.,
-,

- 2 Concerning the revision of "The South American Monsoon Variability over the Last
- 3 Millennium in CMIP5/PMIP3 simulations" by M. Rojas, P. A. Arias, V. Flores-
- 4 Aqueveque, A. Seth, and M. Vuille.

5 Please find below our responses the reviewer of our manuscript. First of all, we are grateful

- 6 for the reviewer's and your own insightful comments and the time spent reviewing our
- 7 manuscript for the second time. We have accepted all the comments and implemented the
- 8 changes. Please find below out revised version. We sincerely hope that it can be considered
- 9 for publication now.
- 10 We have taken out the section on the regional Hadley Cell. We also tried to look directly at
- 11 the vertical wind in order to analyse vertical motion, but only 5 out of the 9 models had
- 12 vertical wind fields available. Hence we calculated the LIA MCA vertical wind
- 13 difference, but we only mention the results, without including the figure, as it is not directly
- 14 comparable with the rest of the analysis. We include the figure for your consideration.
- 15 Second Review of 'The South American Monsoon Variability over the Last
- 16 Millennium in CMIP5/PMIP3 simulations' by M. Rojas et al.
- 17 18 Car
- 18 General Comment19
- 20 Overall I see some improvement concerning the English, but I have still major
- 21 comments with respect to the presented findings. Therefore, I recommend major
- 22 revisions and if the authors insist to keep the analysis of the 'regional' Hadley cell I
- recommend to reject the manuscript (see details below). Note that I used the version including the track changes.
- 25 Including the track ch
- 26 We have taken out the discussion on the regional Hadley Cell.
- 2728 Comments
- 29 30 L348: "Therefore, we use ..."
- 31 R: corrected
- 3233 L351: "... are identified"
- 34 R: corrected
- 35
- 36 L374: "This results in a weakening of the monsoon ..."
- 37 R: replaced38
- 39 L448: Please remove 'derived from temperature and precipitation reconstructions' as
- 40 it is not necessary.
- 41 R: removed.
- 42
- 43 L450: 'ocean heat transport'
- 1

- 44 R: changed 45 L452: 'freshwater' is normally written in one word, please change elsewhere. 46 R: implemented 47 48 L510: The phrase 'near-global temperature anomalies' is awkward, please clarify. 49 R: changed the sentence to "...South American climate during the MCA and LIA." 50 51 L593: Please make a reference to this statement. 52 R: I changed the sentences to:" This is consistent with the notion that both periods are 53 partially a result of internal climate variability (PAGES 2k Consortium, 2013)." 54 55 L594: 'methodology' is defined as the systematic, theoretical analysis of the methods 56 applied to a field of study. So please use 'analysis of' instead of 'methodology used to 57 asses'. 58 R: changed. 59 60 L611: 'conditional composite analysis' is misleading. 'Conditional' is used in statistics 61 in a very specific way. R: I have deleted this sentence. 62 63 64 L683: Please explain all the variables used in this formula. But as I suggest to remove 65 the analysis of the regional Hadley cell this part needs to be rearranged. R: the complete section was removed 66 67 68 L800/801: If most of the simulations show a southward migration of the ITCZ then it 69 needs to be visible in the ensemble mean. If not something with the analysis is wrong. 70 R: I have clarified this sentence: "most models show a southward migration of sections of 71 the Atlantic ITCZ (not very visible in the ensemble mean)". 72 73 L808-828: I suggest to remove this section from the manuscript for several reasons. As 74 stated in the last review I am not convinced that a regional Hadley cell makes sense, 75 although this paper of Zhang and Wang exists. Another important argument is that the results presented in the discussion phase (reply, figure of 'global and regional' 76 77 Hadley cell) are not consistent with classical analysis of the Hadley circulation 78 (http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1029/2011JD016677/epdf Stachnik and 79 Schumacher 2011, JGR) and the Zhang and Wang paper. The structure is different 80 and the signs are wrong. So I have doubts that the analysis is correct. Finally, I think 81 it is not necessary as the authors could simply analyze the vertical wind at different levels in the region of interest. They already state in the manuscript (L813) that they 82 83 are interested in the areas of rising. Please also note that the references in L810 and 84 811 only analyze the classical Hadley cell, not the 'regional one'.
- 85 R: We removed this section.86
- 87 L870: I guess that the authors refer her to the classical Hadley cell?
- 88 R: yes, we refer to the global Hadley Cell. It shouldn't need to be clarified as all mentions
- 89 to the regional Hadley Cell have been deleted.
- 90

- 91 Section 4: You need to remove or revise the discussion on the Hadley cell.
- 92 R: removed discussion on Hadley Cell.
- 93
- 94 L972: Please change to 'Therefore, the weak temperature ...'
- 95 R: changed.
- 96
- 97 L979-981: This is fully unclear and needs to be explained. Also the authors need to
- 98 add citations.
- **99** R: we have deleted this sentence.
- 100

101 L1005-1008: There are multi proxy reconstructions for South America, e.g. from the 102 PAGES 2K initiative: Working Groups LOTRED-SA.A few relevant publications:

- 103
- 104 We have included the first two references. Thanks.105
- 106 Neukom, R., Gergis, J., Karoly, D., Wanner, H., Curran, M., Elbert, J., Gonzàles-Rouco, F.,
- 107 Linsley, B., Moy, A. D., Mundo, I. A., Raible, C. C., Steig, E. J., Van Ommen, T., Vance,
- 108 T., Villalba, R., Zinke, J. and Frank, D (2014): Inter-hemispheric temperature variability
- 109 over the past millennium. Nature Climate Change, 4, 362-367, doi:
- 110 10.1038/NCLIMATE2174.
- 111

PAGES 2k Consortium (2013): Continental-scale temperature variability during the past
 two millennia. Nature Geoscience 6: 339-346, doi:10.1038/NGEO1797

114

Fig 2: There is a problem at the 0 degree longitude line in all panels. I also suggest to
use white for not significant areas and colors when the differences are significant. In
the caption there is a strange sign before 0.05

- 118 R: sign has been deleted. Figure has been re-done so that problem at 0 longitude is fixed.
- 119 However, I prefer to leave non significant areas with colors and otherwise the complete
- 120 picture is difficult to "construct in my mind". The same idea for the other figures.
- 121

122 Fig3a: The color scale makes no sense as we only see blue and yellow. Also treat the

- 123 significance similar to Fig. 2. In the caption there is a strange sign before 0.05.
- 124 R: changes the color scale.
- 125

126 Fig.4: Wind arrows have two components so if a vector is significant does this imply

- 127 that both components are significant or only one?
- 128 R: Yes, both components are significant.
- 129

130 Fig.5: According to my suggestion this figure needs to be removed.

- 131 R: Figure has been removed.
- 132
- 133 Fig.7: You use white for two information, significance and values between -0.3 and 0.3.
- 134 This is awkward so I suggest to use white for not significant areas and avoid white in 135 the color bar.
- 136 R: changed color bar
- 137

138 The South American Monsoon Variability over the Last Millennium in climate models

139 140

M. Rojas, P. A. Arias, V. Flores-Aqueveque, A. Seth, and M. Vuille

141

142 Abstract

143 In this paper we assess South American Monsoon System (SAMS) variability in the Last 144 Millennium as depicted by global coupled climate model simulations. High-resolution 145 proxy records for the South American monsoon over this period show a coherent regional 146 picture of a weak monsoon during the Medieval Climate Anomaly and a stronger monsoon 147 during the Little Ice Age (LIA). Due to the small external forcing during the past 1000 148 years, model simulations do not show very strong temperature anomalies over these two 149 specific periods, which in turn do not translate into clear precipitation anomalies, in 150 contrast with the rainfall reconstructions in South America. Therefore, we used an ad-hoc 151 definition of these two periods for each model simulation in order to account for model-152 specific signals. Thereby, several coherent large-scale atmospheric circulation anomalies 153 are identified. The models feature a stronger Monsoon during the LIA associated with: (i) maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:02 154 an enhancement of the rising motion in the SAMS domain in austral summer, (ii) a stronger Eliminado: were monsoon-related upper-tropospheric anticyclone, (iii) activation of the South American 155 156 dipole, which results in a poleward shift of the South Atlantic Convergence Zone, and (iv) a 157 weaker upper-level subtropical jet over South America. The diagnosed changes provide 158 important insights into the mechanisms of these climate anomalies over South America 159 during the past millennium. 160 maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 161 Keywords Eliminado: South American monsoon, Last Millennium, Little Ice Age, Medieval Climate Anomaly, 162 163 CMIP5/PMIP3 simulations, precipitation reconstruction 164 maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 165 1. Introduction 4 Eliminado: It is well established that monsoon systems respond to orbital forcing (Kutzbach and Liu, 166 maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 167 1997; Kutzbach et al., 2007; Bosmans et al., 2012). At orbital timescales (especially related Con formato: Esquema numerado + Nivel: 1 + Estilo de numeración: 1, 2, 3, ... to the precessional cycle of approx. 19 and 21 kyrs), changes in the latitudinal insolation 168 + Iniciar en: 1 + Alineación: Izquierda + 169 gradient, and hence temperatures, force the monsoon circulation globally (e.g., Bosmans et Alineación: 0 cm + Sangría: 0.71 cm 170 al., 2012). In the precession frequency band the summer insolation is in anti-phase between maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 171 hemispheres (for example, when Northern Hemisphere (NH) summer insolation is at its Eliminado: 172 maximum, summertime insolation in the Southern Hemisphere (SH) is at its minimum). maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 173 This results in a weakening of the monsoon circulation and precipitation in one hemisphere Con formato: Fuente: Negrita 174 while in the other the monsoon is strengthened. The mechanism for the orbital-induced maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:02 175 monsoon variability is therefore mainly related to meridional temperature gradients. Thus, Eliminado: ed 176 it is not surprising that other phenomena that produce important changes in hemispheric 177 temperature gradients are also responsible for monsoon variability. Examples of these are

abrupt Dansgaard-Oeschger events during the last glacial (Kanner et al., 2012; Cheng et al.,

184 2013) and Heinrich events, including the Heinrich 1 event, during the last deglaciation (ca.

185 17 ka BP) (e.g., Griffiths et al., 2013; Deplazes et al., 2014; Cruz et al., 2006; Strikis et al.,

- 186 2015).
- 187

188 In recent years, similar variability has also been observed for shorter timescales, in 189 particular between the two most prominent climate anomalies over the Last Millennium 190 (LM), the Medieval Climate Anomaly (MCA, ca. 950-1250 CE) and the Little Ice Age 191 (LIA, ca. 1450-1850 CE) (e.g., Masson-Delmotte et al., 2013a). Recent high-resolution 192 records from the area of the South American Monsoon System (SAMS) domain have been 193 used to reconstruct precipitation over this region. Records include speleothems (Novello et 194 al., 2012, 2016; Kanner et al., 2013; Apaestegui et al., 2014), pollen (Ledru et al., 2013), 195 lake sediments (Bird et al., 2011), as well as tree-ring reconstructions (Morales et al., 2012). 196 Vuille et al. (2012) reviewed current available proxy records for the SAMS region. Most 197 reconstructions show good correlations with NH temperature and Intertropical 198 Convergence Zone (ITCZ) reconstructions. According to these paleoclimate studies, the 199 LIA was characterized by a cool north equatorial Atlantic and a warm south equatorial 200 Atlantic (Haug et al., 2001; Polissar et al., 2006) whereas an opposite pattern was present 201 during the MCA. This meridional temperature gradient led to a southward (northward) 202 migration of the Atlantic ITCZ during the LIA (MCA) (Haug et al., 2001). Indeed, SAMS 203 reconstructions during the last millennium show a weaker monsoon during the MCA period 204 and a relatively stronger monsoon during the LIA period (e.g. Bird et al., 2011; Vuille et al., 205 2012; Ledru et al., 2013; Apaestegui et al., 2014), indicating an anti-correlation with 206 reconstructions of the Southeast Asian monsoon (Zhang et al., 2008; Shi et al., 2014; 207 Polanski et al., 2014), as well as with the North African and North American monsoons 208 (Asmerom et al., 2013), for those periods.

209

210 Moreover, modelling studies support a southward (northward) shift of the Atlantic ITCZ 211 during LIA (MCA), For instance, model simulations by Vellinga and Wu (2004) suggest 212 that anomalous northward ocean heat transport during the MCA was linked to an enhanced 213 cross-equatorial temperature gradient in the Atlantic and a northward movement of the 214 ITCZ. Kageyama et al. (2013) analysed freshwater hosing simulations over the North 215 Atlantic to force fluctuations in the strength of the Atlantic Meridional Overturning 216 Circulation (AMOC). Their analyses suggest that the model response to an enhanced high latitude freshwater flux is characterized by a general cooling of the North Atlantic, a 217 218 southward shift of the Atlantic ITCZ, and a weakening of the African and Indian monsoons. 219 Furthermore, modelling experiments discussed by Broccoli et al. (2006) and Lee et al. 220 (2011) indicate that cooler-than-normal temperatures imposed in the North Atlantic domain, 221 as occurred during the LIA, shifts the Atlantic ITCZ southward. In their experiments, this 222 shift is related to a strengthening of the northern Hadley cell in austral summer and a slight 223 shift in its rising branch to the south. Thus, a number of paleoclimate reconstructions and 224 modelling studies suggest that the particular temperature anomalies observed during the

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:03 Eliminado: derived from temperature and precipitation reconstructions maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:04 Eliminado: s maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:04 Eliminado: maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:11

Eliminado:

- 230 MCA and LIA periods, especially in the North Atlantic, were large enough to modify the
- 231 location of the ITCZ over the tropical Atlantic, thereby affecting the strength of the summer

232 SAMS throughout the past millennium (see also a review by Schneider et al., 2014).

233

234 Recent climate modelling experiments for the LM (850–1850 CE) have been incorporated

- 235 in the third phase of the Paleoclimate Modelling Intercomparison Project (PMIP3). About a
- 236 dozen models included in the Climate Model Intercomparison Project Phase Five (CMIP5)
- 237 ran this experiment, which considers solar, volcanic, greenhouse gases, and land use
- scenarios during the LM (Schmidt et al., 2011, 2012).
- 239

In this paper, we explore if and how these coupled General Circulation Models (GCMs) simulations capture the variability of the SAMS associated with LIA and MCA temperature anomalies, as suggested by rainfall reconstructions and diverse modelling studies in the region. This evaluation provides further insights regarding the response of the current generation of GCMs to external forcing during the LM. We focus on the models' ability to simulate the variability of the main characteristics of the South American climate during the MCA and LIA. These characteristics are analysed by concentrating on three main features: precipitation temperature and atmospheric circulation

features: precipitation, temperature, and atmospheric circulation.

This paper is organized as follows: section 2 presents a short description of the model simulations considered and the methodology used to identify the MCA and LIA periods; section 3 presents the main results from the climate simulations of the SAMS during both periods; and section 4 presents a discussion and the main conclusions from this study.

253 254

2. Methodology and Model Simulations

255 We use nine available coupled GCMs, eight of which correspond to CMIP5/PMIP3 LM simulations and one that does not follow the exact PMIP3 experimental setup. The model 256 257 simulations are listed in Table 1. These simulations cover the period 850-1850 CE, 258 although some of them continued up to the present. But since not all modeling groups have 259 continuous runs to the present (including the period 1850-2000) available, the analysis in 260 this paper covers only the period until 1850 CE. The LM simulations were forced with 261 orbital variations (mainly shifts in the perihelion date), common solar irradiance, two 262 different volcanic eruption reconstructions, land-use change, and greenhouse gas (GHG) 263 concentrations. A full description of the exact forcings used in these LM simulations is 264 given by Schmidt et al. (2011, 2012). Furthermore, a detailed list of individual forcings 265 applied in each simulation is given in Annex 2 of Masson-Delmotte et al. (2013a).

266

267 **2.1 Definition of periods**

268 The fifth Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) assessment report (AR5)

269 (IPCC, 2013), defined the two periods of most prominent climate anomalies over the past

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:14

Eliminado: g two periods of near-global temperature anomalies

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 Eliminado: . maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 Eliminado: . maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 Con formato: Fuente: Negrita maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 Con formato: Esquema numerado + Nivel: 1 + Estilo e numeración: 1, 2, 2

Nivel: 1 + Estilo de numeración: 1, 2, 3, ... + Iniciar en: 1 + Alineación: Izquierda + Alineación: 0 cm + Sangría: 0.71 cm

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 09:43 Eliminado:

275 millennium as the MCA (950–1250 CE) and the LIA (1450–1850 CE). This report also concluded that the MCA was a period of relative global warmth, although in general less 276 277 homogenous than the current warmth, whereas the LIA was a much more globally uniform 278 cold period (Masson-Delmotte et al., 2013a). A recent analysis of the consistency of the 279 CMIP5/PMIP3 LM temperature simulations indicates that these simulations often differ 280 from available temperature reconstructions in their long-term multi-centennial trends, 281 which is related to the transition from the MCA to the LIA period (Bothe et al., 2013; 282 Fernández-Donado et al., 2013). Figure 1a shows the NH temperature anomaly time series 283 for each of the nine models considered, as well as its ensemble mean. For comparison, 284 reconstructions used in Figure 5.7 of the fifth IPCC report are shown (Masson-Delmotte et 285 al, 2013a,b). From Figure 1a it is clear that the temperature anomalies over the last millennium are small, and that clearly common MCA and LIA periods are not easily 286 287 identifiable across models. This is consistent with the notion that both periods are partially a result of internal climate variability (PAGES 2k Consortium, 2013), particularly the MCA 288

289 (Neukom et al, 2014).

290 The hypothesis that guides our analysis used to asses the SAMS variability in models is that 291 both periods resulted substantially from internal (non-forced) variability. In addition, given 292 that not all GCM simulations used the exact same forcing, we cannot expect the models to 293 exactly reproduce the temporal variability as indicated by the reconstructions. Therefore, 294 we identify these two periods individually in each model, using two criteria. First, for each 295 model, the warmest period during 950-1250 CE (MCA) and coldest period during 1450-296 1950 CE (LIA) are defined by calculating the annual temperature anomaly over the NH 297 (north of 30°N) with respect to the 1000-1850 mean (the longest common period in the simulations) and lying above and below the mean for the MCA and LIA respectively. 298 299 Second, given the evidence for Atlantic southward/northward shifts of the ITCZ related to 300 altered meridional sea surface temperature gradients between the tropical north and south Atlantic, we also verify that the periods identified with the first criterion correspond to 301 302 periods when the surface temperature difference between the boxes (5°-20°N) and (20°-5° 303 S) in the Atlantic were negative (positive) for LIA (MCA). We then verify that both criteria 304 coincide. For example, for the LIA, the period with cold NH temperature anomalies 305 coincide with temperature anomalies in the North Atlantic box colder than that its South 306 Atlantic box counterpart (negative gradient, not shown) The MCA and LIA periods 307 identified in each model are shown in Table 1. Note that in general the periods are on the 308 order of 80-110 years long; shorter than the more general MCA and LIA definition. Figure 309 1b shows the Gaussian fit of the frequency distribution of NH temperatures of all the years 310 defined as LIA years (red curve) and MCA years (blue curve) respectively. The difference 311 between the two periods is statistically significant (bootstrap test, 5% significance level). 312 Even though the anomalies are rather weak during both periods, a comparison with the 313 values from their respective control simulation (piControl) shows that both periods are also



maisa rojas 8/7/2016 21:57 Eliminado:

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 12:06 **Eliminado:** This ad-hoc definition of periods can be considered as a "conditional composite" analysis maisa rojas 8/7/2016 21:58

Eliminado:

significantly different, at the 5% significance level from the long-term mean. In addition, 327

328 Figure 2 shows the maps of the annual mean temperature anomalies during LIA and MCA,

329 as well as their difference, for the ensemble mean. Temperature anomalies in the models

330 are largest over the NH and in particular over the North Atlantic domain. Importantly,

331 however, the LIA and MCA periods identified in the models are not synchronous, as shown

332

333

334 2.2 Variables used

in Table 1.

335 To identify the main differences in LM simulations of the SAMS, particularly during the 336 LIA and MCA periods, we analyse monthly CMIP5/PMIP3 output for rain rate, and 850 337 hPa and 200 hPa horizontal winds. We also analysed vertical wind (omega) at 500 hPa in order to evaluate regions of ascending motion. However, not all modelling groups have 338 339 saved this variable, so that this analysis was done with 5 models only and a figure of the 340 vertical wind changes is not included in the paper. All variables have been re-gridded using

341 a simple linear interpolation to a common 2x2 degree grid.

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43 Eliminado:

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 10:58

342 The oceanic Inter-tropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) is identified following the method 343 proposed by Frierson and Hwang (2012). They define the ITCZ location by the 344 precipitation centroid, as the tropical latitude with the maximum precipitation, at all 345 longitudes over the ocean. Following their method, the precipitation was first interpolated 346 onto a grid of 0.1 degrees to allow the precipitation centroid to vary. We explicitly do not 347 consider the precipitation maxima over continents due to known problems in the correct 348 definition of the ITCZ (e.g. see Laderrach and Raible, 2013: Nicholson, 2009). 349

- 350 The next section examines the performance of the models and whether they simulate a 351 stronger SAMS during the LIA, in comparison to the MCA, as suggested by precipitation 352 proxies and previous modelling experiments. In addition, since the SAMS is a dominant
- 353 feature of the South American climate during austral summer (e.g., Vera et al., 2006), we

354

- focused on its mature phase, the December-January-February (DJF) season.
- 355

3. Simulated SAMS circulation. 356

357 **3.1 Precipitation**

Figure 3a shows the annual mean precipitation difference between the LIA and MCA 358 359 periods. Blue and red curves correspond to the annual mean position of the oceanic ITCZ 360 during LIA and MCA periods, respectively. The ensemble mean shows that the 361 precipitation differences are small and statistically significant only in some regions 362 (bootstrap test, p < 0.05). There is more precipitation during the LIA compared with the 363 MCA in Northeastern Brazil and across the tropical Atlantic, which are regions directly 364 affected by the ITCZ position in the current climate. The mean position of the ITCZ between the two periods does not show any significant shifts (see Figure 3b), but a small 365 366 southward shift in the Atlantic during the LIA is found, in accordance with the precipitation 367 signal. Individually, models do show that during the LIA the ITCZ was shifted further

Eliminado: In addition, the local Hadley Cell is evaluated using the meridional mass streamfunction (Ψ) calculated from the irrotational component of the meridional flow, as proposed by Zhang and Wang (2013). The computation involves the irrotational components of the zonal mean meridional wind [v_{IR}] over the American sector (80°W- 30°W, 35°S-15°N). Here, Ψ is defined as the vertically integrated northward mass flux at
vertically integrated northward mass flux at latitude φ from pressure level p to the top of
the atmosphere. Thus,
maisa rojas 8/7/2016 21:58

Eliminado: (maisa rojas 8/7/2016 21:58

Eliminado:)

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44

Eliminado:

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Con formato: Esquema numerado + Nivel: 1 + Estilo de numeración: 1, 2, 3, ... + Iniciar en: 1 + Alineación: Izquierda + Alineación: 0 cm + Sangría: 0.71 cm

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44

Eliminado:

maisa roias 8/7/2016 22:44 Con formato: Fuente: Negrita

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 21:59

Eliminado:

387 southward at some longitudes (Pacific and Atlantic Oceans) when compared with the MCA

388 (not shown).

389

390 Figure 4a shows climatological precipitation and 850 hPa atmospheric circulation over the 391 SAMS region during austral summer. In general, models are able to reproduce the main 392 summer circulation and precipitation characteristics over South America observed in 393 present-day climate. A narrow oceanic ITCZ, a broad area of maxima rainfall over the 394 continent (SAMS), and a southeast-northwest oriented South Atlantic Convergence Zone 395 (SACZ) are observed in LM simulations, consistent with present-day observations (e.g., 396 Garreaud et al., 2009). However, some models exhibit a double ITCZ over the eastern 397 Pacific. This bias has been previously identified in CMIP3 and CMIP5 simulations, 398 especially during austral summer and fall seasons (Hirota and Takayabu, 2013; Sierra et al., 399 2015). Despite the limitations of model resolution, austral summer lower tropospheric 400 circulation simulated by the ensemble mean reproduces a cyclonic circulation over 401 southeastern Bolivia (a.k.a. "Chaco low") as seen in observations and its associated 402 northerly low-level jet, which is channelled by the Andes topography, transporting moisture 403 to southern South America (Marengo et al., 2004).

404

405 When comparing LIA and MCA composites for DJF (Figure 4b), the models exhibit an 406 increased easterly flow at approximately 5°S over the Atlantic and a weaker northerly low-407 level jet north of the Chaco low region, consistent with less precipitation over the SACZ 408 during the LIA. Models also simulate less summer SAMS precipitation during LIA over the 409 Amazon and the SACZ, but more in the Nordeste. When analysing the associated vertical 410 motion in models for which this variable is available, during the LIA, compared to MCA, 411 there is stronger ascending motion in most of the SAMS domain (not shown). This 412 precipitation pattern is in opposition to rainfall reconstructions over the western Amazon, 413 the SACZ, as well as Nordeste (e.g., Vuille et al., 2012; Novello et al, 2012; Apaestegui et 414 al., 2014; Novello et al., 2016). By contrast, when considering annual mean simulations 415 (Figure 3), most models show a southward migration of sections of the Atlantic ITCZ (not 416 very visible in the ensemble mean) and enhanced precipitation over the SAMS domain 417 during the LIA, particularly over the eastern and southern Amazon, in agreement with 418 paleo-climatological records for this period. This indicates that the LM simulations are not 419 able to reproduce the expected changes of the austral summer Atlantic ITCZ location and 420 SAMS rainfall during LIA and MCA periods. The positive changes in the annual mean 421 seen in Figure 3 are due to the spring and autumn transition seasons.

422

423 **3.2** Bolivian high and subtropical jet

The well-documented southward migration of the Hadley Cell and its rising centre from 10°N in JJA to 10°S in DJF is only a part of the monsoon rainfall seasonal migration over the Americas, which reaches a more southward location in austral summer (Dima and

- 427 Wallace, 2003). Furthermore, this wide area of continental convection, although related to
 - 9

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 12:08 Eliminado: the

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado: _ maisa rojas 5/7/2016 10:59 Eliminado: <#>Local Hadley ce(....[2] 432 local convergence zones, is not only a result of the shift of the ITCZ into subtropical
433 latitudes. The establishment of the Bolivian high, the characteristic monsoon upper-level
434 anticyclone located over the central Andes during austral summer, and the position and
435 strength of the SH subtropical jet (SHSJ) in South America are also related to this

436 monsoonal convective activity (Lenters and Cook, 1997; Garreaud et al., 2003; Yin et al.,437 2014).

438

439 To identify changes in the Bolivian high during the LM, we analyse the austral summer 440 upper-troposphere circulation during the LIA and MCA (Figure 5). Results indicate a 441 stronger and more southeastward location of the SAMS anticyclone during the LIA. This 442 strengthening of the Bolivian high is consistent with a stronger SAMS circulation. The 443 southward shift of this upper-level anticyclone is related to an enhanced summer easterly 444 flow over the central Andes, as suggested by previous studies (Lenters and Cook, 1999), 445 and in turn would favour moisture transport and rainfall over the region (Garreaud et al., 446 2003). Moreover, the upper tropospheric wind anomalies strikingly resemble the South 447 American dipole (e.g. Robertson and Mechoso, 2000), a primary mode of variability over 448 this region. An anticyclonic anomaly is associated with a diffuse SACZ, enhancing 449 moisture convergence and precipitation on its southwestern flank (i.e. leading to a poleward 450 shift in the location of the SACZ). Again, model simulations do not show this enhanced 451 austral summer rainfall in the Amazon and central Andes during the LIA, and feature only

452 marginally more precipitation to the southwest (Figure 3).

453

454 On the other hand, recent studies have identified that the strength and location of the SHSJ, 455 which corresponds to the southward extent of the Hadley Cell, is a key factor for triggering 456 convection during the dry-to-wet season transition in the Amazon (Yin et al., 2014). 457 Particularly, when the SHSJ is weaker and/or reaches a more equatorward location, it 458 promotes the incursion of synoptic disturbances to subtropical South America (e.g., 459 Garreaud, 2000), enhancing lower-troposphere convergence and triggering the wet season 460 onset over the region (e.g., Li and Fu, 2006). To identify simulated changes of the SHSJ 461 during the LIA and the MCA, Figure 6 shows the 30m/s isotach of the climatological September-November 200 hPa zonal wind as well as the difference between LIA and MCA 462 463 periods. In general, the ensemble mean does not exhibit significant changes in the SHSJ 464 location over South America during either period, as also indicated by Figure 5b; however, 465 the models simulate a weaker SHSJ during the LIA, not only in austral spring, but also for 466 the annual mean and summer seasons (not shown). This weaker SHSJ, particularly during 467 austral spring (i.e., the transition season from dry to wet conditions in the SAMS), would 468 allow a stronger influence of cold air incursions to trigger SAMS convection and probably 469 maintain a stronger monsoon during the LIA.

470

471 **4. Discussion and conclusions**

472 According to our analysis, LM simulations are able to identify circulation features coherent

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 16:02 Eliminado: 6

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 16:02 Eliminado: 7

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 16:04 Eliminado: 6

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado: maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado:

478 with a stronger SAMS during the LIA: (i) an enhancement of the rising motion in the SAMS domain in austral summer, (ii) a stronger monsoon-related upper-troposphere 479 480 anticyclone, (iii) activation of the South American dipole, which results to a certain extent 481 in a poleward shift in the SACZ and (iv) a weaker spring SHSJ over South America. 482 However, austral summer simulations do not exhibit the expected increase in precipitation 483 in this region during this cold period, as suggested by proxy evidence, except over the 484 Nordeste, where it is not expected based on proxy data (Novello et al., 2012). Furthermore, 485 LM simulations only reproduce a slight, but insignificant, southward (northward) shift of 486 the austral summer Atlantic ITCZ during the LIA (MCA), unlike results found in other 487 modelling studies (Vellinga and Wu, 2004; Lee et al., 2011; Kageyama et al., 2013). This 488 disagreement might be partially related to the fact that the above-mentioned modelling 489 studies impose much stronger external forcing than the forcing used in the LM simulations. 490 This meridional shift of the Atlantic ITCZ is commonly considered a key aspect to explain 491 the changes in SAMS rainfall observed during these periods (e.g., Vuille et al., 2012).

492

493 Recent studies indicate that the new generation of models included in the CMIP5 still tend 494 to perform poorly in simulating precipitation in South America, especially over the

495 Amazon basin, and the Atlantic ITCZ (Yin et al., 2013; Siongco et al., 2014; Sierra et al.,

496 2015)._However, CMIP5 models have shown further improvement in simulating 497 precipitation over the region, in comparison to the CMIP3 generation (Jones and Carvalho,

497 precipitation over the region, in comparison to the CMIP3 generation (Jones and Carvalho,
498 2013; Yin et al., 2013; Hirota and Takayabu, 2013).

499

500 What could bias the simulated austral summer SAMS rainfall response of the CMIP5 501 models during the past millennium? Recent studies indicate that CMIP5 simulations tend to 502 overestimate rainfall over the Atlantic ITCZ (Yin et al., 2013) and exhibit either an East or 503 West Atlantic bias, in association with overestimated rainfall along the African (Gulf of 504 Guinea) or South American (Brazil) coasts, respectively (Siongco et al., 2014). Such a 505 misinterpretation of the local ITCZ has been shown to bias rainfall simulations in the core 506 of the SAMS (Bombardi and Carvalho, 2011). A stronger Atlantic ITCZ, for example, may 507 contribute to enhanced surface divergence over tropical South America, inducing drier conditions in the region (e.g., Li et al., 2006), as observed in CMIP5 historical simulations 508 509 (Yin et al., 2013; Sierra et al., 2015). However, a stronger local ITCZ does not necessarily 510 translate into reduced SAMS rainfall since moisture convergence in this region is mainly influenced by the SACZ (Vera et al., 2009). Thus, the weaker SACZ during the LIA 511 512 simulated by these models (Figure 3) could reduce moisture convergence and rainfall over 513 the SAMS. Furthermore, positive feedbacks between land surface latent heat flux, rainfall, 514 surface net radiation, and large-scale circulation are also found to contribute to the dry 515 biases over the Amazon and SAMS in most of the CMIP5 historical simulations (Yin et al., 516 2013).

517

518 Another circulation feature related to SAMS rainfall is the intensity and location of the

11

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:01 Eliminado: 520 South Atlantic subtropical high. The eastward displacement of this anticyclone and its

521 interaction with the SACZ provide favourable conditions for monsoon precipitation (Raia

522 and Cavalcanti, 2008). Recent analysis of CMIP5 projections under different scenarios

523 suggests that this surface anticyclone is likely to strengthen in association with globally 524 warmer conditions (Li et al., 2013). Thus, a detailed examination of the response of this

subtropical high to LM forcing is necessary in order to provide further explanations for the

526 inadequate CMIP5/PMIP3 simulations of the SAMS rainfall variability throughout the past

527 millennium.

528

529 The previous generation of LM model simulations reproduced warmer temperatures during 530 the MCA when compared with the LIA, but generally underestimated the regional changes 531 detected from available reconstructions or failed to simulate a synchronous response in 532 accordance with these reconstructions (e.g., Gonzalez-Rouco et al., 2011). The latter has 533 been mainly related to uncertainties in the forcing estimates, as well as reduced sensitivity 534 to external perturbations, underestimated internal variability, or incorrect representation of 535 important feedbacks in GCMs (e.g. Goosse et al. 2005; Braconnot et al., 2012). Some of 536 these problems still persist in the PMIP3 LM simulations (PAGES 2k-PMIP3 group, 2015). 537 Furthermore, a recent model simulation of the global monsoon during the LM, performed 538 in a non PMIP3-experiment, indicates that the NH summer monsoon responds more 539 sensitively to GHG forcing than the SH monsoon rainfall, which appears to be more 540 strongly influenced by solar and volcanic forcing (Liu et al., 2012; Colose et al., 2016; 541 Novello et al., 2016). Hence, a stronger sensitivity of SAMS rainfall to LM forcing 542 estimations and the inadequate response of current GCMs to such forcings may also bias 543 the CMIP5/PMIP3 simulations of the summer SAMS rainfall during the past millennium. Therefore, weak temperature response seen in these models during the MCA (Figures 1 and 544 545 2) could contribute to the inadequate changes of austral summer rainfall in South America between LIA and MCA (Figures 3 and 4). 546

547

548 This evaluation of the SAMS throughout the past 1000 years in the latest generation of LM 549 simulations confirms previous findings regarding the ability of the current generation of 550 GCMs to reproduce large-scale circulation features in South America and their lack of an adequate representation of precipitation over the region. However, the weak or absent 551 552 temperature and precipitation response to the imposed forcing in climate models provides a 553 formidable challenge for proxy-model comparisons. To better compare and eventually 554 reconcile model reconstructions with proxy evidence will require a more detailed analysis 555 of precipitation-generating mechanisms in climate models. Our results indicate that the 556 CMIP5/PMIP3 models quite accurately reproduce changes in the large-scale circulation 557 that in turn are consistent with proxy evidence of precipitation changes over the past 558 millennium. These changes, however, do not translate into corresponding precipitation 559 changes. This implies that the models may lack relevant feedbacks or that precipitation in 560 the models may be too dependent on the microphysics and convective parameterization

12

Eliminado: Hence the

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 15:44

Eliminado: The availability of precipitation reconstructions from South America has been useful to provide new insights into the GCMs response to past forcings.

- 567 schemes, but not sufficiently sensitive to large-scale circulation mechanisms. On the proxy
- side, a stronger effort to not only reconstruct surface climate at individual locations, but
- so focus on reconstructions of modes of variability or entire climate components such as
- 570 the SAMS, which implicitly include circulation changes, are needed. Proxies such as pollen
- 571 or stable hydrogen and oxygen isotopes from lakes, speleothems and ice cores have shown
- 572 potential to record larger-scale climate signals and changes in the tropical hydrological
- 573 cycle over South America (Vuille and Werner, 2005; Vimeux et al., 2009; Bird et al., 2011;
- 574 Vuille et al., 2012, Ledru et al., 2013; Flantua et al., 2016; Hurley et al., 2015). Multi-proxy 575 reconstructions from such networks, which implicitly incorporate remote and large-scale
- 575 reconstructions from such networks, which implicitly incorporate remote and large-scale 576 circulation aspects, may therefore provide a better tool to assess the performance of climate
- 577 models than reconstructions that are based solely on local precipitation estimates.
- 578

579 Acknowledgments

We acknowledge the World Climate Research Programme's Working Group on Coupled 580 581 Modeling, which is responsible for CMIP5, and we thank the climate modeling groups for 582 producing and making available their model outputs. We appreciate the comments from 2 583 anonymous reviewers who helped to significantly improve the quality of this manuscript. 584 This work was partially funded by NC120066, FONDAP-CONICYT n. 15110009. MR 585 acknowledges support from FONDECYT grant #1131055. PAA was supported by 586 FONDECYT grant #3140570 and Colciencias grant #115-660-44588. VF acknowledges funding from FONDECYT grant #11121543. AS acknowledges financial support from 587 NSF CAREER Award # 1056216 and NOAA grant NA110AR4310109. MV was partially 588 589 supported by NSF award AGS-1303828.

590

591 References

Apaestegui, J., F.W. Cruz, A. Sifeddine, M. Vuille, J.C. Espinoza, J.L. Guyot, M. Khodri,
N. Strikis, R.V. Santos, H. Cheng, L. Edwards, E. Carvahlo and W. Santini, 2014:
Hydroclimate variability of the northwestern Amazon basin near the Andean foothills of
Peru related to the South American Monsoon System during the last 1600 years. Climate of

- 596 the Past, 10, 1967-1981.
- 597

Asmerom, Y., V.J. Polyak, J.B.T. Rasmussen, S.J. Burns, and M. Lachniet, 2013:
 Multidecadal to multicentury scale collapses of Northern Hemisphere monsoons over the

past millennium. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 110, 9651–9656.

601

Bao, Q., and Coauthors, 2012: The flexible global ocean-atmosphere-land system model,
spectral version: FGOALS-s2. Advances in Atmospheric Sciences, 30(3), 561-576, doi: 10.

- 604 1007/s00376-012-2113-9.
- 605

Bird, B.W., M. B. Abbott, M. Vuille, D.T. Rodbell, N.D. Stansell, and M.F. Rosenmeier,
2011: A 2,300-year-long annually resolved record of the South American summer monsoon

13

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado:

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 **Con formato:** Izquierda, Interlineado: sencillo, Control de líneas viudas y

huérfanas, Adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Adjust space between Asian text and numbers, Tabulaciones:No en 0.99 cm + 1.98 cm + 2.96 cm + 3.95 cm + 4.94 cm + 5.93 cm + 6.91 cm + 7.9 cm + 8.89 cm + 9.88 cm + 10.86 cm + 11.85 cm

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44

Eliminado:

- 610 from the Peruvian Andes. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 108(21),
- 611 8583-8588, doi/10.1073/pnas.1003719108.
- 612

613 Bombardi, R.J., L.M.V. Carvalho, 2011: The South Atlantic dipole and variations in the

- 614 characteristics of the South American Monsoon in the WCRP-CMIP3 multi-model
- 615 simulations. Climate Dynamics, 36(11–12), 2091–2102, doi:10.1007/s00382-010-0836-9.
- 616

617 Bosmans, J. H. C., S. S. Drijfhout, E. Tuenter, L.J. Lourens, F.J. Hilgen, and S.L. Weber,

- 618 2012: Monsoonal response to mid-Holocene orbital forcing in a high resolution GCM.
- 619 Climate of the Past, 8, 723-740, doi:10.5194/cp-8-723-2012.
- 620

Bothe, O., J. H. Jungclaus, and D. Zanchettin, 2013: Consistency of the multi-model
CMIP5/PMIP3-past1000 ensemble, Climate of the Past, 9, 2471-2487, doi: 10.5194/cp-92471-2013.

624

- 628
- Broccoli, A. J., Dahl, K. A., and Stouffer, R.J., 2006: Response of the ITCZ to northern
 hemisphere cooling, Geophysical Research Letters, 33, L01702,
 doi:10.1029/2005GL024546.
- 632
- Cheng, H., A. Sinha, F.W. Cruz, X. Wang, R.L. Edwards, F.M. d'Horta, C.C. Ribas, M.
 Vuille, L.D. Stott and A.S. Auler, 2013: Climate change patterns in Amazonia and
 biodiversity. Nature Communications, 4, 1411.
- 636

640

645

Deplazes, G., A. Lückge, J.-B. W. Stuut, J. Pätzold, H. Kuhlmann, D. Husson, M. Fant, and
G. H. Haug, 2014: Weakening and strengthening of the Indian monsoon during Heinrich
events and Dansgaard-Oeschger oscillations. Paleoceanography, 29, 99–114,
doi:10.1002/2013PA002509.

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:43

Eliminado: Donohoe, A., Marshall, J., Ferreira, D., Ferreira, D., McGee, D., 2013. The relationship between ITCZ location and cross equatorial atmospheric heat transport; from the seasonal cycle to the last glacial maximum. Journal of Climate, 26, 3597–3618. DOI: 10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00467.1

<sup>Braconnot, P., S.P. Harrison, M. Kageyama, P.J. Bartlein, V. Masson-Delmotte, A. AbeOuchi, B. Otto-Bliesner, and Y. Zhao, 2012: Evaluation of climate models using
palaeoclimatic data. Nature Climate Change, 2, 417-424, doi:10.1038/nclimate1456.</sup>

 ^{637 &}lt;u>Colose, C.M.</u>, A.N. LeGrande and M. Vuille, 2016: The influence of volcanic eruptions on
 638 the climate of tropical South America during the last millennium in an isotope-enabled
 639 general circulation model. Climate of the Past, 12, 961-979.

⁶⁴¹ Cruz Jr., F. W., S.J. Burns, I. Karmann, W.D. Sharp, and M. Vuille, 2006: Reconstruction
642 of regional atmospheric circulation features during the Late Pleistocene in subtropical
643 Brazil from oxygen isotope composition of speleothems, Earth and Planetary Science
644 Letters, 248, 494–506.

- 659 Dufresne, J-L, Foujols, M.A, Denvil, S., et al., 2013: Climate change projections using the
- 660 IPSL-CM5 Earth System Model: from CMIP3 to CMIP5. Climate Dynamics, 40(9-10),
- 661 2123-2165.

663 Efron, B. (1979), Bootstrap Methods: Another Look at the Jackknife. The Annals of 664 Statistics, 7(1), 1-26.

Fernández-Donado, L., J.F. González-Rouco, C.C. Raible, C.M. Ammann, D. Barriopedro,
E. García-Bustamante, J.H. Jungclaus, S.J. Lorenz, J. Luterbacher, S.J. Phipps, J. Servonnat,
D. Swingedouw, S.F.B. Tett, S. Wagner, P. Yiou and E. Zorita, 2013: Large-scale
temperature response to external forcing in simulations and reconstructions of the last
millennium. Climate of the Past, 9, 393–421, 2013, www.clim-past.net/9/393/2013/
doi:10.5194/cp-9-393-2013.

Flantua, S.G.A., H. Hooghiemstra, M. Vuille, H. Behling, J.F. Carson, W.D. Gosling, I
Hoyos, M.P. Ledru, E. Montoya, F. Mayle, A. Maldonado, V. Rull, M.S. Tonello, B.S.
Whitney and C. González-Arango, 2016: Climate variability and human impact on the
environment in South America during the last 2000 years: synthesis and perspectives from
pollon records. Climate of the Best, 12, 483, 523, doi:10.5104/or.12.483, 2016

- 675 pollen records. Climate of the Past, 12, 483-523, doi:10.5194/cp-12-483-2016. 676
- Frierson, D. M. W., and Y.-T. Hwang, 2012: Extratropical influence on ITCZ shifts in slab
 ocean simulations of global warming. Journal of Climate, 25, 720–733, DOI:
 10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00116.1,
- Garreaud, R. D., 2000: Cold air incursions over subtropical South America: Mean structure
 and dynamics, Mon. Weather Reviews, 128, 2544–2559.
- 682

Garreaud, R., M. Vuille, and A. Clement, 2003: The climate of the Altiplano: observed
current conditions and mechanism of past changes. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
Palaeoecology, 194(3054), 1–18.

686

687 Garreaud, R.D., M., Vuille, R. Compagnucci, and J. Marengo, 2009: Present-day South 688 American climate. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 281(3-4), 180-195

Gent, P.R., G. Danabasoglu, L. J. Donner et al., 2011: The community climate system
model version 4. Journal of Climate, 24(19), 4973–4991.

692

689

693 Giorgetta, M. A., et al., 2013: Climate and carbon cycle changes from 1850 to 2100 in

- 694 MPI-ESM simulations for the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project phase 5, Journal of
- Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 5, 572–597, doi:10.1002/jame.20038.
- 696

697 Gonzalez-Rouco, F.J., L. Fernandez-Donado, C.C. Raible, D. Barriopedro, J. Luterbacher,

698 J.H. Jungclaus, D. Swingedouw, J. Servonnat, E. Zorita, S. Wagner, and C.M. Ammann,

15

aisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:42

Eliminado: Donohoe, A., Marshall, J., Ferreira, D., McGee, D., 2013. The relationship between ITCZ location and cross equatorial atmospheric heat transport; from the seasonal cycle to the last glacial maximum. Journal of Climate, 26, 3597–3618. DOI: 10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00467.1

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado:

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:44 Eliminado:

⁶⁶²

- 709 2011: Medieval Climate Anomaly to Little Ice Age transition as simulated by current
- climate models. [In: Xoplaki E, Fleitmann D, Diaz H, von Gunten L, Kiefer T (eds)
 Medieval Climate Anomaly. Pages News 19(1):7–8].
- 712
- 713 Goosse, H., E. Crespin, S. Dubinkina, M.-F. Loutre, M. E. Mann, H. Renssen, Y. Sallaz-
- 714 Damaz, and D. Shindell., 2012: The role of forcing and internal dynamics in explaining the
- 715 "Medieval Climate Anomaly". Climate Dynamics, 39(12), 2847-2866.
- 716

Goosse, H., T. Crowley, E. Zorita, C. Ammann, H. Renssen, and E. Driesschaert, 2005:
 Modelling the climate of the last millennium: what causes the differences between

- simulations? Geophysical Research Letters, 32(L06710), doi:10.1029/2005GL22368.
- 720

Griffiths, M.L., R.N. Drysdale, M.K. Gagan, J.C. Hellstrom, I. Couchoud, L.K. Ayliffe,
H.B. Vonhof, and W.S. Hantoro, 2013: Australasian monsoon response to DansgaardOeschger event 21 and teleconnections to higher latitudes. Earth and Planetary Science
Letters, 369-370, 294-304.

725

729

733

raction relation rela

736 Quelccaya Ice Cap, Peru. Journal of Geophysical Research, 120, 7467-7487,

- 737 doi:10.109/2015JD023323.
- 738

IPCC, 2013: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of WorkingGroup I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

[Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y.

742 Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United

743 Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, 1535 pp, doi:10.1017/CBO9781107415324.

744

745 Jones, C., and L. M. V. Carvalho, 2013: Climate Change in the South American Monsoon

- 746 System: Present Climate and CMIP5 Projections. Journal of Climate, 26, 6660–6678.
- 747

748 Kageyama, M., U. Merkel, B. Otto-Bliesner, M. Prange, A. Abe-Ouchi, G. Lohmann, R.

- 749 Ohgaito, D. M. Roche, J. Singarayer, D. Swingedouw, and X Zhang, 2013: Climatic
 - 16

<sup>Haug, G. H., K.A. Hughen, D.M. Sigman, L.C Peterson, and U. Röhl, 2001: Southward
migration of the intertropical convergence zone through the Holocene, Science, 293, 1304–
1306.</sup>

<sup>Hirota, N., and Y. N. Takayabu, 2013: Reproducibility of precipitation distribution over the
tropical oceans in CMIP5 multi-climate models compared to CMIP3. Climate Dynamics,
41(11-12), 2909–2920.</sup>

⁷³⁴ Hurley, J.V., M. Vuille, D.R. Hardy, S. Burns, and L.G. Thompson, 2015: Cold air

750	impacts of freshwater hosing under Last Glacial Maximum conditions: a multi-model study.	
751	Climate of the Past, 9, 935-953.	

755

Kanner, L.C., Burns, S.J., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., 2012: High-latitude forcing of the South American Summer monsoon during the last glacial. Science, 335, 570-573.

Kanner, L.C., S.J. Burns, H. Cheng, R.L. Edwards, M. Vuille, 2013. High-resolution
variability of the South American summer monsoon over the last seven millennia: insights
from a speleothem record from the central Peruvian Andes. Quaternary Science Reviews,
759 75(1), 1-10.

760

764

Kutzbach, J.E., X. Liu, Z. Liu, and G. Chen, 2007: Simulation of the evolutionary response
of global summer monsoons to orbital forcing over the past 280,000 years. Climate
Dynamics, 30(6), 567-579.

- Kutzbach, J.E., and Z. Liu, 1997: Response of the African Monsoon to Orbital Forcing and
 Ocean Feedbacks in the Middle Holocene. Science, 278(5337), 440-443.
- Laederach and Raible, 2013: Lower-tropospheric humidity: climatology, trends and the
 relation to the ITCZ. Tellus A 2013, 65, 20413,
 http://dx.doi.org/10.3402/tellusa.v65i0.20413.
- Ledru, M.-P., V. Jomelli, P. Samaniego, M. Vuille, S. Hidalgo, M. Herrera, and C. Ceron,
 2013: The Medieval Climate Anomaly and the Little Ice Age in the Eastern Ecuadorian
- 772 Andes. Climate of the Past, 9, 307-321: doi:10.5194/cp-9-307-2013.
- 773

778

Lee, S.-Y., J. C. H. Chiang, K. Matsumoto, and K. S. Tokos, 2011: Southern Ocean wind
response to North Atlantic cooling and the rise in atmospheric CO2: Modeling perspective
and paleoceanographic implications. Paleoceanography, 26(PA1214),
doi:10.1029/2010PA002004.

Lenters, J.D., and K.H. Cook, 1997: On the origin of the Bolivian high and related
circulation features of the South American climate. Journal of Atmospheric Sciences, 54,
656-677.

782
783 Lenters, J.D., and K.H. Cook, 1999: Summertime precipitation variability over South
784 America: role of the large-scale circulation. Monthly Weather Reviews 127, 409-431.

785

Li, W., and R. Fu, 2006: Influence of cold air intrusions on the wet season onset over
Amazonia. Journal of Climate, 19, 257–275, doi:10.1175/JCLI3614.1.

788

789 Li, W., R. Fu, R.E. Dickinson, 2006: Rainfall and its seasonality over the Amazon in the

aisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:11

Eliminado:

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:45

Eliminado:



- 21st century as assessed by the coupled models for the IPCC AR4. Journal of Geophysical
 Research, 111(D2), doi: 10.1029/2005jd006355.
- 794

Li, W., L. Li, M. Ting, Y. Deng, Y. Kushnir, Y. Liu, Y. Lu, C. Wang, and P. Zhang, 2013:
Intensification of the Southern Hemisphere summertime subtropical anticyclones in a
warming climate. Geophysical Research Letters, 40, 5959–5964,
doi:10.1002/2013GL058124.

799

Liu, J., B. Wang, S.Y. Yim, J.Y. Lee, J.G. Jhun, and K.J. Ha, 2012: What drives the global summer monsoon over the past millennium? Climate Dynamics, 39:1063–1072.

Marengo, J., Soares, W., Saulo, C., Nicolini, M., 2004: Climatology of the LLJ east of the
Andes as derived from the NCEP reanalyses. Journal of Climate 17, 2261–2280.

805

802

Masson-Delmotte, V., M. Schulz, A. Abe-Ouchi, J. Beer, A. Ganopolski, J. F. González
Rouco, E. Jansen, K. Lambeck, J. Luterbacher, T. Naish, T. Osborn, B. Otto-Bliesner, T.

Quinn, R. Ramesh, M. Rojas, X. Shao and A. Timmermann, 2013: Information from

Paleoclimate Archives. In: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution

of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on

- 811 Climate Change [Stocker, T. F., D. Qin, G-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung,
- 812 A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P. M. Midgley (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press,
- 813 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- 814

815 Masson-Delmotte, Valerie; Schulz, Michael; Abe-Ouchi, Ayako; Beer, Jürg; Ganopolski,

816 Andrey; González Rouco, Jesus Fidel; Jansen, Eystein; Lambeck, Kurt; Luterbacher, Jürg;

- 817 Naish, Timothy; Osborn, T; Otto-Bliesner, Bette L; Quinn, Terrence Michael; Ramesh,
- 818 Rengaswamy; Rojas, Maisa; Shao, XueMei; Timmermann, Axel (2013)b: Information from
 819 Paleoclimate Archives. doi:10.1594/PANGAEA.828636
- 820

Morales, M.S., D.A. Christie, R. Villalba, J. Argollo, et al., 2012: Precipitation changes in
the South American Altiplano since 1300 AD reconstructed by tree-rings. Climate of the
Past: Special Issue, 8, 653-666.

824

825 Neukom, R., Gergis, J., Karoly, D., Wanner, H., Curran, M., Elbert, J., González-Rouco, F.,

826 Linsley, B., Moy, A. D., Mundo, I. A., Raible, C. C., Steig, E. J., Van Ommen, T., Vance,

- 827 <u>T., Villalba, R., Zinke, J. and Frank, D (2014): Inter-hemispheric temperature variability</u>
- 828 over the past millennium. Nature Climate Change, 4, 362-367, doi:
- 829 <u>10.1038/NCLIMATE2174.</u>
- 830
- 831 Nicholson, S. E., 2009: A revised picture of the structure of the "monsoon" and land ITCZ
- 832 over West Africa. Climate Dynamics, 32,1155-1171, DOI 10.1007/s00382-008-0514-3

- 833 Novello, V.F., F.W. Cruz, I. Karmann, S.J. Burns, N.M. Stríkis, M. Vuille, H. Cheng, R.L.
- 834 Edwards, R.V. Santos, E. Frigo and E.A.S. Barreto, 2012: Multidecadal climate variability
- in Brazil's Nordeste during the last 3000 years based on speleothem isotope records, 835
- 836 Geophysical Researchs Letters, 39, L23706, doi:10.1029/2012GL053936. 837
- 838 Novello, V.F., M. Vuille, F.W. Cruz, N.M. Stríkis, M.S. de Paula, R.L. Edwards, H. Cheng,
- 839 I. Karmann, P.F. Jaqueto, R.I. F. Trindade, G.A. Hartmann, and J.S. Moquet, 2016:
- 840 Centennial-scale solar forcing of the South American Monsoon System recorded in
- 841 stalagmites. Scientific Reports, 6, 24762, doi:10.1038/srep24762
- 842

843 PAGES 2k Consortium, 2013; Continental-scale temperature variability during the past two 844 millennia. Nature Geoscience 6: 339-346, doi:10.1038/NGEO1797

845

846 PAGES 2k–PMIP3 group, 2015: Continental-scale temperature variability in PMIP3

- 847 simulations and PAGES 2k regional temperature reconstructions over the past millennium.
- Climate of the Past, 11, 1673–1699, 2015, www.clim-past.net/11/1673/2015/ 848 doi:10.5194/cp-11-1673-2015.
- 849

850

- 851 Phipps, S. J., L. D. Rotstayn, H. B. Gordon, J. L. Roberts, A. C. Hirst and W. F. Budd 852 (2011), The CSIRO Mk3L climate system model version 1.0 - Part 1: Description and evaluation, Geoscientific Model Development, 4(2), 483-509, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-483-853
- 854 855

2011.

- 856 Polanski, S., B. Fallah, D. J. Befort, S. Prasad, and U. Cubasch, 2014: Regional moisture change over India during the past Millennium: A comparison of multi-proxy 857 reconstructions and climate model simulations. Global and Planetary Change, 122, 176-185. 858
- 859 860 Polissar, P. J., M.B. Abbott, A.P. Wolfe, M. Bezada, V. Rull, and R.S. Bradley, 2006: Solar 861 modulation of Little Ice Age climate in the tropical Andes. Proceedings of the National 862 Academy of Sciences, 103, 8937-8942.
- 863
- 864 Raia, A., I.F.A. Cavalcanti, 2008. The Life Cycle of the South American Monsoon System. 865 Journal of Climate, 21, 6227-6246.

866

- Raddatz et al., 2007. Will the tropical land biosphere dominate the climate-carbon cycle 867 868 feedback during the twenty first century? Climate Dynamics, 29, 565-574, doi
- 10.1007/s00382-007-0247-8; 869
- 870
- 871 Robertson, A.W. and C.R. Mechoso, 2000: Interannual and Interdecadal Variability of the
- 872 South Atlantic Convergence Zone. Monthly Weather Review, 128, 2947-2957.

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 15:45

Eliminado:

maisa rojas 5/7/2016 11:45 Con formato: Fuente: (Predeterminado)

Times New Roman

Eliminado:

875	Schmidt, G. A., J. H. Jungclaus, C. M. Ammann, E. Bard, P. Braconnot, T. J. Crowley, G.	
876	Delaygue, F. Joos, N. A. Krivova, R. Muscheler, B. L. Otto-Bliesner, J. Pongratz, D. T.	
877	Shindell, S. K. Solanki, F. Steinhilber, and L. E. A. Vieira, 2011: Climate forcing	
878	reconstructions for use in PMIP simulations of the last millennium (v1.0). Geosci. Model	
879	Dev., 4, 33–45, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-33-2011.	
880		
881	Schmidt, G. A., J. H. Jungclaus, C. M. Ammann, E. Bard, P. Braconnot, T. J. Crowley, G.	
882	Delaygue, F. Joos, N. A. Krivova, R. Muscheler, B. L. Otto-Bliesner, J. Pongratz, D. T.	
883	Shindell, S. K. Solanki, F. Steinhilber, and L. E. A. Vieira, 2012: Climate forcing	
884	reconstructions for use in PMIP simulations of the last millennium (v1.1). Geoscientific	
885	Model Development 5, 185–191, doi:10.5194/gmd-5-185-2012.	
886		
887	Schneider, T., Bishoff, T., Haug, G.H., 2014: Migrations and dynamics of the intertropical	
888	convergence zone, Nature, 513, 45-53.	
889		
890	Schurer, A.; Tett, S.F.B.; Mineter, M.; Hegerl, G.C. (2013): Euroclim500 - Causes of	
891	change in European mean and extreme climate over the past 500 years: HadCM3 model	
892	output from the ALL experiment. NCAS British Atmospheric Data Centre.	
893		
894	Shi, F., J. Li, R. J. S. Wilson, 2014: A tree-ring reconstruction of the South Asian summer	
895	monsoon index over the past millennium. Scientific Reports 4, 6739.	
890	Signa LD D A Ariag S C Viging 2015: Provinitation over Northern South America and	
097	sterra, J.F., F. A. Allas, S. C. Viella, 2015. Flecipitation over Northern South America and	
898 800	2015 1 22 doi:10.1155/2015/624720	
900	2015, 1-22, doi:10.1155/2015/054/20.	
901	Signaço A.C. C. Hohenegger and B. Stevens 2014: The Atlantic ITCZ bias in CMIP5	
902	models Climate Dynamics 1-12 DOI 10 1007/s00382-014-2366-3	
903	noucle. Chinade Dynamices, 1 12, DOI 10.1007/500502 011 2500 5.	
904	Strikis NM CM Chiessi FW Cruz M Vuille H Cheng FA de Sousa Barreto G	
905	Mollenhauer, S. Kasten, I. Karmann, R.L. Edwards, J.P. Bernal and H. dos Reis Sales.	
906	2015: Timing and structure of Mega-SACZ events during Heinrich Stadial 1. Geophysical	
907	Research Letters, 42, 5477-5484, doi:10.1029/2015GL064048.	
908		
909	Vellinga, M., and P. Wu, 2004: Low-latitude freshwater influence on centennial variability	maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:03
910	of the Atlantic thermohaline circulation. Journal of Climate, 17(23), 4498–4511.	Eliminado: [3]
911		
912	Vera, C.S., P. Gonzalez, and G. Silvestri, 2009: About uncertainties in WCRP/CMIP3	
913	climate simulations over South America. In: Proceedings of the 9th international	
914	conference on southern hemisphere meteorology and oceanography, p 10.	
915		

- 918 Vera, C., W. Higgins, J. Amador, T. Ambrizzi, R. Garreaud, D. Gochis, D. Gutzler, D.
- 919 Lettenmaier, J. Marengo, C.R. Mechoso, J. Nogues-Paegle, P.L. Silva Dias, and C. Zhang,
- 2006: Towards a unified view of the American Monsoon System. Journal of Climate, 19,4977–5000.
- 922
- 923 Vimeux, F., P. Ginot, M. Schwikowski, M. Vuille, G. Hoffmann, L.G. Thompson, and U.
- 924 Schotterer, 2009: Climate variability during the last 1000 years inferred from Andean ice
- 925 cores: a review of recent results. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 281,
- 926 229-241, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2008.03.054.
- 927
- Vuille, M. and M. Werner, 2005: Stable isotopes in precipitation recording South American
 summer monsoon and ENSO variability observations and model results. Climate
- 930 Dynamics, 25, 401-413, doi:10.1007/s00382-005-0049-9.
- 931
- Vuille M., S. J. Burns, B.L. Taylor, F.W. Cruz, B.W. Bird, M.B. Abbott, L.C. Kanner, H.
 Cheng, and V.F. Novello, 2012: A review of the South American Monsoon history as
 recorded in stable isotopic proxies over the past two millennia. Climate of the Past, 8, 637–
- 935 668, doi:10.5194/cpd-8-637-2012.
- 936
- Wu, T. W., R. C. Yu, F. Zhang, et al., 2010: The Beijing climate center for atmospheric
 general circulation model: Description and its performance for the present-day climate.
 Climate Dynamics, 34, 123–147.
- 940 941 Yin, L., R. Fu, E. Shevliakova, and R. E. Dickinson, 2013: How well can CMIP5 simulate
- 942 precipitation and its controlling processes over tropical South America? Climate Dynamics,
 943 41(11-12), 3127–3143.
 944
- Yin, L., R. Fu, Y.-F. Zhang, P. A. Arias, D. N. Fernando, W. Li, K. Fernandes, and A. R.
 Bowerman, 2014: What controls the interannual variation of the wet season onsets over the
 Amazon? Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres, 119, 2314–2328,
 doi:10.1002/2013JD021349.
- 949
- 950 Yukimoto et al. 2011: Technical Report of the Meteorological Research Institute, 64, 83pp.951
- Zhang, P., H. Cheng, R.L. Edwards, et al., 2008: A test of climate, sun, and culture
 relationships from an 1810-year Chinese cave record. Science, 322, 940–942.
- 953 relationships from an 1810-year Chinese cave record. Science, 322, 9
- 954

957

958

672.

21

model and its 1000-year control integration. Advances in Atmospheric Sciences, 25, 655-

²⁵⁵ Zhou, T.J., B., Wu, X.Y., Wen, et al., 2008: A fast version of LASG/IAP climate system

961 Figure Legends

- 962 Figure 1. (a) Northern Hemisphere (north of 30°N) temperature anomaly evolution. Grey
- shading: 15 reconstructions used in Fig. 5.7 of Masson-Delmotte et al (2013a,b), colour
- lines: nine LM simulations considered in this study. (b) Distribution of Northern
- 965 Hemisphere temperature anomalies during the Medieval Climate Anomaly (MCA, red
- 966 curve) and Little Ice Age (LIA, blue curves), all with respect to the reference period 1500-
- 967 1850 CE, corresponding to the longest common period in the reconstructions.
- 968
- 969 Figure 2. Multi-model average annual mean temperatures. (a) Difference between MCA
- and reference period 1000-1850 CE, (b) difference between LIA and reference period, (c)
- 971 LIA MCA. Stippling indicates regions where differences are significant at p < 0.05.
- 972 Figure 3. (a) Multi-model average annual mean LIA MCA precipitation difference
- 973 (colours) and position of the oceanic Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) during the
- 974 MCA (red line) and LIA (blue line). Stippling indicates regions where precipitation
- 975 differences are significant at p<0.05. (b) Distribution of the zonal mean position [degrees]
- 976 of the oceanic ITCZ during the MCA (red curve) and LIA (blue curve).
- 977 Figure 4. (a) Model mean Dec-Jan-Feb (DJF) 850hPa winds (vectors) and precipitation
- 978 (colours) for the reference period (1000-1850 CE). (b) DJF mean LIA MCA winds
- 979 (vectors) and precipitation difference (colours). Red vectors indicate significant differences.
- 980 Figure 5, Multi-model mean DJF wind field at 200 hPa. (a) Climatology for reference
- 981 period (1000-1850 CE). (b): LIA MCA differences. Red box represents the South
- American Monsoon System (SAMS) domain. Red vectors indicate significant differences
 (p<0.05).
- 984 | Figure 6, Multi-model mean LIA -MCA 200 hPa zonal wind for Sep-Oct-Nov (SON).
- 985 Black contour corresponds to the 30m/s isotach of reference period zonal wind (1000-1850
- 986 CE). Only significant differences (p<0.05) are shown.
- 987
- 988 989 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997
- 999

maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:45

... [5]

Eliminado: maisa rojas 8/7/2016 22:45

Eliminado:

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 16:05

Eliminado: Figure 5. Multi-model mean DJF meridional mass stream function calculated from the irrotational wind over the

region 80-30°W, depicting the regional Hadley Cell. (a) Climatology for reference period (1000-1850 CE), Red (blue) colours indicate clockwise (counterclockwise) circulation, (b) LIA - MCA. Only significant changes (p=0.05) are shown.

maisa roja<u>s 6/7/2016 16:05</u>

Eliminado: 6

maisa rojas 6/7/2016 16:05

Eliminado: 7

- 1015 Table 1. LM model simulations used, including key reference and definition of LIA and MCA periods in each model.

Model	MCA	LIA	Period (CE)	Reference
bcc-csm-1	1040-1130	1590-1790	851-2000	-
CCSM4	1110-1200	1710-1810	850-1850	Gent et al. (2001)
CSIRO-Mk3L-1-2	950-1050	1760-1850	851-2000	Phipps et al. (2011)
FGOALS-gl	1210-1270	1690-1820	1000-2000	Zhou et al. (2008)
FGOALS-s2	915-990	1710-1790	850-1850	Zhou et al. (2008)
HadCM3	1160-1250	1600-1700	801-2000	Schurer et al. (2013)
IPSL-CM5A-LR	910-950	1630-1710	850-1850	Dufresne et al. (2013)
MPI-ESM-P	1120-1220	1600-1680	850-1850	Raddatz et al. (2007)
MRI-CGCM3	1130-1230	1510-1620	850-1849	Yukimoto et al. (2011)

The South American Monsoon Variability over the Last Millennium in coupled climate simulations



Figure 1. (a) Northern Hemisphere (north of 30°N) temperature anomaly evolution. Grey shading: 15 reconstructions used in Fig. 5.7 of Masson-Delmotte et al (2013a,b), colour lines: nine LM simulations considered in this study. (b) Distribution of Northern Hemisphere temperature anomalies during the Medieval Climate Anomaly (MCA, red curve) and Little Ice Age (LIA, blue curves), all with respect to the reference period 1500-1850 CE, corresponding to the longest common period in the reconstructions.



Figure 2. Multi-model average annual mean temperatures. (a) Difference between MCA and reference period 1000-1850 CE, (b) difference between LIA and reference period, (c) LIA - MCA. Stippling indicates regions where differences are significant at p<0.05.



Figure 3. (a) Multi-model average annual mean LIA - MCA precipitation difference (colours) and position of the oceanic Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) during the MCA (red line) and LIA (blue line). Stippling indicates regions where precipitation differences are significant at p<0.05. (b) Distribution of the zonal mean position [degrees] of the oceanic ITCZ during the MCA (red curve) and LIA (blue curve).



Figure 4. (a) Model mean Dec-Jan-Feb (DJF) 850hPa winds (vectors) and precipitation (colours) for the reference period (1000-1850 CE). (b) DJF mean LIA - MCA winds (vectors) and precipitation difference (colours). Red vectors indicate significant differences.



Figure 5. Multi-model mean DJF wind field at 200 hPa. (a) Climatology for reference period (1000-1850 CE). (b): LIA - MCA differences. Red box represents the South American Monsoon System (SAMS) domain. Red vectors indicate significant differences (p<0.05).



Figure 6. Multi-model mean LIA -MCA 200 hPa zonal wind for Sep-Oct-Nov (SON). Black contour corresponds to the 30m/s isotach of reference period zonal wind (1000-1850 CE). Only significant differences (p<0.05) are shown.