

***Interactive comment on “Sensitivity of the  
grassland-forest ecotone in East African open  
woodland savannah to historical rainfall variation”  
by I. Ssemmanda et al.***

**J. Guiot (Editor)**

guiot@cerege.fr

Received and published: 9 June 2014

Dear authors

We have received three interesting reviews of your ms. Two of them consider that the paper should be published after minor revision and the last one after major revision. The quality of the paper is judged between fair and good. Rev#1 and #2 are concerned by the fact that you missed the opportunity of go further by doing a real calibration and providing quantitative reconstruction. It is not your choice and I can accept it if it is argued. Another point raised by all the reviewers is the difficulty to compare Fig 2 and 3: (1) because there is no quantification (2) because Fig2 does not present

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



any precipitation data, (3) because the figures have not the same scale. I am also particularly concerned by the fact that rev#2 finds the paper too descriptive and that it missed the opportunity to answer interesting question (leads and lags in vegetation response, indicator taxa, pollen production, change in biodiversity). Rev #2 and #3 would like also find in the paper some presentation of the chronology and the full age model. There is also several points of terminology and lack of knowledge of literature of the 70s and 80s raised by rev#3.

Now you have to reply to all the criticisms done by the three reviewers, and to take into account their constructive remarks, in particular those I have summarized in the previous paragraph. Then you are expected to resubmit an improved version of the manuscript. I think that the needed revision is moderate. Thank you to do it carefully.

With my best regards

Joel Guiot

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 1675, 2014.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)