a definable history during the pre-instrumental period that they are trying to reconstruct. If necessary conditions for reproducing the PDO are met (see Reply to Rev1-2), then I would expect these reconstructions to agree more closely.

Rev1-2: It should also be noted that some reconstructions are based 20th-century characterizations of the teleconnections between a given NA region and the oceanic states. If these teleconnections are not stable over time, it is also possible that the associations that the author is looking for are not reflected in the reconstructions because of a breakdown in the teleconnections.

Reply: I agree that its possible that teleconnections may change over time. But it also seems that the entire idea of trying to reconstruct ocean mode variability from dendrochronologies is based on the assumption that teleconnections are stable over time. If that assumption wasn't true, there would be no point in trying. Although there may be more, I can think of three necessary conditions for reconstructing the AMO or PDO from tree-ring data.

1. Tree rings respond to rainfall and that response is the same in the instrumental period and the pre-instrumental period.

2. During the instrumental period the PDO or AMO has a significant effect on rainfall over the region where a dendrochronology is formed. For example, +PDO → more rain → more growth, -PDO → less rain → less growth.
3. Stable teleconnections, i.e., the general rainfall effects of the PDO or AMO teleconnections for a region are the same in the pre-instrumental period as they are in the instrumental period.

My guess is that the PDO reconstructions disagree because (2) or (3) were violated. It is possible that PDO teleconnections are non-stationary, but some of the reconstructions were based on tree-ring data from regions that may not have the strongest PDO signals (Southern California and Northern Baja California, Alberta).

Rev1-3: Additionally, it would be useful for the author to note the independence between the dynamic reconstructions and the streamflow/hydro proxies that are used. Is there any overlap between the dendroclimatic series used in the streamflow reconstructions and the dynamic mode reconstructions?

Reply: Overall, very little. Most of the results in the streamflow reconstructions of Fig. 4 are based on tree-ring chronologies from the Upper Colorado basin, while the PDO reconstructions were based on tree ring records from Southern California and Northern Baja California (Biondi et al. 2001), Asia and Siberia (D'Arrigo and Wilson 2006), and California and Alberta (McDonald and Case, 2005). The Shen et al. (2006) PDO was based on a summer drought/flood index derived from Chinese historical documents. The Gray et al. (2004) AMO reconstructions used tree-ring records from eastern North America, Europe, Scandinavia, North Africa and the Middle East. There may be some overlap with the ENSO proxies used in the McGregor et al (2010) PCA analysis, as some were located in interior western North America (their Fig. 2).

After writing some text that addressed this lack of overlap, I found it hard to come up with a reason why such overlap might be a problem. Even if there was complete overlap, e.g., one set of upper Colorado dendrochronologies that were regressed on both streamflow and the PDO, you would still be doing regressions on two separate signals. You could only get significant regressions if there was a signal common to both the streamflow and the PDO in the dendrochronologies. If Rev1 could be more specific about why this might be a concern, I'd have a better idea of how and where to include this discussion in the paper.

Rev1-4: Finally, I do not think it is necessary to include an appendix in this paper. Why not make the ORR analysis of the climate indices a final section in the paper? It is not clear to me that the material should be presented in such a way, especially in a journal that allows for this extra length.

Reply: After thinking about this, I'd rather keep the paper as is. The analysis of the climate indices was included to check whether the available PDO and AMO reconstructions showed any evidence of Fig. 4's centennial scale Active-Dormant-Active cycle. It didn't, and in my view didn't reveal anything interesting – other than the fact that the PDO reconstructions clearly disagree. I'd rather give a quick summary of this in the paper and not move the current Appendix A into the paper itself. I tried this with an alternate draft and it seemed like a diversion. If readers wants more details they can read Appendix A, but my thinking is that it's results are not really central to the paper.

Rev1-5: It should be noted that the reconstructions also have formal uncertainties associated with them. I do not think the author includes these in the ORR analysis, i.e. he has only used the mean estimate of the reconstructions. While not necessary here, the author should mention something about the possibility of including uncertainties about the mean estimate and how they might affect the results.

Reply: I imagine you could figure out a method of accounting for uncertainty using a ranking based analysis method. Maybe a Monte Carlo approach that randomly perturbed the reconstruction values within their 2σ limits, and then ranked those values. But without doing this sort of thing I can't really say how it would affect the results. My guess is that the fairly clear common signal in Fig. 4's analyses of the mean values would "lose focus" and become weaker. I'm really not sure I can figure out how to say something meaningful and coherent about how data uncertainty would propagate through an ORR analysis without actually doing a test. Maybe this is a topic for a future paper

Rev1-6: In the context of future analyses, I presume that ORR could be applied to a gridded hydroclimate product like the Cook et al. North American Drought Atlas that would both complement the current analysis and sidestep the issue of spatial heterogeneities in the streamflow records. Something should be mentioned along these lines.

Reply: This is a likely next step. In the current draft a paragraph in the Conclusion was added on page 26 lines 585-590, which includes the following sentence:

"Also, because these reconstructions are mostly representative of the upper Colorado watershed and the WY-UT-CO region (Table 1, Fig. 1), Fig. 4's overall regime pattern may not represent variability over the broader western U.S. Whether this is the case might be resolved in the future via an ORR analysis of the more spatially continuous Cook et al. (2007) PDSI reconstructions. "

Rev1-7: Is there any overlap in the underlying tree chronologies that are used for the various streamflow reconstructions? A note on this issue would be helpful.

Reply: Many of the streamflow reconstructions were done by the same group (e.g. Barnett et al. 2010), and are from adjacent watersheds, so I imagine there is some overlap. Without digging into identifying the tree-ring chronologies for all the Table 1 reconstructions, I can't say for sure. But to acknowledge the possibility, I've added the following sentence in lines 580-585 of the conclusion:

"Although the individual ORR analyses of reconstructed streamflow in Fig. 4 show consistent regime patterns, the Table 1 streamflow reconstructions may not be completely independent. As many of these reconstructions were done by individual groups (e.g. Barnett et al. 2010, Wise 2010) and are from adjacent watersheds, some may reflect flow variability estimated from overlapping sets of dendrochronologies. As noted in Section 2, a number of the Table 1 reconstructions are for flow for the same rivers at various points in their watershed."

The last sentence refers to additional text that has been included on Page 7 Lines 145-152.

Rev1-8: Pg. 764, Ln 15: Step ii

    Reply: On page 11 line 232 changed to 'step (ii)'

Rev 1-9: Pg. 768, Ln 15: Remove the second dry periods.

    Reply: On page 15 lines 337-229 that sentence has been changed to:

"In some instances these dry regimes are of longer duration and higher significance than the same reconstruction's previous dry periods in Fig. 4a, e.g., those in Fig. 4c's R19, R24, R32-R36, and R40 reconstructions."

Reply to Reviewer 2

Rev2-1: I have read the paper "Optimal Ranking Regime Analysis of TreeFlow Dendrohydrological Reconstructions" by S.A. Mauget and like it a lot. I have no substantive criticisms of it at all. Within the limits of the unknown uncertainties inherent in the reconstructions themselves, all statistical bases appear to be well covered in my opinion. What I do request from the author is the stated opportunity to use his program. It would be nice to know in what language it is written and how it can be obtained. This information should be provided somewhere in the paper, say in the Acknowledgements.

    Reply: I have included the calc_orr.c program and an associated C-Shell script file (CALC_ORR.scr) in the supplemental file calc_orr.zip . I've also noted this in the Acknowledgements. I can also supply these files to Reviewer 2 directly is she/he contacts me at Steven.Mauget@ars.usda.gov.

List of Changes

Page 7 Lines 145-152: Additional text.

Page 11 Line 232: Change made in response to Reviewer 1.

Page 26 Lines 580-590: Added Paragraph.

Page 35 Lines 779-780: Sentence added in response to Reviewer 2 comment.

Page 15 lines 337-229: Sentence changed in response to Reviewer 1 comment.

Page 46 Lines 1058-1059: Corrections made to Table 1.

Page 51 Line 1177: Correction made to Fig. 4 caption.

1 **Optimal Ranking Regime Analysis of TreeFlow**

2 **Dendrohydrological Reconstructions.**

3

4 **S. A. Mauget**

5 {USDA-ARS Plant Stress and Water Conservation Laboratory, Lubbock, TX }

6 Correspondence to: S.A. Mauget (Steven.Mauget@.ars.usda.gov)

7

8 **Abstract**
9

10 The Optimal Ranking Regime (ORR) method was used to identify 6-100 year time windows

11 containing significant ranking sequences in 55 western U.S. streamflow reconstructions, and

12 reconstructions of the level of the Great Salt Lake and San Francisco Bay salinity during

13 1500-2007. The method's ability to identify optimally significant and non-overlapping runs of

14 low and high rankings allows it to re-express a reconstruction time series as a simplified

15 sequence of regime segments marking intra- to multi-decadal (IMD) periods of low or high

16 streamflow, lake level, or salinity. Those ORR sequences, referred to here as Z-lines, can be

17 plotted to identify consistent regime patterns in the analysis of numerous reconstructions. The

18 Z-lines for the 57 reconstructions evaluated here show a common pattern of IMD cycles of

19 drought and pluvial periods during the late 16th and 17th centuries, a relatively dormant period

20 during the 18th century, and the reappearance of alternating dry and wet IMD periods during

21 the 19th and early 20th centuries. Although this pattern suggests the possibility of similarly

22 active and inactive oceanic modes in the North Pacific and North Atlantic, such centennial-

23 scale patterns are not evident in the ORR analyses of reconstructed Pacific Decadal

24 Oscillation (PDO), El Niño-Southern Oscillation, and North Atlantic seas-surface temperature

25 variation. But given the inconsistency in the analyses of four PDO reconstructions the

26 possible role of centennial-scale oceanic mechanisms is uncertain. In future research the ORR

27 method might be applied to climate reconstructions around the Pacific Basin to try to resolve

28 this uncertainty. Given its ability to compare regime patterns in climate reconstructions

29 derived using different methods and proxies, the method may also be used in future research

30 to evaluate long-term regional temperature reconstructions.

31

32 **1 Introduction**

33 Since the first attempts at tree-ring dating analysis over the western U.S. focus has shifted

34 from questions centered on the past to questions related to current and future water

35 management. Whereas the early emphasis was on the dating of prehistoric native American

36 structures in the U.S. southwest (Nash 1999; Creasman et al. 2012), subsequent work has

37 tried to better estimate hydrological variability over important watershed areas of the arid

38 American west. Although the first streamflow reconstructions based on tree-ring data were

39 conducted in the 1930s (see Meko and Woodhouse, 2011 for a review), the growth of western

40 population and agricultural production centers in the latter half of the 20th century spurred

41 demand for better estimates of hydrological variability than were available from gauged

42 streamflow data records.

43 A leading example of the re-assessment of a key western U.S. water resource was Stockton

44 and Jacoby's (1976) reconstruction of Colorado River flow at Lee's Ferry Arizona. The

45 Colorado River Compact (MacDonnell et al. 1995; Hundley 2009) was based on a 16.4

46 million acre-feet (maf) per year Lee's Ferry flow estimate derived from relatively brief gauge

2

47 records from the period immediately preceding the Compact's 1922 drafting. However,

48 Stockton and Jacoby's 1512-1961 flow reconstruction varied about an average level of 13.5

49 maf. As a result, the Compact's equal 7.5 maf division of flow between the upper and lower

50 Colorado basins over-allocated the river's water. Given the experience of more recent western

51 U.S. drought conditions (e.g. Pagano et al., 2004, Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a; Woodhouse

52 et al. 2006), and doubts that the variability in centennial-scale gauge records reflect what

53 water managers might expect in the near future, the current demand for more representative

54 records of hydro-climate is particularly clear regarding the intensity, duration, and recurrence

55 of drought (Rice et al 2009).

56 In meeting the need for extended proxy records streamflow reconstructions have been

57 conducted over a number of western watershed regions including the upper Snake (Wise

58 2010), the upper Colorado (Woodhouse and Lukas, 2006a; Woodhouse et al., 2006; Meko et

59 al. 2007; Gray et al 2011), the South Platte (Woodhouse and Lukas, 2006a), the Rio Grande

60 (Margolis et al. 2011), the Great Salt Lake (Bekker et al. 2014; DeRose et al. 2014) and

61 California's central valley (Meko et al. 2001). The results of many of these reconstructions

62 have been made available via the TreeFlow web data resource (http://treeflow.info).   The

63 amount of data currently available from treeflo.info – 54 TreeFlow reconstructions are

64 evaluated here in addition to flow and lake level reconstructions from other sources – presents

65 both opportunities and challenges. The analysis of multiple reconstructions allows for the

66 possibility of detecting patterns of common pluvial and drought regimes in the pre-

67 instrumental period. However, objectively and consistently identifying these regime periods,

68 and presenting the results in a way that can expose consistent patterns of variation may require

69 new approaches to time series analysis.

3

70 One commonly used method to test for regimes in multi-century proxy climate records is runs

71 analysis (Meko et al. 1995,2007; Biondi et al., 2002, 2005; Gray et al. 2011; Bekker et al.

72 2014). This approach defines the run duration of extreme flow periods as the number of

73 consecutive high or low flow years above or below a specified flow threshold. The sum of

74 those flow departures above or below that threshold is referred to as the run magnitude, while

75 the average departure over the run's duration, i.e. the run's magnitude divided by it's duration,

76 is the run intensity (Dracup et al 1980; Biondi et al. 2002). However, as noted by Gray et al.

77 (2011) and Meko and Woodhouse (2011), a basic problem with this method is that single

78 years exceeding the threshold in the midst of otherwise extended runs results in the definition

79 of two individual runs. Also, a drought or pluvial period's magnitude and intensity are

80 dependent on the choice of a subjectively chosen threshold. Thus while runs analysis can

81 provide information about the magnitude and duration of anomalous flow events in a

82 reconstructed streamflow record, it's results can be dependent on the choice of threshold and

83 may not provide the most robust estimates of event duration.

84 A second method that can be used to detect regime periods in climate records is intervention

85 analysis. As described by Box and Tiao (1975) and used by Mantua et al. (1997), intervention

86 analysis involves forming stochastic models that account for the influence of events, or

87 interventions, that lead to abrupt changes in a time series. This iterative process of model

88 identification, fitting, and diagnostic checking assumes prior knowledge of the timing of

89 intervention events. When that timing is not known, candidate regime shifts have been

90 identified via two-sample t-tests to detect significant shifts in 15 year sample means before

91 and after each year in a time series (Gedalof and Smith 2001; D'Arrigo et al. 2005).

4

92 In previous work the Optimal Ranking Regime (ORR) method has been used to identify

93 significant intra- to multi-decadal (IMD) periods in U.S. temperature, precipitation, and

94 streamflow during the instrumental period (Mauget 2003a,b 2004; Cordero et al. 2011;

95 Mauget and Cordero 2014a,b), and in reconstructed records of South American snowpack

96 based on tree-ring data (Masiokas et al. 2012). This approach ranks a time series' data values,

97 samples those rankings over moving time windows, and then calculates Mann-Whitney U and

98 Z statistics for each running sample. Conducting this sampling process over running time

99 windows allows for testing every possible ranking sequence occurring over a fixed window

100 duration. By repeating this running sampling using windows of varying widths, the process

101 exhaustively samples the ranking sequences in a time series over a range of time scales.

102 Comparing the magnitudes of the resulting Z statistics for all the ranking samples allows the

103 method to objectively identify a time series' most significant sequences of low or high

104 rankings.   The ORR algorithm's simple output – a time series' most significant, non-

105 overlapping ranking regimes - makes it possible to graphically identify common drought or

106 pluvial regime patterns in the analyses of many hydroclimate reconstructions. Using this

107 graphic approach here may allow for a 'big picture' of the reconstructed IMD flow regimes in

108 the current TreeFlow data during 1500-2007. Given that features of climate reconstructions

109 might be sensitive to choices of modeling methodology (Hidalgo et al. 2000; Woodhouse et

110 al. 2006), this may also have a corroborative effect in showing common regime patterns in

111 reconstructions produced by investigators using different methods.

112 In the following Section 2 describes the streamflow, lake level, and salinity reconstruction

113 data evaluated here. Section 3 explains the ORR method and demonstrates it on Colorado

114 River at Lee's Ferry reconstructed annual flow values during 1500-2005. Section 4 presents

5

115 the results of the ORR approach on all 57 reconstructed data series during 1500-2010.

116 Section 5 summarizes and discusses Section 4's results, outlines the advantages and

117 disadvantages in using the ORR approach in evaluating reconstructed climate series, and

118 proposes possible future research to apply the method to climate reconstructions around the

119 Pacific basin.

120 **2 Data**

121 The dendrohydrological data evaluated here (Table 1) includes 55 streamflow reconstructions,

122 and reconstructions of Great Salt Lake level (DeRose et al. 2014) and San Francisco Bay

123 salinity (Stahle et al. 2001). Figure 1 shows the locations of the USGS gauge stations

124 associated with each flow reconstruction and the general locations of San Francisco Bay and

125 the Great Salt Lake. Although the Sacramento-Four reconstruction (Meko et al. 2001) was

126 derived as the sum of four streamflow components in the Sacramento River watershed, its

127 location is marked at the junction of the Sacramento and American Rivers. The Stahle et al.

128 (2001) salinity data and all but two of the streamflow records were obtained from

129 treeflow.info. Reconstructed flow values for the Columbia River at The Dalles (Gedalof et al.

130 2004) was obtained via personal communication with Z'ev Gedalof. The Weber River flow

131 near Oakley, Utah (Bekker et al 2014) and Great Salt Lake Level data was obtained from

132 Matthew Bekker and Justin DeRose of the Wasatch Dendroclimatology Research Group. Of

133 Table 1's 57 reconstructions the shortest is Gedalof et al.'s (2004) record of annual

134 Columbia River flow (238 years), while the longest is Meko et al.'s (2007) Colorado River

135 flow at Lee's Ferry AZ reconstruction (1241 years). In the following these stations will be

136 referred to by their Table 1 reconstruction number, i.e., R1, R2,…R57.

6

137 Given the goal of detecting patterns of intra-decadal to centennial-scale hydrological regimes

138 over the western U.S., a network of streamflow gauge stations with a more uniform

139 geographic distribution than that found in Fig. 1 would be ideal. However, more than 1/3rd of

140 Fig. 1's stations (R19-R36) are concentrated in northern Colorado over the upper watersheds

141 of the Colorado and South Platte rivers. More than 3/4^{ths} (R4-R47) are located in three states

142 in the interior western U.S. – Wyoming, Utah and Colorado (WY-UT-CO). This in part due to

143 the demand of western water managers for better estimates of drought duration and recurrence

144 in key watershed areas of the U.S. central Rockies (e.g., Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a,b,c).

145 Another source of data redundancy is the repetition of reconstructions at gauge stations by

146 different investigators. Flow records for the Green River at Green River, Wyoming (R13,

147 R14) estimated by both Barnett et al. (2010) and Woodhouse et al. (2006) are tested here, as

148 are two records (R52,R53) for the Colorado River at Lee's Ferry (Meko et al. 2007;

149 Woodhouse et al. 2006). Finally, some of the Fig. 1 gauge stations measure flow for the same

150 rivers   at   various   points   in   their   watersheds,   e.g.,   the   Colorado

151 (R19,R22,R36,R38,R40,R51,R52), the Snake (R2-4) and the Green (R7, R12-14, R17)

152 Rivers.

153 Estimating pre-instrumental annual flow records from tree-ring data takes place in a general

154 framework (Fritts 1976; Meko et al 1995; also, see http://treeflow.info/study.html):

155

156   • Evaluating and conducting quality control of flow data from a gauge location whose

157   flow record is to be extended. If necessary, the data may be adjusted to correct for the

158   effects of diversions or non-climatic trends.

159   • Collecting and evaluating tree-ring data from multiple sites in or near the gauge's

160   watershed region. This includes site selection and tree coring, cross dating the cores

161   from different trees, de-trending of ring width measurements to remove the 'age trend'

162   effects of increasing trunk radius, and the removal of biological autocorrelation in ring

163   widths. Finally, the resulting standardized ring width indices for numerous trees at a

164   site are averaged to form a site dendrochronology.

165 • Forming a reconstruction model that estimates annual flow values from a set of

166   predictor site chronologies during a calibration period common to both instrumental

167   flow data and the site chronologies. These models are typically regression models,

168   where the predictor variables can be actual site chronology time series (e.g.

169   Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a; Watson et al. 2009; Gray et al. 2011), principal

170   component (PC) series derived from the filtered ring width indices of individual trees

171   (Meko 1997), PC series derived from site chronologies (Woodhouse et al 2006; Meko

172   et al. 2001; Hidalgo et al. 2000), or PC series derived from flow reconstructions based

173   on individual site chronologies (Meko et al. 2007; Hirschboeck and Meko 2008).

174 • Validating the reconstruction model using predictor variables and gauge data that were

175   withheld from the regression training process.

176 • Evaluating the calibration and validation statistics. TreeFlow reconstructions report the

177   portion of the annual flow variance explained by the regression model during the

178   calibration period (R^2), the standard error of the estimate during the calibration period,

179   a Reduction of Error (RE) statistic derived from the validation data, and the root

180   square error of the regression during the validation period.

181   •   Applying the model to the full length of the site chronology predictor data to generate

182   reconstructed annual flow values in both the pre-instrumental and instrumental

183   periods.

184

185

186 The R^2 and RE statistics for each of the reconstructions evaluated here can be found in Table

187 1. When multiple RE and R^2 are reported because different validation procedures are used

188 (e.g., Margolis et al. 2011), or when multiple values are reported for different reconstruction

189 periods (e.g., Meko et al. 2007; Hirschboeck and Meko 2008; Meko et al., 2001), Table 1

190 shows the lowest RE and R2 values. As defined by Cook et al. (1999, Appendix B) RE > 0.0

191 indicates predictive skill relative to a regression estimate defined by the calibration period's

192 climatological mean. Table 1's RE scores range between 0.20 (R15) to 0.80 (R57). The

193 median RE value is 0.59, and 46 of the RE values are greater than 0.50.

194

195 **3 The Optimal Ranking Regime Method**

196 The ORR method ranks a time series' data values, samples the rankings over running time

197 windows of n_I years duration, then converts each sample of rankings into Mann-Whitney U

198 and Z statistics (Mann and Whitney 1947). Although the U statistic for rankings within a

199 sample window can be calculated based on the sample's size and rank sum (Mendenhall et al.

200 1990; Wilks 1995), the statistic is also equal to the total number of data values outside the

201 sampling window that precede each sample value when all data values are arranged by rank

202 (Hollander and Wolfe 1999). For a N-year reconstructed flow series divided into an $n_I = 21$

203 year sample window and $n_{II} = N-21$ years outside the window, the highest possible U statistic

9

204 occurs when the sample contains the 21 highest ranked years [U = (N-21)*21]. A sample

205 containing the 21 lowest ranked years produces the lowest U statistic [U=0*21]. Randomly

206 sampled sets of 21 rankings produce U statistics that are normally distributed between those

207 two extreme values, with values in the distribution's lower and upper tails indicating a high

208 incidence of low and high ranked values in a sample. The U distribution's mean is equal to the

209 average of the minimum and maximum U values, e.g.,

$$210 \qquad\qquad \mu_0 = 0.5\left[\left(0*21\right)+\left(21*\left(N-21\right)\right)\right]=0.5*n_I*n_{II} \qquad\qquad (1)$$

211 while the standard deviation can be estimated via Eq. 2 (Mendenhall et al. 1990),

$$212 \qquad\qquad \sigma_0 = \left(\left(n_I n_{II}*\left(n_I+n_{II}+1\right)\right)/12\right)^{1/2} . \qquad\qquad (2)$$

213 The Gaussian U statistics can be Z-normalized using these null parameters, with significantly

214 low (high) Z values indicating a significant incidence of low (high) annual flow rankings

215 relative to a null hypothesis that assumes random sampling (H_0).

$$216 \qquad\qquad Z_0 = \frac{U-\mu_0}{\sigma_0} \qquad\qquad (3)$$

217 For a specific sample size, the Eq. 1 and 2 solutions for μ_0 and σ_0 assume that a sample's

218 rankings are serially independent. However, in a multi-century reconstructed annual flow

219 series, outcomes consistent with persistent 'red' variation are more likely in a sampled

220 sequence of rankings. As a result, both null parameters were calculated here via Monte Carlo

221 simulations consistent with a null hypothesis that allows for year-to-year persistence. This

222 hypothesis (H_1) holds that the flow time series represents semi-random climate variation with

223 inter-annual persistence, but is essentially stationary and trendless. The parameters of U null

224 distributions consistent with H_1 were derived here via the following autoregressive (AR)

225 modeling and Monte Carlo procedure:

10

226

  227 i.   As H_1 assumes that the time series is trendless, calculate AR(1), AR(2), and AR(3)

  228   regression coefficients from the autocorrelation values of the detrended reconstruction

  229   series. Then, select the AR model yielding the minimum Akaike Information Criteria

  230   score (Akaike, 1974).

  231 ii.   Use the AR model identified in step (i) to form AR red noise processes.

  232 iii. Adjust the mean and variance of the red noise process resulting from step (ii) to agree

  233   with that of the data. Then, select red noise series with lengths equal to that of the time

  234   series being tested and rank those values.

  235 iv. From the ranked noise processes resulting from step (iii) calculate appropriate null

  236   statistics, which in the preceding example would be U_I statistics derived from non-

  237   overlapping 21 element segments of each red noise series.

  238 v.   Repeat steps ii-iv until 50,000 independent null statistics are calculated, and determine

  239   the parameters of the resulting U_I null distribution.

240

241 Given the null distribution parameters derived from these Monte Carlo simulations (μ_1,σ_1), the

242 Z statistics of rankings sampled from a reconstruction time series can be used to test H_1 .

$$243 \qquad\qquad\qquad Z_1 = \frac{U - \mu_1}{\sigma_1} \qquad\qquad\qquad (4)$$

244 A sample's Z statistic is assigned based on which normalization, Z_0 or Z_1, produces the most

245 conservative significance estimate. These assignments are determined mainly by the relative

246 magnitudes of σ_0 and σ_1. Although the Monte Carlo generated μ_1 values agree closely with the

247 corresponding Eq. 1 μ_0 values, σ_1 values generated using 6 to 100 year samples drawn from

248 the rankings of the step (ii) red noise series were usually greater than the corresponding Eq. 2

Steven Mauget 8/3/15 6:00 PM
Comment [2]: Changed this to step (ii)

249 σ_0 values. In those cases $|Z_1| < |Z_0|$, and Z statistics are calculated via Eq. 4. In instances

250 when the Monte Carlo generated σ_1 values are less than the σ_0 values, $|Z_1| > |Z_0|$, and

251 significance could be assigned to ranking samples that were consistent with white noise if the

252 Eq. 4 normalization was used.   In those cases U statistics are normalized using Eq. 3. As a

253 result, the absolute value of the Eq. 3 Z_0 statistics serve as a ceiling limiting the magnitudes of

254 Z values, and helps to insure that significance is not assigned to ranking samples that were

255 consistent with essentially random white noise variation.

256 Figures 2a-e shows the ORR method applied to Meko et al.'s (2007) Colorado River at Lee's

257 Ferry (CRLF) flow reconstruction during 1500-2005. Figure 2a shows the annual flow values

258 and their 21-year running mean, while Fig. 2b shows the Z statistics for flow rankings

259 sampled over running 21-year windows. The horizontal lines in Fig. 2b mark the Z statistics'

260 negative and positive significance at two-sided 95%, and 99% confidence levels, and a dry

261 and wet shade scheme that marks negative and positive significance at both levels. Figure 2c's

262 dry and wet shade horizontal lines show the 21-year ranking regimes indicated as negatively

263 or positively significant at a 95% or better confidence level in Fig. 2b, superimposed on the

264 CRLF series. The vertical placement of those horizontal regime segments shows the ranking

265 regime's corresponding Z statistic, which is measured on the figure's right axis.

266 To apply the ORR procedure to an extended range of time scales, U and Z statistics were

267 calculated with moving sampling windows between 6 and 100 years in length. For every

268 sample size, running Z_0 and Z_1 statistics were calculated for each time series, and, as

269 described above, Z values were defined by the normalization that produced the smallest Z

270 magnitude. This normalization allows for significance testing of a specific sample size, as in

271 Fig. 2c, but also allows for comparing the significance of U statistics derived using different

12

272 sample sizes. After normalizing the running U statistics from each analysis, the positive and

273 negative Z statistics from all 95 tests that are significant at a 95% confidence level are

274 combined as in Fig. 2d. Those pooled statistics are then evaluated to identify ranking

275 sequences that are optimally significant over distinct, non-overlapping time windows (Fig.

276 2e). This process first sorts all the significant regime periods by the absolute value of the

277 period's Z statistic ($|Z|$) and then records the most significant statistic and its period. Then, the

278 next most significant $|Z|$ value with a period that does not overlap with the most significant

279 ranking period is recorded. In the Fig. 2e CRLF series these leading statistics (Table 2)

280 occurred during a 1601-1621 wet regime ($Z = 3.498$) and two 6 year wet regimes with equal

281 rank sums and Z statistics during 1836-1841 and 1982-1987 ($Z = 3.063$). The ORR algorithm

282 iteratively proceeds by recording the next most significant $|Z|$ statistic with a period that does

283 not overlap with all previously recorded periods, and continues until all the significant ranking

284 regimes identified by the 95 running tests have been tested. In the CRLF series the most

285 significant sequence of low flow years occurred during 1870-1904 ($Z= -2.742$). While the Z-

286 normalization process allows for comparing the significance of Z statistics derived using

287 varying sample sizes, it also makes it possible to rank the optimal ranking regimes found in a

288 reconstruction series. As a time series' ORR Z statistics can be interpreted as measures of

289 regime intensity, the most intense CRLF pluvial and drought periods in Fig. 2e occurred

290 during 1601-1621 and 1870-1904.

291 Figures 3a-d show the results of the ORR analysis when applied to the reconstructions of (a)

292 Columbia River flow at the Dalles, (b) Great Salt Lake level, (c) the Sacramento River Four

293 Rivers Index (Meko et al. 2001), and, (d), San Francisco Bay salinity. Because the method

294 defines non-overlapping high and low ranking regimes at two significance levels, compact

13

295 graphs can be formed showing the ORR results from multiple time series. Using Fig. 2b's

296 shading scheme for positive and negative significance, a time series' optimal ranking regimes

297 can be graphed on a single horizontal line referred to as a Z-line. The optimally significant

298 streamflow, lake level, and salinity regimes from Figs. 2e and 3a-d have been re-plotted as Z-

299 lines in Fig. 3e. By applying the ORR algorithm to all of Table 1's reconstructions, the

300 resulting Z-lines can be similarly arranged to show hydrological regime patterns over all of

301 Fig. 1's corresponding locations.

302

303 **4 ORR Analyses of Hydroclimate Reconstructions: 1500-2007**

304 Figure 4 shows the Z-lines for Table 1's 57 reconstructions during 1500-2007. The white

305 areas in that figure show each reconstruction's duration during that period, and each Z-line's

306 vertical coordinate is determined by the corresponding reconstruction number in Table 1 and

307 Fig. 1. These Z-lines will be referred to by their Table 1 reconstruction number, i.e., R1,

308 R2,…R57. The y-axis color backgrounds of Fig. 4's reconstruction numbers also follow Fig.

309 1's state color shading scheme. Thus R1-R14 are located in Fig. 1's light yellow states, R15-

310 R47 are located in Utah and Colorado, R48-R53 in New Mexico and Arizona, while R54-R57

311 are located in California. In the following the timing and duration of Fig. 4's drought and

312 pluvial regimes will be compared with those highlighted in previous work, particularly Fye

313 et al. (2003), Stahle and Dean (2011), and Cook et al. (2007), which were based on the

314 summer Palmer Drought Severity Index (PDSI) reconstructions of Cook et al.

315 (1996,1999,2004, 2007).

316

317

14

4.1 16th and 17th Centuries

Figure 4a outlines dry ORR periods beginning in the 1570's and ending on or before 1601. These dry periods coincide with the late 16th century 'megadrought' apparent in streamflow and PDSI reconstructions (Meko et al. 1995; Stahle et al. 2000,2007), which Meko et al. (1995) and Stahle et al. (2007) describe as occurring during 1579-1598 and 1559-1582 respectively. Stahle and Dean (2011) describe this period as " … the most severe sustained North American drought evident in the tree-ring record for the past 500 years". In the ORR analysis of the Fig. 2e CRLF reconstruction this drought's effects are apparent as a low flow regime during 1579-1592. However, as measured by that 14 year period's Z statistic (Table 2), that dry regime is the second most intense in the Meko et al. (2007) CRLF reconstruction during 1500-2005.

Following the late 16th century drought was a multi-decadal wet period during the early 17th century (Fig. 4b). This drought to pluvial transition is clearly seen in the Great Salt Lake level reconstruction (Fig. 3b, R15), and clearly significant wet regimes are also found in the upper Rio Grande (R50) and both CRLF reconstructions (R52, R53) during this time. Based on an analysis of gridded PDSI reconstructions, Fye et al. (2003) also note a western U.S. pluvial period during 1602-1622. The earliest onset year in Fig. 4b's optimally wet periods is 1601, while the latest termination year is 1622.

After 1621 dry periods re-appear in many proxy records that showed drought conditions during the late 16th century (Fig. 4c). In some instances these dry regimes are of longer duration and higher significance than the same reconstruction's previous dry periods in Fig. 4a, e.g., those in Fig. 4c's R19, R24, R32-R36, and R40 reconstructions. Figure 4c's multi-decadal drought pattern tends to be more consistent in the R2-R14 eastern Idaho and

15

341 Wyoming streamflow reconstructions. Fye et al. (2003) note drought conditions over this area

342 during 1624-1633, but the Fig. 4c low flow regimes are of generally longer duration.

343 In Fig. 4d brief drought periods are detected after many of the Fig. 4c dry regimes. However,

344 it is unclear whether these are two distinct drought events as some extended regimes span

345 both periods. The Woodhouse et al. (2006) CRLF reconstruction (R53) contains a 50 year dry

346 ORR period during 1622-1671 that is the longest and most significant low flow regime in that

347 record (Table 3). Dry regimes of similar duration and significance are found in the Colorado

348 River at Hot Sulphur Springs (R19), Big Thompson (R24), Blue River at Dillon (R34), and

349 Colorado River near Cisco (R40) reconstructions in Fig. 4c and d. The duration of Fig. 4d's

350 dry regimes coincides with the 1666-1671 Pueblo Drought period (Cook et al. 2007; Stahle

351 and Dean, 2011), which is also noted by Fye et al. (2003) as occurring during 1663-1672. The

352 earliest onset year of the Pueblo Drought regimes detected here is 1662, while the latest

353 termination year is 1672. After 1671 brief wet regimes, most ending in 1683 or before, are

354 found in many of the reconstructions (Fig. 4e).

355
356 **4.2 18th Century**

357
358 Compared to the 1575-1683 period in Fig. 4, 1700-1825 is marked by the relative absence of

359 consistent drought or pluvial patterns. One exception is Fig. 4f's pattern of dry periods evident

360 over the upper Colorado and upper Rio Grande watersheds (i.e., R36-R48, R50, R52, R53)

361 during the 1770's and early 1780's. Many of these ORR periods, including those in the two

362 CRLF reconstructions (R52, R53), coincide with the 1772-1782 time window attributed to

363 this drought by Fye et al. (2003). Figure 4f's drought periods immediately preceded the Año

364 del Hambre ("Year of Hunger") drought that affected northern Mexico and the Southern Great

365 Plains during 1785-1787 (Stahle and Dean, 2011). Although the 18th century appears to be

16

366 relatively free of extended drought or pluvial regimes over the Fig. 1 watershed regions, this

367 period may not have been generally drought-free over western North America. Before the

368 Año del Hambre period and the drought regimes of Fig. 4f, a series of indigenous rebellions

369 have been associated with drought conditions in northern Mexico during 1725-1742

370 (Brenneman, 2009).

371 Fresh water inflow to San Francisco Bay from the Sacramento-San Joaquin Delta   has a

372 controlling influence on the bay's salinity levels (Stahle et al. 2001). In the mid-18th century

373 the California reconstructions (R54-R57) show a semi-consistent pattern of wet (dry)

374 streamflow regimes that coincide with fresh (salty) San Francisco Bay salinity (SFBNaCl)

375 regimes. During 1740-1747 high flow periods are found in the Feather River (R55) and

376 Sacramento-Four (R56) reconstructions, while a significant incidence of fresh, low-ranked,

377 SFBNaCl values (R57) are detected during 1738-1746 (Fig. 4g). In the 1770's these regimes

378 reverse sign, with low streamflow periods indicated in the Feather River and Sacramento-Four

379 records during 1776-1783, while a salty SFBNaCl regime is detected during 1775-1783 (Fig.

380 4h). Immediately after that period in Fig. 4h a fresh SFBNaCl regime occurs during 1784-

381 1792, while the Sacramento-Four and Feather River reconstructions show high flow periods

382 during that same time. Although the Salinas River at Paso Robles (R54) does not flow into

383 San Francisco Bay, it's Z-line also shows consistent periods of low and high flow with the

384 Feather River and Sacramento Four flow regimes in Figs. 4g and h.

385

386 **4.3 19th Century**

387 After 1825 pluvial conditions are widely apparent outside of California and the most northern

388 streamflow reconstructions (R1-R5), with the years 1836-1841 indicated as the most common

389 wet ORR period (Fig. 4i). Both Stahle and Dean (2011) and Fye et al (2003) consider this

17

390 pluvial to have occurred during 1825-1840, and the significant ranking regimes in Fig. 2d's

391 CRLF series during that time also indicates significant wet periods beginning in the late

392 1820's over the upper Colorado watershed. However, Fig. 4i's ORR results suggest that the

393 most significant concentrations of wet years occurred after 1835. This wet period was

394 followed by dry regimes in the early 1840's (Fig. 4j). Woodhouse et al. (2002) attribute this

395 drought to 1845-1856 based on an analysis of 60 tree-ring chronologies from the Rocky

396 Mountains, the Colorado Front Range, and the Great Plains. Stahle and Dean (2011) assign

397 this dry period to 1841-1865, and consider it the longest and most severe reconstructed

398 drought over the Great Plains and western North America during the 19th century. In Fig. 4i

399 the most common dry ORR periods occur during 1842-1847 and 1842-1848, and are generally

400 not highly significant, i.e., at a 99% confidence level. During this time, however, the

401 reconstructed flow for the Columbia River at the Dalles (R1, Fig. 3a) does show a highly

402 significant sequence (Z = -3.309) of low flow conditions during 1839-1852. After the low-

403 flow ORR periods of Fig. 4j, Fig. 4k outlines a consistent pattern of brief (6-8 year) wet

404 periods that, for the most part, begin after 1861 and end before 1871. The most common high

405 flow period is 1864-1869, which coincides closely with the 1867-1869 'Garden Myth' wet

406 period over the western U.S. described by Cook et al. (2007). Although Cook et al (2007)

407 note a second wet episode over the western U.S. during 1877–1879, that wetness was

408 not found in the reconstructed summer PDSI over the WY-UT-CO region (their Fig. 13).

409 A shift to wet conditions is also found in the reconstructed Columbia River flow during this

410 time (Fig. 3a), although, unlike Fig. 4j's dry periods, the 1860-1881 Columbia high flow

411 period is generally more significant (Z = 2.916) and spans both 'Garden Myth' periods.

18

412 After 1869 dry regimes, many of multi-decadal duration, are apparent over most of the R7-

413 R53 reconstructions (Fig. 4l). Between 1870 and the early 20th century Fye et al. (2003) note

414 separate southwestern U.S. drought periods during 1870-1883 and 1897-1904, while Stockton

415 and Jacoby (1976) note a single extended period of low flow in their CRLF reconstruction

416 during 1870-1894. The 1870-1904 low flow regime in the Meko et al. (2007) CRLF

417 reconstruction (R52) is the longest ORR of either sign in that record, and also it's most

418 significant ORR dry period (Z = -2.742) since 1500 (Table 2). However, a low flow period

419 during 1874-1883 in the Woodhouse et al. (2006) CRLF reconstruction (R53) has a shorter

420 duration and is only the third most significant dry regime during that time (Table 3). Other

421 reconstructions that show multi-decadal dry regimes significant at a 99% confidence level in

422 Fig. 4l include R18, R20-R22, R29, R31-R33, and R39.

423

424 **4.4 20th Century**

425

426 Figure 4m outlines early 20th century high flow conditions apparent in most of the

427 reconstructions apart from the California (R54-R57) and Columbia River flow (R1) records.

428 The most common beginning year in these wet periods is 1905, and most end on or before

429 1934. Wet periods in six reconstructions, however, persist into the 1940's and early 1950's

430 (R20, R22, R33, R36, R44, and R48). Fye et al. (2003) and Stahle and Dean (2011) define this

431 pluvial's duration as 1905-1917 and 1907-1916 respectively based on their analyses of

432 reconstructed summer PDSI. These high flow periods are most consistently and significantly

433 detected in gauge stations in Idaho and Wyoming (R2-R20), and in southern Colorado, New

434 Mexico, and Arizona (R44-R53), but are not as clearly apparent in the reconstructions for

435 upper Colorado and upper South Platte gauge stations in northern Colorado (R21-R52).

19

436 Despite the relative lack of significant wet regimes in the upper Colorado watershed in Fig.

437 4m, wet periods are detected in the Meko et al. (2007) CRLF reconstruction (R52) during

438 1905-1928 and in the Woodhouse et al. (2006) CRLF reconstruction (R53) during 1905-1932.

439 Stockton and Jacoby (1976) identified a Colorado River high flow period during 1906-1930,

440 and cited it as the longest and greatest period of anomalously high flow in their 1512-1961

441 CRLF reconstruction. However, the highest magnitude positive ORR Z statistic in both the

442 Meko et al. (Table 2) and Woodhouse et al. CRLF reconstructions (Table 3) occur during

443 1601-1621. Although the 1905-1928 and 1905-1932 wet periods are the longest in those

444 reconstructions, the corresponding Z statistics rank 3rd (Table 2) and 4th (Table 3)

445 respectively.

446 Figure 4 shows little evidence of the effects of the 1930's drought, which were mainly

447 centered over the Great Plains in the analyses of Shubert et al. (2004) and Mauget (2003a). In

448 the analysis of Fye et al. (2003) drought conditions during 1929-1940 also extend into parts of

449 the Columbia River watershed. A 1922-1941 low flow regime in the Columbia River

450 reconstruction (R1, Fig. 3a) overlaps with the Fye et al. (2003) drought period, but also

451 precedes it. Unlike the drought of the 1930's, the 1950's drought had strong precipitation

452 effects over Colorado and New Mexico during 1950-1956 (Mauget 2003a). But apart from

453 early 1950's low flow regimes in R29-R31, R44, and R50, there is also no widespread

454 evidence of that drought's effects in the Fig. 4 reconstructions.

455 In Fig. 4n a pattern of high flow regimes beginning in the mid-1960's and ending in the mid-

456 1980's is evident in the Idaho and Wyoming reconstructions (R2-R5, R7-R11). One of Fig.

457 4's most consistent patterns of pluvial regimes is found in R12-R53 in the mid 1980's (Fig.

458 4o). Woodhouse and Lukas (2006a) refer to a period of unusually abundant moisture in

20

459 Colorado during 1982-1999, but in Fig. 4o's flow reconstructions the most common wet ORR

460 period is 1982-1987.   Although most of the Fig. 4 reconstructions end during or before the

461 1999-2004 drought period in the western U.S. (Piechota et al., 2004; Cook et al., 2007), R2-

462 R4 and R49 show low flow ORR periods during 2000-2005 and 2000-2006.

463

464 **4.5 Centennial Scale Variation**

465 Apart from the four California reconstructions (R54-R57), Fig. 4's dominant variability

466 patterns are evident as alternating drought-pluvial regimes during the late 16th and 17th

467 centuries (Fig. 4a-e) and also during the 19th and early 20th centuries (Fig. 4i-m). But between

468 those two periods, with the exception of low flow conditions in R29-R53 during the 1770's

469 (Fig. 4f), many of the reconstructions are more consistent with red noise during 1680-1835.

470 An example of this lack of significant IMD variation is seen in the R23-R25 reconstructions,

471 which have no ranking regimes significant at a 95% confidence level during 1719-1830 (Fig.

472 4p).   These periods of active and dormant hydroclimate variability are more evident when the

473 number of Z-lines that are in significant ($|Z| \geq 1.96$) drought and pluvial regimes are counted

474 for each year of 1500-2000. In Fig. 4q these counts are expressed as percentages of the total

475 number of R1-R53 Z-lines that are defined in a particular year, which is determined by the

476 duration of the reconstruction records. As few lines extend past the year 2000, the Fig. 4q

477 percentages are not calculated during 2001-2007. During 1580-1680 and 1835-1930 relatively

478 high percentages (> 40%) of the R1-R53 Z-lines experienced alternating wet and dry IMD

479 regimes. However, between those two periods, years in which more than 40% of the

480 reconstructions are in a drought or pluvial ORR period are relatively rare. As a result, the Fig.

481 4 ORR analyses generally show two active centennial scale periods marked by alternating

21

482 IMD wet and dry regimes, separated by a period during the 18th and early 19th century with

483 relatively little IMD regime variation. Similar centennial scale variability in the Cook et al.

484 (1999) summer PDSI reconstructions was noted over western U.S. grid locations by Hidalgo

485 (2004). That analysis calculated the percentage of the PDSI total power spectral density in

486 bidecadal (8-32 year) and pentadecadel (32-64 year) frequency bands during three periods:

487 1525-1650, 1700-1825, and 1850-1975. Pentadecadal PDSI variation was dominant during the

488 1525-1650 and 1850-1975 periods over grid locations in the interior west, but virtually absent

489 during 1700-1825 (Hidalgo 2004; his Figs. 3d,e,f). Conversely, higher frequency bidecadal

490 PDSI variation was relatively strong during 1700-1825, but less apparent during the 1525-

491 1650 and 1850-1975 periods (Hidalgo 2004; his Figs. 3a,b,c).

492 Decadal to multi-decadal variation in U.S. hydroclimate has been associated with similarly

493 persistent regimes in North Pacific and North Atlantic sea-surface temperature; i.e., those

494 associated with the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) and the Atlantic Multidecadal

495 Oscillation (AMO), and with regimes in the El Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO) mechanism

496 (see review in McCabe and Wolock 2013). Oceanic forcing is generally thought to play a

497 central role in sustaining persistent climate regimes (Schubert et al. 2004,2008; Cook et al.

498 2007; Solomon et al. 2010; Hoerling et al. 2011). Over the interior western U.S. the combined

499 influence of the AMO and PDO are considered to be particularly important (Gray et al. 2003;

500 Hidalgo 2004; McCabe et al. 2004, 2007). As a result, Fig. 4q's patterns of relatively active

501 and inactive periods of IMD variation lead to questions as to whether similar variation is

502 evident in PDO, AMO, and ENSO reconstructions. A commonly studied influence over the

503 western U.S is the PDO, which has been associated with pre-instrumental precipitation

504 regimes in PDO reconstructions derived from tree-ring chronologies (Gedalof and Smith,

22

505 2001; Biondi et al. 2001; MacDonald and Case, 2005). However, as Mantua and Hare (2002)

506 and D'Arrigo and Wilson (2006) note, the variation in these PDO reconstructions are

507 frequently inconsistent. This lack of consensus was also found here in the ORR analyses of

508 four PDO reconstructions (Appendix A).   Moreover, the Z-lines for those reconstructions,

509 and for reconstructions of the AMO and a unified ENSO proxy series, show no obvious

510 similarity to Fig. 4q's centennial scale pattern of active and inactive IMD variation (Fig. A2).

511 As a result, even though those consistent patterns of drought and pluvial activity suggest an

512 oceanic influence, the ORR analyses of Appendix A's reconstructed North Pacific and North

513 Atlantic climate indices show no clear evidence of that influence.

514
515 **5 Summary and Discussion**
516
517 The Optimal Ranking Regime (ORR) method was used to identify intra- to multi-decadal

518 (IMD) variation in reconstructed records of western U.S. streamflow, the level of the Great

519 Salt Lake (Fig. 3b), and San Francisco Bay salinity levels (Fig. 3d) during 1500-2007. The

520 ORR algorithm, which is described in Section 3 and demonstrated in Figs. 2a-e, detects the

521 most significant sequences of low and high ranked values in a time series relative to a null

522 hypothesis that holds that the series consists of trendless red noise. As these optimal ranking

523 sequences are defined over non-overlapping 6-100 year time windows, the associated periods

524 of low and high rankings in a reconstruction series, and their significance at 95% and 99%

525 confidence levels, can be displayed on graphically concise horizontal traces referred to as Z-

526 lines (Figs. 3e and 4).

527 As described in Section 3, Mann-Whitney U statistics for samples of rankings are normally

528 distributed, with values in a U distribution's lower and upper tails indicating a sample with a

529 high incidence of low or high rankings. In the ORR procedure U statistics calculated over

23

530 running sampling windows are normalized into Z statistics (Eqs. 3,4), which allows for

531 determining the significance of each running sample. Because these running analyses are

532 repeated with varying sample sizes, this normalization also allows for comparing the

533 significance of Z statistics derived using each sample size.   The optimal ranking regimes

534 detected by this 'brute-force' algorithm are the most significant ranking sequences in all the

535 running analyses that occur over non-overlapping time windows (e.g., Fig. 2e). Because each

536 ORR's Z statistic is a measure of the regime's concentration of extreme low or high rankings,

537 those statistics can also be used to rank the intensity of a reconstruction's leading drought and

538 pluvial regimes.   However, because Eq. 4's μ_1 and σ_1 null parameters are calculated via a

539 Monte Carlo (MC) process that uses random number generators, the magnitudes of ORR Z

540 statistics can vary slightly between successive applications of the algorithm. This is primarily

541 due to variation in the σ_1 parameter, which can lead to slight variation in the magnitudes of Z

542 statistics in separate runs of the algorithm.

543 In Tables 2 and 3 the five wettest and driest flow regime periods were defined for the Meko et

544 al. (2007) and Woodhouse et al. (2006) reconstructions of Colorado River at Lee's Ferry

545 (CRLF) flow based on the Z statistics of their optimal ranking regimes.   In addition, the

546 longest high and low flow periods were highlighted. When those ORR analyses are repeated

547 twice with different MC simulations the leading regime's Z magnitudes vary slightly from the

548 Table 2 and 3 values, but the ordering of the wettest and driest regimes, and the longest

549 duration periods, are unchanged (Appendix B). As a result, those rankings, and the relative

550 intensity of reconstructed low and high CRLF flow regimes, appear insensitive to variation in

551 the σ_1 parameter from different MC simulations. Although Stockton and Jacoby (1976)

552 identified 1906-1930 as the leading period of high flow in their 450 year CRLF

24

553 reconstruction, the most significant sequence of rankings found here in the Meko et al. and

554 Woodhouse et al. CRLF reconstructions occurred during 1601-1621. In other cases the

555 intensity of ORR drought periods over the interior western U.S. detected here seems

556 inconsistent with previous analyses based on reconstructed summer PDSI. Although Goodrich

557 (2007) and Stahle and Dean (2011) cite the late 16th century drought (Fig. 4a) as the most

558 severe North American drought evident in the tree-ring record during the past 500 years, the

559 drought regimes in the Z-lines outlined in Figs. 4c and d during the 17th century appear

560 stronger in both duration and intensity over the WY-UT-CO region. In the Woodhouse et al.

561 CRLF reconstruction the driest ORR period occurred during 1622-1671 (Table 3). Stahle and

562 Dean (2011) cite 1841-1865 as the most severe drought over the Great Plains and western

563 North America during the 19th century based on reconstructed PDSI analyses, yet that period

564 shows relatively weak evidence of dry regimes in Fig. 4j. Based on the magnitudes of ORR Z

565 statistics, a more intense 19th century drought over the upper Colorado watershed is indicated

566 here during 1870-1904 in Fig. 4l, which is also the Meko et al. CRLF reconstruction's driest

567 period (Fig. 2e, Table 2).

568 For the most part, the ORR analyses conducted here were of streamflow reconstructions from

569 the TreeFlow web data resource (http:/treeflow.info). As described in Section 4.4 and

570 summarized in Fig. 4q, a common pattern in these analyses is that of IMD cycles of drought

571 and pluvial regimes during the late 16th and 17th centuries (Fig. 4a-e), a period with relatively

572 little variability during the 18th century, and the reappearance of alternating drought and

573 pluvial periods during the 19th and early 20th centuries (Fig. 4i-m). Although studies

574 summarizing reconstructed U.S. hydroclimate tend to emphasize extended drought (e.g.,

575 Meko et al. 1995; Woodhouse and Overpeck 1998; Cook et al. 1999; Cole et al. 2002; Cook et

25

576 al. 2007), less attention is generally paid to pluvial periods (Woodhouse et al. 2005).

577 However, over the interior western U.S. the results here indicate two centennial-scale periods

578 marked by drought-pluvial cycles, separated by an 18th century period that was, in a climatic

579 sense, comparatively quiet.

580 But although Fig. 4's individual ORR analyses of reconstructed streamflow show consistent

581 regime patterns, the Table 1 streamflow reconstructions may not be completely independent.

582 As many of these reconstructions were done by individual groups (e.g. Barnett et al. 2010,

583 Wise 2010) and are from adjacent watersheds, some may reflect flow variability estimated

584 from overlapping sets of dendrochronologies. As noted in Section 2, a number of the Table 1

585 reconstructions are for flow for the same rivers at various points in their watershed. Also,

586 because these reconstructions are mostly representative of the upper Colorado watershed and

587 the WY-UT-CO region (Table 1, Fig. 1), Fig. 4's overall regime pattern may not represent

588 variability over the broader western U.S. Whether this is the case might be resolved in the

589 future via an ORR analysis of the more spatially continuous Cook et al. (2007) PDSI

590 reconstructions.

591 However, over the upper Colorado region, the consistency of Fig. 4's reconstructed flow

592 regime patterns does suggest a real signal in centennial-scale hydroclimate. Given the current

593 conception of the role of oceanic mechanisms in driving the IMD hydrology of the upper

594 Colorado River basin (McCabe et al. 2007) and the western U.S. in general (Redmond and

595 Koch, 1991; Cayan et al. 1998; Dai 2013), this leads to questions as to whether those

596 mechanisms may also experience centennial-scale periods of active and dormant variability.

597 As described in Section 4.5, such variation has been noted by Hidalgo (2004) in reconstructed

598 summer PDSI over the western U.S. The leading modes of Hidalgo's (2004) rotated principal

Steven Mauget 7/21/15 5:19 PM
Comment [3]: This paragraph was added

26

599 component analysis of the Cook et al. (1999) summer PDSI reconstructions show common

600 features with the Biondi et al. (2001) PDO reconstruction and the AMO reconstruction of

601 Gray et al. (2004). As a result, he concluded that extended droughts over the interior western

602 U.S. may be a consequence of combined PDO and AMO effects. However, the ORR analyses

603 of four independently derived PDO reconstructions in Figs. A1c-f, which includes the Biondi

604 et al. (2001) reconstruction (PDO-B), show no common regime features.   Appendix A's

605 ORR analyses of a unified ENSO proxy series and of North Atlantic sea-surface temperature

606 anomalies also show no evidence of regime patterns similar to that of Fig. 4q. However, this

607 may not indicate that Fig. 4q's centennial scale signal in reconstructed streamflow occurred

608 independently of oceanic variability. The lack of common regime patterns in the ORR

609 analyses of the Appendix A PDO reconstructions suggests that Pacific decadal variation

610 during the pre-instrumental period is, at this time, essentially unknown. However, the ORR

611 method might be used to indirectly detect that variability. The current approach of inferring

612 the state of the pre-instrumental PDO typically involves comparing tree ring or coral

613 chronologies with observed PDO (Gedalof and Smith, 2001; Biondi et al. 2001; MacDonald

614 and Case, 2005) or Northern Pacific Index (D'Arrigo et al. 2005) data to develop regression

615 models. An alternative approach might involve applying ORR analysis to networks of

616 streamflow or temperature reconstructions around the Pacific basin, e.g., TreeFlow data

617 counterparts in Asia or South America. Consistent regime patterns from ORR analyses of

618 dense networks of Asian and North American reconstructions, or from a transect of

619 reconstructions spanning the western coasts or North and South America (e.g., Villalba et al.

620 2001, 2011), might indirectly show a common low frequency Pacific influence.

621 The ORR method may be a useful option for evaluating IMD variability in reconstructed

27

622   climate records. Because it is based on the analysis of data rankings, it is insensitive to the

623   influence of data outliers and to how data is distributed. The method does not involve the use

624   of subjectively selected thresholds or filters to detect low frequency variation, but instead uses

625   an exhaustive and relatively objective algorithm to find the most significant ranking regimes

626   occurring over a range of IMD time scales. The graphic approach to displaying Z-lines

627   demonstrated here in Figs. 3e and 4 can help to identify consistent regime patterns in

628   numerous reconstructions, and to corroborate variability in reconstructions produced by

629   different investigators using different methods. These features may make the method

630   particularly useful in evaluating the extensive data sets being generated in millennial-scale

631   regional temperature reconstructions (PAGES 2k Consortium 2013). The Z-line diagrams may

632   also highlight climate regimes that appear as outliers relative to those in other data records.

633   Examples in Fig. 4 of such possible behavior are the 99 year low flow regime in the Wind

634   River (R5) reconstruction   during 1561-1659, and the 64 year dry regime in the Canadian

635   River Z-line (R48) during 1845-1908. However, some features of the ORR method may also

636   lead users to consider more traditional methods such as runs analysis (Dracup 1980). Because

637   of it's use of Monte Carlo simulated null parameters, attempts at ranking the intensity and

638   duration of optimal regime periods in a reconstruction series, e.g., as in the CRLF

639   reconstructions in Tables 2 and 3, may require repeated applications of the algorithm to verify

640   rank ordering. It is also possible that runs analysis may be more useful to water managers who

641   need estimates of the probability of a drought or pluvial period of a specified duration (e.g.,

642   Biondi 2002, 2005).

643

Appendix A: ORR Analyses of Pacific and North Atlantic Climate Indices

644
645
646 As in Fig. 2e, Figs. A1a-f show the results of ORR analyses of six reconstructions of North

647 Atlantic and Pacific climate variability during 1500-1998. Table A1 summarizes the first

648 and last years of the reconstructions, their calibration periods where applicable, and

649 references. As these reconstructions follow variation in sea-surface temperature anomalies

650 (SSTA), optimal ranking regimes significant at 95% and 99% confidence levels are marked

651 in Figs. A1 and A2 with the warm shade-cool shade significance scheme shown at the top of

652 Fig. A1. Thus in the analyses of North Atlantic sea-surface temperatures anomalies

653 (NATSSTA)   and a Unified ENSO Proxy (UEP) series red (blue) shades indicate

654 anomalously warm (cool) SSTA regimes over the North Atlantic and equatorial Pacific. In

655 the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) analyses red (blue) shades mark warm (cool) SSTA

656 periods in the Gulf of Alaska and along the western coast of North America.

657 Figure A1a shows IMD regimes of cold and warm NATSSTA conditions derived from the

658 reconstructions of Gray et al. (2004). Figure A1b shows the ORR analysis of the UEP

659 series of McGregor et al. (2010). The UEP series is the leading principal component of a

660 PCA of 10 reconstructions that reflect ENSO variation, and is considered to represent those

661 series' common ENSO signal during 1650-1977. As the low-passed UEP series shows IMD

662 variability similar to that of the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) during the 20th century,

663 McGregor et al. (2010) also consider it as a potential PDO proxy.

664 Figures A1c-f shows the ORR analyses of four PDO reconstructions. The PDO-B (c) series

665 is the reconstruction of Biondi et al. (2001), which was based on Southern California and

666 Northern Baja California tree-ring records and reconstructs Nov.-Mar. PDO variation

667 between 1661 and 1991.   The PDO-D (d) series is   D'Arrigo and Wilson's (2006)

29

668 reconstruction of boreal spring (March-May) PDO during 1565-1988 based on Asian and

669 Siberian tree-ring records. The PDO-M (e) reconstruction of MacDonald and Case (2005)

670 was based on California and Alberta tree-ring records. The PDO-M values reconstruct

671 annual (Jan.-Dec.) PDO during 993-1996, but only the 1500-1996 values were tested in the

672 Fig. A1e ORR analysis. The PDO-S (f) series is Shen et al.'s (2006) reconstruction of

673 annual PDO during 1470-1998 based on a summer drought/flood index derived from

674 Chinese historical documents. Like the PDO-M analysis, only the 1500-1998 PDO-S values

675 were subjected to ORR analysis in Fig. A1f.

676 Figure A2 shows the Z-lines for the NATSSTA, UEP, and PDO-B,D,M, and S ORR

677 analyses, and compares those regime periods with the variation in R1-R53 streamflow

678 regimes plotted in Fig. 4q. Cool PDO regimes are evident in all four PDO reconstructions

679 and the UEP reconstruction during the 1940's to mid-1970's (Fig. A2a) , which generally

680 coincides with the 1947-1976 cool phase period defined by Mantua et al. (1997). Although

681 the UEP, PDO-B and PDO-M reconstructions also show warm PDO regimes during 1905-

682 1915, 1906-1923 and 1906-1928 (Fig. A2b), those periods precede Mantua et al.'s 1925-

683 1946 warm phase PDO period. However, the regimes detected in the PDO-S reconstruction

684 during the 20th century (Fig. A2c) more closely follow Mantua et al.'s PDO phase periods,

685 with warm phase conditions during 1926-1942 and cool phase conditions during 1948-1977.

686 After the mid 1970's, the warm phase regime in the PDO-S reconstruction during 1978-

687 1998 also closely coincides with Mantua et al.'s warm phase period after 1976. But

688 although there is some agreement between the UEP and PDO reconstructions during the

689 instrumental calibration periods (Table A1), there is virtually no agreement in the pre-

690 instrumental period. In the one instance where the Pacific reconstructions show clearly

30

691 concurrent regimes before 1900 those regimes are of opposite sign, i.e., the PDO-M and

692 PDO-D reconstructions roughly coincident cold and warm phase regimes during 1619-1718

693 and 1626-1703 (Fig. A1d). As a result, the PDO and UEP indices show essentially no

694 common behavior in the pre-instrumental period, and when compared with Fig. 4q, no

695 evidence of centennial scale periods of active and inactive variability.

696 In Fig. A2 during the 20th century the optimal ranking regimes of the NATSSTA

697 reconstruction include a 1926-1961 warm regime, which nearly coincides with the 1931-

698 1960 warm phase period defined by Sutton and Hodson (2005). However, Sutton and

699 Hodson (2005) also defined cool North Atlantic SSTA periods during 1905-1925 and

700 1965-1990, which the ORR procedure did not detect in the NATSSTA series at a 95%

701 confidence level. The ORR analysis detected multi-decadal cool regimes in the

702 reconstructed NATSSTA series during 1597-1625 and 1801-1847 and a warm regime

703 during 1656-1696, but, like the Pacific analyses of Figs. A1b-f, show no patterns of

704 centennial variability similar to that of the reconstructed streamflow described in Section 4.4

705 and graphed in Figs. 4q and A2.

706

707   Table A1

	Reconstruction Period	Calibration Period	Reference
708 | | | |
709 | | | |
710 | | | |
711 NATSSTA | 1567-1990 | 1922-1990 | Gray et al. (2004) |
712 | | | |
713 UEP | 1650-1977 | NA | McGregor et al. (2010) |
714 | | | |
715 PDO-B | 1661-1991 | 1962-1991/1925-1954 | Biondi et al. (2001) |
716 | | | |
717 PDO-D | 1565-1988 | 1917-1960 | D'Arrigo and Wilson (2006) |
718 | | | |
719 PDO-M | 993-1996 | 1940-1996 | MacDonald and Case (2005) |
720 | | | |
721 PDO-S | 1470-1998 | 1925-1998 | Shen et al. (2006) |

722
723
724
725 Table A1. Reconstruction periods, calibration periods, and references for the North Atlantic

726 SSTA (NATSSTA), Unified ENSO Proxy (UEP) and PDO-B,D,M, and S reconstructions of

727 Figs. A1a-f.

728

729 **Appendix B**
730

731 Table B1

732 |Z| Rank	Period	Duration (Years)	Z	Period	Duration (Years)	Z
735 1	1601-1621	21	3.497	1870-1904	**35**	-2.727
736 2	1982-1987/1836-1841	6	3.068	1579-1592	14	-2.421
737 3	1905-1928	**24**	2.806	1772-1782	11	-2.344
738 4	1672-1683	12	2.541	1663-1671	9	-2.223
739 5	1741-1747	7	1.966	1622-1632	11	-2.203

740   Wet Periods   Dry Periods

741   Table B1: As in Table 2 with an alternate random number generator seed.

742

743 Table B2

744 |Z| Rank	Period	Duration (Years)	Z	Period	Duration (Years)	Z
747 1	1601-1621	21	3.498	1870-1904	**35**	-2.742
748 2	1982-1987/1836-1841	6	3.064	1579-1592	14	-2.424
749 3	1905-1928	**24**	2.797	1772-1782	11	-2.331
750 4	1672-1683	12	2.523	1663-1671	9	-2.208
751 5	1741-1747	7	1.965	1622-1632	11	-2.191

752   Wet Periods   Dry Periods

753   Table B2: As in Tables 2 and B1 with an alternate random number generator seed.

754

755 Table B3

|Z| Rank	Period	Duration	Z	Period	Duration	Z
1	1601-1621	21	3.491	1622-1671	**50**	-2.679
2	1836-1841	6	3.250	1772-1782	11	-2.441
3	1982-1987	6	3.055	1874-1883	10	-2.196
4	1905-1932	**28**	2.658	1842-1847	6	-1.991
5	1687-1702	16	2.498	1528-1533	6	-1.913
	Wet Periods			Dry Periods		

763   Table B3: As in Table 3 with an alternate random number generator seed.

764

765 Table B4

|Z| Rank	Period	Duration	Z	Period	Duration	Z
1	1601-1621	21	3.498	1622-1671	**50**	-2.677
2	1836-1841	6	3.251	1772-1782	11	-2.449
3	1982-1987	6	3.056	1874-1883	10	-2.192
4	1905-1932	**28**	2.654	1842-1847	6	-1.992
5	1687-1702	16	2.493	1528-1533	6	-1.914
	Wet Periods			Dry Periods		

773   Table B4: As in Tables 3 and B3 with an alternate random number generator seed.

774

775

776

777

34

Program Access and Acknowledgements

778

779 The calc_orr.c program and an associated shell script are available in the supplementary

780 material. Thanks to Matthew Becker and Justin DeRose of the Wasatch Dendroclimatology

781 Research Group for the Weber River flow and Great Salt Lake Level reconstruction data, and

782 to Z'ev Gedalof for the Columbia River flow reconstruction. All figures were produced using

783 Generic Mapping Tools (Wessel and Smith, 1995). The U.S. Department of Agriculture is an

784 equal opportunity provider and employer.

785

786 References

787 Akaike, H.: A new look at the statistical model identification, IEEE T Automat Contr, ac-

788 19, 716-723, 1974.

789 Barnett, F., Gray, S., and Tootle, G.: Upper Green River Basin (United States) streamflow

790 reconstructions, J Hydrol Eng, 15, 567-579, 2010.

791 Bekker, M. F., DeRose, R.J., Buckley, B.M., Kjelgren, R.K., and Gill, N.S. : A 576-year

792 Weber River streamflow reconstruction from tree rings for water resource risk

793 assessment in the Wasatch Front, Utah, J Am Water Resour As, 50, 1338-1348, 2014.

794 Biondi, F., Gershunov, A., and Cayan, D. R.: North Pacific decadal climate variability

795 since 1661, J Climate, 14, 5-10, 2001.

796 Biondi, F., Kozubowski, T. J., and Panorska, A. K.: Stochastic modeling of regime shifts,

797 Climate Res, 23, 23-30, 2002.

798 Biondi, F., Kozubowski, T. J., and Panorska, A. K.: A new model for quantifying climate

799 episodes, Int J Climatol, 25, 1253-1264, 2005.

Steven Mauget 8/3/15 5:12 PM
Comment [4]: This sentence added in response to Reviewer 2 comment.

35

800 Box, G. E. P., and Tiao, G. C.: Intervention analysis with applications to economic and

801 environmental problems, J Am Stat Assoc, 70, 70-79, 1975.

802 Brenneman, D.: Climate of rebellion: The relationship between climate variability and

803 indigenous uprisings in mid-eighteenth-century Sonora, PhD Dissertation, Univ. of

804 Arizona Anthropology Dept., University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ, 2004.

805 Cayan, D. R., Dettinger, M. D., Diaz, H. F., and Graham, N. E.: Decadal variability of

806 precipitation over western North America, J Climate, 11, 3148-3166, 1998.

807 Cole J.E., Overpeck, J.T., and Cook, E.R.: Multiyear La Niña events and persistent

808 drought in the contiguous United States, Geophys Res Lett, 29, 25-1 - 25-4 , 2002.

809 Cook, E. R., Meko, D. M., Stahle, D.W. and Cleaveland, M.K.: Tree Rings, Environment,

810 and Humanity, Eds., Radio- carbon, 155–169.: Tree-ring reconstructions of past

811 drought across the conterminous United States: Tests of a regression method and

812 calibration/verification results. In: Tree Rings, Environment, and Humanity, J. S. Dean,

813 D. M. Meko, T. W. Swetnam (Ed.), Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona

814 ,Radiocarbon, Tucson, 1996.

815 Cook, E. R., Meko, D. M., Stahle, D. W., and Cleaveland, M. K.: Drought Reconstructions

816 for the Continental United States, J Climate, 12, 1145-1162, 1999.

817 Cook, E. R., Woodhouse, C. A., Eakin, C. M., Meko, D. M., and Stahle, D. W.: Long-term

818 aridity changes in the western United States, Science, 306, 1015-1018, 2004.

819 Cook, E. R., Seager, R., Cane, M. A., and Stahle, D. W.: North American drought:

820 Reconstructions, causes, and consequences, Earth-Science Reviews, 81, 93-134, 2007.

821 Cordero, E., Kessomkiat, W., Abatzoglou, J., and Mauget, S.: The identification of distinct

822 patterns in California temperature trends, Climatic Change, 108, 357-382, 2011.

823   Creasman, P. P., Bannister, B., Towner, R. H., Dean, J. S., and Leavitt, S. W.: Reflections

824   on the foundation, persistence, and growth of the Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research,

825   circa 1930–1960, Tree-Ring Research, 68, 81-89, 2012.

826   D'Arrigo, R. and Wilson, R.: On the Asian expression of the PDO, Int J Climatol, 26,

827   1607-1617, 2006.

828   D'Arrigo, R., Wilson, R., Deser, C., Wiles, G., Cook, E., Villalba, R., Tudhope, A., Cole, J.,

829   and Linsley, B.: Tropical–North Pacific climate linkages over the past four centuries, J

830   Climate, 18, 5253-5265, 2005.

831   Dai, A.: The influence of the inter-decadal Pacific oscillation on US precipitation during

832   1923–2010, Climate Dynamics, 41, 633-646, 2013.

833   DeRose, R. J., Wang, S.-Y., Buckley, B. M., and Bekker, M. F.: Tree-ring reconstruction of

834   the level of Great Salt Lake, USA, The Holocene, 24, 805-813, 2014.

835   Dracup, J. A., Lee, K. S., and Paulson, E.G. : On the Definition of Droughts, Water Resour

836   Res, 16, 297-302, 1980.

837   Fritts, H. C.: Tree Rings and Climate, Academic Press, London, 1976.

838   Fye, F. K., Stahle, D. W., and Cook, E. R.: Paleoclimatic Analogs to Twentieth-Century

839   Moisture Regimes Across the United States, B Am Meteorol Soc, 84, 901-909, 2003.

840   Gedalof, Z., and Smith, D.J.: Interdecadal climate variability and regime-scale shifts in

841   Pacific North America, Geophys Res Lett, 28, 1515-1518, 2001.

842   Gedalof, Z., Peterson, D.L., and Mantua N.: Columbia River Flow and Drought since

843   1750, J Am Water Resour As, 2004. 1579-1592, 2004.

844   Goodrich, G. B.: Multidecadal Climate Variability and Drought in the United States,

845   Geography Compass, 1, 713-738, 2007.

37

846 Gray, S.T., Betancourt, J.L., Fastie, C.L., and Jackson, S.T.: Patterns and sources of

847 multidecadal oscillations in drought-sensitive tree-ring records from the central and

848 southern Rocky Mountains, Geophys Res Lett, 30, DOI: 10.1029/2002GL016154, 2003.

849 Gray, S.T., Graumlich, L.J., Betancourt, J.L., and Pederson, G.T.: A tree-ring based

850 reconstruction of the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation since 1567 A.D., Geophys Res

851 Lett, 31, L12205, doi:10.1029/2004GL019932, 2004.

852 Gray, S. T., Lukas, J. J., and Woodhouse, C. A.: Millennial-Length Records of Streamflow

853 From Three Major Upper Colorado River Tributaries, J Am Water Resour As, 47, 702-

854 712, 2011.

855 Griffin, R. D.: A 600-Year Streamflow History in the Salinas Valley Reconstructed from

856 Blue Oak Tree Rings, M.A. Thesis, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, 67 pp., 2007.

857 Hidalgo, H. G.: Climate precursors of multidecadal drought variability in the western

858 United States, Water Resour Res, 40, W12504, 2004.

859 Hidalgo, H. G., Piechota, T. C., and Dracup, J. A.: Alternative principal components

860 regression procedures for dendrohydrologic reconstructions, Water Resour Res, 36,

861 3241-3249, 2000.

862 Hirschboeck, K. K. and Meko., D. M.: The Current Drought In Context: A Tree-Ring

863 Based Evaluation of Water Supply Variability for the Salt-Verde River Basin Final

864 Report, University of Arizona Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research & The Salt River

865 Project, Tucson, AZ, 29 pp., 2008.

866 Hoerling, M., Hurrell, J., Kumar, A., Terray, L., Eischeid, J., Pegion, P., Zhang, T., Quan, X.,

867 and Xu, T.: On North American Decadal Climate for 2011–20, J Climate, 24, 4519-4528,

868 2011.

869 Hollander, M. and Wolfe, D. A.: Nonparameteric Statistical Methods, Wiley and Sons,

870 Hoboken, 1999.

871 Hundley, N.: Water and the West: The Colorado River Compact and the Politics of

872 Water in the American West, University of California Press, Oakland, CA, 2009.

873 MacDonald, G. M. and Case, R. A.: Variations in the Pacific Decadal Oscillation over the

874 past millennium, Geophys Res Lett, 32, L08703, doi: 10.1029/2005GL022478, 2005.

875 MacDonnell, L. J., Getches, D. H., and Hugenberg, W. C.: The Law of the Colorado River:

876 Coping with Severe Sustained Drought, J Am Water Resour As , 31, 825-836, 1995.

877 Mann, H. B. and Whitney, D. R.: On a Test of Whether One of Two Random Variables is

878 Stochastically Larger than the Other, Ann Math Stat, 18, 50-60, 1947.

879 Mantua, N. J., Hare, S. R., Zhang, Y., Wallace, J. M., and Francis, R. C.: A Pacific

880 Interdecadal Climate Oscillation with Impacts on Salmon Production, B Am Meteorol

881 Soc, 78, 1069-1079, 1997.

882 Mantua, N. J. and Hare, S. R.: The Pacific Decadal Oscillation, J Oceanogr, 58, 35-44,

883 2002.

884 Margolis, E. Q., Meko, D. M., and Touchan, R.: A tree-ring reconstruction of streamflow

885 in the Santa Fe River, New Mexico, J Hydrol, 397, 118-127, 2011.

886 Masiokas, M. H., Villalba, R., Christie, D. A., Betman, E., Luckman, B. H., Le Quesne, C.,

887 Prieto, M. R., and Mauget, S.: Snowpack variations since AD 1150 in the Andes of Chile

888 and Argentina (30°–37°S) inferred from rainfall, tree-ring and documentary records, J

889 Geophys Res-Atmos, 117, D05112, doi: 10.1029/2011JD016748, 2012.

890 Mauget, S. A.: Intra- to Multidecadal Climate Variability over the Continental United

891 States: 1932–99, J Climate, 16, 2215-2231, 2003a.

39

892   Mauget, S. A.: Multidecadal Regime Shifts in U.S. Streamflow, Precipitation, and

893   Temperature at the End of the Twentieth Century, J Climate, 16, 3905-3916, 2003b.

894   Mauget, S. A.: Low Frequency Streamflow Regimes over the Central United States:

895   1939–1998, Climatic Change, 63, 121-144, 2004.

896   Mauget, S. A., and E. C. Cordero. : Optimal Ranking Regime Analysis of Intra- to Multi-

897   Decadal U.S. Climate Variability. Part I: Temperature. J Climate, 27,9006-9026, 2014a.

898   Mauget, S., and E. C. Cordero.: Optimal Ranking Regime Analysis of Intra- to Multi-

899   decadal U.S. Climate Variability. Part II: Precipitation and Streamflow, J Climate. 27,

900   9027-9049, 2014b.

901   McCabe, G. J. and Wolock, D. M.: Variability Common to Global Sea Surface

902   Temperatures and Runoff in the Conterminous United States, J Hydrometeorol, 15,

903   714-725, 2013.

904   McCabe, G. J., Palecki, M.A., and J. Betancourt, J.L.: Pacific and Atlantic Ocean influences

905   on multidecadal drought frequency in the United States, P Natl Acad Sci USA, 101,

906   4136–4141, 2004.

907   McCabe, G. J., Betancourt, J. L., and Hidalgo, H. G.: Associations of Decadal to

908   Multidecadal Sea-Surface Temperature Variability with Upper Colorado River Flow, J

909   Am Water Resour As, 43, 183-192, 2007.

910   McGregor, S., Timmermann, A., Timm, O.: A unified proxy for ENSO and PDO variability

911   since 1650, Clim Past, 1-17, 2010.

912   Meko, D.: Dendroclimatic Reconstruction with Time Varying Predictor Subsets of Tree

913   Indices, J Climate, 10, 687-696, 1997.

914 Meko, D., Stockton, C. W., and Boggess, W. R.: The tree ring record of severe sustained

915 drought., J Am Water Resour As, 31, 789-801, 1995.

916 Meko, D. M., Therrell, M. D., Baisan, C. H., and Hughes, M. K.: Sacramento river flow

917 reconstructed to A.D. 869 from tree rings, J Am Water Resour As, 37, 1029-1039, 2001.

918 Meko, D. M., Woodhouse, C. A., Baisan, C. A., Knight, T., Lukas, J. J., Hughes, M. K., and

919 Salzer, M. W.: Medieval drought in the upper Colorado River Basin, Geophys Res Lett,

920 34, L10705, doi:10.1029/2007GL029988, 2007.

921 Meko, D. M. and Woodhouse, C.W.: Application of Streamflow Reconstruction to Water

922 Resources Management. In: Dendroclimatology: Progress and Prospects, Hughes, M. K.,

923 , T.W. Swetnam and H.F. Diaz (Ed.), Developments in Paleoenvironmental Research,

924 Springer, New York, 231-261, 2011.

925 Mendenhall, W., Wackerly, D.D. and Sheaffer, R.L.: Mathematical Statistics with

926 Applications. PWS-Kent, Boston, 1990.

927 Nash, S. E.: Time, Trees, and Prehistory: Tree Ring Dating and the Development of

928 North American Archaeology 1914-1950, The University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City,

929 1999.

930 Pagano, T., Pasteris, P., Dettinger, M., Cayan, D., and Redmond, K.: Water year 2004:

931 Western water managers feel the heat, Eos, Transactions American Geophysical Union,

932 85, 385-393, 2004.

933 PAGES 2k Consortium.: Continental-scale temperature variability during the past two

934 millennia, Nat Geosci, 6, 339-346, 2013.

935 Piechota, T., Timilsena, J., Tootle, G. and Hidalgo, H: The western U.S.. drought: How bad

936 is it? Eos, Transactions, American Geophysical Union, 85, 301-308, 2004

937 Redmond, K. T. and Koch, R. W.: Surface Climate and Streamflow Variability in the

938 Western United States and Their Relationship to Large-Scale Circulation Indices, Water

939 Resour Res, 27, 2381-2399, 1991.

940 Rice, J. L., Woodhouse, C.A., and Lukas, J.J.: Science and Decision Making: Water

941 Management and Tree-Ring Data in the Western United States, J Am Water Resour As,

942 45, 1248-1259, 2009.

943 Salas J.D, Delleur, J.W., Yevjevich, V.M., and Lane, W.L. : Applied Modelling of Hydrologic

944 Time Series, Water Resources Publication, Littleton, CO, 1980.

945 Shen, C., Wang, W., Gong, W., Hao, Z.: A Pacific Decadal Oscillation record since 1470 AD

946 reconstructed from proxy data of summer rainfall over eastern China, Geophys Res

947 Lett, 33, L03702, doi:10.1029/2005GL024804, 2006.

948 Schubert, S. D., Suarez, M. J., Pegion, P. J., Koster, R. D., and Bacmeister, J. T.: Causes of

949 Long-Term Drought in the U.S. Great Plains, J Climate, 17, 485-503, 2004.

950 Schubert, S. D., Suarez, M. J., Pegion, P. J., Koster, R. D., and Bacmeister, J. T.: Potential

951 Predictability of Long-Term Drought and Pluvial Conditions in the U.S. Great Plains, J

952 Climate, 21, 802-816, 2008.

953 Solomon, A., Goddard, L., Kumar, A., Carton, J., Deser, C., Fukumori, I., Greene, A. M.,

954 Hegerl, G., Kirtman, B., Kushnir, Y., Newman, M., Smith, D., Vimont, D., Delworth, T.,

955 Meehl, G. A., and Stockdale, T.: Distinguishing the Roles of Natural and

956 Anthropogenically Forced Decadal Climate Variability, B Am Meteorol Soc, 92, 141-

957 156, 2010.

958 Stahle, D. W. and Dean, J. S.: North American Tree Rings, Climate Extremes, and Social

959 Disasters. In: Dendroclimatology: Progress and Prospects, M.K. Hughes, T. W. S., and

960   H.F. Diaz (Ed.), Developments in Paleoenvironmental Research, Springer, New York,

961   297-327, 2011.

962   Stahle, D. W., Cook, E. R., Cleaveland, M. K., Therrell, M. D., Meko, D. M., Grissino-Mayer,

963   H. D., Watson, E., and Luckman, B. H.: Tree-ring Data Document 16th Century

964   Megadrought Over North America, Eos, Transactions, American Geophysical Union, 81,

965   121-125, 2000.

966   Stahle, D. W., Therrell, M. D., Cleaveland, M. K., Cayan, D. R., Dettinger, M. D., and

967   Knowles, N.: Ancient blue oaks reveal human impact on San Francisco Bay salinity, Eos,

968   Transactions American Geophysical Union, 82, 141-145, 2001.

969   Stahle, D.W. Fye, F.K, Cook, E.R., Griffin, R. D.: Tree-ring reconstructed megadroughts

970   over North America since A.D. 1300, Climatic Change, 83, 133-149, 2007.

971   Stockton, C. W., and Jacoby, G. C.: Long-term surface-water supply and streamflow

972   trends in the Upper Colorado River Basin, Lake Powell., Natl. Sci. Found. (Ed.),

973   Arlington, VA, 1976.

974   Sutton, R. T. and Hodson, D. L. R.: Atlantic Ocean Forcing of North American and

975   European Summer Climate, Science, 309, 115-118, 2005.

976   Villalba, R., Luckman, B. H., Bosinsegna, J., D'Arrigo, R. D., Lara, A., Villenueva-Diaz, J.,

977   Masiokas, M., Argollo, J., Soliz, C., LeQuesne, C., Stahle, D. W., Roig, F., Aravena, J. C.,

978   Hughes, M. K., Wiles, G., Jacoby, G., Hartsough, P., Wilson, R. J. S., Watson, E., Cook, E. R.,

979   Serano-Paredes, J., Therrell, M., Cleaveland, M., Morales, M. S., Graham, N. E., Moya, J.,

980   Pacajes, J., Massacchesi, G., Biondi, F., Urrutia, R., and Pastur, G. M.: Dendroclimatology

981   from Regional to Continental Scales: Understandimg Regional Processes to

982   Reconstruct Large Scale Climate Variations Across the Western Americas. In:

43

983 Dendroclimatology: Progress and Prospects, M.K. Hughes, Swetnam, T. W., and Diaz, H.

984 F. (Eds.), Springer, New York, 175-227, 2011.

985 Villalba, R., R. D'Arrigo, E. Cook, G. Wiles, and G. Jacoby: Decadal-scale climatic

986 variability along the extratropical western coast of the Americas: Evidence from tree-

987 ring records. In: Inter-Hemispheric Climate Linkages, Markgraf, V. (Ed.), Academic

988 Press, San Diego, 155-172, 2001.

989 Watson, T. A., Anthony, B.F., Gray, S. T., and Tootle, G. A.: Reconstructed Streamflows

990 for the Headwaters of the Wind River, Wyoming, United States, J Am Water Resour As,

991 45, 224-236, 2009.

992 Wessel, P. and Smith, W. H. F.: New version of the generic mapping tools, Eos,

993 Transactions American Geophysical Union, 76, 329-329, 1995.

994 Wilks, D. S.: Statistical Methods in the Atmospheric Sciences, Academic Press, San Diego ,

995 1995.

996 Wise, E. K.: Tree ring record of streamflow and drought in the upper Snake River,

997 Water Resour Res, 46, W11529, doi: 10.1029/2010WR009282, 2010.

998 Woodhouse, C. A. and Lukas, J. J.: Multi-Century Tree-Ring Reconstructions of Colorado

999 Streamflow for Water Resource Planning, Climatic Change, 78, 293-315, 2006a.

1000 Woodhouse, C.A. and Lukas, J. J.: Streamflow Reconstructions for Boulder Creek, South

1001 Boulder Creek, and the Colorado River., City of Boulder and Hydrosphere Resource

1002 Consultants, Boulder, CO, 2006b.

1003 Woodhouse, C.A. and Lukas., J. J.: Tree-ring reconstruction of Clear Creek annual

1004 streamflow, 1566-2002, Report to City of Westminster, Westminster, CO, 2006c.

1005   Woodhouse, C. A. and Overpeck, J. T.: 2000 Years of Drought Variability in the Central

1006   United States, B Am Meteorol Soc, 79, 2693-2714, 1998.

1007   Woodhouse, C. A., Lukas, J. J., and Brown, P. M.: Drought in the Western Great Plains,

1008   1845–56, B Am Meteorol Soc, 83, 1485-1493, 2002.

1009   Woodhouse, C.A., Kunkel, K.E., Easterling, D.R., and Cook, E.R.: The twentieth-century

1010   pluvial in the western United States, Geophys Res Lett, 32, L07701, doi:

1011   10.1029/2005GL022413, 2005.

1012   Woodhouse, C. A., Gray, S. T., and Meko, D. M.: Updated streamflow reconstructions for

1013   the Upper Colorado River Basin, Water Resour Res, 42, W05415,

1014   doi:10.1029/2005WR004455, 2006.

1015

1016

1017

1018   Table 1
1019

1020	R#	Location	Begin Year	End Year	R2	RE	Citation
1021							
1022							
1023	1	Columbia R. at Dalles OR	1750	1987	0.25	0.24	Gedalof et al. 2004
1024	2	Snake R. near Heise, ID	1591	2005	0.63	0.59	Wise 2010
1025	3	Snake R. near Irwin, ID	1591	2005	0.66	0.59	Wise 2010
1026	4	Snake R. near Moran, WY	1591	2005	0.56	0.52	Wise 2010
1027	5	Wind R. near Dubois, WY	1560	1992	0.45	0.36	Watson et al. 2009
1028	6	Little Popo Agie R. near Lander, WY	1560	1999	0.58	0.5	Watson et al. 2009
1029	7	Green R. near Daniel, WY	1615	1999	0.44	0.38	Barnett et al.2010
1030	8	Pine Creek above Fremont Lake, WY	1615	1999	0.53	0.48	Barnett et al.2010
1031	9	East Fork R. near Big Sandy, WY	1615	1999	0.58	0.51	Barnett et al.2010
1032	10	Hams Fork near Frontier, WY	1615	1999	0.48	0.43	Barnett et al.2010
1033	11	Fontanelle Creek near Fontanelle, WY	1615	1999	0.48	0.39	Barnett et al.2010
1034	12	Green r. below Fontanelle Reservoir, WY	1615	1999	0.59	0.52	Barnett et al.2010
1035	13	Green R. near Green River, WY	1525	1997	0.48	0.38	Woodhouse et al. 2006
1036	14	Green R. near Green River, WY	1615	1999	0.6	0.54	Barnett et al.2010
1037	15	Great Salt Lake Level Reconstruction	1429	2005	0.5	0.2	DeRose et al. 2014
1038	16	Weber R. near Oakley, Utah	1429	2004	0.49	0.29	Bekker et al. 2014
1039	17	Green River near Greendale, UT	1615	1999	0.65	0.58	Barnett et al.2010
1040	18	Yampa River near Maybell, CO	1000	2002	0.6	0.56	Gray et al. 2011
1041	19	Colorado R. at Hot Sulphur Springs, CO	1566	2002	0.7	0.67	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006b
1042	20	Fraser R. at Granby, CO	1383	1999	0.73	0.69	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1043	21	Willow Creek Reservoir Inflow, CO	1383	1999	0.73	0.67	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1044	22	Colorado R. near Granby, CO	1383	1999	0.67	0.59	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1045	23	Cache la Poudre R. at Canyon Mouth, CO	1615	1999	0.64	0.56	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1046	24	Big Thompson R. at Mouth of Canyon, CO	1569	1999	0.72	0.65	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1047	25	St Vrain R. at Lyons, CO	1571	1999	0.65	0.61	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1048	26	Boulder Creek near Orodell, CO	1566	2002	0.64	0.6	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006b
1049	27	S. Boulder Creek near Eldorado Springs, CO	1566	2002	0.69	0.65	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006b
1050	28	Clear Creek near Golden, CO	1566	2002	0.7	0.66	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006c
1051	29	N. Fork of South Platte R. at South Platte, CO	1685	1987	0.67	0.61	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1052	30	South Platte R. at South Platte, CO	1634	2002	0.76	0.71	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1053	31	South Platte R. below Cheesman Lake, CO	1685	1987	0.63	0.58	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1054	32	Fraser R. at Winter Park, CO	1437	2002	0.67	0.62	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1055	33	Williams Fork R. near Leal, CO	1437	2002	0.67	0.62	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1056	34	Blue R. at Dillon, CO	1437	2002	0.63	0.59	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1057	35	Blue R. above Green Mountain Reservoir, CO	1539	1999	0.76	0.7	Woodhouse and Lukas 2006a
1058	36	Colorado River near Kremmling, CO	1440	2002	0.7	0.64	**/upco/coloradokremmling.html
1059	37	Roaring Fork River at Glenwood Springs, CO	1402	1999	0.69	0.63	**/upco/roaringfork.html

Steven Mauget 8/3/15 1:35 PM
Comment [5]: ** added here

Steven Mauget 8/3/15 1:35 PM
Comment [6]: ** added here

1060 Table 1 (Cont.)

1061

R#	Location	Begin Year	End Year	R2	RE	Citation
38	Colorado River at Glenwood Springs, CO	1525	1997	0.72	0.65	Woodhouse et al. 2006
39	White River near Watson, UT	1000	2002	0.61	0.58	Gray et al. 2011
40	Colorado River near Cisco, UT	1569	1997	0.77	0.73	Woodhouse et al. 2006
41	Gunnison River near Grand Junction, CO	1569	1997	0.77	0.73	Woodhouse et al. 2006
42	Gunnison River at Crystal Reservoir, CO	1569	1997	0.69	0.64	Woodhouse et al. 2006
43	Arkansas River at Canon City, CO	1685	1987	0.63	0.58	**/ark/arkansascanoncity.html
44	Saguache Creek near Saguache, CO	1520	2000	0.7	0.63	**/riogr/saguache.html
45	Rio Grande near Del Norte, CO	1508	2002	0.71	0.69	**/riogr/riograndedelnorte.html
46	Conejos River near Mogote, CO	1508	2002	0.67	0.63	**/riogr/conejos.html
47	Animas River at Durango, CO	1470	2002	0.82	0.8	**/upco/animas.html
48	Canadian R. near Sanchez, NM	1604	1997	0.61	0.51	**/ark/canadian.html
49	Rio Grande at Otowi Bridge, NM	1450	2002	0.74	0.72	**/riogr/riograndeotowinrcs.html
50	Santa Fe River near Santa Fe, NM	1592	2007	0.6	0.54	Margolis et al. 2011
51	Colorado River at Lees Ferry, AZ	762	2005	0.57	0.54	Meko et al. 2007
52	Colorado River at Lees Ferry, AZ	1490	1997	0.81	0.76	Woodhouse et al. 2006
53	Sum of Salt-Verde-Tonto waterways, AZ	1330	2005	0.49	0.45	Hirschboeck and Meko 2008
54	Salinas R. at Paso Robles, CA	1409	2003	0.73	0.68	Griffin 2007
55	Sacramento River - Four Rivers Index	901	1977	0.62	0.55	Meko 2001
56	Feather River inflow to Lake Oroville, CA	901	1977	0.61	0.54	Meko 2001
57	San Francisco Bay Salinity	1604	1997	0.82	0.8	Stahle et al. 2001

1085

1086 **Table 1**. Reconstruction number, location, beginning year, ending year, calibration period

1087 R^2, validation period reduction of error (RE), and citations or URLs (** = http://treeflow.info

1088) for the reconstructions evaluated here.

1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099

1100 Table 2

1101 |Z| Rank	Period	Duration	Z	Period	Duration	Z
1102 1	1601-1621	21	3.498	1870-1904	**35**	-2.742
1103 2	1982-1987/1836-1841	6	3.063	1579-1592	14	-2.419
1104 3	1905-1928	**24**	2.804	1772-1782	11	-2.332
1105 4	1672-1683	12	2.530	1663-1671	9	-2.209
1106 5	1741-1747	7	1.966	1622-1632	11	-2.192
1107	Wet Periods			Dry Periods		

1108 **Table 2** Periods, durations, and Mann Whitney Z statistics of the five wettest and driest

1109 ranking regimes in the ORR analysis of Meko et al.'s (2007) reconstruction of Colorado

1110 River flow at Lee's Ferry annual flow during 1500-2005. Bold duration numbers mark the

1111 longest wet and dry regime period.

1112 Table 3

1113 |Z| Rank	Period	Duration	Z	Period	Duration	Z
1114 1	1601-1621	21	3.496	1622-1671	**50**	-2.695
1115 2	1836-1841	6	3.230	1772-1782	11	-2.441
1116 3	1982-1987	6	3.036	1874-1883	10	-2.171
1117 4	1905-1932	**28**	2.647	1842-1847	6	-1.980
1118 5	1687-1702	16	2.486	1528-1533	6	-1.902
1119	Wet Periods			Dry Periods		

1120 **Table 3** Periods, durations, and Mann Whitney Z statistics of the five wettest and driest

1121 ranking regimes in the ORR analysis of Woodhouse et al.'s (2006) reconstruction of

1122 Colorado River flow at Lee's Ferry annual flow during 1500-1997. Bold duration numbers

1123 mark the longest wet and dry regime periods.

48

1124   Table A1

	Reconstruction Period	Calibration Period	Reference
NATSSTA	1567-1990	1922-1990	Gray et al. (2004)
UEP	1650-1977	NA	McGregor et al. (2010)
PDO-B	1661-1991	1962-1991/1925-1954	Biondi et al. (2001)
PDO-D	1565-1988	1917-1960	D'Arrigo and Wilson (2006)
PDO-M	993-1996	1940-1996	MacDonald and Case (2005)
PDO-S	1470-1998	1925-1998	Shen et al. (2006)

1142 Table A1. Reconstruction periods, calibration periods, and references for the North Atlantic

1143 SSTA (NATSSTA), Unified ENSO Proxy (UEP) and PDO-B,D,M, and S reconstructions of

1144 Figs. A1a-f.

Figure Captions

Figure 1: Locations of the USGS gauge stations associated with the Table 1 flow reconstructions and the locations of San Francisco Bay and the Great Salt Lake.

Figure 2: a) Time series of Colorado River at Lee's Ferry reconstructed water year total natural flow (CRLF) during 1500-2005. b) Mann-Whitney Z statistics of ranked reconstructed flow values sampled over running 21 year time windows. Horizontal lines indicate two-sided 95% (Z= ±1.96) and 99% (Z = ±2.575) confidence intervals. c) As in (a) with horizontal extent of colored bars showing significant 21 year low and high flow ranking regimes as indicated in (b). Vertical placement of bars show corresponding Z values as marked by right axis. Color scheme on left axis shows positive and negative significance at 95%, and 99% confidence levels. d) As in (c) with significant low and high flow ranking regimes indicated by running Mann-Whitney Z analyses with 6,7,…,100 year sampling windows. e) The optimally significant low and high flow ranking regimes in (d) occurring over non-overlapping time windows.

Figure 3. a) As in Fig. 2e for the reconstructed flow of the Columbia River at The Dalles during 1750-1987. b) As in Fig. 2e for the reconstructed level of the Great Salt Lake during 1500-2005. c) As in Fig. 2e for the reconstructed Sacramento River - Four Rivers Index during 1500-1977. d) As in Fig. 2e for reconstructed San Francisco Bay salinity during 1604-1997. c) The optimal ranking regimes in Figs. 2e and 3a-d plotted as Z-lines. The significance shading scheme for Z statistics is as shown at the top.

50

1172 Figure 4. Z-lines for the optimal ranking regimes found in each of the Table 1

1173 reconstructions. The vertical axis marks the corresponding reconstruction number as found

1174 in Table 1. The vertical axis' yellow, cyan, violet, and green shaded regions mark Z-lines

1175 from reconstructions in the similarly shaded states in Fig. 1. Positive and negative

1176 significance at 95%, and 99% confidence levels is marked by the shading scheme at the top

1177 of Fig. 3. The a-p black frames outline regime features discussed in the text. q) The

1178 percentage of R1-R57 Z-lines that indicate significant drought or pluvial conditions ($|Z| \geq$

1179 1.96) during 1500-2000. Green traces indicate the percentage of lines in a pluvial regime,

1180 and orange traces show the percentage of lines in a drought regime during each year.

1181

1182 Figure A1. a) Optimal ranking regime analysis of the North Atlantic SSTA reconstruction of

1183 Gray et al. (2004). b) As in (a) for the Unified ENSO Proxy of McGregor et al. (2010). c)

1184 As in (a) for the PDO reconstruction of Biondi et al. (2001). d) As in (a) for the PDO

1185 reconstruction of D'Arrigo and Wilson (2006). e) As in (a) for the PDO reconstruction of

1186 MacDonald and Case (2005). f) As in (a) for the PDO reconstruction of Shen et al. (2006).

1187

1188 Figure A2. The optimal ranking regimes in Figs. A1e-f plotted as Z-lines. The significance

1189 shading scheme for Z statistics is as shown at the top of Fig. A1. The a-d black frames

1190 outline regime features discussed in the Appendix A text. The lower figure reproduces Fig.

1191 4q, which shows the percentage of Fig. 4's R1-R53 Z-lines that indicate significant drought

1192 or pluvial conditions ($|Z| \geq 1.96$) during 1500-2000. Green traces indicate the percentage of

1193 lines in a pluvial regime, and orange traces show the percentage of lines in a drought

1194 regime during each year.

Steven Mauget 8/3/15 1:36 PM
Comment [7]: This changed to R1-R57