

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Seasonal variations recorded in cave monitoring results and a 10 year monthly resolved speleothem $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record from the Han-sur-Lesse cave, Belgium” by M. Van Rampelbergh et al.

J. Guiot (Editor)

guiot@cerege.fr

Received and published: 20 June 2014

Dear authors,

As you can see in both reviews, your paper can be accepted after major revision. First reviewer finds that the paper is well written and structured and that the discussion is clear and for most parts solid. He raises nevertheless some important points : the impact of visitors of the show cave is insufficiently taken into account (point also raised by rev#2) and the characteristics of the Lesse river underrepresented. He mentions

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive
Comment

also that the discussion about the pH is not correct. I think that these points are well argued and you have to answer to them very carefully.

Reviewer #2 thinks also that you present a very interesting story and a nice data set, which is a good contribution to the scientific progress, and that the paper is well written and structured. But he raises also a long list of points that you should taken into account. One point related to the proxy resolution, and another one related to CO2 degassing have to be clarified through the ms. He mentions also a problem of structure of the abstract and of the introduction. I also agree with him when he request a strict separation of results and discussion section (some results are already discussed in the results section). He recommends more care in some interpretation and also a better comparison with previous studies. It is important also to reduce the conclusion so it is more punchy.

Both reviewers propose numerous technical and specific corrections, which will likely to improve the paper. I encourage you to provide and extended answer letter to both reviewers, to re-submit an improve version with a clear indication of the changes (using the track change option for example).

With my best regards

Joel Guiot

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 1821, 2014.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)