

1 **Climatic variability and human impact during the last 2000 years**
2 **in western Mesoamerica: evidence of Late Classic (AD 600 – 900)**
3 **and Little Ice Age drought events**

4
5 **A. Rodríguez-Ramírez^{1,*}, M. Caballero², P. Roy³, B. Ortega², G. Vázquez-Castro^{4,**}, S.**
6 **Lozano-García³**

7 [1]{Posgrado en Ciencias del Mar y Limnología, Instituto de Geofísica, Universidad Nacional
8 Autónoma de México, Ciudad Universitaria, 04510, México DF}

9 [2]{Instituto de Geofísica, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad Universitaria, 04510,
10 México DF.}

11 [3]{Instituto de Geología, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad Universitaria, 04510,
12 México DF.}

13 [4]{Posgrado en Ciencias de la Tierra, Instituto de Geofísica, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de
14 México, Ciudad Universitaria, 04510, Mexico DF}

15 [*]{Now at: Instituto de Ciencias del Mar y Limnología, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México,
16 México},

17 [**]{Now at: Escuela Nacional de Estudios Superiores Unidad Morelia, Universidad Nacional
18 Autónoma de México, México}

19 Correspondence to A. Rodríguez-Ramírez (alerdz@unam.mx) and M. Caballero
20 (maga@geofisica.unam.mx)

21
22 **Abstract**

23 We present results of analysis of biological (diatoms and ostracodes) and non-biological (Ti, Ca/Ti,
24 total inorganic carbon, magnetic susceptibility) variables from an 8.8 m long, high resolution (~20
25 yr/sample) laminated sediment sequence from lake Santa María del Oro (SMO), western Mexico. This
26 lake lies at a sensitive location between the dry climates of northern Mexico, under the influence of the
27 north Pacific High Pressure Subtropical Cell and the moister climates of central Mexico, under the

28 influence of the seasonal migration of the Intertropical Convergence Zone and the North American
29 Monsoon (NAM). The sequence covers the last 2000 years and provides evidence of two periods of
30 human impact in the catchment, shown by increases in the diatom *Achnantheidium minutissimum*. The
31 first from AD 100 to AD 400 (Early Classic) is related to the Shaft and Chamber Tombs Cultural
32 Tradition in Western Mexico, and the second is related to Postclassic occupation from AD 1100 to
33 1300. Both periods correspond to relatively wet conditions. Three dry intervals are identified from
34 increased carbonate and the presence of ostracodes and aerophilous *Eolimna minima*. The first, from
35 AD 500 to 1000 (most intense during the Late Classic, from AD 600 to 800), correlates with the end of
36 the Shaft and Chamber Tradition in Western Mexico after ca. AD 600. This Late Classic dry period is
37 the most important climatic signal in the Mesoamerican region during the last 2000 years, and has been
38 recorded at several sites from Yucatan to the Pacific coast. In the Yucatan area this dry interval has
39 been related with the demise of the Maya culture at the end of the Classic (AD 850 – 950). The last
40 two dry events (AD 1400 to 1550 and 1690 to 1770) correspond with the onset and late Little Ice Age,
41 and follow largely the Spörer and Maunder minima in solar radiation. The first of these intervals (AD
42 1400 – 1550) shows the most intense signal over western Mexico; however this pattern is different at
43 other sites. Dry/wet intervals in the SMO record are related with lower/higher intensity of the NAM
44 over this region, respectively.

45

46 **1 Introduction**

47 Knowledge of past climate and environmental events is critical to understand a wide variety of modern
48 environmental processes and to better estimate causes and effects of future environmental changes.
49 Records from many parts of the world have led to the recognition of climate variability in the late
50 Holocene. However, the magnitude, duration and the possible mechanisms of climate change at each
51 location are not clear, especially at tropical latitudes where there are fewer continental records than at
52 higher latitudes (Maasch et al., 2005; Mann et al., 1999).

53 In Mesoamerica, the last two thousand years appear to have been a time of substantial climatic change
54 with a complex signal, mostly linked to moisture availability (Metcalf et al., 2000). At present, the
55 influence of the Intertropical Converge Zone (ITCZ) and Subtropical High-Pressure Cells (SHPCs)
56 varies seasonally, showing latitudinal shifts associated with the tropospheric equator-pole temperature
57 gradient in each hemisphere, and the thermal contrast between the hemispheres (Haug et al., 2001;

58 Nyberg et al., 2002). The seasonal shift in insolation and latitudinal location of the ITCZ and SHPCs
59 brings shifts in moisture availability that affect most of Mesoamerica, with an intense summer rainfall
60 season associated with the northerly location of the ITCZ and the onset of the North American
61 Monsoon (NAM). Past changes in the amplitude, intensity and location of the ITCZ and SHPCs and in
62 the intensity of the NAM are therefore likely explanations for the changes documented in the
63 Mesoamerican geological records (Hodell et al., 2005a; Metcalfe et al., 2010; Haug et al., 2003; Barron
64 et al., 2012). Long-term changes in these climatic systems can be recorded in the sediment archives of
65 lakes in the region given that lakes are sensitive to climatic variations, which can lead to changes in
66 their stratification patterns, their water chemistry and/or their biological associations. Western
67 Mexico's precipitation is modulated by the position of the ITCZ and the intensity of the NAM,
68 however, most of the available paleolimnological records for Mesoamerica are concentrated in the
69 highlands of central Mexico or in the Yucatan region (Metcalfe et al., 2000).

70 In this paper we present a multiproxy, high-resolution (~20 yr per sample) study of a laminated
71 sediment sequence from a closed lake basin in western Mexico, Santa María del Oro, Nayarit (Fig. 1),
72 and infer past climatic events that affected western Mesoamerica during the past 2000 years. This lake
73 currently sits at the intersection between the arid climates of northern Mexico, mostly under the
74 influence of the north Pacific SHPC, and the temperate, sub-humid to humid climates of central
75 Mexico (García-Oliva et al., 2002), under the influence of the ITCZ and the NAM systems. This
76 record gives clear evidence of two intense drought periods, the Late Classic (AD 600 to 800) and the
77 onset of the Little Ice Age (AD 1400 to 1550), and a third, less intense dry phase around AD 1690 to
78 1770.

79

80 **2 Site description**

81 Santa Maria del Oro (SMO, 21°23'N, 104°35'W, 750 m asl) is a topographically closed freshwater
82 crater lake at the western end of the Transmexican Volcanic Belt and lies only 65 km from the Pacific
83 coast (Fig. 1). Catchment rocks are dominated by dacite-rhyolite and basaltic-andesite. Minor
84 exposures of basaltic lava flows are present on the northern wall of the crater. There are no carbonate
85 rock outcrops in the catchment or in the surrounding areas (Ferrari et al., 2003; Vázquez-Castro et al.,
86 2008).

87 The climate at SMO is warm and sub-humid, with monthly average temperatures that range from
88 16.5°C to 25°C (Station 18005-Cerro Blanco - Servicio Meteorológico Nacional). This region receives
89 average annual precipitation of ~1200 mm mainly during the warm summer months (June to
90 September) when the ITCZ is at its most northerly location and the NAM is active (Liebmann et al.,
91 2008; Berbery, 2001). During summer, tropical storms and hurricanes can also bring moisture from the
92 Pacific (Castro, 2010; García-Oliva et al., 2002). The rest of the year (October to May) is relatively dry,
93 particularly during spring.

94 SMO is a nearly round, ~2-km diameter lake. It has a maximum depth of 65.5 m and a mean depth of
95 46 m (Serrano et al., 2002). The crater has steep slopes but there is a small flat and shallow bay (12 m
96 deep) where the core for this study was retrieved (Fig. 1). The lake receives inflows directly from
97 precipitation, seasonal runoff and ground water, and loses water to evaporation and seepage. The
98 lowest point of the crater is on the north-eastern side, where the natural sill has been anthropogenically
99 modified. Today it lies ~5 m above the lake level (755 m asl). The closed nature of the basin and
100 relatively unpolluted condition make this lake an ideal paleoenvironmental research site, where lake
101 chemistry depends mostly on the precipitation - evaporation balance. At present SMO is a freshwater,
102 $[\text{HCO}_3^-]$ - $[\text{Cl}^-]$, $[\text{Na}^+] > [\text{Mg}^{2+}] >> [\text{Ca}^{2+}]$, oligotrophic, warm monomictic lake, with a winter mixing
103 period (Caballero et al., 2013); the oxycline lies between 13 and 20 m depth the rest of the year.
104 Currently the lake ostracode fauna is dominated by *Potamocypris variegata* Brady & Norman,
105 *Cypridopsis vidua* Müller and *Darwinula stevensoni* Brady & Robertson and the planktonic diatom
106 flora by *Aulacoseira granulata* (Ehrenberg) Simonsen, in association with *Nitzschia amphibia* Grunow.

107

108 **3 Methods**

109 Four cores between 4 and 9 m length were recovered from the shallow south-western bay (12 m depth)
110 of SMO in 2002 (Fig. 1c) with a Usinger coring system (Mingram et al., 2007). All cores were split,
111 described, photographed and sampled at the Instituto de Geofísica, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de
112 México (UNAM) and, unless otherwise specified, all analyses were performed there. The longest core
113 (SMO02-V, 8.8 m) was sampled on average at 5 cm intervals for magnetic susceptibility (MS),
114 biological (ostracodes, diatoms, pollen) and geochemical analyses (total inorganic carbon, total organic
115 carbon, X-Ray fluorescence elemental analysis). Seven samples for ^{14}C AMS radiocarbon age
116 determinations were collected at selected levels, dried and sent without further treatment to a

117 commercial dating laboratory (Beta Analytic). The seven dates (Table 1) were calibrated to calendar
118 years with Calib 5.0 (Stuiver et al., 2005) and the IntCal04 data set (Reimer et al., 2004). The age
119 model (Fig. 2) assumed constant, linear sediment accumulation rates between the dates and anchored
120 the top sediment to the year of coring (2002) (Vázquez-Castro et al., 2008). The sediment stratigraphy,
121 age model, MS and total inorganic carbon (TIC) data were published in Vazquez et al. 2008. Here we
122 present MS data, expressed in dimensionless international SI units, and TIC expressed as CaCO₃%,
123 together with new diatom, ostracode, Ca and Ti data from the SMO02-V core.

124

125 **3.1 X-Ray Fluorescence**

126 Thirty nine freeze-dried sediment samples were chosen, on average every 20 cm, for X-Ray
127 fluorescence (XRF) elemental analysis. Samples were homogenized and ground to 200 mesh using an
128 agate mortar. Elemental concentrations were measured at the Institute of Geology, UNAM using a
129 Siemens SRS 3000 wavelength dispersive XRF spectrometer with a precision of 5%. Titanium and
130 calcium concentrations are expressed as percentages; Ca was normalized against titanium and
131 expressed as Ca/Ti mass ratio.

132

133 **3.2 Diatoms**

134 For diatom analysis, 108 samples were chosen, on average at every 10-cm interval, of which 78
135 contained diatoms. Dry sediment (0.5 g) was cleaned successively with HCl (10%), H₂O₂ and HNO₃.
136 Permanent slides were made with 200 µl of clean sediment material and embedded with Naphrax®
137 mounting medium. Minimum counts of 300 valves were undertaken in most samples, but 22 had low
138 diatom abundance and only 100 valves were counted. Diatom counts were done with an Olympus
139 BX50 microscope with Interferential Phase Contrast at 1000x magnification. Species composition is
140 reported as relative abundance (%), and total abundance is reported as valves per gram of dry sediment
141 (v gds⁻¹).

142

143 **3.3 Ostracodes**

144 For ostracodes the same 108 samples were analyzed, but only 57 levels contained ostracodes remains.
145 Two cubic centimeters from each sample were freeze dried, from which 1 g of dry sediment was

146 disaggregated by standard methods (Delorme, 1990; Forester, 1988) and wet-sieved (63 μm).
147 Ostracode valves were picked under an Olympus SZX12 stereo microscope, counted, determined to
148 species taxonomic level and stored in micropalaeontological slides. Care was taken to pick whole adult
149 valves to allow species identification, and juvenile valves were counted separately. Ostracode counts
150 are expressed as valves per gram of dry sediment (v gds^{-1}).

151

152 **4 Results**

153 **4.1 Core description**

154 Sedimentation rates varied between 0.21 cm yr^{-1} and 1.15 cm yr^{-1} (Fig. 2) and, according to the age
155 model (Fig. 2), the base of the core (882 cm) is ca. 2600 years old. Average sample resolution was
156 about 23 years per sample. The SMO02-V sequence consists of sand/silt laminations with intercalated
157 woody peat layers. Individual silt layers can be of $\sim 1 - 3 \text{ mm}$ up to 60 mm in thickness and either
158 light-brown calcareous, greenish, reddish or dark brown (Vázquez-Castro et al., 2008). A 13 mm thick
159 gray tephra layer at 454 cm depth was identified as the Toba Jala from nearby Ceboruco volcano;
160 according to our chronology this tephra dates to AD ~ 860 (Vázquez-Castro et al., 2008), a date that
161 falls within the range of calibrated radiometric ages reported for this tephra (Fig. 2) (Sieron and Siebe,
162 2008). The light-brown calcareous silt layers contain either authigenic carbonates or ostracodes, and
163 are more frequent towards the top of the core, whereas woody peat layers are more frequent towards
164 the bottom. There is no evidence for hiatuses, erosion features or slumping structures in the cores.

165

166 **4.2 Non biological variables**

167 Magnetic susceptibility (MS) (Fig. 3) fluctuates along the core between 24 and $520 \times 10^{-6} \text{ SI}$, with
168 lowest values ($< 200 \times 10^{-6} \text{ SI}$) observed between 530 and 490 cm , and between 200 and 150 cm . The
169 highest MS values ($> 300 \times 10^{-6} \text{ SI}$) are mainly present from 600 to 530 cm and from 490 to 420 cm .
170 Titanium contents range between 0.3 and 1.5% with lower than average ($< 0.8\%$) values concentrated
171 between 530 and 370 cm and 200 to 150 cm . The highest values ($> 1.3\%$) in the record are present
172 between 450 and 420 cm .

173 TIC as its CaCO_3 equivalent varies along the core from 0 to 59% (Fig. 3), in a pattern nearly opposite
174 to magnetic susceptibility, showing in general higher values ($> 20\%$) between 530 and 370 cm , 320 and

175 240 cm, 200 to 150 cm and 120 to 100 cm. The Ca/Ti weight ratio ranges between 1.4 and 175 and
176 shows above average values (>15) between 530 and 370 cm and at 200 cm.

177

178 **4.3 Diatoms**

179 Diatom abundance shows several intervals of lower than average values ($<40 \times 10^6$ v gds⁻¹, Fig. 4), but
180 the lowest abundances are recorded between 740 and 690 cm and from 380 to 330 cm. Sixty-four
181 species are recorded in the sequence, nine with relative abundances $> 20\%$ in more than one sample
182 (Fig. 3). *Aulacoseira granulata*, *Nitzschia amphibia* and small species of *Fragilaria sensu lato*
183 (*Staurosira construens*, *Staurosirella pinnata*, *Pseudostaurosira parasitica*, *P. brevistriata*) are the
184 dominant species along the record. *Achnantheidium minutissimum* (Kützing) Czarnecki has a
185 preferential distribution between 750 and 650 cm and from 400 to 250 cm, *Amphora libyca* Ehrenberg
186 and *Hippodonta luneburgensis* (Grunow) Lange-Bertalot, Metzeltin & Witkowski have higher
187 abundances in the top 500 cm of the core and *Eolimna minima* (Grunow) Lange-Bertalot & W.Schiller
188 shows a distinctive distribution with maxima between 530 and 420 cm and two less important peaks
189 between 200 and 110 cm and 75 to 60 cm.

190

191 **4.4 Ostracodes**

192 Ostracode total abundance shows two distinct intervals with high values (>1000 adult v gds⁻¹), the first
193 between 530 and 420 cm and the second between 200 and 110 cm. A smaller peak at 75 to 60 cm is
194 also present while the rest of the core has very low (<100 adult v gds⁻¹) ostracode concentration (Fig.
195 3). Six species are recorded in the sequence; *Candona patzcuaro* Tressler is the most abundant and
196 constant along the core in association with *Potamocypris variegata* and minor numbers of
197 *Chlamydotheca arcuata* Sars. *Cypridopsis vidua* and *Darwinula stevensoni* are also present along the
198 core, but show a preferential distribution between the 530 and 420 cm interval. *Limnocythere verrucosa*
199 Hoff is only present as juvenile valves, and shows maximum concentrations between 570 and 530 cm.

200

201 **5 Interpretation of sediment variables**

202 MS indicates the abundance of magnetic minerals that reach a lake mainly by surface runoff from the
203 catchment area or, on occasion, from volcanic activity (Evans and Heller, 2003). Titanium is an

204 element that originates from minerals in the catchment rocks and its abundance in lacustrine sediments
205 is also indicative of surface runoff to the lake and erosion (Metcalf et al., 2010; Sosa-Nájera et al.,
206 2010). Both variables can therefore be used to identify times of higher or lower precipitation and
207 surface transport of sediments to the lake.

208 On the other hand, given that there are no carbonate rocks in the lake catchment, high values of TIC are
209 indicative of times of higher authigenic carbonate precipitation. This is a process that currently occurs
210 in SMO during the warmer part of the year (Caballero et al., 2013) and that is, in general, favored by
211 high evaporation rates leading to increased electric conductivity, alkalinity and pH (Eugster and
212 Hardie, 1978; Gierlowski-Kordesch, 2010). Calcium may originate from the minerals in the catchment
213 but is also incorporated in authigenic carbonates. Sosa-Nájera et al. (2010) demonstrated that, in this
214 lake higher Ca concentrations correlate with historical droughts during the last 700 years, supporting
215 the interpretation that, in SMO, high calcium values are mostly related with carbonate deposition
216 during times of higher evaporation. Nevertheless, Ca was normalized against Ti to down weight the
217 detrital signal in this element. High TIC and high Ca/Ti values in this record can, therefore, be taken as
218 indicators of increased carbonate deposition during times of lower precipitation and higher evaporation
219 rates leading to relatively high lake water electric conductivity, pH and alkalinity. Given the
220 contrasting environmental conditions that lead to high MS and Ti versus high TIC and Ca, it is not
221 surprising that they show nearly opposite patterns of downcore variations. Together, these records
222 enable identification of two intervals of intense evaporation and reduced surface runoff to the lake, the
223 first from 530 to 490 cm (AD 600 to 800) and the second from 200 to 150 cm (AD 1400 to 1450).

224 With respect to the biological variables, three ecological groups can be identified in the diatom record:
225 1) A planktonic/tychoplanktonic association dominated by *Aulacoseira granulata*, *Nitzschia amphibia*
226 and small *Fragilaria* spp., which is abundant along most of the sequence (Fig. 3); this association
227 includes the two main diatom species present in the modern lake plankton (Caballero et al., 2013). 2)
228 A benthic/periphytic association in which *Amphora libyca*, *Hippodonta luneburgensis* and *Eolimna*
229 *minima*, are the main species. These periphytic genera (*Amphora*) and species (*H. luneburgensis*, *E.*
230 *minima*) are currently distributed in the shallower environments of the lake (Caballero et al., 2013). *E.*
231 *minima* in particular is an aerophilic species (Wolfe and Härtling, 1996; Van Dam et al., 1994). Its
232 distinctive distribution along the record (shaded areas in Fig. 3) suggests intervals of particularly
233 shallow lake levels. 3) An eutrophication/human impact association is defined by the presence of
234 *Achnantheidium minutissimum*, a species that has been considered by some authors as a colonizer in

235 disturbed environments (Peterson and Stevenson, 1992; Hodgson et al., 1997). In Mexico, this species
236 has been recorded in the plankton of tropical lakes in areas that have been severely altered by human
237 activities (Caballero et al., 2006; Vázquez and Caballero, 2013). This interpretation is further
238 supported by the presence of *Zea mays* pollen grains in the same segments of the core (S. Sosa-Nájera,
239 personal communication, 2013).

240 The ostracode record can be interpreted based on the study by Caballero et al. (2013) in this lake, who
241 found that ostracodes were most abundant in shallow water environments with littoral vegetation and a
242 low sediment supply. Given that the dominant species in the SMO record are the same as those that
243 currently live in this lake (*P. variegata*, *D. stevensoni*, *C. vidua*) high ostracode abundances are taken
244 to be indicative of these conditions, which are consistent with lower surface runoff. The ostracode
245 relative abundance record and the distribution of *E. minima*, suggest three zones of lower than average
246 lake levels (Fig. 3): 560 to 410 cm (AD 500 to 1000), 200 to 100 cm (AD 1400 to 1550) and 75 to 56
247 cm (AD 1690 to 1770). The first two periods include the two events of intense evaporation identified
248 in the geochemical record.

249

250 **6 Paleoenvironmental history of Lake SMO**

251 The MS, Ti, Ca/Ti, ostracode and diatom records together (Fig. 3) enable reconstruction of the
252 environmental history of Lake SMO during the last 2000 years. Low values of Ca/Ti, TIC and
253 ostracode abundance, together with the absence of benthic/periphytic diatoms in the record prior to AD
254 500 indicate that the Lake SMO was generally deeper and the lake water was more dilute from 100 BC
255 to AD 500. An early phase of human impact is identified by the abundance of *A. minutissim* from 100
256 BC to AD 300 possibly related with the local expression of the Shaft and Chamber Tomb Tradition
257 (200 BC to AD 600) characteristic of western Mexico (Beekman, 2010; Barrera-Rodríguez, 2006).

258 After AD 500 the lake experienced a low level stage defined mainly by an increase in *E. minima* and
259 ostracode concentrations, by low MS and also by its magnetic mineralogy (Vázquez-Castro et al.,
260 2008). This period of low lake level extended from AD 500 to 1000, with the interval from AD 600 to
261 800 representing the driest conditions (lowest MS and Ti values and highest TIC and Ca/Ti ratios).
262 This first low lake level phase in SMO correlates with what is known as Late Classic (AD 600 – 900)
263 period in the development of Mesoamerican cultures, characterized by a decline of the Teotihuacan
264 culture in central Mexico after AD 650 (Manzanilla, 2011) and development of Maya cities in the

265 Yucatan region, which ends abruptly between AD 850 and 950. In western Mexico in general and
266 specifically in the state of Nayarit (Barrera-Rodríguez, 2006), this is a time of cultural transition as the
267 Shaft and Chamber Tomb tradition ended by AD 600 (Barrera-Rodríguez, 2006). In the SMO record
268 there is no evidence of human impact during this dry interval. Thus, the inferred dry conditions in this
269 period reflect a true climatic signal, not obscured by anthropogenic activities.

270 This Late Classic drought has been identified in several records from Mexico, particularly from
271 Yucatan (Hodell et al., 2005a; Metcalfe et al., 2010; Caballero et al., 2002; Lozano-García et al., 2010;
272 Curtis et al., 1996; Bhattacharya et al., 2015) (Fig. 1), to the extent that it is referred to as the “Great
273 Maya Drought” (Gill, 2001) and has been put forward as an important factor in the collapse of the
274 Maya culture at the end of the Classic (AD 850 – 950). The exact timing of these droughts varies
275 across sites but in general, it is centered in a similar time interval as in SMO (AD 500 to 1000) (Fig. 4).
276 In some records, the droughts show a recurrent or cyclic pattern (Haug et al., 2003; Hodell et al., 2001;
277 Curtis et al., 1996) which could explain the fluctuating values of the geochemical records of Lake SMO
278 (alternating high and low TIC, Ti and MS) from AD 800 to 1000 and even until AD 1200.

279 After AD 1000 low abundances of *E. minima* and ostracode valves suggest that the lake level in SMO
280 recovered. However TIC, Ca/Ti and Ti still fluctuate between high and low values until AD ~1200.
281 After this date, the age model (Fig. 2) also suggests that sedimentation rates increased (from ≤ 0.3 cm/yr
282 to >1 cm/yr), which is in accordance with higher surface runoff to the lake. Moister conditions after
283 AD 1000 and especially from AD 1200 to 1400 correlate with moist conditions inferred from the Ti
284 record from Lake Juanacatlán, a site also in western Mexico (Metcalfe et al., 2010). Between AD 1000
285 and 1400, however, the presence of *A. minutissimum* points to a time of human disturbance in the
286 system. This trend in human occupation at Lake SMO agrees with recent archaeological findings in
287 Nayarit that show Late Postclassic (AD 1100-1400) occupations (Gálvez-Rosales, 2006) and is also in
288 agreement with the Late Postclassic cultural peak reached in western Mesoamerica by groups like the
289 Purepecha or Tarascans (Pollard, 2005).

290 From AD 1400 to 1550 the increase in TIC, *E. minima* and ostracode abundance, the decline in MS as
291 well as the magnetic mineralogy (Vázquez-Castro et al., 2008) suggest that the lake level in SMO
292 dropped again. The lowest MS and Ti values and highest TIC suggest that the reduction in moisture
293 was most intense from AD 1400 to 1450. This second dry interval in the Lake SMO record
294 corresponds with the onset of the Little Ice Age. This period has also been recorded as a time of
295 reduced moisture and lower lake levels in other Mesoamerican records (Metcalfe et al., 2010; Hodell et

296 al., 2005b; Cuna et al., 2014) (Fig. 4) and represents the climatic scenario for the Spanish conquest of
297 Mesoamerica in 1521.

298 Water levels recovered in SMO between AD 1550 and 1690, but a third, less intense period of reduced
299 moisture availability is evident in the record from a slight increase in *E. minima* and ostracode
300 concentrations between AD 1690 and 1770. This smaller reduction in moisture is coeval with the end
301 of the Little Ice Age and shows the two period of cooling in the Little Ice Age, also evident in the
302 record from Lago Verde, eastern Mexico (Lozano-García et al., 2007).

303

304 **7 Paleoclimate implications**

305 The data from Lake SMO enabled us to identify two periods of human impact that are consistent with
306 findings from recent archaeological research in the area (Barrera-Rodríguez, 2006; Gálvez-Rosales,
307 2006), the first related with the Shaft and Chamber Tomb tradition (100 BC to AD 300) and the second
308 during the Late Postclassic (AD 1100 to 1400). It is interesting to note that these periods of occupation
309 correspond with times of moister conditions while there is no evidence of human impact in this lake
310 during the drier Late Classic (AD 600 – 900).

311 The biological and non-biological variables in the sediment of Lake SMO provide solid evidence of
312 three drier than average intervals, the most intense from AD 600 to 800, correlating mostly with the
313 Late Classic, and the other two related with the onset (AD 1400-1550) and the late (AD 1690-1770)
314 Little Ice Age. There is also evidence of a wetter Late Postclassic period (AD 1200 to 1400). In this
315 region where climate is controlled by the seasonal shift of the north Pacific SHPC, the ITCZ and the
316 onset of the NAM, drier than average conditions can be related to an expansion of the north Pacific
317 SHPC, a southward migration of the ITCZ and a less active NAM (Haug et al., 2003; Metcalfe et al.,
318 2010). Other mechanisms that could bring wetter/drier conditions in this region are changes in the
319 frequency or strength of “La Niña” / “El Niño”, as today “La Niña” is related with wetter than average
320 summers (Magaña et al., 2003; Metcalfe et al., 2010). Changes in the paths or frequency of Pacific
321 tropical storms and hurricanes could also be elements that control the moisture balance in this area.

322 The data presented in this paper provide further evidence that the Late Classic drought (AD 500 to
323 1000) was the most important one in Mesoamerica during the last 2000 years, affecting the whole
324 region from Yucatan to the Pacific coast (Fig. 4); it was not only a circum-Caribbean feature. In SMO
325 the most intense phase is recorded from AD 600 to 800. The variable nature of the Lake SMO record

326 from AD 800 to 1200 seems consistent with the proposed recurrent nature of droughts, which has been
327 suggested to follow cycles in solar activity (mainly 50 and 200 yr), (Hodell et al., 2001; Haug et al.,
328 2003; Hodell et al., 2005a). This period of strong fluctuations in the Lake SMO record also correlates
329 with the onset of warmer- than-average conditions over the northern hemisphere from AD 830 to 1100
330 during the Medieval Climatic Anomaly (PAGES-2k-Consortium, 2013) that locally correlated with
331 warmer sea surface temperatures in the Gulf of California (Barron et al., 2002).

332 The dry interval from AD 1400 to 1550 which corresponds with the onset of the Little Ice Age,
333 correlates closely with the Spörer minimum in solar activity. The less intense dry period near the end
334 of the Little Ice Age (AD 1690 to 1770) correlates partly with the Maunder solar minimum. A two
335 phase Little Ice Age cooling, partly following the two solar minima, is also present in the record from
336 Lago Verde, eastern Mexico (Lozano-García et al., 2007). In lakes SMO and Juanacatlán (both in
337 western Mexico, Fig. 1) the Spörer minimum shows the most intense signal. However, in other records
338 in central and eastern Mexico, the Maunder minimum represents the driest and/or coldest period (Haug
339 et al., 2003; Cuna et al., 2014) (Fig. 4). Furthermore, in some records, the two periods seem to merge
340 into a single, longer Little Ice Age drought (Hodell et al., 2005b). These Little Ice Age droughts seem
341 to be related with the Spörer and Maunder solar minima.

342 The good coherence of the biological and non-biological proxies, the solid chronology and high-
343 resolution nature of the Lake SMO record yield insights into the environmental and climatic processes
344 that affected this lake during the last 2000 years, and provides insight into the interplay between
345 climatic and anthropogenic influences on this lake.

346

347 **Acknowledgements**

348 This research was possible thanks to economical support from projects UNAM-DGAPA IN107928,
349 UNAM-DGAPA IN203102 and CONACyT G28528T. The authors are thankful for the technical
350 support from: Susana Sosa Nájera, Antonio González, Teodoro Hernández, Luis Oseguera, Rufino
351 Lozano, and Teresa Pi. Total inorganic carbon determinations were performed in the facilities of the
352 Limnological Research Center, University of Minnesota. A. Rodríguez wishes to thank Dr. Richard
353 Forester[†] for his help in ostracode taxonomy, the support from the Postgraduate Program in Marine
354 Sciences and Limnology of the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (UNAM) and the
355 economic support from CONACyT for his PhD research.

357 **References**

- 358 Barrera-Rodríguez, R.: El proyecto arqueológico El Cajón, Nayarit, in: Entre ríos y montañas sagradas:
 359 arqueología en El Cajón, Nayarit., edited by: Barrera-Rodríguez, R., Consejo Nacional para la
 360 Cultura y las Artes, Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia, Comisión Federal de
 361 Electricidad., México D.F., 13-28, 2006.
- 362 Barron, J. A., Bukry, D., and Bischoff, J. L.: A 2000-yr-long record of climate from the Gulf of
 363 California, Proceedings of the Nineteenth Pacific Climate Workshop, Asilomar, Pacific Grove, CA,
 364 2002, 11-21,
- 365 Barron, J. A., Metcalfe, S. E., and Addison, J. A.: Response of the North American monsoon to
 366 regional changes in ocean surface temperature, *Paleoceanography*, 27, PA3206, 3201-3217, doi:
 367 10.1029/2011PA002235, 2012.
- 368 Beekman, C. S.: Recent research in western Mexican archaeology, *Journal of Archaeological Research*,
 369 18, 41-109, 2010.
- 370 Berbery, E. H.: Mesoscale moisture analysis of the North American monsoon, *Journal of Climate*, 14,
 371 121-137, 2001.
- 372 Bhattacharya, T., Byrne, R., Böhnell, H., Wogau, K., Kienel, U., Ingram, L., and Zimmerman, S.:
 373 Cultural implications of late Holocene climate change in the Cuenca Oriental, Mexico, Proceedings
 374 of the National Academy of Sciences, 112, 1693-1698, doi: 10.1073/pnas.1405653112, 2015.
- 375 Caballero, M., Ortega, B., Valadez, F., Metcalfe, S., Macias, J. L., and Sugiura, Y.: Sta. Cruz Atizapan:
 376 a 22-ka lake level record and climatic implications for the late Holocene human occupation in the
 377 Upper Lerma Basin, Central Mexico, *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology*, 186, 217-
 378 235, doi: 10.1016/s0031-0182(02)00502-3, 2002.
- 379 Caballero, M., Vázquez, G., Lozano-García, S., Rodríguez, A., Sosa-Nájera, S., Ruiz-Fernández, A. C.,
 380 and Ortega, B.: Present Limnological Conditions and Recent (ca. 340 yr) Palaeolimnology of a
 381 Tropical Lake in the Sierra de Los Tuxtlas, Eastern Mexico, *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 35, 83-97,
 382 doi: 10.1007/s10933-005-7427-5, 2006.
- 383 Caballero, M., Rodriguez, A., Vilaclara, G., Ortega, B., Roy, P., and Lozano García, S.:
 384 Hydrochemistry, ostracods and diatoms in a deep, tropical, crater lake in Western Mexico., *Journal*
 385 *of Limnology*, 72, 512-523, 10.4081/jlimnol.2013.e42, 2013.
- 386 Castro, S. C. D.: Variabilidad de los ciclones tropicales que afectan a México, *Interciencia*, 35, 306-
 387 310, 2010.
- 388 Cuna, E., Zawisza, E., Caballero, M., Ruiz-Fernández, A. C., Lozano-García, M. S., and Alcocer, J.:
 389 Environmental impacts of Little ice Age cooling in central Mexico recorded in the sediments of a
 390 tropical alpine lake., *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 51, 1-14, 10.1007/s10933-013-9748-0, 2014.
- 391 Curtis, J. H., Hodell, D. A., and Brenner, M.: Climate variability on the Yucatan Peninsula (Mexico)
 392 during the past 3500 years, and implications for Maya cultural evolution, *Quaternary Research*, 46,
 393 37-47, 1996.
- 394 Delorme, L. D.: Freshwater Ostracodes., in: *Methods in quaternary ecology*, edited by: Warner, B. G.,
 395 Geological Association of Canada, 93-100, 1990.
- 396 Eugster, P. H., and Hardie, L. A.: Saline lakes, in: *Lakes: chemistry, geology, physics.*, edited by:
 397 Lerman, A., Springer, New York, 237 - 293, 1978.
- 398 Evans, M., and Heller, F.: *Environmental magnetism: principles and applications of enviromagnetics*,
 399 Academic press, 2003.

- 400 Ferrari, L., Petrone, C. M., Francalanci, L., Tagami, T., Eguchi, M., Conticelli, S., Manetti, P., and
401 Venegas-Salgado, S.: Geology of the San Pedro – Ceboruco Graben, western Trans-Mexican
402 Volcanic Belt, *Revista Mexicana de Ciencias Geológicas*, 20, 165-181, 2003.
- 403 Forester, R.: Nonmarine calcareous microfossil sample preparation and data acquisition procedures,
404 United States Geological Survey Technical Proceed HP-78 RI, 1-9, 1988.
- 405 Gálvez-Rosales, M.: Unidades habitacionales y ceremoniales en el paraje Los Ciruelos, Paso de San
406 Juan, Nayarit., in: *Entre ríos y montañas sagradas: arqueología en El Cajón, Nayarit.*, edited by:
407 Barrera-Rodríguez, R., Consejo Nacional para la Cultura y las Artes, Instituto Nacional de
408 Antropología e Historia, Comisión Federal de Electricidad., México D.F., 29-43, 2006.
- 409 García-Oliva, F., Camou, A., and Maass, J. M.: El clima de la región central de la costa del Pacífico
410 mexicano, *Historia natural de Chamela*, 3, 2002.
- 411 Gierlowski-Kordesch, E. H.: Lacustrine carbonates, *Developments in Sedimentology*, 61, 1-101, 2010.
- 412 Gill, R. B.: *The great Maya droughts: water, life, and death*, UNM Press, 2001.
- 413 Haug, G. H., Hughen, K. A., Sigman, D. M., Peterson, L. C., and Röhl, U.: Intertropical Convergence
414 Zone through the Holocene, *Science*, 293, 1304-1308, 2001.
- 415 Haug, G. H., Günther, D., Peterson, L. C., Sigman, D. M., Hughen, K. A., and Aeschlimann, B.:
416 Climate and the collapse of Maya civilization, *Science*, 299, 1731-1735, 2003.
- 417 Hodell, D. A., Brenner, M., Curtis, J. H., and Guilderson, T.: Solar forcing of drought frequency in the
418 Maya lowlands, *Science*, 292, 1367-1370, doi: 10.1126/science.1057759, 2001.
- 419 Hodell, D. A., Brenner, M., and Curtis, J. H.: Terminal Classic drought in the northern Maya lowlands
420 inferred from multiple sediment cores in Lake Chichancanab (Mexico), *Quaternary Science*
421 *Reviews*, 24, 1413-1427, 2005a.
- 422 Hodell, D. A., Brenner, M., Curtis, J. H., Medina-González, R., Ildefonso Chan Can, E., Albornaz-Pat,
423 A., and Guilderson, T. P.: Climate change on the Yucatán Peninsula during the Little Ice Age,
424 *Quaternary Research*, 63, 109-121, 2005b.
- 425 Hodgson, D., Vyverman, W., and Tyler, P.: Diatoms of meromictic lakes adjacent to the Gordon River,
426 and of the Gordon River Estuary in south-west Tasmania., *Bibliotheca Diatomologica*, 174 pp.,
427 1997.
- 428 Liebmann, B., Bladé, I., Bond, N. A., Gochis, D., Allured, D., and Bates, G. T.: Characteristics of
429 North American summertime rainfall with emphasis on the monsoon, *Journal of Climate*, 21, 1277-
430 1294, 2008.
- 431 Lozano-García, M. S., Caballero, M., Ortega, B., Rodríguez, A., and Sosa, S.: Tracing the effects of the
432 Little Ice Age in the tropical lowlands of Eastern Mesoamerica, *Proceedings of the National*
433 *Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 104, 16200-16203, 2007.
- 434 Lozano-García, S., Sosa-Najera, S., Sugiura, Y., and Caballero, M.: 23,000 yr of vegetation history of
435 the Upper Lerma, a tropical high-altitude basin in Central Mexico, *Quaternary Research*, 64, 70-82,
436 doi: 10.1016/j.yqres.2005.02.010, 2005.
- 437 Lozano-García, S., Caballero, M., Ortega, B., Sosa, S., Rodríguez, A., and Schaaf, P.: Late Holocene
438 palaeoecology of Lago Verde: evidence of human impact and climate change in the northern limit of
439 the neotropics during the late formative and classic periods, *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*,
440 19, 177-190, doi: 10.1007/s00334-010-0240-8, 2010.
- 441 Maasch, K., Mayewski, P., Rohling, E., Stager, J., Karlen, W., Meeker, L., and Meyerson, E.: A
442 2000-year context for modern climate change., *Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical Geography*,
443 87, 7-15, 2005.
- 444 Magaña, V. O., Vázquez, J. L., Pérez, J. L., and Pérez, J. B.: Impact of El Niño on precipitation in
445 Mexico., *Geofísica Internacional*, 42, 313-330, 2003.

446 Mann, M. E., Bradley, R. S., and Hughes, M. K.: Northern hemisphere temperatures during the past
447 millennium: inferences, uncertainties, and limitations., *Geophysical Research Letters*, 26, 759-762,
448 1999.

449 Manzanilla, L.: *Metrópolis prehispánicas e impacto ambiental: el caso de Teotihuacan a través del*
450 *tiempo.*, in: *Escenarios de cambio climático: registros del Cuaternario en América Latina I*, edited
451 by: Caballero, M., and Ortega, B., Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México D.F., 287-
452 320, 2011.

453 Metcalfe, S. E., O'Hara, S. L., Caballero, M., and Davies, S. J.: Records of Late Pleistocene-Holocene
454 climatic change in Mexico - a review, *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 19, 699-721, doi:
455 10.1016/s0277-3791(99)00022-0, 2000.

456 Metcalfe, S. E., Jones, M. D., Davies, S. J., Noren, A., and MacKenzie, A.: Climate variability over the
457 last two millennia in the North American Monsoon region, recorded in laminated lake sediments
458 from Laguna de Juanacatlán, Mexico, *The Holocene*, 28, 1195-1206, doi:
459 10.1177/0959683610371994, 2010.

460 Mingram, J., Negendank, J. F., Brauer, A., Berger, D., Hendrich, A., Köhler, M., and Usinger, H.:
461 Long cores from small lakes—recovering up to 100 m-long lake sediment sequences with a high-
462 precision rod-operated piston corer (Usinger-corer), *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 37, 517-528, 2007.

463 Nyberg, J., Malmgren, B. A., Kuijpers, A., and Winter, A.: A centennial-scale variability of tropical
464 North Atlantic surface hydrography during the late Holocene, *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology*
465 *Palaeoecology*, 183, 25-41, doi: 10.1016/s0031-0182(01)00446-1, 2002.

466 PAGES 2k Consortium: Continental-scale temperature variability during the past two millennia.
467 *Nature Geosciences* 6, 339-346, 2013.

468 Peterson, C. G., and Stevenson, R. J.: Resistance and resilience of lotic algal communities: importance
469 of disturbance timing and current, *Ecology*, 73, 1445-1461, 1992.

470 Pollard, H. P.: Michoacán en el mundo mesoamericano prehispánico: Erongarícuaro, Michoacán y los
471 estados teotihuacano y tarasco, *El antiguo occidente de México: nuevas perspectivas sobre el pasado*
472 *prehispánico*, Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia, México, DF, 283-303, 2005.

473 Reimer, P. J., Baillie, M. G. L., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Beck, J. W., Bertrand, C. J., Blackwell, P. G.,
474 Buck, C. E., Burr, G. S., Cutler, K. B., Damon, P. E., Edwards, R. L., Fairbanks, R. G., Friedrich,
475 M., Guiderson, T. P., Hogg, A. G., Hughen, K. A., Kromer, B., McCormac, G., Manning, S.,
476 Ramsey, C. B., Reimer, R. W., Remmele, S., Southon, J. R., Stuiver, M., Talamo, S., Taylor, F. W.,
477 van der Plicht, J., and Weyhenmeyer, C. E.: IntCal10 terrestrial radiocarbon age calibration, 0-26
478 cal kyr BP., *Radiocarbon* 46, 1029-1058, 2004.

479 Serrano, D., Filonov, A., and Tereshchenko, I.: Dynamic response to valley breeze circulation in Santa
480 María del Oro, a volcanic lake in Mexico, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 29, Artn 1649, doi
481 10.1029/2001gl014142, 2002.

482 Sieron, K., and Siebe, C.: Revised stratigraphy and eruption rates of Ceboruco stratovolcano and
483 surrounding monogenetic vents (Nayarit, Mexico) from historical documents and new radiocarbon
484 dates, *Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research*, 176, 241-264, 2008.

485 Sosa-Nájera, S., Lozano-García, S., Roy, P. D., and Caballero, M.: Registro de sequías históricas en el
486 occidente de México con base en el análisis elemental de sedimentos lacustres: El caso del lago de
487 Santa María del Oro. , *Boletín de la Sociedad Geológica Mexicana*, 62, 437-451, 2010.

488 Stuiver, M., Reimer, P.J., and Reimer R.W.: CALIB 5.0 radiocarbon calibration program and
489 documentation (on line), 2005

490 Van Dam, H., Mertens, A., and Sinkeldam, J.: A coded checklist and ecological indicator values of
491 freshwater diatoms from the Netherlands, *Netherland Journal of Aquatic Ecology*, 28, 117-133,
492 1994.

493 Vázquez-Castro, G., Ortega-Guerrero, B., Rodríguez, A., Caballero, M., and Lozano-García, S.:
494 Mineralogía magnética como indicador de sequía en los sedimentos lacustres de los últimos ca.
495 2,600 años de Santa María del Oro, occidente de México., *Revista Mexicana de Ciencias*
496 *Geológicas*, 25, 21-38, 2008.

497 Vázquez, G., and Caballero, M.: The structure and species composition of the diatom communities in
498 tropical volcanic lakes of eastern Mexico., *Diatom Research*, 28, 77-91, doi:
499 10.1080/0269249x.2012.739974, 2013.

500 Wolfe, A. P., and Härtling, J. W.: The late Quaternary development of three ancient tarns on
501 southwestern Cumberland Peninsula, Baffin Island, Arctic Canada: paleolimnological evidence from
502 diatoms and sediment chemistry., *Journal of Paleolimnology* 15, 1-18, 1996.

503

504

505 **Table 1.** Radiocarbon (AMS) dates of core SMO02-V, lake Santa Maria del Oro, Nayarit (Vázquez-
 506 Castro et al. 2008). Calendar years were calculated using the program Calib 5.0 (Stuiver et al., 2005)
 507 with the IntCal04 data set (Reimer et al., 2004).

Laboratory I.D.	Depth (cm)	Material dated	Radiocarbon age (yr BP)	2σ range (cal. yr)
Beta – 186780	125.0	peat	400 \pm 40	AD 1432–1526
Beta – 176359	246.5	peat	660 \pm 40	AD 1341-1397
Beta – 186781	278.0	peat	700 \pm 40	AD 1256–1327
Beta – 176360	366.5	wood	850 \pm 40	AD 1154-1275
Beta – 176361	404.7	peat	990 \pm 40	AD 983-1073
Beta – 176362	791.8	peat	2250 \pm 40	324-202 BC
Beta – 169050	837.0	wood	2340 \pm 40	520-357 BC

518
519

520

521

522 **Figure 1.** Location maps (a) Map of Mexico showing the research site (star) and locations discussed in
523 the text from E to W: 1. Juanacatlán (Metcalf et al., 2010), 2. La Luna (Cuna et al., 2014), 3.
524 Chignahuapan (Caballero et al., 2002), 4. Aljojuca (Bhattacharya et al., 2015), 5. Lago Verde (Lozano-
525 García et al., 2007; Lozano-Garcia et al., 2005), 6. Aguada X'caamal (Hodell et al., 2005b), 7. Lake
526 Chichancanab (Hodell et al., 2001; Hodell et al., 2005a), 8. Punta Laguna (Curtis et al., 1996), 9.
527 Cariaco Basin (Haug et al., 2003; Haug et al., 2001). Dotted line delimits the Transmexican Volcanic
528 Belt (MVB). (b) Map of the research area with the location of lake Santa María del Oro, Nayarit,
529 Mexico. (c) Aerial photograph showing the catchment (continuous black line) of Lake Santa María del
530 Oro and the location of the SMO02-V core site.

531

532

533

534 **Figure 2.** Age model of core SMO02-V, lake Santa Maria del Oro, Nayarit. Details of dates are listed
535 in Table 1. Sedimentation rates are indicated above the line. The stratigraphic position of Toba Jala in
536 the SNO02-V sequences is shown with the black square; gray bars and the gray shaded area represent
537 the range of calibrated ages reported for this volcanic event (Sieron and Siebe, 2008).

538

539

540 **Figure 3.** Biological (diatoms and ostracodes) and non-biological (Ca/Ti, Ti, magnetic susceptibility
541 and TIC) variables from core SMO02-V, Santa María del Oro, Nayarit, Mexico. TIC = total inorganic
542 carbon. Small *Fragilaria* spp. includes: *Staurosira construens*, *Staurosirella pinnata*, *Pseudostaurosira*
543 *parasitica*, *P. brevistriata*, of which only *P. brevistriata* had <20% abundance in the sequence. Gray
544 shaded areas highlight periods with high *Eolimna minima* and ostracode valves abundance, dark gray
545 areas highlight periods when high *Eolimna minima* and ostracode valves abundance correspond with
546 low magnetic susceptibility and high TIC. The black line represents the Toba Jala. Samples with low
547 diatom counts are marked with a cross (+).

548

549

550 **Figure 4.** Correlation between selected palaeoenvironmental records for the last 2000 years in Central
551 Mexico and circum-Caribbean (location of sites shown in Fig. 1): a) Ostracode valve concentrations
552 from lake Santa María del Oro (SMO; this study); b) Titanium record from lake Juanacatlán (Metcalf
553 et al., 2010); c) Magnetic susceptibility and *Chydourus* cf. *sphaericus* abundance from lake La Luna
554 (Cuna et al., 2014); d) Diatom-based lake level fluctuations from lake Chignahuapan (Caballero et al.,
555 2002); e) Bulk sediment calcite $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from lake Aljojuca (Bhattacharya et al., 2015); f) Diatom-based
556 lake level fluctuations from Lago Verde (Lozano-García et al., 2010); g) Biogenic calcite $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from
557 Aguada X'caamal (Hodell et al., 2005b); h) Sediment density from lake Chichancanab (Hodell et al.,
558 2005a); i) Biogenic calcite $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from Punta Laguna (Curtis et al., 1996). J) Titanium record from
559 marine Caricao Basin (Haug et al., 2001). VPDB = Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite standard, PBD =Pee
560 Dee Belemnite standard. Shaded areas correspond to the time intervals of shaded areas in Figure 3.
561