

Interactive comment on “Multiscale monsoon variability during the last two climatic cycles inferred from Chinese loess and speleothem records” by Y. Li et al.

M.F. Loutre (Editor)

marie-france.loutre@uclouvain.be

Received and published: 2 March 2015

The reviewers carefully commented this paper. They all found some value to the work although they all put strong reservation and recommended in depth revision of the paper. Both aspects of the paper, the interpretation of the speleothems and the spectral analysis of the data, need more work. The three reviewers clearly listed the different points that must be improved before any consideration for publication. I do not intend to copy their list here. However, I am very concerned with some of the items. According to the reviewers, a more thorough bibliographic work is required. Some references to important previous works are missing, a more detailed state of the art is requested and

C2403

a comparison with other similar records should be provided. The interpretation of the spectral analysis is questionable and, at least, additional analyses must be provided to support the conclusions. In view of the in depth work necessary to answer the reviewers comments, I would strongly suggest the author to take the time of fully rewriting their paper and then submit it later as a new paper. However, the possibility remains open to address and reply to all comments and to submit a revised manuscript. In this latter case, it is clear that the paper will go again through a full and in depth round of review.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 4623, 2014.

C2404