

Dear Climate of the Past Editor,

First of all, we warmly thank you for the observations that further improve our manuscript. Please find the uploaded manuscript and figures corrected with suggestions.

Specifically:

- We changed throughout the text *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* instead of morozovellids and acarininids. Micropaleontologists dealing with planktic foraminifera are used to discussing genera with 'ids'. (We could cite lots of papers by Wade, Premoli Silva, Boersma, Pearson, etc.). In fact, the two referees B. Wade and P. Pearson did not object to this issue. The 'ids', termination (not Latin) is not included within the Zoological code, and we suspect an origin to avoid the frequent use of italics. However, we realize that the double terminology may be confusing for non-foraminiferal specialists and we have amended the text and Figure 1 accordingly.

- While no referees pointed the problem, we have added in Figure 1 a line in the foraminiferal zonation column since we omitted a zonal boundary (between P4c and P5).

- We added a sentence about the complexity to identify the EECO termination.

- We changed figure 2 updating paleolatitudes for Sites 577, 1258 and 1051 (Van Hinsbergen et al., 2015). The Possagno paleolatitude is still according to <http://www.odsn.de/services/paleomap.html> since it is located in an unconstrained plate and the updated paleolatitude it is not yet available at www.paleolatitude.org.

- We changed ELMO with Elmo (as it is usually cited in the literature).

Going back to the history of this curious name, we find that the original given name is the acronym of Eocene Layer of Mysterious Origin (Leg 208, Preliminary report, 2003; p. 35). In truth, we believe that good colleagues firstly thought of the red doll Sesame street character Elmo and then they found an appropriate acronym. Nonetheless, we modified.

Finally, we followed all remaining minor corrections suggested. Changes/corrections are in red color.

Sincerely,

Valeria Luciani on behalf of co-authors

1 **Major perturbations in the global carbon cycle and photosymbiont-bearing**
2 **planktic foraminifera during the early Eocene**

3

4

5 Valeria Luciani¹, Gerald R. Dickens^{2,3}, Jan Backman², Eliana Fornaciari⁴, Luca Giusberti⁴,
6 Claudia Agnini⁴, Roberta D'Onofrio¹

7

8

9 ¹Department of Physics and Earth Sciences, Ferrara University, Polo Scientifico Tecnologico, via G.
10 Saragat 1, 44100, Ferrara, Italy

11 ²Department of Geological Sciences, Stockholm University, SE-10691 Stockholm, Sweden

12 ³Department of Earth Science, Rice University, Houston, TX 77005, USA

13 ⁴Department of Geosciences, Padova University, via G. Gradenigo 6, 35131, Padova, Italy

14

15

16 *Correspondence to:* V. Luciani (valeria.luciani@unife.it)

17

18

19 **Abstract.** A marked switch in the abundance of the planktic foraminiferal genera
20 *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* occurred at low-latitude sites near the start of the Early Eocene
21 Climatic Optimum (EECO), a multi-million-year interval when Earth surface temperatures
22 reached their Cenozoic maximum. Stable carbon and oxygen isotope data of bulk sediment
23 are presented from across the EECO at two locations: Possagno in northeast Italy, and DSDP
24 Site 577 in the northwest Pacific. Relative abundances of planktic foraminifera are presented
25 from these two locations, as well as from ODP Site 1051 in the northwest Atlantic. All three
26 sections have good stratigraphic markers, and the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records at each section can be
27 correlated amongst each other and to $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records at other locations across the globe. These
28 records show that a series of negative carbon isotope excursions (CIEs) occurred before,
29 during and across the EECO, which is defined here as the interval between the J event and the
30 base of *Discoaster subloidoensis*. Significant though ephemeral modifications in planktic
31 foraminiferal assemblages coincide with some of the short-term CIEs, which were marked by
32 increases in the relative abundance of *Acarinina* acarininids, similar to what happened across
33 established hyperthermal events in Tethyan settings prior to the EECO. Most crucially, a
34 temporal link exists between the onset of the EECO, carbon cycle changes during this time,
35 and the decline of morozovellids *Morozovella*. Possible causes are multiple, and may include
36 temperature effects on photosymbiont-bearing planktic foraminifera and changes in ocean
37 chemistry.

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46 **1 Introduction**

47

48 Cenozoic Earth surface temperatures attained their warmest long-term state during the Early
49 Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO). This was a 2-4 Myr time interval (discussed below)
50 centered at ca. 51 Ma (**Figure 1**), when average high latitude temperatures exceeded those at
51 present-day by at least 10°C (Zachos et al., 2008; Bijl et al., 2009; Huber and Caballero,
52 2011; Hollis et al., 2012; Pross et al., 2012; Inglis et al., 2015). Several short-term (<200 kyr)
53 global warming events (**Figure 1**) occurred before the EECO. The Paleocene Eocene
54 Thermal Maximum (PETM) provides the archetypical example: about 55.9 Ma
55 (Vandenbergh et al., 2012; Hilgen et al., 2015) temperatures soared an additional 5-6°C
56 relative to background conditions (Sluijs et al., 2006, 2007; Dunkley Jones et al., 2013).
57 Evidence exists for at least two other significant Eocene warming events (Cramer et al., 2003;
58 Lourens et al., 2005; Röhl et al., 2005; Thomas et al., 2006; Nicolo et al., 2007; Agnini et al.,
59 2009; Coccioni et al., 2012; Lauretano et al., 2015; Westerhold et al., 2015): one ca. 54.1 Ma
60 and named H-1 or Eocene Thermal Maximum 2 (ETM-2, also referred as the ~~ELMO~~ **Elmo**
61 event), and one at 52.8 Ma and variously named K, X, or ETM-3 (hereafter called K/X).
62 However, additional brief warming events may have spanned the early Eocene (above
63 references; Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014), and the EECO may comprise a series of successive
64 events (Slotnick et al., 2012). Both long-term and short-term intervals of warming
65 corresponded to major changes in global carbon cycling, although the precise timing between
66 these parameters remains insufficiently resolved.

67 In benthic foraminiferal stable isotope records for the early Paleogene (**Figure 1**), $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
68 serves as a proxy for deep-water temperature, while $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ relates to the composition of deep-
69 water dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC). The highest $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the Cenozoic occurred at
70 ca. 58 Ma. From this Paleocene Carbon Isotope Maximum (PCIM), benthic foraminiferal

71 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values plunge by approximately 2.5 ‰ to reach a near Cenozoic minimum at or near the
72 start of the EECO, and subsequently rise by approximately 1.5 ‰ across this interval
73 (Shackleton and Hall, 1984; Shackleton, 1986; Zachos et al., 2001, 2008; Cramer et al.,
74 2009). Benthic foraminiferal $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records also exhibit prominent negative carbon isotope
75 excursions (CIEs) across the three hyperthermals mentioned above (Kennett and Stott, 1991;
76 Littler et al., 2014; Lauretano et al., 2015). Crucially, at least from the late Paleocene to the
77 start of the EECO, similar $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records occur in other carbon-bearing phases, such as bulk
78 marine carbonate, planktic foraminifera, and various marine and terrestrial organic carbon
79 compounds (Shackleton, 1986; Schmitz et al., 1996; Lourens et al., 2005; Nicolo et al., 2007;
80 Agnini et al., 2009, submitted; Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010; Abels et al., 2012;
81 Coccioni et al., 2012; Sluijs and Dickens, 2012; Slotnick et al. 2012, 2015a; Clyde et al.,
82 2013). This strongly suggests that observed changes in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, both long-term trends as well as
83 short-term perturbations, represent variations in the input and output of ^{13}C -depleted carbon
84 to the exogenic carbon cycle (Shackleton, 1986; Dickens et al., 1995; Dickens, 2000; Kurtz et
85 al., 2003; Komar et al., 2013).

86 Significant biotic changes occur in terrestrial and marine environments during times
87 when the early Paleogene $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records show major variations. This has been
88 recognized for the PETM, where land sections exhibit a prominent mammal turnover
89 (Gingerich 2001, 2003; McInerney and Wing, 2011; Clyde et al., 2013), and where marine
90 sections reveal a profound benthic foraminiferal extinction (Thomas, 1998), turnovers in
91 calcareous nannoplankton, ostracods, corals and larger benthic foraminifera (Raffi and De
92 Bernardi, 2008; Scheibner and Speijer, 2008; Yamaguchi and Norris, 2012; Agnini et al.,
93 2014), and appearances of excursion taxa in calcareous nannoplankton, dinoflagellates and
94 planktic foraminifera (Kelly et al., 1996, 1998; Crouch et al., 2001; Sluijs et al., 2006; Self-
95 Trail et al., 2012). Major plant and mammal turnovers also occurred on land during the longer

96 EECO (Wing et al., 1991; Zonneveld et al., 2000; Wilf et al., 2003; Falkowski et al., 2005;
97 Woodbourne et al., 2009; Figueirido et al., 2012). In the marine realm, evolutionary trends
98 across the EECO have been noted, in particular the inception of modern calcareous
99 nanofossil community structure (Agnini et al., 2006, 2014; Schneider et al., 2011; Shamrock
100 et al., 2012) and possibly the same for diatoms (Sims et al., 2006; Oreshkina, 2012). These
101 observations, both from continents and the oceans, support an overarching hypothesis that
102 climate change drives biotic evolution, at least in part (Ezard et al., 2011).

103 Planktic foraminiferal assemblages are abundant in carbonate bearing marine sediments
104 and display distinct evolutionary trends that often can be correlated to climate variability
105 (Schmidt et al., 2004; Ezard et al., 2011; Fraass et al., 2015). This is especially true in the
106 early Paleogene, even though the relationship between climate variability and planktic
107 foraminiferal evolution remains insufficiently known. At the beginning of the Eocene,
108 planktic foraminifera had evolved over ca. 10 Myr following the Cretaceous-Paleogene mass
109 extinction event. Several early Paleogene phylogenetic lines evolved, occupying different
110 ecological niches in the upper water column. Subsequently, a major diversification occurred
111 during the early Eocene, which resulted in a peak of planktic foraminiferal diversity during
112 the middle Eocene (Norris, 1991; Schmidt et al., 2004; Pearson et al., 2006; Aze et al., 2011;
113 Ezard et al., 2011; Fraass et al., 2015).

114 In this study, we focus on the evolution of two planktic foraminiferal genera:
115 ~~morozovellids~~ *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* ~~acarininids~~ (**Figure 1**). These two genera belong
116 to the “muricate group”, a term derived from the muricae that form layered pustules on the
117 test wall. These two genera are of particular interest because of their dominance among
118 tropical and subtropical assemblages of the early Paleogene oceans, and because these genera
119 show a major turnover in taxonomic diversity close to the beginning of the EECO, one that
120 comprises species reduction among ~~morozovellids~~ *Morozovella* and species diversification

121 among *Acarinina* acarininids (Lu and Keller, 1995; Lu et al., 1998; Pearson et al., 2006; Aze
122 et al., 2011).

123 Numerous lower Eocene sedimentary sections from lower latitudes contain well-
124 recognizable preserved (albeit often recrystallized) planktic foraminiferal tests. Changes in
125 foraminiferal assemblages presumably reflect relationships between climate and carbon
126 cycling across the EECO. The present problem is that no section examined to date provides
127 counts of foraminiferal assemblages, detailed stable isotope records and robust planktic
128 foraminiferal biostratigraphies across the entire EECO. Indeed, at present, only a few sites
129 have detailed and interpretable stable isotope records across much of the EECO (Slotnick et
130 al., 2012, 2015a; Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014). Furthermore, the EECO lacks formal
131 definition. As a consequence, any relationship between climatic perturbations during the
132 EECO and the evolution of planktic foraminifera remains speculative. Here, we add new data
133 from three locations: the Possagno section from the western Tethys, DSDP Site 577 from the
134 tropical Pacific Ocean, and ODP Site 1051 from the subtropical Atlantic Ocean (**Figure 2**).
135 These sections hence represent a wide longitudinal span of low latitude locations during the
136 early Paleogene. By comparing stable isotope and planktic foraminiferal records at these
137 three locations, we provide a new foundation for understanding why the abundances of
138 *Acarinina* acarininids and *Morozovella* morozovellids changed during the EECO.

139

140 **2 The Early Eocene Climatic Optimum**

141

142 Evidence for extreme Earth surface warmth during a multi-million year time interval of the
143 early Eocene is overwhelming, and comes from many studies, utilizing both marine and
144 terrestrial sequences, and both fossil and geochemical proxies (Huber and Caballero, 2011;
145 Hollis et al., 2012; Pross et al., 2012). However, a definition for the EECO, including the

146 usage of “optimum”, endures as a perplexing problem. This is for several reasons, including
147 the basic facts that: (i) proxies for temperature should not be used to define a time increment,
148 (ii) clearly correlative records across the middle of the early Eocene with temporal resolution
149 less than 50 kyr remain scarce, and (iii) absolute ages across the early Eocene have changed
150 significantly (Berggren et al., 1995; Vandenberghe et al., 2102). As a consequence, various
151 papers discussing the EECO give different ages and durations spanning from 2 to 4 Myr long
152 sometime between circa 49 and 54 Ma (e.g., Yapp, 2004; Lowenstein and Demicco, 2006;
153 Zachos et al., 2008; Woodburne et al., 2009; Bijl et al., 2009; Smith et al., 2010; Hollis et al.,
154 2012; Slotnick et al., 2012; Puljalte et al., 2015).

155 The EECO, at least as presented in many papers, refers to the time of minimum $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
156 values in “stacked” benthic foraminifera stable isotope curves (**Figure 1**). These curves were
157 constructed by splicing together multiple $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records generated at individual locations onto
158 a common age model (originally Berggren et al., 1995). However, the stacked curves (Zachos
159 et al., 2001, 2008; Cramer et al., 2009), while they can be adjusted to different time scales,
160 show significant variance in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ across the middle to late early Eocene. Some of this
161 variance belies imprecisely calibrated records at individual sites, where cores do not align
162 properly in the depth domain (Dickens and Backman, 2013). Some of this variance probably
163 reflects a dynamic early Eocene climate regime, where average temperatures and atmospheric
164 $p\text{CO}_2$ across Earth changed significantly, perhaps on orbital time scales (Smith et al., 2010;
165 Slotnick et al., 2012, 2015a; Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014).

166 There is also the root problem as to where EECO starts and ends. At a basic level, the
167 interval characterized by the lowest Cenozoic benthic foraminiferal $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values begins at a
168 time that closely corresponds with a long-term minimum in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (**Figure 1**). This is
169 important for stratigraphic reasons because the two stable isotope curves were generated
170 using the same benthic foraminiferal samples, but $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records at different locations should

171 necessarily correlate in the time domain (unlike $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and temperature). The rationale for such
172 carbon isotope stratigraphy lies in the rapid cycling of carbon across Earth's surface
173 (Shackleton, 1986; Dickens, 2000).

174 The Eocene minimum in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ corresponds to the K/X event (**Figure 1**), which happened
175 in polarity chron C24n.1n and approximately 3 Myr after the PETM (Agnini et al., 2009;
176 Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010; Slotnick et al., 2012; Dallanave et al., 2015; Lauretano
177 et al., 2015; Westerhold et al., 2015). However, in several detailed studies spanning the early
178 Eocene, changes in long-term trends appear to have occurred about 400 kyr before the K/X
179 event, and at an event called "J" (after Cramer et al., 2003), which happened near the
180 boundary of polarity chrons C24n.2r and C24n.3n (Slotnick et al., 2015a; Lauretano et al.,
181 2015). Notably, the long-term late Paleocene-early Eocene decrease in detailed benthic
182 foraminiferal $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records at Site 1262 on Walvis Ridge ceases at the J event (Lauretano et
183 al., 2015).

184 The end of the EECO has received limited attention from a stratigraphic perspective.
185 Indeed, **the termination of the EECO may not be a recognizable global "event", because it**
186 **might relate to ocean circulation and gateways and expressed mostly in Southern Ocean and**
187 **deep ocean records (Pearson et al., 2007; Bijl et al. 2013).** In Paleogene continental slope
188 sections now uplifted and exposed in the Clarence River Valley, New Zealand, a major
189 lithologic change from limestone to marl coincides with the J event (Slotnick et al., 2012,
190 2015a; Dallanave et al., 2015). The marl-rich unit, referred to as "Lower Marl", has been
191 interpreted to reflect enhanced terrigenous supply to a continental margin because of greater
192 temperature and enhanced seasonal precipitation. It has been suggested further that Lower
193 Marl expresses the EECO (Slotnick et al., 2012; Dallanave et al., 2015). The top of Lower
194 Marl, and a return to limestone deposition, lies within the upper part of polarity chron C22n
195 (Dallanave et al., 2015). This is interesting because it approximates the time when general

196 long-term Cenozoic cooling initiates at several locations that have records of polarity chrons
197 and proxies for temperature (Bijl et al., 2009; Hollis et al., 2012; Pross et al., 2012). It is also
198 useful from a stratigraphic perspective because the end of the EECO thus lies close to a well
199 documented and widespread calcareous nannofossil biohorizon, the base of *Discoaster*
200 *sublodoensis*. This marks the base of CP10, NP12 or CNE4, depending on the chosen
201 calcareous nannofossil zonal scheme (Okada and Bukry, 1980; Martini, 1971; Agnini et al.,
202 2014).

203 Without an accepted definition in the literature, we tentatively present the EECO as the
204 duration of time between the J event and the base of *D. sublodoensis*. This interval thus
205 begins at about 53 Ma and ends at about 49 Ma on the 2012 Time Scale (GTS; Vandenberghe
206 et al., 2012). However, while the EECO was characterized by generally warm conditions,
207 numerous fluctuations in average temperature likely occurred during the 4 Myr interval.

208

209 **3 Sites and stratigraphy**

210

211 **3.1 Possagno, Venetian Prealps, Tethys**

212

213 An Upper Cretaceous through Miocene succession crops out at the bottom of the Monte
214 Grappa Massif in the Possagno area, about 60 km northwest of Venice. The lower to middle
215 Eocene, of primary focus to this study, is represented by the Scaglia beds. These
216 sedimentary rocks represent pelagic and hemipelagic sediment that accumulated at middle to
217 lower bathyal depths (Cita, 1975; Thomas, 1998) in the western part of the Belluno Basin, a
218 Mesozoic–Cenozoic paleogeographic unit of the Southern Alps (Bosellini, 1989). The basin
219 very likely was an embayment connected to the western Tethys, with a paleolatitude of ca.
220 42° during the early Eocene (**Figure 2**).

221 A quarry at 45°51.0' N and 11°51.6' E exposed in 2002-2003 a 66 m thick section of
222 the Scaglia beds (Figure 3), although it is at present largely covered and inaccessible. This
223 section was examined for its stratigraphy (Agnini et al., 2006; Luciani and Giusberti, 2014),
224 and shown to extend from just below the PETM to within lower Chron C20r in the lower
225 middle Eocene. Like other lower Paleogene sections of the Venetian Pre-alps (Giusberti et
226 al., 2007; Agnini et al., submitted), a Clay Marl Unit (CMU) with a prominent negative CIE
227 marks the PETM.

228 The Possagno section appears to be continuous, but with an important decrease in
229 sedimentation rate (to below 1.4 m/Myr) between 14.66 m and 15.51 m (Agnini et al., 2006).
230 This interval lies within Chron C23r and near the start of the EECO, and predates the onset
231 of a major increase in ~~discaster~~ *Discoaster* abundance (Agnini et al., 2006).

232

233 **3.2 Site 577, Shatsky Rise, Western Pacific**

234

235 Deep Sea Drilling Project (DSDP) Leg 86 drilled Site 577 at 32°26.5' N, 157°43.4' E, and
236 2680 m water depth, on Shatsky Rise, a large igneous plateau in the NW Pacific with a
237 relatively thin veneer of sediment (Shipboard Scientific Party 1985). During the early
238 Eocene, this site was located closer to 15° N (**Figure 2**), and probably at a slightly shallower
239 water depth (Ito and Clift, 1998).

240 Two primary holes were drilled at Site 577. Both Hole 577* and Hole 577A recovered
241 portions of a nominally 65 m thick section of Upper Cretaceous through lower Eocene
242 nannofossil ooze. Similar to the Possagno section, the lower Paleogene interval has
243 biomagnetostratigraphic information (Bleil, 1985; Monechi et al., 1985; Backman, 1986; Lu
244 and Keller, 1995; Dickens and Backman, 2013). Stable isotope records of bulk carbonate
245 have been generated for sediment from several cores at low sample resolution (Shackleton,

246 1986), and for much of Cores 577*-9H and 577*-10H at fairly high sample resolution
247 (Cramer et al. 2003).

248 The composition and relative abundances of planktic foraminifera were nicely
249 documented at Site 577 (Lu, 1995; Lu and Keller, 1995), and show a marked turnover
250 between *Morozovella morozovellids* and *Acarinina acaraninids* during the early Eocene.
251 These data, however, have remained on an out-dated view for the stratigraphy at this
252 location, where cores were not originally aligned to account for gaps and overlaps (Dickens
253 and Backman, 2013). As will become obvious later, the main phase of the EECO spans
254 Cores 577*-8H and 577A-8H, where detailed stable isotope records have not been generated
255 previously.

256

257 **3.3 Site 1051, Blake Nose, Western Atlantic**

258

259 The Blake Nose is a gentle ramp extending from 1000 m to 2700 m water depth east of
260 Florida (Norris et al, 1998). The feature is known for a relatively thick sequence of middle
261 Cretaceous through middle Eocene sediment with minimal overburden. Ocean Drilling
262 Program (ODP) Leg 171B drilled and cored this sequence at several locations, including Site
263 1051 at 30°03.2' N, 76°21.5' W, and 1994 m water depth (Shipboard Scientific Party 1998).
264 The site was located slightly to the south during the early Eocene (**Figure 2**). Benthic
265 foraminiferal assemblages indicate a lower bathyal depth (1000-2000 m) during the late
266 Paleocene and middle Eocene (Norris et al., 1998), although Bohaty et al. (2009) estimated a
267 paleodepth of about 2200 m for sedimentation ca. 50 Ma.

268 Sediments from 452.24 to 353.10 meters below sea floor (mbsf) at Site 1051 consist of
269 lower to middle Eocene carbonate ooze and chalk (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1998). The
270 site comprises two holes (1051A and 1051B), with core gaps and core overlaps existing at

271 both (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1998). However, the impact of these depth offsets upon
272 age is less than at Site 577, because of higher overall sedimentation rates.

273 The Eocene section at Site 1051 has good sediment recovery, except an interval between
274 382 mbsf and 390 mbsf, which contains significant chert. Stratigraphic markers across the
275 Eocene interval include polarity chrons (Ogg and Bardot, 2001), calcareous nannofossil
276 biohorizons (Mita, 2001), and planktic foraminiferal biohorizons (Norris et al., 1998; Luciani
277 and Giusberti, 2014). As first noted by Cramer et al. (2003), though, there is a basic
278 stratigraphic problem with the labelling of the polarity chrons. The intervals of normal
279 polarity between approximately 388 and 395 mbsf, and between approximately 412 and 420
280 mbsf were tentatively assigned to C22n and C23n, respectively (Ogg and Bardot, 2001). This
281 age assignment was assumed to be correct by Luciani and Giusberti (2014), who therefore
282 considered the last occurrence of *Morozovella subbotinae* as happening near the top of C23n,
283 an assumption that was also made for the revision of Eocene foraminiferal biozones (Wade et
284 al., 2011).

285 These age assignments, however, cannot be correct, because calcareous nannofossil
286 biohorizons that lie below or within C22n (top of *T. orthostylus*, top of *Toweius*, base of *D.*
287 *sublodoensis*) occur above 388 mbsf (Mita, 2001). Instead, there must be a significant hiatus
288 or condensed interval at the chert horizon, and the above noted intervals of normal polarity
289 are C23n and C24n.1n.

290

291 **4 Methods**

292

293 **4.1 Samples for isotopes and foraminifera**

294

295 The three sites provide a good stratigraphic background and key existing data for

296 understanding the temporal link between the EECO, carbon isotope perturbations and
297 planktic foraminiferal evolution. Our analytical aim was to obtain comparable data sets
298 across the sites. More specifically, a need existed to generate stable isotope and planktic
299 foraminiferal assemblage records at the Possagno section, to generate stable isotope records
300 at DSDP Site 577, and to generate planktic foraminiferal assemblage records at ODP Site
301 1051.

302 In total, 298 samples were collected from the originally exposed Possagno section in
303 2002-2003 for isotope analyses. The sampling interval was 2 to 5 cm for the basal 0.7 m, and
304 at variable spacing from 20 to 50 cm for the interval between 0.7 m and 66 m. Bulk sediment
305 samples previously were examined for their calcareous nannofossil assemblages (Agnini et
306 al., 2006). One hundred and ten of these samples were selected for the foraminiferal study.

307 Aliquots of the 110 samples were weighed, and then washed to obtain foraminifera using
308 two standard procedures, depending on lithology. For the indurated marly limestones and
309 limestones, the cold-acetolyse technique was used (Lirer, 2000; Luciani and Giusberti, 2014).
310 This method disaggregates strongly lithified samples, in which foraminifera otherwise can be
311 analyzed only with thin sections (Fornaciari et al., 2007; Luciani et al., 2007). For the marls,
312 samples were disaggregated using 30 % hydrogen peroxide and subsequently washed and
313 sieved at 63 μm . In most cases, gentle ultrasonic treatment (e.g., low-frequency at 40 kHz for
314 30–60 seconds) improved the cleaning of the tests.

315 Relative abundance data of planktic foraminiferal samples were generated for 65 samples
316 at Site 577 (Lu, 1995; Lu and Keller, 1995). We collected new samples for stable isotope
317 measurements that span their previous effort.

318 Fifty samples of Eocene sediment were obtained from Hole 1051A between 452 to 353
319 mbsf. Sample spacing varied from 2.0 m to 0.5 m. As the samples are ooze and chalk, they
320 were prepared using disaggregation using distilled water and washing over 38 μm and 63 μm

321 sieves. Washed residues were dried at <50°C.

322

323 **4.2 Stable Isotopes**

324

325 Carbon and oxygen stable isotope data of bulk sediment samples from the Possagno section
326 and Site 577 were analysed using a Finnigan MAT 252 mass spectrometer equipped with a
327 Kiel device at Stockholm University. Precision is within ± 0.06 ‰ for carbon isotopes and
328 within ± 0.07 ‰ for oxygen isotopes. Stable isotope values were calibrated to the Vienna Pee
329 Dee Belemnite standard (VPDB) and converted to conventional delta notation ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and
330 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$).

331

332 **4.3 Foraminifera analyses**

333

334 The mass percent of the >63 μm size fraction relative to the mass of the bulk sample,
335 typically 100 g/sample was calculated for the 110 Possagno samples. This is referred to as the
336 weight percent coarse fraction, following many previous works. Due to the consistent
337 occurrence of radiolarians at Site 1051, the coarse fraction cannot give information on
338 foraminiferal productivity.

339 Relative abundances for both Possagno and Site 1051 have been determined from about
340 300 complete specimens extracted from each of the 110 samples investigated in the >63 μm
341 size fraction from random splits.

342 The degree of dissolution, expressed as the fragmentation index (*F* index) was evaluated
343 according to Petrizzo et al. (2008) on ca. 300 elements, by counting planktic foraminiferal
344 fragments or partially dissolved tests versus complete tests. These data are expressed in
345 percentages. Fragmented foraminifera include specimens showing missing chambers and

346 substantial breakage. The taxonomic criteria for identifying planktic foraminifera follows the
347 work by Pearson et al. (2006).

348

349 **5 Results**

350

351 **5.1 Carbon isotopes**

352

353 *Possagno*

354 Carbon isotopes of bulk carbonate at Possagno vary between +1.8 and -0.3 ‰ (**Figure 4,**
355 **Table S1**). Overall, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ decreases from 1.8 ‰ at the base of the section to about 0.6 ‰ at 14
356 m. Generally, values then increase to 1.5 ‰ at 24 m, and remain between 1.5 ‰ and 0.8 ‰
357 for the remainder of the studied interval.

358 Superimposed on these trends are a series of negative CIEs. The most prominent of these
359 (~1.5 ‰) occurs at the 0 m level, and marks the PETM (Agnini et al., 2009). However, other
360 negative CIEs lie above this marker and within the lowermost 21.4 m, albeit some are only
361 defined by one data point (**Figure 4, Table S1**). The lower two at ~8 m and ~12.5 m probably
362 represent the H-1/ETM-2 and J event, respectively, as they lie at the appropriate stratigraphic
363 horizons in relation to polarity chrons. The K/X event may lie at 14.8 m, although this height
364 marks the start of the condensed interval.

365 The complex interval between 15.5 m and 24 m broadly corresponds to all of Chron
366 C23n and the bottom half of Chron C22r. A series of CIEs occur in that interval on the order
367 of 1.4 ‰, superimposed on a background trend of increasing $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (about 0.7 ‰). We
368 tentatively label these CIEs with even numbers for internal stratigraphic purposes (**Figure 4**),
369 as will become obvious below; their magnitudes range between 0.9 and 0.3 ‰ (**Table S1**).
370 However, the sample spacing through this interval varies from 20 to 50 cm. The precise

371 magnitudes and positions certainly could change with higher sample resolution, given the
372 estimated compacted sedimentation rate of ~0.5 cm/kyr for this part of the section (Agnini et
373 al., 2006).

374 Above Chron C22r, the Possagno $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record contains additional minor CIEs (**Figure 4**).
375 The most prominent of these CIEs, at least relative to baseline values (~1.2 ‰), occurs within
376 Chron C21n. More important to understanding the EECO, a ~0.6 ‰ CIE nearly coincides
377 with the base of *D. subloboensis* within the lower part of Chron C22n.

378

379 DSDP Site 577

380 The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record of bulk carbonate at DSDP Site 577 from just below the PETM through
381 Chron C22n ranges between 2.3 and 0.6 ‰ (**Figure 5; Table S2**). Overall, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ decreases
382 from 1.4 ‰ at 84.5 mcd to about 0.6 ‰ at ~76 mcd. Values then generally increase to 2.1 ‰
383 at ~68 mcd, and remain between 2.3 ‰ and 1.6 ‰ for the rest of the studied interval. Thus,
384 the ranges and general trends in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ for the two sections are similar, but skewed at DSDP
385 Site 577 relative to Possagno by about +0.6 ‰.

386 Like at Possagno, the early Eocene $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record at DSDP Site 577 exhibits a series of
387 CIEs (**Figure 5**). The portion of this record from the PETM through the K/X event has been
388 documented and discussed elsewhere (Cramer et al., 2003; Dickens and Backman, 2013). The
389 new portion of this record, from above the K/X event through Chron C22n, spans the
390 remainder of the EECO. Within this interval, where background $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values rise by ~1.5 ‰,
391 there again occur a series of minor CIEs with magnitudes between 0.3 and 0.5 ‰ (**Table S2**).
392 Here, however, multiple data points define most of the CIEs. We again give these an internal
393 numerical labelling scheme. A ~0.4 ‰ CIE also nearly coincides with the base of *D.*
394 *subloboensis* within the lower part of C22n.

395

396 **5.2 Oxygen isotopes**

397

398 Possagno

399 Oxygen isotopes of bulk carbonate at Possagno range between -3.3 and 0.8 ‰ with a mean
400 value of -1.7 ‰ (**Figure 4, Table S1**). In general, considerable scatter exists across the data
401 set with respect to depth, as adjacent samples often display a difference in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ that exceeds
402 0.5 ‰. Nonetheless, some of the more prominent lows in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ show a clear correspondence
403 with negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (CIEs) and vice versa. This correspondence occurs across the
404 PETM and other known hyperthermals, as well as within and after the EECO. Indeed, the
405 main phase of the EECO corresponds with a broad has the lowest $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values.

406

407 DSDP Site 577

408 The $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record at Site 577 noticeably deviates from that at Possagno (**Figure 5, Table S2**).
409 This is because values range between -1.1 ‰ and 0.2 with an average value of -0.4 ‰. Thus,
410 relative to Possagno, the record at Site 577 has less scatter, and an overall shift of about -1.3
411 ‰. There ~~is~~ exists again a modest correlation between decreases in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
412 values, as well as a general low in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ across the main phase of the EECO.

413

414 **5.3 Coarse fraction**

415

416 The coarse fraction of samples from Possagno shows two distinct trends (**Figure 6, Table**
417 **S3**). Before the EECO, values are $10.4 \pm 2.67 \%$. However, from the base of the EECO
418 and up through the section, values decrease to $5.3 \pm 1.3 \%$.

419

420 **5.4 Foraminiferal preservation and fragmentation**

421

422 Planktic foraminifera are consistently present and diverse throughout the studied intervals at
423 Possagno and at ODP Site 1051. Preservation of the tests at Possagno varies from moderate
424 to fairly good (Luciani and Giusberti, 2014). However, planktic foraminiferal tests at
425 Possagno are recrystallized and essentially totally filled with calcite. Planktic foraminifera
426 from samples at Site 1051 are readily recognizable throughout the studied interval. Planktic
427 foraminifera from Site 577, at least as illustrated by published plates (Lu and Keller, 1995),
428 show a very good state of preservation (albeit possibly recrystallized).

429 The *F* index record at Possagno (**Figure 6, Table S3**) displays large amplitude variations
430 throughout the investigated interval. The highest values, up to 70 %, were observed between
431 16 and 22 m. In general, highs in *F* index values correspond to lows in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record.

432 The *F* index record at Site 1051 (**Figure 8, Table S4**) shows less variability compared to
433 that at Possagno, although some of this may reflect the difference in the number of samples
434 examined at the two locations. A maximum value of 60 % is found in Zone E5, just below an
435 interval of uncertain magnetostratigraphy (Norris et al., 1998), but corresponding to the J
436 event (Cramer et al., 2003). Relatively high *F* index values, around 50 %, also occur in
437 several samples below this horizon. The interval across the EECO generally displays low *F*
438 index values (<20 %).

439

440 **5.5 Planktic foraminiferal quantitative analysis**

441

442 Possagno

443 Planktic foraminiferal assemblages at Possagno show significant changes across the early to
444 early middle Eocene (**Figure 6, Table S3**). Throughout the entire section, the mean relative
445 abundance of *Acarinina* is about 46 % of the total assemblage. However, members of this

446 genus ~~show exhibit~~ peak abundances of 60-80 % of the total assemblage ~~occur~~ across several
447 intervals, often corresponding to CIEs. Particularly prominent is the broad abundance peak of
448 *Acarinina* coincident with the main phase of the EECO.

449 The increases in *Acarinina* ~~acarininid~~ relative abundance typically are counterbalanced
450 by transient decreases of subbotinids (~~that include both~~ *Subbotina* and *Parasubbotina* genera;
451 **Figure 6**). This group also shows a general increase throughout the section. Below the EECO
452 the relative abundances of subbotinids average ~24 %. Above the EECO, this average rises to
453 ~36 %.

454 The trends of *Acarinina* ~~acarininid~~ and subbotinids contrast with that of *Morozovella*
455 ~~morozovellid~~ (**Figure 6**), which exhibit a major and permanent decline within Zone E5. This
456 group collapses from mean abundances ~24 % in the 0-15 m interval to <6 % above 15 m.
457 Qualitative examination of species shows that, in the lower part of Zone E5, where relatively
458 high *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ abundances are recorded, there is no dominance of any
459 species. *M. marginodentata*, *M. subbotinae* and *M. lensiformis* are each relatively common,
460 and *M. aequa*, *M. aragonensis*, *M. formosa* and *M. crater* are each less common. By contrast,
461 in the upper part of Zone E5, where low abundances of *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ occur, *M.*
462 *aragonensis*, *M. formosa*, *M. crater* and *M. caucasica* are the most common species. The
463 general decrease of *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ abundances appears unrelated to the
464 disappearance of a single, dominant species.

465 At Possagno, *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ never recover to their pre-EECO abundances.
466 This is true even if one includes the morphologically and ecologically comparable genus
467 *Morozovelloides* (Pearson et al., 2006), which first appears in samples above 36 m.

468 Other planktic foraminiferal genera are always less than 15 % of the total assemblages
469 throughout the studied interval at Possagno (**Figure S1, Table S3**).

470

471 ODP Site 577

472 Samples from Site 577 were disaggregated in water and washed through a >63 sieve (Lu,
473 1995; Lu and Keller, 1995). They determined relative abundances of planktic foraminifera
474 from random splits of about 300 specimens (Lu, 1995; Lu and Keller, 1995). The resulting
475 data are shown in **Figure 7**, placed onto the composite depth scale by Dickens and Backman
476 (2013). Major changes in planktic foraminiferal assemblages are comparable to those
477 recorded at Possagno. Such changes include indeed a distinct decrease of *Morozovella*
478 ~~morozovellids~~ within Zone E5. The decrease at Site 577 is from mean values of 26.6 % to 6.7
479 % (**Table S4**). This marked drop occurs at ca. 78 mcd close to the J event and at the start of
480 the EECO. Like at Possagno, *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ never recover to their pre-EECO
481 abundances.

482 The *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ decrease is counter balanced by the trend of *Acarinina*
483 ~~acarininid~~ abundances that increase from mean values of 30.4 % to 64.8 % in correspondence
484 to the level of the *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ collapse. Subbotinids fluctuate in abundance
485 throughout the interval investigated from 1 % to 18 %, with a mean value of ca. 8 %.

486

487 ODP Site 1051

488 Planktic foraminifera show distinct changes in abundance at Site 1051 (**Figure 8, Table S5**).
489 The changes of the main taxa are similar to the variations observed at Possagno. The genus
490 *Acarinina* displays an increase in mean relative abundance from 35 % (base to ca. 450 mbsf)
491 to around 50 % (ca. 430 mbsf), with maximum values of about 60 %. The relatively low
492 resolution used here does not permit comparison to the early Eocene CIEs at Site 1051
493 (Cramer et al., 2003), or how the relative abundance of planktic foraminiferal genera varies
494 with respect to CIEs.

495 The abundance of subbotinids shows ~~little~~ **small** variations around mean values of 20 %

496 at Site 1051. Like at Possagno, samples from Site 1051 also record a slight increase in
497 abundance toward the end of the EECO and above.

498 The major change in planktic foraminiferal assemblages at Site 1051 includes a distinct
499 decrease of *Morozovella*, from mean values around 40 % to 10 % in the middle part of Zone
500 E5 (**Figure 7**). Similar to Possagno, the lower part of Zone E5 with the higher percentages of
501 *Morozovella morozovellids* does not record the dominance of selected species, but at Site
502 1051 *M. aragonensis* and *M. formosa* besides *M. subbotinae* are relatively common whereas
503 *M. marginodentata* is less frequent. Within the interval of low ~~morezovellids~~ *Morozovella*
504 abundances, *M. aragonensis* and *M. formosa* are the most common taxa. The general decline
505 of *Morozovella morozovellids* does not appear therefore related, both at Possagno and at Site
506 1051, to the extinction or local disappearance of a dominant species.

507

508 **6 Discussion**

509

510 **6.1 Dissolution, recrystallization, and bulk carbonate stable isotopes**

511

512 The bulk carbonate stable isotope records within the lower Paleogene sections at Possagno
513 and at Site 577 need ~~some reflection~~ ~~thought~~, considering how such records are produced and
514 modified in much younger strata dominated by pelagic carbonate. In open ocean
515 environments, carbonate preserved on the seafloor principally consists of calcareous tests of
516 nannoplankton (coccolithophores) and planktic foraminifera (Bramlette and Riedel, 1954;
517 Berger, 1967; Vincent and Berger, 1981). However, the total amount of carbonate and its
518 microfossil composition can vary considerably across locations because of differences in
519 deep-water chemistry and in test properties (e.g., ratio of surface area to volume;
520 mineralogical composition). For regions at low to mid latitudes, a reasonable representation

521 of carbonate components produced in the surface water accumulates on the seafloor at
522 modest (<2000 m) water depth. By contrast, microfossil assemblages become heavily
523 modified in deeper water, because of increasingly significant carbonate dissolution (Berger,
524 1967). Such dissolution preferentially affects certain tests, such as thin-walled, highly porous
525 planktic foraminifera (Berger, 1970; Bé et al., 1975; Thunell and Honjo, 1981).

526 The stable isotope composition of modern bulk carbonate ooze reflects the mixture of its
527 carbonate components, which mostly record water temperature and the composition of
528 dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) within the mixed layer (<100 m water depth). The stable
529 isotope records are imperfect, though, because of varying proportions of carbonate
530 constituents, and “vital effects”, which impact stable isotope fractionation for each
531 component (Anderson and Cole, 1975; Reghellin et al., 2015). Nonetheless, the stable isotope
532 composition of bulk carbonate ooze on the seafloor can be related to overlying temperature
533 and chemistry of surface water (Anderson and Cole, 1975; Reghellin et al., 2015).

534 Major modification of carbonate ooze occurs during sediment burial. This is because,
535 with compaction and increasing pressure, carbonate tests begin to dissolve and recrystallize
536 (Schlanger and Douglas, 1974; Borre and Fabricus, 1998). Typically within several hundred
537 meters of the seafloor, carbonate ooze becomes chalk and, with further burial, limestone
538 (Schlanger and Douglas, 1974; Kroencke et al., 1991; Borre and Fabricus, 1998). Carbonate
539 recrystallization appears to be a local and nearly closed system process, such that mass
540 transfer occurs over short distances (i.e., less than a few meters) (above references and Matter
541 et al., 1975; Arthur et al., 1984; Frank et al., 1999).

542 In pelagic sequences with appreciable carbonate content and low organic carbon content,
543 bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records typically give information of paleoceanographic significance
544 (Scholle and Arthur, 1980; Frank et al., 1999). Even when transformed to indurated
545 limestone, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value for a given sample should be similar to that originally deposited on

546 the seafloor. This is because, for such sediments, almost all carbon within small **sedimentary**
547 volumes exists as carbonate. Bulk carbonate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records are a different matter, especially in
548 indurated marly limestones and limestones (Marshall, 1992; Schrag et al., 1995; Frank et al.,
549 1999). This is because pore water dominates the total amount of oxygen within an initial
550 parcel of sediment, and oxygen isotope fractionation depends strongly on temperature. Thus,
551 during dissolution and recrystallization of carbonate, significant exchange of oxygen isotopes
552 occurs. At first, carbonate begins to preferentially acquire ^{18}O , because shallowly buried
553 sediment generally has lower temperatures than surface water. However, with increasing
554 burial depth along a geothermal gradient, carbonate begins to preferentially acquire ^{16}O
555 (Schrag et al., 1995; Frank et al., 1999).

556

557 **6.2 Carbon isotope stratigraphy through the EECO**

558

559 Stratigraphic issues complicate direct comparison of various records from Possagno and Site
560 577. The two sections have somewhat similar multi-million year sedimentation rates across
561 the early Eocene. However, the section at Possagno contains the condensed interval, where
562 much of C23r spans a very short distance (Agnini et al., 2006), and the section at Site 577 has
563 a series of core gaps and core overlaps (Dickens and Backman, 2013).

564 An immediate issue to amend is the alignment of Cores 8H and 9H in Hole 577* and
565 Core 8H in Hole 577A (**Figure 5**). On the basis of GRAPE density records for these cores,
566 Dickens and Backman (2013) initially suggested a 2.6 m core gap between Cores 8H* and
567 9H*. However, a 3.5 m core gap also conforms to all available stratigraphic information. The
568 newly generated $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) records across these three cores show the latter to be correct.

569 Once sedimentation rate differences at Possagno are recognized and coring problems at
570 Site 577 are rectified, early Eocene $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records at both locations display similar trends and

571 deviations in relation to polarity chrons and key microfossil events (**Figures 4, 5**). Moreover,
572 the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variations seemingly can be correlated in time to those found in bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
573 records at other locations, including Site 1051 (**Figure 8**) and Site 1258 (**Figure 9**). As noted
574 previously, such correlation occurs because the bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ signals reflect past global
575 changes in the composition of surface water DIC, even after carbonate recrystallization.

576 For the latest Paleocene and earliest Eocene, nominally the time spanning from the base
577 of C24r through the middle of C24n, detailed stable carbon isotope records have been
578 generated at more than a dozen locations across the globe (Cramer et al., 2003; Agnini et al.,
579 2009; Galeotti et al., 2010; Zachos et al., 2010; Slotnick et al., 2012; Littler et al., 2014;
580 Agnini et al., in review). These records can be described consistently as a long-term drop in
581 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ superimposed with a specific sequence of prominent CIEs that include those
582 corresponding to the PETM, H-1, and J events. In continuous sections with good
583 magnetostratigraphy and biostratigraphy, there is no ambiguity in the assignment of CIEs
584 (Zachos et al., 2010; Littler et al., 2014; Slotnick et al., 2012, 2105a; Lauretano et al., 2015).
585 This “ $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ template” can be found at the Possagno section and at Site 577 (**Figure 9**); it is
586 found at Site 1051 for the depth interval where carbon isotopes have been determined
587 (**Figure 8**).

588 After the J event and across the EECO, very few detailed $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records have been
589 published (Slotnick et al., 2012, 2015a; Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014). Moreover, the available
590 records are not entirely consistent. For example, the K/X event in Clarence River valley
591 sections manifests as a prominent CIE within a series of smaller $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ excursions (Slotnick et
592 al., 2012, 2015a), whereas the event has limited expression in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record at Site 1258
593 (Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014; **Figure 9**).

594 The new records from Possagno and Site 577 emphasize an important finding regarding
595 bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records across the EECO. Between the middle of C24n and the upper

596 part of C23r, there appears to be a sequence of low amplitude, low frequency CIEs. (Note
597 that this portion of the record is missing at Possagno because of the condensed interval;
598 **Figure 9**). However, near the C23r/C23n boundary, a long-term rise in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ begins, but with
599 a series of relatively high amplitude, high frequency CIEs (Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014;
600 Slotnick et al., 2014). The number, relative magnitude and precise timing of CIEs within this
601 interval remain uncertain. For example, the CIE labelled “4” appears to occur near the top of
602 C23r at Site 577 but near the bottom of C23n.2n at Site 1258 and at Possagno. Additional
603 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records across this interval are needed to resolve the correct sequence of CIEs and to
604 derive an internally consistent labelling scheme for these perturbations. It is also not clear
605 which of these CIEs during the main phase of the EECO specifically relate to significant
606 increases in temperature, as clear for the “hyperthermals” in the earliest Eocene. Nonetheless,
607 numerous CIEs, as well as an apparent change in the mode of these events, characterize the
608 EECO (Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014; Slotnick et al., 2014).

609 The causes of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ changes during the early Paleogene lie at the crux of considerable
610 research and debate (Dickens et al., 1995, 1997; Zeebe et al., 2009; Dickens, 2011; Lunt et
611 al., 2011; Sexton et al., 2011; De Conto et al., 2012; Lee et al., 2013; Kirtland Turner et al.,
612 2014). Much of the discussion has revolved around three questions: (1) what are the sources
613 of ^{13}C -depleted carbon that led to prominent CIEs, especially during the PETM? (2) does the
614 relative importance of different carbon sources vary throughout this time interval? and, (3)
615 are the geologically brief CIEs related to the longer secular changes in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$? One might
616 suggest, through several papers, a convergence of thought as to how carbon cycled across
617 Earth’s surface during the early Paleogene, at least between the late Paleocene and the K/X
618 event (Cramer et al., 2003; Lourens et al., 2005; Galeotti et al., 2010; Hyland et al., 2013;
619 Zachos et al., 2010; Lunt et al. 2011; Littler et al., 2014; Lauretano et al., 2015; Westerhold et
620 al., 2015). Changes in ~~tectonism~~, **tectonism**, volcanism, and weathering drove long-term

621 changes atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ (Vogt, 1979; Raymo and Ruddiman, 1992; Sinton and Duncan,
622 1998; Demicco, 2004; Zachos et al., 2008), which was generally high throughout the early
623 Paleogene, but increased toward the EECO (Pearson and Palmer, 2000; Fletcher et al., 2008;
624 Lowenstein and Demicco, 2006; Smith et al., 2010; Hyland and Sheldon, 2013). However, as
625 evident from the large range in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ across early Paleogene stable isotope records, major
626 changes in the storage and release of organic carbon must have additionally contributed to
627 variability in atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ and ocean DIC concentrations (Shackleton, 1986; Kurtz et
628 al., 2003; Komar et al., 2013). When long-term increases in $p\text{CO}_2$, perhaps in conjunction
629 with orbital forcing, pushed temperatures across some threshold, such as the limit of sea-ice
630 formation (Lunt et al., 2011), rapid inputs of ^{13}C -depleted organic carbon from the shallow
631 geosphere served as a positive feedback to abrupt warming (Dickens et al., 1995; Bowen et
632 al., 2006; DeConto et al., 2012).

633 Our new $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records do not directly address the above questions and narrative
634 concerning early Paleogene carbon cycling. However, they do highlight two general and
635 related problems when such discussion includes the EECO. First, surface temperatures appear
636 to stay high across an extended time interval when the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of benthic foraminifer (**Figure 1**)
637 and bulk carbonate (**Figure 9**) increase. Second, numerous brief CIEs mark this global long-
638 term rise in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$. Whether the aforementioned views need modification or reconsideration
639 (Kirtland Turner et al., 2014) is an outstanding issue, one that depends on how long-term and
640 short-term $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ changes relate across the entire early Paleogene.

641 The overall offset between bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values at Possagno and Site 577 may hint
642 at an important constraint to any model of early Paleogene carbon cycling. Throughout the
643 early Eocene, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values at Site 577 exceed those at Possagno by nominally 0.8 ‰ (**Figure**
644 **9**). This probably does reflect recrystallization or lithification, because similar offsets appear
645 across numerous records independent of post-depositional history but dependent on location

646 (Schmitz et al., 1996; Cramer et al., 2003; Slotnick et al., 2012, 2015a; Agnini et al.,
647 submitted). In general, absolute values of bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records increase from the
648 North Atlantic and western Tethys (low), through the South Atlantic and eastern
649 Tethys/Indian, to the Pacific (high), although suggestively with a latitudinal component to
650 this signature.

651

652 **6.3 Stable oxygen isotope stratigraphy across the EECO**

653

654 Bulk carbonate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values for Holocene sediment across the Eastern Equatorial Pacific
655 relate to average temperatures in the mixed layer (Shackleton and Hall, 1995; Reghellin et al.,
656 2015). Indeed, values are close to those predicted from water chemistry ($\delta^{18}\text{O}_w$) and
657 equilibrium calculations for calcite precipitation (e.g., Bemis et al., 1998) if vital effects in
658 the dominant nanoplankton increase $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ by nominally 1‰ (Reghellin et al., 2015).

659 Site 577 was located at about 15°N latitude in the eastern Pacific during the early
660 Paleogene. Given that sediment of this age remains “nanofossil ooze” (Shipboard Scientific
661 Party, 1985), one might predict past mixed layer temperatures from the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values with
662 three assumptions: early Paleogene $\delta^{18}\text{O}_w$ was 1.2 ‰ less than that at present-day to account
663 for an ice-free world; local $\delta^{18}\text{O}_w$ was equal to average seawater, similar to modern chemistry
664 at this off-Equator location (LeGrande and Schmidt, 2006); and, Paleogene nanoplankton
665 also fractionated $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ by 1.0 ‰. With commonly used equations that relate the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of
666 calcite to temperature (Bemis et al., 1998), these numbers render temperatures of between
667 16°C and 21°C for the data at Site 577. Such temperatures seem too cold by at least 10°C,
668 given other proxy data and modelling studies (e.g., Pearson et al., 2007; Huber and Caballero,
669 2011; Hollis et al., 2012; Pross et al., 2012; Inglis et al., 2015). At low latitudes, bottom
670 waters are always much colder than surface waters. Even during the EECO, deep waters

671 probably did not exceed 12°C (Zachos et al., 2008). The calculated ~~tepid~~ temperatures likely
672 indicate partial recrystallization of bulk carbonate near the seafloor. Examinations of
673 calcareous nanofossils in Paleogene sediment at Site 577 show extensive calcite
674 overgrowths (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1985; Backman, 1986). Relatively low $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values
675 mark the H-1 and K/X events, as well as the main phase of the EECO (**Figure 5**). Both
676 observations support the idea that the bulk carbonate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at Site 577 represents the
677 combination of a primary surface water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ signal and a secondary shallow pore water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
678 signal.

679 Lithification should further impact bulk carbonate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records (Marshall, 1992; Schrag
680 et al., 1995; Frank et al., 1999). Because this process occurs well below the seafloor, where
681 temperatures approach or exceed those of surface water, the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of pelagic marls and
682 limestones should be significantly depleted in ^{18}O relative to partially recrystallized
683 nanofossil ooze. This explains the nominal 2‰ offset in average $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ between correlative
684 strata at Possagno and at Site 577. While temperature calculations using the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record at
685 Possagno render reasonable surface water values for a mid-latitude location in the early
686 Paleogene (26-31°C, using the aforementioned approach), any interpretation in these terms
687 more than likely reflects happenstance. The fact that planktic foraminifera are completely
688 recrystallized and totally filled with calcite at Possagno supports this inference.

689 One might suggest, at least for the Possagno section, that meteoric water might have also
690 impacted the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record. This is because rainwater generally has a $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ composition less
691 than that of seawater. However, samples were collected at Possagno in 2002-2003 from fresh
692 quarry cuts.

693 As observed at Site 577, however, horizons of lower $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at Possagno may represent
694 times of relative warmth in surface water. This includes the broad interval between 16 and
695 22.5 m, which marks the main phase of the EECO, as well as many of the brief CIEs, at least

696 one that clearly represents the PETM (**Figure 4**). That is, despite obvious overprinting of the
697 original $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ signal, early to early middle Eocene climate variations appear manifest in the
698 data.

699

700 **6.4 The EECO and planktic foraminiferal abundances**

701

702 Bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records, especially in conjunction with other stratigraphic markers,
703 provide a powerful means to correlate early Paleogene sequences from widely separated
704 locations (**Figure 9**). They also allow for placement of planktic foraminiferal assemblage
705 changes into broader context.

706 The most striking change in planktic foraminiferal assemblages occurred near the start of
707 the EECO. Over a fairly short time interval and at multiple widespread locations, the relative
708 abundance of *Acarinina* acarininids increased significantly whereas the relative abundance of
709 *Morozovella* morozovellids decreased significantly. This switch, best defined by the decline
710 in *Morozovella* morozovellids, happened just before the condensed interval at Possagno
711 (**Figure 6**), just above the J event at Site 577 (**Figure 7, Table S4**), and during the J event at
712 Site 1051 (**Figure 8**). At the Farra section, cropping out in the same geological setting of
713 Possagno at 50 km NE of the Carcoselle quarry, it also appears to have occurred close to the J
714 event (**Figure 10**). Indeed, the maximum turnover in relative abundances may have been
715 coincident with the J event at all locations. Importantly, the relative abundance of subbotinids
716 only changed marginally during this time.

717 The *Morozovella* morozovellid decline across the start of the EECO did not rebound
718 afterward. At Possagno, at Site 1051, and at Site 577, it was coupled with the gradual
719 disappearances of several species, including *M. aequa*, *M. gracilis*, *M. lensiformis*, *M.*
720 *marginodentata*, and *M. subbotinae*. Furthermore, the loss of *Morozovella* morozovellids was

721 not counterbalanced by the appearance of the *Morozovelloides* genus, which shared with
722 *Morozovella* the same ecological preferences. This latter genus appeared in C21r, near the
723 Ypresian/Lutetian boundary, and well after the EECO (Pearson et al., 2006; Aze et al., 2011),
724 including at Possagno (Luciani and Giusberti, 2014; **Figure 6**). Though *Morozovelloides*
725 were morphologically similar to *Morozovella*, they probably evolved from *Acarinina*
726 (Pearson et al., 2006; Aze et al., 2011; **Figure 1**).

727 At Possagno, higher abundances of *Acarinina* acarininids also correlate with pronounced
728 negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ perturbations before and after the EECO (**Figure 6**). This includes the H-1
729 event, as well as several unlabelled CIEs during C22n, C21r and C21n. Such increases in the
730 relative abundances of *Acarinina* acarininids have been described for the PETM interval at
731 the nearby Forada section (Luciani et al., 2007), and for the K/X event at the proximal Farra
732 section (Agnini et al., 2009). Unlike for the main switch near the J event, however, these
733 changes are transient, so that relative abundances in planktic foraminiferal genera are similar
734 before and after the short-term CIEs.

735

736 **6.5 The impact of dissolution**

737

738 Carbonate dissolution at or near the seafloor presents a potential explanation for observed
739 changes in foraminifera assemblages. Some studies of latest Paleocene to initial Eocene age
740 sediments, including laboratory experiments, suggest a general ordering of dissolution
741 according to genus, with *Acarinina* acarininids more resistant than *Morozovella*
742 morozovellids, and the latter more resistant than subbotinids (Petrizzo et al., 2008; Nguyen et
743 al., 2009, 2011).

744 Carbonate solubility horizons that impact calcite preservation and dissolution on the
745 seafloor (i.e., the CCD and lysocline) also shoaled considerably during various intervals of

746 the early Eocene. The three most prominent hyperthermals that occurred before the main
747 phase of the EECO (PETM, H-1, K/X) were clearly marked by pronounced carbonate
748 dissolution at multiple locations (Zachos et al., 2005; Agnini et al., 2009; Stap et al., 2009;
749 Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010). A multi-million year interval characterized by a
750 relatively shallow CCD also follows the K/X event (Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010;
751 Pälike et al., 2012; Slotnick et al., 2015b).

752 Should changes in carbonate preservation primarily drive the observed planktic
753 foraminiferal assemblages, it follows that the dominance of *Acarinina* ~~acariniids~~ during the
754 EECO and multiple CIEs could represent a taphonomic artefact. Limited support for this idea
755 comes from our records of fragmentation (*F* index). In general, intervals with relatively high
756 abundances of *Acarinina* ~~acariniids~~ (and low $\delta^{13}\text{C}$) correspond to intervals of fairly high
757 fragmentation at Possagno and at Site 1051 (**Figures 6, 8**). This can suggest carbonate
758 dissolution, because this process breaks planktic foraminifera into fragments (Berger, 1967;
759 Hancock and Dickens, 2005).

760 Carbonate dissolution can cause the coarse fraction of bulk sediment to decrease (Berger
761 et al., 1982; Broecker et al., 1999; Hancock and Dickens, 2005). This happens because whole
762 planktic foraminiferal tests typically exceed 63 μm , whereas the resulting fragments often do
763 not exceed 63 μm . The decrease in CF values at the start of the EECO at Possagno (**Figure 6**)
764 may therefore further indicate loss of foraminiferal tests. However, relatively low CF values
765 continue to the top of the section, independent of changes in the *F* index. The CF record
766 parallels the trend of *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ abundance, and thus might also suggest a
767 loss of larger *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ rather than carbonate dissolution.

768 The cause of the long-term rise in carbonate dissolution horizons remains perplexing, but
769 may relate to reduced inputs of ^{13}C -depleted carbon into the ocean and atmosphere (Leon-
770 Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010; Komar et al., 2013). Should the *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~

771 decline and amplified F index at the Possagno section mostly represent dissolution, it would
772 imply considerable shoaling of these horizons in the western Tethys, given the inferred
773 deposition in middle to lower bathyal setting. As with open ocean sites (Slotnick et al.,
774 2015b), further studies on the Eocene lysocline and CCD are needed from Tethyan locations.
775 One idea is that remineralization of organic matter intensified within the water column,
776 driven by augmented microbial metabolic rates at elevated temperatures during the EECO;
777 this may have decreased pH at intermediate water column depths (Brown et al., 2004;
778 Olivarez Lyle and Lyle, 2006; O'Connor et al., 2009; John et al., 2013, 2014).

779 Despite evidence for carbonate dissolution, this process probably only amplified primary
780 changes in planktic foraminiferal assemblages. The most critical observation is the similarity
781 of the abundance records for major planktic foraminiferal genera throughout the early Eocene
782 at multiple locations (**Figures 6-8**). This includes the section at Site 1051, where carbonate
783 appears only marginally modified by dissolution according to the F index values (**Figure 7**).
784 Subbotinid abundance also remains fairly high throughout the early Eocene. One explanation
785 is that, in contrast to laboratory experiments (Nguyen et al., 2009, 2011), subbotinids are
786 more resistant to dissolution than *Morozovella morozovellids* (Boersma and Premoli Silva,
787 1983; Berggren and Norris, 1997), at least once the EECO has transpired. In the proximal
788 middle-upper Eocene section at Alano, Luciani et al. (2010) documented a dominance of
789 subbotinids within intervals of high fragmentation (F index) and enhanced carbonate
790 dissolution. The degree of dissolution across planktic foraminiferal assemblages may have
791 varied through the early Paleogene, as distinct species within each genus may respond
792 differently (Nguyen et al., 2011). So far, data on dissolution susceptibility for different
793 species and genera are limited for early and early middle Eocene times (Petruzzo et al., 2008).

794 There is also recent work from the Terche section (ca. 28 km NE of Possagno) to
795 consider. This section is located in the same geological setting as Possagno, but across the H-

796 1, H-2 and I1 events, there are very low F index values and marked increases of *Acarinina*
797 ~~acarininids~~ coupled with significant decreases of subbotinids (D'Onofrio et al., 2014).
798 Therefore, although the Possagno record may be partially altered by dissolution, an increase
799 of warm water *Acarinina* ~~acarininids~~ concomitant with decrease of subbotinids seems to be a
800 robust finding during early Paleogene warming events in Tethyan settings.

801

802 **6.6 A record of mixed water change**

803

804 The switch in abundance between *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ and *Acarinina* ~~acarininids~~ at
805 the start of the EECO supports a hypothesis whereby environmental change resulted in a
806 geographically widespread overturn of planktic foraminiferal genera. During the PETM and
807 K/X events, *Acarinina* ~~acarininids~~ became dominant over *Morozovella* ~~morozovellids~~ in a
808 number of Tethyan successions. This has been interpreted as signifying enhanced
809 eutrophication of surface waters near continental margins (Arenillas et al., 1999; Molina et
810 al., 1999; Ernst et al., 2006; Guasti and Speijer, 2007; Luciani et al., 2007; Agnini et al.,
811 2009), an idea consistent with evidence for elevated (albeit more seasonal) riverine discharge
812 during these hyperthermals (Schmitz and Pujalte, 2007; Giusberti et al., 2007; Schulte et al.,
813 2011; Slotnick et al., 2012; Pujalte et al., 2015). Increased nutrient availability may also have
814 occurred at Possagno during the early part of the EECO, given the relatively high
815 concentration of radiolarians, which may reflect eutrophication (Hallock, 1987).

816 However, the fact that the major switch at the start of the EECO can be found at Sites
817 1051 (western Atlantic) and Site 577 (central Pacific) suggests that local variations in
818 oceanographic conditions, such as riverine discharge, was not the primary causal mechanism.
819 Rather, the switch must be a consequence of globally significant modifications related to the
820 EECO, most likely sustained high temperatures, elevated $p\text{CO}_2$, or both. Given model

821 predictions for our Earth in the coming millennia (IPCC, 2014), indirect effects also could
822 have contributed, especially including increased ocean stratification and decreased pH.

823 An explanation for the shift may lie in habitat differences across planktic foraminiferal
824 genera. Although both *Morozovella morozovellids* and *Acarinina acarininids* likely had
825 photosymbionts, *Morozovella morozovellids* may have occupied a shallower surface habitat
826 than the latter genus as indicated by minor variations in their stable isotope compositions
827 (Boersma et al., 1987; Pearson et al., 1993; 2001).

828 One important consideration to any interpretation is the evolution of new species that
829 progressively appear during the post-EECO interval. In good agreement with studies of lower
830 Paleogene sediment from other low latitude locations (Pearson et al., 2006), thermocline
831 dwellers such as subbotinids and parasubbotinids seem to proliferate at Possagno (Luciani
832 and Giusberti, 2014). These include *Subbotina corpulenta*, *S. eocena*, *S. hagni*, *S. senni*, *S.*
833 *yeguanesis*, *Parasubbotina griffinae*, and *P. pseudowilsoni*. The appearance of the radially-
834 chambered *Parasubbotina eoclava*, considered to be the precursor of the truly clavate
835 chambered *Clavigerinella* (Coxall et al., 2003; Pearson and Coxall, 2014), also occurs at 19.8
836 m, and in the core of the EECO (Luciani and Giusberti, 2014). *Clavigerinella* is the ancestor
837 of the genus *Hantkenina* that successfully inhabited the sub-surface and surface waters during
838 the middle through late Eocene (Coxall et al., 2000).

839 A second consideration is the change in planktic foraminiferal assemblages during the
840 Middle Eocene Climate Optimum (MECO), another interval of anomalous and prolonged
841 warmth ca. 40 Ma (Bohaty et al. and Zachos, 2009 2003). At Alano (**Figure 11**) and other
842 locations (Luciani et al., 2010; Edgar et al., 2012), the MECO involved the reduction in the
843 abundance and test size of large *Acarinina acarininids* and *Morozovelloides*. This has been
844 attributed to “bleaching” and the loss of photosymbionts resulting from global warming
845 (Edgar et al., 2012), although related factors, such as a decrease in pH, a decrease in nutrient

846 availability, or changes in salinity, may have been involved (Douglas, 2003; Wade et al.,
847 2008). The symbiotic relationship with algae is considered an important strategy adopted by
848 muricate planktic foraminifera during the early Paleogene (Norris, 1996; Quillévéré et al.,
849 2001). Considering the importance of this relationship in extant species (Bé, 1982; Bé et al.,
850 1982; Hemleben et al., 1989), the loss of photosymbionts may represent a crucial mechanism
851 to explain the relatively rapid decline foraminifera utilizing this strategy, including
852 *Morozovella morozovellids* at the start of the EECO.

853 Available data suggest that the protracted conditions of extreme warmth and high $p\text{CO}_2$
854 during the EECO were the key elements inducing a permanent impact on planktic
855 foraminiferal evolution, and the decline of *Morozovella* ~~the morozovellids~~. Even ~~during~~ the
856 PETM, the most pronounced hyperthermal, did not adversely affect the *genus Morozovella*
857 ~~morozovellids~~ permanently. While “excursion taxa” appeared, *Morozovella morozovellids*
858 seem to have increased in abundance in open ocean settings (Kelly et al., 1996; 1998, 2002;
859 Lu and Keller, 1995; Petrizzo, 2007); only in some continental margin settings did a transient
860 decrease in abundance occur (Luciani et al., 2007).

861

862 **6.7 Post-EECO changes at Possagno**

863

864 Several small CIEs appear in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record at Possagno during polarity chrons C22n, C21r,
865 and C21n. Some of these post-EECO excursions coincide with planktic foraminiferal
866 assemblage changes similar to those recorded in lower strata. Specifically, there are marked
867 increases of *Acarinina acarininids* (**Figure 6**). These “post-EECO” CIEs are concomitant
868 with $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ excursions and coupled to distinct modifications in the planktic foraminiferal
869 assemblages comparable to those recorded across known hyperthermals in Tethyan settings
870 (Luciani et al., 2007; Agnini et al., 2009; D’Onofrio et al., 2014). Additional hyperthermals,

871 although of less intensity and magnitude, may extend through the entirety of the early and
872 middle Eocene, as suggested previously (Sexton et al., 2006; 2011; Kirtland-Turner et al.,
873 2014). Whether these imply different forcing and feedback mechanisms compared to the
874 PETM remains an open discussion.

875

876 **7 Summary and conclusions**

877 The symbiont-bearing planktic foraminiferal genera *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* were
878 among the most important calcifiers of the early Paleogene tropical and subtropical oceans.
879 However, a remarkable and permanent switch in the relative abundance of these genera
880 happened in the early Eocene, an evolutionary change accompanied by species reduction of
881 *Morozovella* and species diversification of *Acarinina*. We show here that this switch probably
882 coincided with a carbon isotope excursion (CIE) presently coined J. Although the Early
883 Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO), a multi-million year interval of extreme Earth surface
884 warmth, lacks an accepted definition, we propose that the EECO is best defined as the
885 duration of time between the J event and the base of *D. sublodoensis* (about 53 Ma to 49 Ma
886 on the 2012 GTS).

887 Our conclusion that the planktic foraminiferal switch coincides with the start of the
888 EECO derives from the generation of new records and collation of old records concerning
889 bulk sediment stable isotopes and planktic foraminiferal abundances at three sections. These
890 sections span a wide longitude range of the low latitude Paleogene world: the Possagno
891 section from the western Tethys, DSDP Site 577 from the central Pacific Ocean, and ODP
892 Site 1051 from the western Atlantic Ocean. Importantly, these locations have robust
893 calcareous nannofossils and polarity chron age markers, although the stratigraphy required
894 amendment at Sites 577 and 1051.

895 An overarching problem is that global carbon cycling was probably very dynamic during

896 the EECO. The interval appears to have been characterized not only by numerous CIEs, but
897 also a major switch in the timing and magnitude of these perturbations. Furthermore, there
898 was a rapid shoaling of carbonate dissolution horizons in the middle of the EECO. A key
899 finding of our study is that the major switch in planktic foraminiferal assemblages happened
900 at the start of the EECO. Significant, though ephemeral, modifications in planktic
901 foraminiferal assemblages coincide with numerous short-term CIEs, before, during and after
902 the EECO. Often, there are marked increases in the relative abundance of *Acarinina*
903 ~~aearininids~~, similar to what happened permanently across the start of the EECO.

904 Although we show for the first time that the critical turnover in planktic foraminifera
905 clearly coincided with the start of the EECO, the exact cause for the switch (aka the decline
906 of *Morozovella morozovellids*) remains elusive. Possible causes are multiple, and may
907 include temperature effects on photosymbiont-bearing planktic foraminifera, changes in
908 ocean chemistry, or even interaction with other microplankton groups such as radiolarians,
909 diatoms or dinoflagellates that represented possible competitors in the use of symbionts or as
910 symbiont providers. For some reason, a critical threshold was surpassed at the start the
911 EECO, and this induced an unfavourable habitat for continued *Morozovella morozovellid*
912 diversification and proliferation but a favourable habitat for the *genus Acarinina* ~~aearininids~~.

913

914 *Acknowledgements.* Initial and primary funding for this research was provided by
915 MIUR/PRIN COFIN 2010-2011, coordinated by D. Rio. V. Luciani was financially
916 supported by FAR from Ferrara University, and L. Giusberti and E. Fornaciari received
917 financial support from Padova University (Progetto di Ateneo GIUSPRAT10). J. Backman
918 acknowledges support from the Swedish Research Council. G. Dickens received support
919 from the Swedish Research Council and the U.S. NSF (grant NSF-FESD-OCE-1338842). We
920 are grateful to Domenico Rio who promoted the research on the “Paleogene Veneto” and for

921 fruitful discussion. Members of the “Possagno net”, Simone Galeotti, Dennis Kent, and
922 Giovanni Muttoni, who sampled the Possagno section in 2002-2003, are gratefully
923 acknowledged. We warmly acknowledge the Cementi Rossi s.p.a. and Mr. Silvano Da Roit
924 for collaborations during sampling at the Carcoselle Quarry (Possagno, TV). This research
925 used samples and data provided by the Ocean Drilling Program (ODP). ODP is sponsored by
926 the U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF) and participating countries under management
927 of Joint Oceanographic Institution (JOI) Inc. We especially thank staff at the ODP Bremen
928 Core Repository. Finally, we are grateful to the reviewers, P. Pearson, R. Speijer, B. Wade,
929 and to the editor A. Sluijs who gave very detailed and constructive reviews that strengthened
930 the manuscript significantly.

931

932 **References**

933

- 934 Abels, H. A., Clyde, W. C., Gingerich, P. D., Hilgen, F. J., Fricke, H. C., Bowen, G. J., and
935 Lourens, L. J.: Terrestrial carbon isotope excursions and biotic change during Palaeogene
936 hyperthermals, *Nat. Geosci.*, 5, 326-329, doi: 10.1038/ngeo1427, 2012.
- 937 Agnini, C., Muttoni, G., Kent, D. V., and Rio, D.: Eocene biostratigraphy and magnetic
938 stratigraphy from Possagno, Italy: the calcareous nannofossils response to climate
939 variability, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 241, 815-830, 2006.
- 940 Agnini, C., Macrì, P., Backman, J., Brinkhuis, H., Fornaciari, E., Giusberti, L., Luciani, V.,
941 Rio, D., Sluijs, A., and Speranza, F.: An early Eocene carbon cycle perturbation at ≈ 52.5
942 Ma in the Southern Alps: chronology and biotic response, *Paleoceanography*, 24,
943 PA2209. doi: 10.1029/2008PA001649, 2009.
- 944 Agnini, C., Fornaciari, E., Raffi, I., Catanzariti, R., Pälike, H., Backman, J., and Rio, D.:
945 Biozonation and biochronology of Paleogene calcareous nannofossils from low to middle
946 latitudes, *News. Strat.*, 47, 131-181, 2014.
- 947 Agnini, C., Spofforth, D. J. A., Dickens, G. R., Rio, D., Pälike, H., Backman, J., Muttoni, G.,
948 and Dallanave, E.: Stable isotope and calcareous nannofossil assemblage records for the
949 Cicogna section: toward a detailed template of late Paleocene and early Eocene global

950 carbon cycle and nannoplankton evolution, *Clim. Past*, submitted.

951 Anderson, T. F., and Cole, S. A.: The stable isotope geochemistry of marine coccoliths: a
952 preliminary comparison with planktonic foraminifera, *J. Foram. Res.*, 5 (3), 188-192,
953 1975.

954 Arthur, M. A., Dean, W. E., Bottjer, D., and Scholle, P. A.: Rhythmic bedding in Mesozoic-
955 Cenozoic pelagic carbonate sequences: the primary and diagenetic origin of
956 Milankovitch like cycles, in: *Milankovitch and Climate*, A. Berger, J. Imbrie, J. Hays, G.
957 Kucla, B. S. (eds.), 191-222, D. Reidel Publ. Company, Dordrecht, Holland,
958 1984.

959 Arenillas, I., Molina, E., and Schmitz, B.: Planktic foraminiferal and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ isotopic changes
960 across the Paleocene/Eocene boundary at Possagno (Italy), *Int. J. Earth Sc.*, 88, 352-364,
961 1999.

962 Aze, T., Ezard, T. H. G., Purvis, A., Coxall, H. K., Stewart, D. R. M., Wade, B. S., and
963 Pearson, P. N.: A phylogeny of Cenozoic macroperforate planktonic foraminifera from
964 fossil data, *Biol. Rev.*, 86, 900-927. doi: 10.1111/j.1469-185X.2011.00178.x, 2011.

965 Backman, J.: Late Paleocene to middle Eocene calcareous nannofossil biochronology from
966 the Shatsky Rise, Walvis Ridge and Italy, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 57
967 (1), 43-59, 1986.

968 Bé, A. W. H.: Biology of planktonic foraminifera, in: *Foraminifera: notes for a short course*,
969 Broadhead T., *Stud. Geol.*, 6, Univ. Knoxville, Tenn., 51-92, 1982.

970 Bé, A. W. H., John, W. M., and Stanley, M. H.: Progressive dissolution and ultrastructural
971 breakdown of planktic foraminifera, *Cushman Foundation for Foraminiferal Research*
972 *Special Publication*, 13, 27-55, 1975.

973 Bé, A. W. H., Spero, H. J., and Anderson O. R.: Effects of symbiont elimination and
974 reinfection on the life processes of the planktonic foraminifer *Globigerinoides sacculifer*,
975 *Marine Biol.* 70, 73-86, 1982.

976 Bemis, B. E., Spero, H. J., Bijma, J., and Lea, D. W.: Reevaluation of the oxygen isotopic
977 composition of planktonic foraminifera: Experimental results and revised
978 paleotemperature equations, *Paleoceanography*, 13 (2), 150-160, 1998.

979 Berger, W. H.: Foraminiferal ooze: Solution at depth, *Science*, 156: 383-385, 1967.

980 Berger, W. H.: Planktonic foraminifera - selective solution and lysocline, *Marine Geol.*, 8(2),
981 111-138, 1970.

982 Berger, W. H., Bonneau, M.-C., and Parker, F. L.: Foraminifera on the deep-sea floor:
983 lysocline and dissolution rate, *Oceanol. Acta*, 5 (2), 249-258, 1982.

- 984 Berggren, W. A., and Norris, R. D.: Biostratigraphy, phylogeny and systematics of Paleocene
985 trochospiral planktic foraminifera, *Micropaleont.*, 43 (Suppl. 1), 1-116, 1997.
- 986 Berggren, W. A., and Pearson, P. N.: A revised tropical to subtropical Paleogene planktic
987 foraminiferal zonation: *J. Foram. Res.*, v. 35, p. 279-298, 2005.
- 988 Berggren, W. A., Kent, D. V., Swisher, C. C. III, and Aubry, M-P.: A revised Cenozoic
989 geochronology and chronostratigraphy, in: Berggren W. A, Kent D. V., Aubry M-P.,
990 Hardenbol J. (Eds.), *Geochronology, time scales and global stratigraphic correlation.*
991 *SEPM Special Publication 54*, 129-212, 1995.
- 992 Bijl, P. K., Schouten, S., Sluijs, A., Reichert, G.-J., Zachos, J. C., and Brinkhuis, H.: Early
993 Paleogene temperature evolution of the southwest Pacific Ocean. *Nature*, 461, 776–
994 779, doi:10.1038/nature08399, 2009.
- 995 Bijl, P. K., Bendle, J. A., Bohaty, S. M., Pross, J., Schouten, S., Tauxe, L., Stickle, C. E.,
996 McKay R. M., Röhl, U., Olney, M., Sluijs, A., Escutia Dotti, C., Brinkhuis, H. and
997 Expedition 318 Scientists (2013): Eocene cooling linked to early flow across the
998 Tasmanian Gateway. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United*
999 *States of America*, 110, 9645-9650, 24doi:10.1073/pnas.1220872110, 2013.
- 1000 Bleil, U.: The magnetostratigraphy of northwest Pacific sediments, *Deep Sea Drilling Project*
1001 *Leg 86, Initial Reports Deep Sea Drilling Project*, 86, 441-458.
- 1002 Boersma, A., and Premoli Silva, I.: Paleocene planktonic foraminiferal biogeography and the
1003 paleoceanography of the Atlantic-Ocean, *Micropaleont.*, 29, 355-381, 1983.
- 1004 Boersma, A., Premoli Silva, I., and Shackleton, N.: Atlantic Eocene planktonic foraminiferal
1005 biogeography and stable isotopic paleoceanography, *Paleoceanography*, 2, 287-331,
1006 1987.
- 1007 Bohaty, S. M., and J. C. Zachos: A significant Southern Ocean warming event in the late
1008 middle Eocene, *Geology*, 31, 1017–1020, doi:10.1130/G19800.1, 2003.
- 1009 Bohaty, S. M., Zachos, J. C., Florindo, F., and Delaney, M. L.: Coupled greenhouse warming
1010 and deep-sea acidification in the middle Eocene, *Paleoceanography*, 24, PA2207,
1011 doi:10.1029/2008PA001676, 2009.
- 1012 Bolli, H. M.: *Monografia micropaleontologica sul Paleocene e sull'Eocene di Possagno,*
1013 *Provincia di Treviso, Italia. Mémoires Suisses de Paléontologie 97: 222 pp.*, 1975.
- 1014 Borre, M. and Fabricus, I.L.: Chemical and mechanical processes during burial diagenesis of
1015 chalk: an interpretation based on specific surface data of deep-sea sediments,
1016 *Sedimentology*, 45, 755-769, 1998.
- 1017 Bosellini, A.: Dynamics of Tethyan carbonate platform, in: *Controls on Carbonate Platform*

1018 and Basin Platform, Crevello, P.D., Wilson, J.L., Sarg, J.F., Read, J.F., (Eds.), SEPM
1019 Spec. Publ., 44, 3-13, 1989.

1020 Bowen, G. J., Bralower, T. J., Delaney, M. R., Dickens, G. R., Kelly, D. C., Koch, P. L.,
1021 Kump, L. R., Meng, J., Sloan, L. C., Thomas, E., Wing, S. L., and Zachos, J. C.: Eocene
1022 Hyperthermal Event Offers Insight Into Greenhouse Warming, EOS, 87 (17), 165-169,
1023 DOI: 10.1029/2006EO170002, 2006.

1024 Braga G.: L'assetto tettonico dei dintorni di Possagno (Trevigiano occidentale). Rendiconti
1025 dell'Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, 8/48: 451-455, 1970.

1026 Bramlette, M. N., and Riedel, W. R.: Stratigraphic value of discoasters and some other
1027 microfossils related to recent coccolithophores, J. Paleont., 28: 385-403, 1954.

1028 Broecker, W. S., Clark, E., McCorkle D. C., Peng, T-H., Hajadas, I., and Bonani, G.:
1029 Evidence of a reduction in the carbonate ion content of the deep see during the course of
1030 the Holocene, Paleoceanography, 14 (6), 744-752, 1999.

1031 Brown, J. H., Gillooly, J. F., Allen, A. P., Savage, V. M., and West, G. B.: Toward a
1032 metabolic theory of ecology, Ecology, 85(7), 1771-1789, 2004.

1033 Cita, M. B.: Stratigrafia della Sezione di Possagno, in: Bolli, H. M. (Ed.), Monografia
1034 Micropaleontologica sul Paleocene e l'Eocene di Possagno, Provincia di Treviso, Italia,
1035 Schweiz. Palaeontol. Abhandl., 97, 9–33, 1975.

1036 Clyde, W. C., Gingerich, P. D., Wing, S. L., Röhl, U., Westerhold, T., Bowen, G., Johnson,
1037 K., Baczynski, A. A., Diefendorf, A., McInerney, F., Schnurrenberger, D., Noren, A.,
1038 Brady, K., and the BBCP Science Team: Bighorn Basin Coring Project (BBCP): A
1039 continental perspective on early Paleogene hyperthermals, Scientific Drilling, 16, 21-31,
1040 2013.

1041 Coccioni, R., Bancalà, G., Catanzariti, R., Fornaciari, E., Frontalini, F., Giusberti, L., Jovane,
1042 L., Luciani, V., Savian, J., and Sprovieri, M.: An integrated stratigraphic record of the
1043 Palaeocene–lower Eocene at Gubbio (Italy): new insights into the early Palaeogene
1044 hyperthermals and carbon isotope excursions, Terra Nova, 24, 380-386, 2012.

1045 Coxall, H. K., Pearson, P. N., Shackleton, N.J., Hall, M.A.: Hantkeninid depth adaptation: An
1046 evolving life strategy in a changing ocean, Geology, 28, 87-90, doi:10.1130/0091-
1047 7613(2000)28<87:HDAAEL>2.0.CO;2, 2000.

1048 Coxall, H. K., Huber, B. T., and Pearson, P. N.: Origin and morphology of the Eocene
1049 planktic foraminifera *Hantkenina*, J. Foram. Res., 33, 237-261, 2003.

1050 Cramer, B. S., Wright, J. D., Kent, D. V., and Aubry, M.-P.: Orbital climate forcing of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
1051 excursions in the late Paleocene–early Eocene (chrons C24n–C25n), Paleoceanography,

1052 18, 21-1. doi:10.1029/2003PA000909, 2003.

1053 Cramer, B. S., Toggweiler, J. R., Wright, M. E., Katz, J. D., and Miller, K. G.: Ocean
1054 overturning since the Late Cretaceous: Inferences from a new benthic foraminiferal
1055 isotope compilation, *Paleoceanography*, 24, PA4216, doi:10.1029/2008PA001683, 2009.

1056 Crouch, E. M., Heilmann-Clausen, C., Brinkhuis, H., Morgans, H. E. G, Rogers, K.
1057 M., Egger, H., and Schmitz, B.: Global dinoflagellate event associated with the late
1058 Paleocene thermal maximum, *Geology*, 29(4), 315-318, 2001.

1059 D'Onofrio, R., Luciani V., Giusberti L., Fornaciari E., and Sprovieri, M.: Tethyan planktic
1060 foraminiferal record of the early Eocene hyperthermal events ETM2, H2 and I1 (Terche
1061 section, northeastern Italy), *Rendiconti Online della Società Geologica Italiana*, 31, 66-
1062 67, doi: 10.3301/ROL.2014.48, 2014.

1063 Dallanave, E., Agnini, C., Bachtadse, V., Muttoni, G., Crampton J. S., Strong, C. P., Hines,
1064 B. H., Hollis, C. J., and Slotnick, B. S.: Early to middle Eocene magneto-biochronology
1065 of the southwest Pacific Ocean and climate influence on sedimentation: Insights from the
1066 Mead Stream section, New Zealand, *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.*, 127 (5-6), 643-660, 2015.

1067 DeConto, R. M., Galeotti, S., Pagani, M., Tracy, D., Schaefer, K., Zhang, T., Pollard, D., and
1068 Beerling, D. J.: Past extreme warming events linked to massive carbon re-release from
1069 thawing permafrost, *Nature*, 484, 87-92, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature10929>, 2012.

1070 Demicco, R. V.: Modeling seafloor-spreading rates through time, *Geology*, 32, 485-488,
1071 2004.

1072 Dickens, G. R.: Methane oxidation during the Late Palaeocene Thermal Maximum, *B. Soc.*
1073 *Geol. Fr.*, 171 (1), 37-49, 2000.

1074 Dickens, G. R.: Down the Rabbit Hole: toward appropriate discussion of methane release
1075 from gas hydrate systems during the Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum and other past
1076 hyperthermal events. *Clim. Past*, 7, 831-846. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5194/cp-7-831-2011>,
1077 2011.

1078 Dickens, G. R., and Backman J.: Core alignment and composite depth scale for the lower
1079 Paleogene through uppermost Cretaceous interval at Deep Sea Drilling Project Site 577,
1080 *Newsl. Stratigr.*, 46, 47-68, 2013.

1081 Dickens, G. R., O'Neil, J. R., Rea, D. K., and Owen, R. M.: Dissociation of oceanic methane
1082 hydrate as a cause of the carbon isotope excursion at the end of the Paleocene,
1083 *Paleoceanography*, 10, 965-971, doi:10.1029/95PA02087, 1995.

1084 Dickens, G. R., Castillo, M. M., and Walker, J. C. G.: A blast of gas in the latest Paleocene:
1085 simulating first-order effects of massive dissociation of oceanic methane hydrate,

1086 Geology, 25, 259-262, 1997.

1087 Dunkley Jones, T., Lunt, D. J., Schmidt, D. N., Ridgwell, A., Sluijs, A., Valdez, P. J., and
1088 Maslin, M. A.: Climate model and proxy data constraints on ocean warming across the
1089 Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum, *Earth Sci. Rev.*, 125, 123-145, 2013.

1090 Edgar, K. M., Bohaty, S. M., Gibbs, S. J., Sexton, P. F., Norris, R. D., and Wilson, P. A.:
1091 Symbiont ‘bleaching’ in planktic foraminifera during the Middle Eocene Climatic
1092 Optimum, *Geology*, 41, 15-18, doi:10.1130/G33388.1, 2012.

1093 Ernst, S.R., Guasti, E., Dupuis, C., and Speijer, R.P.: Environmental perturbation in the
1094 southern Tethys across the Paleocene/Eocene boundary (Dababiya, Egypt): foraminiferal
1095 and clay mineral records. *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 60, 89–111, 2006.

1096 Ezard, T. H. G., Aze, T., Pearson, P.N., and Purvis, A: Interplay between changing climate
1097 and species’ ecology drives macroevolutionary dynamics, *Science*, 332, 349-351, 2011.

1098 Falkowski, P. G., Katz, M. E., Milligan, A. J., Fennel, K., Cramer, B. S., Aubry, M. P.,
1099 Berner, R. A., Novacek, M. J., Zapol, W. M.: Mammals evolved, radiated, and grew in
1100 size as the concentration of oxygen in Earth's atmosphere increased during the past 100
1101 million years, *Science*, 309 (5744), 2202-2204, 2005.

1102 Figueirido, B., Janis, C. M., Pérez-Claros, J. A., De Renzi, M., and Palmqvist, P.: Cenozoic
1103 climate change influences mammalian evolutionary dynamics, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*
1104 USA, 109 (3), 722-727, 2012.

1105 Fletcher, B. J., Brentnall, S. J., Anderson, C. W., Berner, R. A., and Beerling, D.J.:
1106 Atmospheric carbon dioxide linked with Mesozoic and early Cenozoic climate change,
1107 *Nature Geoscience*, 1, 43-48, 2008.

1108 Fornaciari, E., Giusberti, L., Luciani, V., Tateo, F., Agnini, C., Backman, J., Oddone, M., and
1109 Rio, D.: An expanded Cretaceous–Tertiary transition in a pelagic setting of the Southern
1110 Alps (central–western Tethys), *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 255, 98-131,
1111 2007.

1112 Fraass, A. J., Kelly, D. K., and Peters, S. E.: Macroevolutionary history of the planktic
1113 foraminifera, *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 43, 139-66, doi:
1114 10.1146/annurev-earth-060614-105059, 2015.

1115 Frank, T. D., Arthur, M. A., and Dean, W. E.: Diagenesis of Lower Cretaceous pelagic
1116 carbonates, North Atlantic: paleoceanographic signals obscured, *J. Foramin. Res.*, 29,
1117 340-351, 1999.

1118 Galeotti, S., Krishnan, S., Pagani, M., Lanci, L., Gaudio, A., Zachos, J. C., Monechi, S.,
1119 Morelli, G., and Lourens, L. J.: Orbital chronology of early Eocene hyperthermals from

- 1120 the Contessa Road section, central Italy, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 290(1-2), 192-200, doi:
1121 10.1016/j.epsl.2009.12.021, 2010.
- 1122 Gingerich, P. D.: Rates of evolution on the time scale of the evolutionary process, *Genetica*,
1123 112-113, 127-144, 2001.
- 1124 Gingerich, P. D.: Mammalian response to climate change at the Paleocene–Eocene boundary:
1125 Polecat Bench record in the northern Bighorn Basin, Wyoming, *Geol. Soc. Am. Spec.*
1126 *Pap.*, 369, 463-478, 2003.
- 1127 Giusberti, L., Rio, D., Agnini, C., Backman, J., Fornaciari, E., Tateo, E., and Oddone, M.:
1128 Mode and tempo of the Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum in an expanded section
1129 from the Venetian pre-Alps, *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.*, 119, 391-412, 2007.
- 1130 Guasti, E., and Speijer, R.P.: The Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum in Egypt and
1131 Jordan: an overview of the planktic foraminiferal record. *Geol. Soc. Spec. Pap.*, 424, 53–
1132 67, 2007.
- 1133 Hallock, P.: Fluctuations in the trophic resource continuum: a factor in global diversity
1134 cycles? *Paleoceanography*, 2, 457–471, 1987.
- 1135 Hancock, H. J. L., and Dickens, G. R.: Carbonate dissolution episodes in Paleocene and
1136 Eocene sediment, Shatsky Rise, west-central Pacific, *Proc. Ocean Drill. Progr., Sci.*
1137 *Results* 198, 24 pp., doi:10.2973/odp.proc.sr.198.116., 2005.
- 1138 Hemleben, C, Spindler, M., and Anderson, O. R (Eds.): *Modern planktonic foraminifera*,
1139 Springer-Verlag, New York, 1-363, ISBN-13: 9780387968155, 1989.
- 1140 Hilgen, F. J., Abels, H. A., Kuiper, K. F., Lourens, L. J., and Wolthers, M.: Towards a stable
1141 astronomical time scale for the Paleocene: aligning Shatsky Rise with the Zumaia –
1142 Walvis Ridge ODP Site 1262 composite, *Newsl. Stratigr.*, 48, 91-110, doi:
1143 10.1127/nos/2014/0054, 2015.
- 1144 Hollis, C. J., Taylor, K. W. R., Handley, L., Pancost, R. D., Huber, M., Creech, J. B., Hines,
1145 B. R., Crouch, E. M., Morgans, H. E. G., Crampton, J. S., Gibbs, S., Pearson, P. N., and
1146 Zachos, J. C.: Early Paleogene temperature history of the Southwest Pacific Ocean:
1147 Reconciling proxies and models: *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 349-350, 53–66, doi:
1148 10.1016/j.epsl.2012.06.024, 2012.
- 1149 Huber, M., and Caballero, R.: The early Eocene equable climate problem revisited. *Clim.*
1150 *Past*, 7, 603-633, 2011.
- 1151 Hyland, E. G., and Sheldon, N. D.: Coupled CO₂-climate response during the Early Eocene
1152 Climatic Optimum, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 369, 125-135, 2013.
- 1153 Hyland, E. G., Sheldon, N. D., and Fan, M.: Terrestrial paleoenvironmental reconstructions

1154 indicate transient peak warming during the early Eocene climatic optimum, *Geol. Soc.*
1155 *Am. Bull.*, 125 (7-8), 1338-1348, 2013.

1156 IPCC, 2014: *Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II*
1157 *and III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate*
1158 *Change [Core Writing Team, R.K. Pachauri and L.A. Meyer (eds.)]. IPCC, Geneva,*
1159 *Switzerland, 151 pp, 2014.*

1160 Inglis, G. N., Farnsworth, A., Lunt, D., Foster, G. L., Hollis, C. J., Pagani, M., Jardine, P. E.,
1161 Pearson, P. N., Markwick, P., Galsworthy, A. M. J., Raynham, L., Taylor, K. W. R., and
1162 Pancost, R. D.: Descent toward the icehouse: Eocene sea surface cooling inferred from
1163 GDGT distributions. *Paleoceanography*, 30 (7), 100-1020, 10.1002/2014PA002723,
1164 2015.

1165 Ito, G., and Clift, P. D.: Subsidence and growth of Pacific Cretaceous plateaus. *Earth Plant.*
1166 *Sci. Lett.*, 161, 85-100, 1998.

1167 John E. H., Pearson P. N., Coxall H. K., Birch H., Wade B. S., and Foster G. L.: Warm ocean
1168 processes and carbon cycling in the Eocene, *Phil. Trans. R. Soc., A*, 371, 20130099,
1169 2013.

1170 John E. H., Wilson J. D., Pearson P. N., and Ridgwell, A.: Temperature-dependent
1171 remineralization and carbon cycling in the warm Eocene oceans, *Palaeogeogr.*
1172 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 413, 158-166, 2014.

1173 Kelly, D. C., Bralower, T. J., Zachos, J. C., Premoli Silva, I., and Thomas, E.: Rapid
1174 diversification of planktonic foraminifera in the tropical Pacific (ODP Site 865) during
1175 the late Paleocene thermal maximum, *Geology* 24, 423-426, 1996.

1176 Kelly, D. C., Bralower, T. J., and Zachos, J. C.: Evolutionary consequences of the latest
1177 Paleocene thermal maximum for tropical planktonic foraminifera, *Palaeogeogr.*,
1178 *Palaeoclimatol., Palaeoecol.*, 141, 139-161, 1998.

1179 Kennett, J. P., and Stott, L. D.: Abrupt deep-sea warming, palaeoceanographic changes and
1180 benthic extinctions at the end of the Palaeocene, *Nature* 353, 225-229, 1991.

1181 Kirtland-Turner, S., Sexton P. F., Charled C. D., and Norris R. D.: Persistence of carbon
1182 release events through the peak of early Eocene global warmth, *Nature Geoscience*, 7,
1183 748-751, doi: 10.1038/NGEO2240, 2014.

1184 Komar, N., Zeebe, R. E., and Dickens, G. R.: Understanding long-term carbon cycle trends:
1185 the late Paleocene through the early Eocene, *Paleoceanography*, 28, 650-662, doi:
1186 10.1002/palo.20060, 2013.

1187 Kroenke, L. W., Berger, W. H., Janecek, T. R., et al.: Ontong Java Plateau, Leg 130: synopsis

1188 of major drilling results, Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Initial Reports, 130,
1189 497-537, 1991.

1190 Kurtz, A. C., Kump, L. R., Arthur, M. A., Zachos, J. C., and Paytan, A.: Early Cenozoic
1191 decoupling of the global carbon and sulfur cycles, *Paleoceanography*, 18, 1090, doi:
1192 10.1029/2003PA000908, 2003.

1193 Lauretano, V., Littler, K., Polling, M., Zachos, J. C., and Lourens, L. J.: Frequency,
1194 magnitude and character of hyperthermal events at the onset of the Early Eocene
1195 Climatic Optimum, *Clim. Past*, 11, 1313-1324, doi: 10.5194/cp-11-1313-2015, 2015.

1196 Lee C. T., Shen B., Slotnick B. S., Liao K., Dickens G. R., Yokoyama Y., Lenardic A.,
1197 Dasgupta R., Jellinek M., Lackey J. S., Schneider T., and Tice M. M.: Continental arc-
1198 island arc fluctuations, growth of crustal carbonates, and long-term climate change,
1199 *Geosphere*, 9, 21-36, 2013.

1200 LeGrande, A. N. and Schmidt, G. A.: Global gridded data set of the oxygen isotopic
1201 composition in seawater, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 33, L12604, doi: 10.1029/2006GL026011,
1202 2006.

1203 Leon-Rodriguez, L. and Dickens, G. R.: Constraints on ocean acidification associated with
1204 rapid and massive carbon injections: The early Paleogene record at ocean drilling
1205 program site 1215, equatorial Pacific Ocean, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*,
1206 298 (3-4), 409-420, doi: 10.1016/j.palaeo.2010.10.029, 2010.

1207 Lirer, F.: A new technique for retrieving calcareous microfossils from lithified lime deposits.
1208 *Micropaleontol.*, 46, 365–369, 2000.

1209 Littler, K., Röhl, U., Westerhold, T., and Zachos, J. C.: A high-resolution benthic stable-
1210 isotope for the South Atlantic: implications for orbital-scale changes in Late Paleocene-
1211 early Eocene climate and carbon cycling, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 401, 18-30.
1212 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.05.054>, 2014.

1213 Lourens, L. J., Sluijs, A., Kroon, D., Zachos, J. C., Thomas, E., Röhl, U., Bowles, J., and
1214 Raffi, I.: Astronomical pacing of late Palaeocene to early Eocene global warming events,
1215 *Nature*, 7045, 1083-1087, 2005.

1216 Lowenstein, T. K., and Demicco R. V.: Elevated Eocene atmospheric CO₂ and its subsequent
1217 decline, *Science*, 313 (5795), doi: 10.1126/science.1129555, 2006.

1218 Lu, G.: Paleocene-Eocene transitional events in the ocean: Faunal and isotopic analyses of
1219 planktic foraminifera, Ph.D. Thesis, Princeton University, pp. 1-284, 1995.

1220 Lu, G., and Keller, G.: Planktic foraminiferal faunal turnovers in the subtropical Pacific
1221 during the late Paleocene to early Eocene, *J. Foramin. Res.*, 25 (2), 97-116, 1995.

- 1222 Lu, G., Keller, G. and Pardo, A.: Stability and change in Tethyan planktic foraminifera across
1223 the Paleocene-Eocene transition, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 35 (3-4), 203-233, 1998.
- 1224 Luciani, V., Giusberti, L., Agnini, C., Backman, J., Fornaciari, E., and Rio, D.: The
1225 Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum as recorded by Tethyan planktonic foraminifera
1226 in the Forada section (northern Italy), *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 64, 189-214, 2007.
- 1227 Luciani, V., Giusberti, L., Agnini, C., Fornaciari, E., Rio, D., Spofforth, D. J. A., and Pälke
1228 H.: Ecological and evolutionary response of Tethyan planktonic foraminifera to the
1229 middle Eocene climatic optimum (MECO) from the Alano section (NE Italy),
1230 *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 292, 82-95, doi: 10.1016/j.palaeo.2010.03.029,
1231 2010.
- 1232 Luciani, V., and Giusberti, L.: Reassessment of the early–middle Eocene planktic
1233 foraminiferal biomagnetostratigraphy: new evidence from the Tethyan Possagno section
1234 (NE Italy) and Western North Atlantic Ocean ODP Site 1051, *J. Foram. Res.*, 44, 2, 187-
1235 201, 2014.
- 1236 Lunt, D. J., Ridgwell, A., Sluijs, A., Zachos, J., Hunter, S., and Haywood, A.: A model for
1237 orbital pacing of methane hydrate destabilization during the Palaeogene, *Nat. Geosc.*, 4,
1238 775-778, doi: 10.1038/NGEO1266, 2011.
- 1239 Marshall, J. D.: Climatic and oceanographic isotopic signals from the carbonate rock records
1240 and their preservation, *Geol. Mag.*, 129, 143-160, 1992.
- 1241 Matter, A., Douglas, R. G., and Perch-Nielsen, K: Fossil preservation, geochemistry and
1242 diagenesis of pelagic carbonates from Shatsky Rise, northwest Pacific, Initial Reports
1243 Deep Sea Drilling Project, 32, 891-922, doi: 10.2973/dsdp.proc.32.137, 1975.
- 1244 Martini, E.: Standard Tertiary and Quaternary calcareous nannoplankton zonation. In:
1245 Farinacci, A., Ed., *Proceedings of the 2nd Planktonic Conference*, 739–785. Roma:
1246 Edizioni Tecnoscienza, vol. 2, 1971.
- 1247 McInerney, F. A. and Wing, S. L.: The Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum: a perturbation
1248 of carbon cycle, climate, and biosphere with implications for the future, *Ann. Rev. Earth
1249 Planet. Sci.*, 39, 489-516, doi: 10.1146/annurev-earth-040610-133431, 2011.
- 1250 Mita, I.: Data Report: Early to late Eocene calcareous nannofossil assemblages of Sites 1051
1251 and 1052, Blake Nose, Northwestern Atlantic Ocean, *Proc. Ocean Drilling Program, Sci.
1252 Results*, 171B, 1-28, 2001.
- 1253 Molina, E., Arenillas, I., Pardo, A.: High resolution planktic foraminiferal biostratigraphy
1254 and correlation across the Palaeocene Palaeocene/Eocene boundary in the Tethys, *B.
1255 Soc. Géol. Fr.*, 170, 521–530, 1999.

- 1256 Monechi, L., Bleil, U., and Backman, J.: Magnetobiochronology of Late Cretaceous-
1257 Paleogene and late Cenozoic pelagic sedimentary sequences from the northwest Pacific
1258 (Deep Sea Drilling Project, Leg 86, Site 577. Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program
1259 86, Initial Reports, Ocean Drilling Program, College Station, TX,
1260 doi:10.2973/dsdp.proc.86.137.1985.
- 1261 Nguyen, T. M. P., Petrizzo, M.-R., and Speijer, R. P.: Experimental dissolution of a fossil
1262 foraminiferal assemblage (Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum, Dababiya, Egypt):
1263 implications for paleoenvironmental reconstructions, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 73 (3-4), 241-
1264 258, doi: 10.1016/j.marmicro.2009.10.005, 2009.
- 1265 Nguyen, T. M. P., Petrizzo, M.-R., Stassen, P., and Speijer, R. P.: Dissolution susceptibility
1266 of Paleocene–Eocene planktic foraminifera: Implications for palaeoceanographic
1267 reconstructions, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 81, 1-21, 2011.
- 1268 Nicolo, M. J., Dickens, G. R., Hollis, C. J., and Zachos, J. C.: Multiple early Eocene
1269 hyperthermals: their sedimentary expression on the New Zealand continental margin and
1270 in the deep sea, *Geology*, 35, 699-702, 2007.
- 1271 Norris, R.D.: Biased extinction and evolutionary trends, *Paleobiology*, 17 (4), 388-399, 1991.
- 1272 Norris, R.: Symbiosis as an evolutionary innovation in the radiation of Paleocene planktic
1273 foraminifera, *Paleobiology*, 22, 461-480, 1996.
- 1274 Norris, R. D., Kroon, D., and Klaus, A.: Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Initial
1275 Reports, 171B, Proc. Ocean Drill. Progr. Sci. Results, 1-749, 1998.
- 1276 O'Connor, M., Piehler, M. F., Leech, D. M., Anton, A., and Bruno, J. F.: Warming and
1277 resource availability shift food web structure and metabolism, *PLOS Biol.*, 7(8), 1-6. doi:
1278 10.1371/journal.pbio.1000178, 2009.
- 1279 Ogg, J. G., and Bardot, L.: Aptian through Eocene magnetostratigraphic correlation of the
1280 Blake Nose Transect (Leg 171B), Florida continental margin, Proc. Ocean Drill. Progr.,
1281 Sci. Results, 171B, 1-58, doi: 10.2973/odp.proc.sr.171B.104.2001
- 1282 Okada, H. and Bukry, D.: Supplementary modification and introduction of code numbers to
1283 the low-latitude coccolith biostratigraphic zonation (Bukry, 1973;1975). *Mar.*
1284 *Micropaleont.*, 5, 321-325, 1980.
- 1285 Olivarez Lyle, A., and Lyle, M. W.: Missing organic carbon in Eocene marine sediments: Is
1286 metabolism the biological feedback that maintains end-member climates?
1287 *Paleoceanography*, 21, PA2007, doi: 10.1029/2005PA001230, 2006.
- 1288 Oreshkina, T. V.: Evidence of late Paleocene - early Eocene hyperthermal events in

1289 biosiliceous sediments of Western Siberia and adjacent areas, *Austrian Journal of Earth*
1290 *Science*, 105, 145-153, 2012.

1291 Pälike, H., Lyle, M. W., Nishi, H., Raffi, I., Ridgwell, A., Gamage, K., Klaus, A., Acton, G.,
1292 Anderson, L., Backman, J., Baldauf, J., Beltran, C., Bohaty S. M., Bown, P., Busch, W.
1293 Channell, J. E. T., Chun, C. O. J., Delaney, M., Dewangan, P., Dunkley Jones, T., Edgar,
1294 K. M., Evans, H., Fitch, P. L., Foster, G. L., Gussone, N., Hasegawa, H., Hathorne, E. C.,
1295 Hayashi, H., Herrle, J. O., Holbourn, A., Hovan, S., Hyeong, K., Iijima, K., Ito, T.,
1296 Kamikuri, S., Kimoto, K., Kuroda, J., Leon-Rodriguez, L., Malinverno, A., Moore, T. C.,
1297 Brandon, H., Murphy, D. P., Nakamura, H., Ogane, K., Ohneiser, C. Richter, C.,
1298 Robinson, R., Rohling, E. J., Romero, O., Sawada, K., Scher, H., Schneider, L., Sluijs,
1299 A., Takata, H., Tian, J., Tsujimoto, A., Wade, B. S., Westerhold, T., Wilkens, R.,
1300 Williams, T., Wilson, P. A., Yamamoto, Y., Yamamoto, S., Yamazaki, T., and Zeebe, R.
1301 E.: Cenozoic record of the equatorial Pacific carbonate compensation depth, *Nature*, 488,
1302 609-614, doi: 10.1038/nature11360, 2012, 2012.

1303 Pearson P.N., Coxall H.K.: Origin of the Eocene planktonic foraminifer *Hantkenina* by
1304 gradual evolution, *Palaeontology*, 57, 243-267, 2014.

1305 Pearson, P. N., and Palmer, M. R.: Atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations over the past
1306 60 million years, *Nature*, 406, 695-699, doi: 10.1038/35021000, 2000.

1307 Pearson, P. N., Shackleton, N.J., Hall, M.A.: Stable isotope paleoecology of middle Eocene
1308 planktonic foraminifera and multi-species isotope stratigraphy, DSDP Site 523, south
1309 Atlantic, *J. Foram. Res.*, 23, 123-140, 1993.

1310 Pearson, P.N., Ditchfield, P.W, Singano, J., Harcourt-Brown, K.G., Nicholas, C.J., Olsson,
1311 R.K, Shackleton, N.J., Hall, M.A.: Warm tropical sea surface temperatures in the Late
1312 Cretaceous and Eocene epochs, *Nature*, 413, 481-487, 2001. doi:10.1038/35097000,
1313 2001.

1314 Pearson, P. N., Olsson, R. K., Huber, B. T., Hemleben, C., and Berggren, W.A. (Eds.): Atlas
1315 of Eocene planktonic foraminifera, *Cushman Found. Foram. Res., Spec. Publ.*, 41, 1-514,
1316 2006.

1317 Pearson, P. N., Van Dongen, B. E., Nicholas, C. J., Pancost, R. D., Schouten, S., Singano, J.
1318 M. and Wade, B. S.: Stable warm tropical climate through the Eocene Epoch, *Geology*,
1319 35, 211-214, 2007.

1320 Petrizzo, M.R.: The onset of the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM) at Sites 1209
1321 and 1210 (Shatsky Rise, Pacific Ocean) as recorded by planktonic foraminifera, *Mar.*
1322 *Micropaleont.*, 63, 187–200, 2007.

- 1323 Petrizzo, M.-R., Leoni, G., Speijer, R. P., De Bernardi, B., and Felletti, F.: Dissolution
1324 susceptibility of some Paleogene planktonic foraminifera from ODP Site 1209 (Shatsky
1325 Rise, Pacific Ocean), *J. Foram. Res.* 38, 357-371, 2008.
- 1326 Pross, J., Contreras, L., Bijl, P. K., Greenwood, D. R., Bohaty, S. M., Schouten, S., Bendle J.
1327 A., Röhl, U., Tauxe, L., Raine, J. I., Claire E., Huck, C. E., van de Flierdt, T., Stewart S.
1328 R. Jamieson, S. S. R., Stickley, C. E., van de Schootbrugge, B., Escutia, C., and
1329 Brinkhuis, H.: Persistent near-tropical warmth on the Antarctic continent during the early
1330 Eocene Epoch: *Nature*, v. 488, 73-77, doi: 10.1038/nature11300, 2012.
- 1331 Pujalte, V., Baceta, J. G., and Schmitz, B.: A massive input of coarse-grained siliciclastics in
1332 the Pyrenean Basin during the PETM: the missing ingredient of a coeval abrupt change
1333 in hydrological regime, *Clim. Past*, Climatic and biotic events of the Paleogene, Special
1334 issue, G. R. Dickens, V. Luciani, and A. Sluijs, (Eds.), 11, 1653-1672, doi:10.5194/cp-
1335 11-1653-2015, 2015.
- 1336 Quillévéré, F., Norris, R. D., Moussa, I., and Berggren, W. A.: Role of photosymbiosis and
1337 biogeography in the diversification of early Paleogene acarininids (planktonic
1338 foraminifera), *Paleobiology*, 27, 311-326, 2001.
- 1339 Raffi, I., and De Bernardi, B.: Response of calcareous nannofossils to the Paleocene-Eocene
1340 Thermal Maximum: observations on composition, preservation and calcification in
1341 sediments from ODP Site 1263 (Walvis Ridge-SW Atlantic). *Mar. Micropaleont.* 69,
1342 119–138, 2008.
- 1343 Raymo, M. E., and Ruddiman W. F.: Tectonic forcing of late Cenozoic climate, *Nature*, 359,
1344 117-122, 1992.
- 1345 Reghellin, D., Coxall, H. K., Dickens, G. R., and Backman, J.: Carbon and oxygen isotopes
1346 of bulk carbonate in sediment deposited beneath the eastern equatorial Pacific over the
1347 last 8 million years. *Paleoceanography*, 30: 1261-1286. doi: 10.1002/2015PA002825,
1348 2015.
- 1349 Röhl, U., Westerhold, T., Monechi, S., Thomas, E., Zachos, J. C., and Donner, B.: The third
1350 and final early Eocene Thermal Maximum: characteristics, timing, and mechanisms of
1351 the “X” event, *Geol. Soc. Am. Abstracts with Program*, 37(7), 264, 2005.
- 1352 Schlanger, S.O. and Douglas, R.G.: The pelagic ooze-chalk-limestone transition and its
1353 implications for marine stratigraphy, In: *Pelagic Sediments: on Land and under the Sea*,
1354 K.J. Hsü and H.C. Jenkyns (Eds.), *Spec. Publ. Ass. Sediment.*, 1, 117–148, 1974.
- 1355 Scholle, P. A., and Arthur, M. A.: Carbon isotope fluctuations in Cretaceous pelagic
1356 limestones: potential stratigraphic and petroleum exploration tool, *American Association*

- 1357 of Petroleum Geologists Bulletin, 64, 67-87, 1980.
- 1358 Schmitz, B., and Puljate, V.: Abrupt increase in seasonal extreme precipitation at the
1359 Paleocene-Eocene boundary, *Geology*, 35, 215-218, 2007.
- 1360 Schmidt, D. N., Thierstein, H. R., and Bollmann, J.: The evolutionary history of size variation
1361 of planktic foraminiferal assemblages in the Cenozoic, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.*
1362 *Palaeoecol.*, 212, 159-180, doi: 10.1016/j.palaeo.2004.06.002, 2004.
- 1363 Scheibner, C., and Speijer, R.P.: Decline of coral reefs during the late Paleocene to early
1364 Eocene global warming, *eEarth*, 3, 19-26, www.electronic-earth.net/3/19/2008/, 2008.
- 1365 Schneider, L. J. Bralower, T. J., and Kump, L. J.: Response of nannoplankton to early Eocene
1366 ocean de-stratification, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 310, 152-162, 2011.
- 1367 Schulte, P., Scheibner, C. and Speijer, R.C.: Fluvial discharge and sea-level changes
1368 controlling black shale deposition during the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum in
1369 the Dababiya Quarry section, Egypt, *Chem. Geol.*, 285, 167-183,
1370 doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2011.04.004, 2011.
- 1371 Schrag, D. P., DePaolo, D. J., and Richter, F. M.: Reconstructing past sea surface
1372 temperatures: correcting for diagenesis of bulk marine carbonate, *Geochim. Cosmochim.*
1373 *Ac.*, 59, 2265-2278, 1995.
- 1374 Schmitz, B., Speijer, R. P., and Aubry M.-P.: Latest Paleocene benthic extinction event on
1375 the southern Tethyan shelf (Egypt): Foraminiferal stable isotopic ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) records,
1376 *Geology*, 24, 347-350, 1996.
- 1377 Self-Trail, J. M., Powars, D. S., Watkins, D. K., Wandless, G. A.: Calcareous nannofossil
1378 assemblage changes across the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum: Evidence from a
1379 shelf setting, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 92–93, 61–80, 2012.
- 1380 Sexton, P.F., Wilson, P.A., Norris, R.D.: Testing the Cenozoic multisite composite $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and
1381 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ curves: New monospecific Eocene records from a single locality, Demerara Rise
1382 (Ocean Drilling Program Leg 207), *Paleoceanography*, 21, PA2019, 2006.
- 1383 Sexton, P. F., Norris R. D., Wilson, P. A., Pälike, H., Westerhold, T., Röhl, U., Bolton, C. T.,
1384 and Gibbs, S.: Eocene global warming events driven by ventilation of oceanic dissolved
1385 organic carbon, *Nature* 471, 349-353, doi: 10.1038/nature09826, 2011.
- 1386 Shackleton, N. J.: Paleogene stable isotope events. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclim. Palaeoecol.*, 57,
1387 91-102, 1986.
- 1388 **Shackleton, N.J. and Hall, M.A.: Carbon isotope data from Leg 74 sediments. Initial Reports**
1389 **of the Deep Sea Drilling Project 74, 613– 619, 1984.**

- 1390 Shackleton, N. J., and Hall, M. A.: Stable isotope records in bulk sediments (Leg 138), Proc.
1391 Ocean Drill. Progr. Sci. Results, 138, 797-805, doi:10.2973/odp.proc.sr.138.150.1995.
- 1392 Shamrock, J. L., Watkins, D. K., and Johnston, K. W.: Eocene bio-geochronology of ODP
1393 Leg 122 Hole 762C, Exmouth Plateau (northwest Australian Shelf), Stratigraphy, 9, 55-
1394 76, 2012.
- 1395 Shipboard Scientific Party, 1985, Site 577: Initial Reports Deep Sea Drilling Project, 86, in:
1396 Heath, G.R., Burckle, L.H., et al. (Eds.), Washington (U.S. Government Printing Office),
1397 91–137. doi:10.2973/dsdp.proc.86.104.1985, 1995.
- 1398 Shipboard Scientific Party, 1998, Site 1051: Proceeding Ocean Drilling Program, Initial
1399 Reports, 171B, in: Norris, R.D., Kroon, D., Klaus, A., et al (Eds.), Ocean Drilling
1400 Program, College Station, TX, 171–239. doi:10.2973/odp.proc.ir.171b.105.1998, 1998.
- 1401 Sims, P. A., Mann, D. G., and Medlin, L. K.: Evolution of the diatoms: insights from fossil,
1402 biological and molecular data, Phycologia, 45, 361-402, 2006.
- 1403 Sinton, C. W., and Duncan R. A.: ⁴⁰Ar-³⁹Ar ages of lavas from the southeast Greenland
1404 margin, ODP Leg 152, and the Rockall Plateau, DSDP Leg 81, Ocean Drill. Progr., Sci.
1405 Res., 152, 387-402, doi:10.2973/odp.proc.sr.152.234.1998, 1998.
- 1406 Slotnick, B. S., Dickens, G. R., Nicolo, M. J., Hollis, C. J., Crampton, J. S., Zachos, J. C., and
1407 Sluijs, A.: Large-amplitude variations in carbon cycling and terrestrial weathering during
1408 the latest Paleocene and earliest Eocene: The Record at Mead Stream, New Zealand, J.
1409 Geol., 120, 487-505, 2012.
- 1410 Slotnick, B. S., Dickens, G. R., Hollis, C. J., Crampton, J. S., Percy Strong, C., and Zachos, J.
1411 C.: Extending lithologic and stable carbon isotope records at Mead Stream (New
1412 Zealand) through the middle Eocene, in: Dickens G.R., Luciani V. eds. Climatic and
1413 biotic events of the Paleogene 2014 CBEP 2014 Volume 31, Roma, Società Geologica
1414 Italiana, 201-202, 2014.
- 1415 Slotnick, B. S., Dickens, G. R., Hollis, C. J., Crampton, J. S., Strong, P. S. and Phillips, A.:
1416 The onset of the Early Eocene Climatic Optimum at Branch Stream, Clarence River
1417 valley, New Zealand, New Zeal. J. Geol. Geop., doi: 10.1080/00288306.2015.1063514,
1418 2015a.
- 1419 Slotnick, B. S., Laurentano, V., Backman, J., Dickens, G. R., Sluijs, A., and Lourens, L.:
1420 Early Paleogene variations in the calcite compensation depth: new constraints using old
1421 borehole sediments from across Ninetyeast Ridge, central Indian Ocean, Clim. Past, 11,
1422 472-493, 2015b.
- 1423 Sluijs, A., and Dickens, G. R.: Assessing offsets between the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of sedimentary

- 1424 components and the global exogenic carbon pool across early Paleogene carbon cycle
1425 perturbations, *Global Biogeochem. Cy.*, 26 (4), GB4019, doi: 10.1029/2011GB004094,
1426 2012.
- 1427 Sluijs, A., Schouten, S., Pagani, M., Woltering, M., Brinkhuis, H., Sinninghe Damsté, J. S.,
1428 Dickens, G. R., Huber, M., Reichart, G., Stein, R., Matthiessen, J., Lourens, L. J.,
1429 Pedentchouk, N., Backman, J., Moran, K., and the Expedition 302 Scientists: Subtropical
1430 Arctic Ocean temperatures during the Palaeocene/Eocene thermal maximum, *Nature*,
1431 441, 610-613, doi: 10.1038/nature04668, 2006.
- 1432 Sluijs, A., Bowen, G. J., Brinkhuis, H., Lourens, L. J., and Thomas, E.: The Paleocene–
1433 Eocene thermal maximum super greenhouse: biotic and geochemical signatures, age
1434 models and mechanisms of global change, in: *Deep-Time Perspectives on Climate
1435 Change*, Williams, M., Haywood, A. M., Gregory, F. J., and Schmidt, D. N., (Eds.),
1436 *Micropalaeont. Soc. Spec. Publ.*, Geological Society, London, 323-350, 2007.
- 1437 Smith, R. Y., Greenwood, D. R., and Basinger, J. F.: Estimating paleoatmospheric pCO₂
1438 during the Early Eocene Climatic Optimum from stomatal frequency of Ginkgo,
1439 Okanagan Highlands, British Columbia, Canada, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.*
1440 *Palaeoecol.*, 293, 120-131, 2010.
- 1441 Stap, L., Sluijs, A., Thomas, E., and Lourens L. J.: Patterns and magnitude of deep sea
1442 carbonate dissolution during Eocene Thermal Maximum 2 and H2, Walvis Ridge,
1443 southeastern Atlantic Ocean, *Paleoceanography*, 24, 1211, doi: 10.1029/2008PA001655,
1444 2009.
- 1445 Thomas, E.: Biogeography of the late Paleocene benthic foraminiferal extinction, in: *Late
1446 Paleocene-early Eocene climatic and biotic events in the marine and terrestrial Records*,
1447 Aubry, M.-P., Lucas, S., and Berggren, W. A., (Eds.), Columbia University Press, New
1448 York, 214-243, 1998.
- 1449 Thomas, E., Brinkhuis, H., Huber, M., and Röhl, U.: An ocean view of the early Cenozoic
1450 Greenhouse world, *Oceanography*, 19, 94-103, 2006.
- 1451 Thunell R. C. and Honjo, S.: Calcite dissolution and the modification of planktonic
1452 foraminiferal assemblages, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 6, 169-182, 1981.
- 1453 **Van Hinsbergen, D. J. J., de Groot, L. V., van Schaik, S. J., Spakman, W., Bijl, P. K., Sluijs,**
1454 **A., Langereis, C. G., Brinkhuis, H.: A Paleolatitude Calculator for Paleoclimate Studies,**
1455 **PLoS ONE 10 (6), e0126946. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0126946, 2015.**
- 1456 Vandenberghe N., Hilgen F. J., Speijer R. P., Ogg J. G., Gradstein F. M., Hammer O., Hollis
1457 C. J., and Hooker J. J.: The Paleogene Period, in: *Gradstein, F., Ogg, J.G., Schmitz,*

- 1458 M.D., Ogg, G.M., (Eds.), The Geologic Time Scale 2012, 855-921, Elsevier,
1459 Amsterdam, 2012.
- 1460 Vincent, E., and Berger, W. H: Planktonic foraminifera and their use in paleoceanography;
1461 in: Emiliani. C (Ed.), The Sea, 7 (25), New York, 1025-1119, 1981.
- 1462 Vogt, P. R.: Global magmatic episodes: New evidence and implications for the steady state
1463 mid-oceanic ridge, *Geology*, 7, 93-98, 1979.
- 1464 Wade, B. S.: Planktonic foraminiferal biostratigraphy and mechanisms in the extinction of
1465 *Morozovella* in the late Middle Eocene, *Mar. Micropaleont.*, 51, 23–38, 2004.
- 1466 Wade, B. S., Al-Sabouni, N., Hemleben, C., and Kroon, D.: Symbiont bleaching in fossil
1467 planktonic foraminifera, *Evol. Ecol.*, 22, 253-265. doi: 10.1007/s10682-007-9176-6,
1468 2008.
- 1469 Wade, B. S., Pearson, P. N., Berggren, and W. A., Pälike, H.: Review and revision of
1470 Cenozoic tropical planktonic foraminiferal biostratigraphy and calibration to the
1471 geomagnetic polarity and astronomical time scale, *Earth Sci. Rev.*, 104, 111-142, doi:
1472 10.1016/j.earscirev.2010.09.003, 2011.
- 1473 Wade, B.S., Fucek, V.P., Kamikuri, S.-I., Bartol, M., Luciani, V., Pearson, P.N.: Successive
1474 extinctions of muricate planktonic foraminifera (*Morozovelloides* and *Acarinina*) as a
1475 candidate for marking the base Priabonian, *Newsl. Stratigr.*, 45 (3) 245-262, 2012.
- 1476 Westerhold, T., Röhl, U., Frederichs, T., Bohaty, S. M., and Zachos, J. C.: Astronomical
1477 calibration of the geological timescale: closing the middle Eocene gap, *Clim. Past*, 11,
1478 1181–1195, doi: 10.5194/cp-11-1181-2015, 2015.
- 1479 Wilf, P., Cúneo, R. N., Johnson, K. R., Hicks, J. F., Wing, S. L., and Obradovich, J. D.: High
1480 plant diversity in Eocene South America: evidence from Patagonia, *Science*, 300, 122-
1481 125, 2003.
- 1482 Wing, S. L., Bown, T. M., and Obradovich, J. D.: Early Eocene biotic and climatic change in
1483 interior western North America, *Geology* 19, 1189-1192, 1991.
- 1484 Woodbourne, M. O., Gunnell, G. F., and Stucky, R. K.: Climate directly influences Eocene
1485 mammal faunal dynamics in North America, *P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 106 (32), 13399-
1486 13403, 2009.
- 1487 Yapp, C. J.: Fe(CO₃)OH in goethite from a mid-latitude North American Oxisol: Estimate of
1488 atmospheric CO₂ concentration in the early Eocene "climatic optimum". *Geochim.*
1489 *Cosmochim. Ac.*, 68(5), 935-947. doi: 10.1016/j.gca.2003.09.002, 2004.
- 1490 Yamaguchi, T., and Norris R. D.: Deep-sea ostracode turnovers through the Paleocene-
1491 Eocene thermal maximum in DSDP Site 401, Bay of Biscay, North Atlantic, *Mar.*

- 1492 Micropaleont., 86-87, 32-44, 2012.
- 1493 Zachos, J. C., Pagani, M., Sloan, L., Thomas, E., and Billups, K.: Trends, rhythms, and
1494 aberrations in global climate 65 Ma to Present, *Science*, 292, 686-693, 2001.
- 1495 Zachos, J. C., Röhl, U., Schellenberg, S. A., Sluijs, A., Hodell, D. A., Kelly, D. C., Thomas,
1496 E., Nicolo, M., Raffi, I., Lourens, L. J., McCarren, H., and Kroon, D.: Rapid acidification
1497 of the ocean during the Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum, *Science*, 308, 1611-161,
1498 2005.
- 1499 Zachos, J. C., Dickens, G. R., and Zeebe, R. E.: An early Cenozoic perspective on
1500 greenhouse warming and carbon-cycle dynamics, *Nature*, 451, 279-283, 2008.
- 1501 Zachos, J. C., McCarren, H., Murphy, B., Röhl, U., and Westerhold, T.: Tempo and scale of
1502 late Paleocene and early Eocene carbon isotope cycles: Implications for the origin of
1503 hyperthermals, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 299, 242-249, doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2010.09.004,
1504 2010.
- 1505 Zeebe, R. E., Zachos, J. C., Dickens, G. R.: Carbon dioxide forcing alone insufficient to
1506 explain Palaeocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum warming. *Nat. Geosci.* 2 (8), 576-580,
1507 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/ngeo578>, 2009.
- 1508 Zonneveld, J. P., Gunnell, G. F., and Bartels, W. S.: Early Eocene fossil vertebrates from the
1509 southwestern Green River Basin, Lincoln and Uinta Counties, Wyoming, *Journal of*
1510 *Vertebrate Paleontology*, 20, 369-386, 2000.

1511

1512 **Figure Captions**

1513

1514 **Figure 1.** Evolution of climate, carbon cycling, and planktic foraminifera across the middle
1515 Paleogene on the GPTS 2012 time scale. Left side shows polarity chrons, and smoothed
1516 oxygen and carbon isotope records of benthic foraminifera, slightly modified from
1517 Vandenberghe et al. (2012). Original oxygen and carbon isotope values come from
1518 compilations by Zachos et al. (2008) and Cramer et al. (2009). Middle of the figure indicates
1519 planktic foraminiferal biozones by Wade et al. (2011) with three modifications. The lower
1520 boundary for Zone E7a is now based on the first occurrence of *Astrorotalia palmerae* due to
1521 diachroneity in the first appearance of the previously selected marker *Acarinina*

1522 *cuneicamerata* (Luciani and Giusberti, 2014). The base of Zone E5, identified by the first
1523 appearance of *Morozovella aragonensis*, occurs within the middle of C24n instead of lower
1524 C23r (see text). A question marks the top of *Morozovella subbotinae* because there is
1525 diachroneity for this occurrence (see text). Right side shows a partial view of *Morozovella*
1526 ~~morozovellid~~ and *Acarinina* ~~acariniid~~ evolution as envisioned by Pearson et al. (2006) and
1527 Aze et al. (2011). It does not include several “root taxa” that disappear in the earliest Eocene
1528 (e.g., *M. velascoensis*) or “excursion taxa” that appear during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal
1529 Maximum (PETM) (e.g., *M. allisonensis*). Superimposed on these records are key intervals of
1530 climate change, including the Early Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO), the Middle Eocene
1531 Climatic Optimum (MECO) and the three well documented early Eocene hyperthermal
1532 events. The extent of the EECO is not precise, because of stratigraphic issues (see text). Red
1533 and blue triangles= top and base of the *Morozovella* ~~morozovellid~~ and *Acarinina* ~~acariniid~~
1534 zonal markers.

1535

1536 **Figure 2.** Approximate locations of the three sites discussed in this work during the early
1537 Eocene. Also shown is Site 1258, which has a bulk carbonate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record spanning the
1538 EECO. Base map is from <http://www.odsn.de/services/paleomap.html> with paleolatitudes
1539 modified for Sites 577, 1051 and 1258 according to www.paleolatitude.org model version 1.2
1540 (Van Hinsbergen et al., 2015). Possagno paleolatitude is referred to the
1541 http://www.odsn.de/odsn/services/paleomap/adv_map.html model since it is not yet
1542 available at <http://www.odsn.de/services/paleomap.html>.

1543

1544 **Figure 3.** The Possagno section. Upper panel: geological map (modified from Braga, 1970).
1545 1 = Quaternary deposits; 2, 3 = Calcarenite di Castelcucco (Miocene); 4 = glauconitic
1546 arenites (Miocene); 5 = siltstones and conglomerates (upper Oligocene-lower Miocene); 6 =

1547 Upper Marna di Possagno (upper Eocene); 7 = Formazione di Pradelgiglio (upper Eocene); 8
1548 = Marna di Possagno (upper Eocene); 9 = Scaglia Cinerea (middle-upper Eocene); 10 =
1549 Scaglia Rossa (upper Cretaceous-lower Eocene); 11 = faults; 12 = traces of stratigraphic
1550 sections originally studied by Bolli (1975); red circle = the Carcoselle quarry. Lower panel:
1551 the exposed quarry face during Summer 2002 (Photo by Luca Giusberti).

1552

1553 **Figure 4.** Lithology, stratigraphy, and bulk sediment stable-isotope composition of the
1554 Possagno section aligned according to depth. Lithologic key: 1 = limestone; 2 = marly
1555 limestone and calcareous marl; 3 = cyclical marl-limestone alternations, 4 = marl; 5= Clay
1556 Marl unit (CMU). Planktic foraminiferal biozones follow those of Wade et al. (2011), as
1557 modified by Luciani and Giusberti (2014). Magnetostratigraphy and key calcareous
1558 nannofossil events come from Agnini et al. (2006); NP-zonation is from Martini (1971).
1559 Nannofossil events are shown as red triangles (tops), blue triangles (bases), and purple
1560 diamonds (evolutionary crossovers); *S. rad.* = *Sphenolithus radians*; T.c./T.o. = *Tribrachiatus*
1561 *contortus*/ *Tribrachiatus orthostylus*; *D. lod.* = *Discoaster lodoensis*; Tow. = *Toweius*; *T. orth.*
1562 = *Tribrachiatus orthostylus*; *D. sublod.* = *Discoaster sublodoensis*. Stable isotope records
1563 determined in this study. Established early Eocene “events” are superimposed in light red;
1564 suggested carbon isotope excursions (CIEs) within the EECO are shown with numbers.

1565

1566 **Figure 5.** Cores, stratigraphy, and bulk sediment stable isotope composition for the early
1567 Eocene interval at Deep-Sea Drilling Project (DSDP) Site 577 aligned according to
1568 composite depth (Dickens and Backman, 2013). Note the increased length for the gap
1569 between Core 577*-8H and Core 577*-9H (see text). The Wade et al. (2011) E-zonation,
1570 partly modified by Luciani and Giusberti (2014), has been applied to Site 577 given
1571 assemblages presented by Lu (1995) and Lu and Keller (1995). Note that: (a) the base of

1572 Zone E3 (top of *Morozovella velascoensis*) lies within a core gap; (b) the E4/E5 zonal
1573 boundary (base of *M. aragonensis*) occurs within C24n, in agreement with Luciani and
1574 Giusberti (2014); (c) the E5/E6 zonal boundary is problematic because the top of *M.*
1575 *subbotinae* occurs in middle C24n, much earlier than the presumed disappearance in the
1576 upper part of C23n (Wade et al., 2011). We have therefore positioned the E5/E6 boundary at
1577 the lowest occurrence of *Acarinina aspensis*, according to the original definition of Zone E5
1578 (Berggren and Pearson, 2005); (d) we cannot differentiate between Zone E6 and Zone E7a
1579 due to the absence of *Astrorotalia palmerae* and to the diachronous appearance of *A.*
1580 *cuneicamerata* (Luciani and Giusberti, 2014). Magnetostratigraphy and key calcareous
1581 nannofossil events are those summarized by Dickens and Backman (2013). For the latter and
1582 beyond that noted for **Figure 4**: *F. spp.* = *Fasciculithus spp.*; *D. dia.* = *Discoaster diastypus*.
1583 Stable isotope records: black - Cramer et al. (2003), red and blue - this study. Early Eocene
1584 “events” are the same as those in **Figure 4**.

1585

1586

1587 **Figure 6.** The Possagno section and its $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record (**Figure 4**) with measured relative
1588 abundances of primary planktic foraminiferal genera, fragmentation index (*F* index) and
1589 coarse fraction. The subbotinid abundance includes both *Subbotina* and *Parasubbotina*
1590 genera. Note that a significant increase in *Acarinina* abundance marks the EECO and several
1591 carbon isotope excursions (CIEs). Note also the major decline in abundance of *Morozovella*
1592 at the start of the EECO. Filled yellow hexagons show occurrences of abundant radiolarians.
1593 Lithological symbols and early Eocene “events” are the same as those in **Figure 4**.

1594

1595 **Figure 7.** The early Eocene succession at DSDP Site 577 and its $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record (**Figure 5**) with
1596 relative abundances of primary planktic foraminiferal genera (Lu, 1995; Lu and Keller,

1597 1995). Note the major switch in *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* abundances approximately
1598 coincides with the J-event, the top of polarity chron C24n, and the start of the EECO. Early
1599 Eocene “events” are the same as those in **Figure 4**.

1600

1601 **Figure 8.** Stratigraphy, bulk sediment $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ composition, relative abundances of primary
1602 planktic foraminiferal genera, and fragmentation index (*F* index) for the early Eocene interval
1603 at ODP Site 1051. Planktic foraminiferal biozones follow those of Wade et al. (2011), as
1604 modified by Luciani and Giusberti (2014; see **Figure 1** caption). Magnetostratigraphy and
1605 positions of key calcareous nannofossil events come from Ogg and Bardot (2001) and Mita
1606 (2001), but with an important modification to polarity chron labelling (see text and Cramer et
1607 al., 2003). Calcareous nannofossil horizons are the same as in previous figures. Foraminiferal
1608 information comes from this study; subbotinids include both *Subbotina* and *Parasubbotina*.
1609 Early Eocene “events” are the same as those in **Figure 4**.

1610

1611 **Figure 9.** Carbon isotope and paleomagnetic records across the early Eocene for the
1612 Possagno section, DSDP Site 577, and ODP Site 1258 (Kirtland-Turner et al., 2014). This
1613 highlights the overall framework of carbon cycling in the early Eocene, but also stratigraphic
1614 problems across the EECO at each of the three sites. At Possagno, the coarse resolution of
1615 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ records and the condensed interval makes correlations difficult. At ODP Site 1258 the
1616 prominent K/X event seems missing. At DSDP Site 577, the entire record is compressed in
1617 the depth domain. Nonetheless, a major shift in frequency and amplitude of carbon isotope
1618 excursions (CIEs) appears to have happened during the EECO. CIEs that suggestively
1619 correlate within the EECO are shown with numbers.

1620

1621 **Figure 10.** Records of magnetostratigraphy, bulk sediment $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, CaCO_3 content, *F* index and

1622 abundance patterns for primary planktic foraminiferal taxa at the Farra section, which crops
1623 out 50 km NE of Possagno. All data are from Agnini et al. (2009). Note that the switch in
1624 abundance between *Morozovella* and *Acarinina* occurs close the J event.

1625

1626 **Figure 11.** Records of *Morozovella* morozovellids and large *Acarinina* acarininids (>200
1627 micron) in the western Tethyan setting from the Possagno section (this paper) and the Alano
1628 section (Luciani et al., 2010), plotted with generalized $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ curves for benthic
1629 foraminiferal on the GTS2012 time scale (as summarized by Vandenberghe et al., 2012;
1630 slightly modified). These records suggest that the long-lasting EECO and MECO intervals of
1631 anomalous warmth mark two main steps in the decline of *Morozovella*, *Morozovelloides*
1632 ~~morozovellids~~ and *Acarinina* ~~acarininids~~. The planktic foraminiferal biozones follow those
1633 presented by Wade et al. (2011), as partly modified by Luciani and Giusberti (2014).

1634

1635 **Supplementary material**

1636

1637 **Table S1.** Carbon and oxygen isotopes from the Possagno section.

1638

1639 **Table S2.** Carbon and oxygen isotopes from DSDP Site 577.

1640

1641 **Table S3.** Foraminiferal abundances, fragmentation index (%) and coarse fraction (%) from
1642 the Possagno section.

1643

1644 **Table S4.** Foraminiferal abundances from DSDP Site 577.

1645

1646 **Table S5.** Foraminiferal abundances from ODP Site 1051.

1647

1648 **Figure S1.** The Possagno $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data and relative abundance of minor planktic foraminiferal
1649 genera and selected species plotted against lithology and fragmentation index (*F* index) data.
1650 Magnetostratigraphy is from Agnini et al. (2006). The planktic foraminiferal biozonal scheme
1651 is from Wade et al. (2011), as modified by Luciani and Giusberti (2014). Various symbols are
1652 the same as in **Figure 4**.

1653

1654 **Appendix A: Taxonomic list of planktic foraminiferal species cited in text and figures**

1655

1656 *Globanomalina australiformis* (Jenkins, 1965)

1657 *Morozovella aequa* (Cushman and Renz, 1942)

1658 *Morozovella gracilis* (Bolli, 1957)

1659 *Morozovella lensiformis* (Subbotina, 1953),

1660 *Morozovella marginodentata* (Subbotina, 1953)

1661 *Morozovella subbotinae* (Morozova, 1939)

1662 *Parasubbotina eoelava* Coxall, Huber and Pearson, 2003

1663 *Parasubbotina griffinae* (Blow, 1979)

1664 *Parasubbotina pseudowilsoni* Olsson and Pearson, 2006

1665 *Subbotina corpulenta* (Subbotina, 1953)

1666 *Subbotina eocena* (Gümbel, 1868)

1667 *Subbotina hagni* (Gohrbandt, 1967)

1668 *Subbotina senni* (Beckmann, 1953)

1669 *Subbotina yeguanesis* (Weinzierl and Applin, 1929)

1670 *Planoglobanomalina pseudoalgeriana* Olsson & Hemleben, 2006

1671

1672 **Appendix B: Taxonomic list of calcareous nannofossil taxa cited in text and figures**

1673

1674 *Globanomalina australiformis* (Jenkins, 1965)

1675 *Morozovella aequa* (Cushman and Renz, 1942)

1676 *Morozovella gracilis* (Bolli, 1957)

1677 *Morozovella lensiformis* (Subbotina, 1953),

1678 *Morozovella marginodentata* (Subbotina, 1953)

1679 *Morozovella subbotinae* (Morozova, 1939)

1680 *Parasubbotina eoelava* Coxall, Huber and Pearson, 2003

1681 *Parasubbotina griffinae* (Blow, 1979)

1682 *Parasubbotina pseudowilsoni* Olsson and Pearson, 2006

1683 *Subbotina corpulenta* (Subbotina, 1953)

1684 *Subbotina eocena* (Gümbel, 1868)

1685 *Subbotina hagni* (Gohrbandt, 1967)

1686 *Subbotina senni* (Beckmann, 1953)

1687 *Subbotina yeguanesis* (Weinzierl and Applin, 1929)

1688 *Planoglobanomalina pseudoalgeriana* Olsson & Hemleben, 2006

1689

1690 **Appendix B: Taxonomic list of calcareous nannofossil taxa cited in text and figures**

1691

1692 *Discoaster diastypus* Bramlette and Sullivan, 1961

1693 *Discoaster lodoensis* Bramlette and Sullivan, 1961

1694 *Discoaster sublodoensis* Bramlette and Sullivan, 1961

1695 *Fasciculithus* Bramlette and Sullivan, 1961

1696 *Fasciculithus tympaniformis* Hay and Mohler in Hay et al., 1967

- 1697 *Sphenolithus radians* Deflandre in Grassé, 1952
- 1698 *Toweius* Hay and Mohler, 1967
- 1699 *Tibrachiatus contortus* (Stradner, 1958) Bukry, 1972
- 1700 *Tibrachiatus orthostylus* (Bramlette and Riedel, 1954) Shamrai, 1963