

Interactive comment on “Long-term regional precipitation disparity in northwestern China and its driving forces” by H. F. Lee et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 29 August 2014

Comments to authors 1. The paper reported the long-term regional precipitation disparity in NW China and its driving force using the F/D data. While the authors did not present the detail information about the historical data, i.e. sample size, time and regional resolution, what are the criteria of flood and drought et al. The reader could not understand what kind of historical documents you used in your manuscript. 2. The abstract is very confused, you should tell the reader what your main points are, but some sentences should present in the introduction rather than abstract. In addition, the region discussed in the manuscript is different with that in the first section of your introduction, in fact, area of Gansu and Shaanxi is not that large as your description. What is the western plain? It is not a correct geographic name (P3). Although the author separated the results and discussions, actually, the two parts were not separated in contents. Therefore, the three parts need to reorganize and re-written. 3. P5 the

C1393

equation (2), why you use this equation, and what is the meaning? P10, what reference you used to define the MWP and LIA? They are different with the general knowledge, like defined by lamb, Mann. 4. Many well-known and new published papers were missed in the references part. Many palaces need to add references, such as the first two sentences in the introduction part (line 23-27 in p2). 5. The qualities of figures are very coarse, especially the last four figures, they need to re-draw.

Therefore, this manuscript has many places need to polish and improve. For the high quality of climate of past journal, I don't recommend to publish this manuscript.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 3097, 2014.