Clim. Past Discuss., 10, C1712–C1713, 2014
www.clim-past-discuss.net/10/C1712/2014/

Climate of the Past Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Long-term regional precipitation disparity in northwestern China and its driving forces" *by* H. F. Lee et al.

V. Brovkin (Editor)

victor.brovkin@zmaw.de

Received and published: 19 October 2014

Dear Dr. Lee,

The comments of the second reviewer are much more specific than the points of the first reviewer, and you did try to answer them in constructive way, but there is still a very long way to go to satisfy both reviewers. One of their concerns that I also share is a robustness of your approach against uncertainty in the data. Perhaps, you can think of a robust statistical method which would be appropriate for analysis and comparison of historical time series accounting for their specifics.

I guess that it would be easier for you to account for provided constructive comments in a revised paper and to resubmit either to another journal (or again to CP), where

a new set of reviewers will take a fresh view on your research. However, it is up to you. If you think that you can address reviewer concerns in depth, you can try to revise the manuscript and to go through the second review round. I would need from you a point-by-point response letter addressing each of reviewer concerns. You would need to write how exactly your manuscript has been changed in response to the reviewer critics. I will ask the same reviewers to provide comments on the revised paper to see if they change their recommendation on accepting the manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Victor Brovkin

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 3097, 2014.