

1 We thank the editor for his comments and guidance.

2

3 The final version of our manuscript has been emended as follows (see below for marked up
4 changes):

5

6 1. We have added a new section on Core discing including the two figures from Kidd (1978)
7 and Leggett (1982) that we included in our response to reviewers. We think it is very useful to
8 bring their discussion of kind of drilling disturbance before a wider audience once again.

9 2. As suggested by the editor we have included a statement in the conclusion that "We cannot
10 rule out the possibility that some of the fracturing may have occurred along pre-existing
11 bedding planes, although we found no evidence of that having occurred despite careful
12 observation of the cores".

13 3. We have re-arranged the figures so that the outcrop photograph comes last, as it does in the
14 text.

15 4. We have made numerous small changes to improve readability.

16

17 We hope the paper will now be acceptable for final publication.

18

19 Paul N. Pearson and Ellen Thomas

20

1 **Drilling disturbance and constraints on the onset of the**
2 **Paleocene-~~E~~Eocene boundary carbon isotope excursion in**
3 **New Jersey**

4
5 **P. N. Pearson¹ and E. Thomas^{2,3}**

6
7 [1]{School of Earth and Ocean Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff CF10 3AT, United
8 Kingdom}

9 [2]{Department of Geology and Geophysics, Yale University, New Haven, CT 06520-8109,
10 USA}

11 [3]{Department of Earth & Environmental Sciences, Wesleyan University, Middletown, CT
12 06459, USA}

13 Correspondence to: P.N. Pearson (pearsonp@cardiff.ac.uk)

14

1 Abstract

2 The onset of the Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum (PETM) and associated carbon
3 isotope excursion (CIE; about 56 million years ago) was geologically abrupt, but it is debated
4 whether it took thousands of years or was effectively instantaneous. ~~A significant new record~~
5 ~~of the onset of the CIE was published by~~ Wright and Schaller (2013) ~~published a significant~~
6 ~~new record of the onset of the CIE, and who~~ claimed that it could be resolved across 13
7 annual layers in a drill core through the Marlboro Clay at Millville, New Jersey (Ocean
8 Drilling Program Leg 174X). Supporting evidence ~~for~~ similar layering was ~~also~~ reported
9 from another New Jersey drill site, Wilson Lake B, and a photograph of the Marlboro Clay in
10 outcrop (Wright and Schaller, 2014). Such a short duration would imply an instantaneous
11 perturbation of the atmosphere and surface ocean, and the impact of a comet or asteroid as the
12 likely cause. However, ~~it was suggested by~~ Pearson and Nicholas (2014) ~~suggested, based on~~
13 ~~from~~ the published ~~core~~ photographs, that the layers in the Marlboro Clay ~~cores~~ could be
14 artifacts of drilling disturbance, (so-called 'biscuiting', wherein the formation is fractured into
15 layers or 'biscuits' and drilling mud is injected in between ~~the layers.~~ (We now prefer the
16 ~~term 'core discing' following Kidd, 1978.~~ Here we report new observations on the cores
17 which support that interpretation, including concentric grooves on the surfaces of the ~~biscuits~~
18 ~~core discs~~ caused by spinning in the bit, micro-fracturing at their edges, and injected drilling
19 mud. We re-interpret the ~~limited~~ outcrop evidence as showing joints rather than sedimentary
20 layers. We argue that foraminifer concentrations in the sediments are far too high for the
21 layers to be annually deposited in turbid waters at depths of 40-70 m, indicating that the onset
22 of the CIE in the Marlboro Clay likely took on the order of millennia, not years (Zeebe et al.,
23 2014). Re-coring of Millville ~~aimed at~~ minimizing drilling disturbance ~~to and~~ allow a
24 higher resolution study of the carbon isotope excursion is highly desirable.

25

26 1 Introduction

27 The Paleocene/Eocene boundary (PEB) is one of the most intensively studied intervals of
28 abrupt climate change in Earth's past (Kennett and Stott, 1991; Thomas and Shackleton 1996;
29 Zachos et al., 2005). Its main features are a pronounced global warming spike of over 5°C
30 (Paleocene / Eocene thermal maximum, PETM), which happened in an already warm world,
31 associated with carbonate dissolution and a negative CIE of at least several parts per thousand
32 that persisted and then decayed over approximately 200 ka (reviews by Sluijs et al., 2007b;

1 | Dunkley Jones et al., 2010; ~~and~~ McInerney and Wing, 2011; [Aze et al., 2014](#)). All attempts at
2 | explaining the event involve the addition of large amounts of isotopically light carbon to the
3 | exogenic carbon pool. Non-exclusive possibilities include volcanic emissions (Eldholm and
4 | Thomas, 1993; Bralower et al., 1997; Storey et al., 2007), the mobilization and oxidation of
5 | seafloor methane from clathrates (Dickens et al., 1995; Katz et al., 1999), emission of
6 | thermogenic methane from deeply buried hydrocarbons after igneous intrusion (Kurtz et al.,
7 | 2003; Svenson et al., 2004), ~~release of dissolved carbon compounds from stratified North~~
8 | ~~Atlantic basins (Nisbet et al., 2009)~~, oxidation of organic-rich sediments in epicontinental
9 | seas (Higgins and Schrag, 2006), ~~release of dissolved carbon compounds from stratified North~~
10 | ~~Atlantic basins (Nisbet et al., 2009)~~, runaway release of methane from rapidly melting
11 | permafrost (Deconto et al., 2012), combustion of part of the biosphere (Huber, 2008), and
12 | extraterrestrial carbon dumped by a comet, the impact of which could have triggered further
13 | methane release (Kent et al., 2003; Cramer and Kent, 2005; Wang et al., 2013). Most
14 | stratigraphic records indicate a geologically rapid onset, but that definition could mean any
15 | duration between about 20 thousand years (Cui et al., 2011) to a few thousand years (e.g.,
16 | Kennett and Stott, 1991; Thomas et al., 2002; Zachos et al., 2005, 2007; Aziz et al., 2008^a) or
17 | just a few years, i.e., effectively instantaneous (Kent et al., 2003; Cramer and Kent, 2005).
18 | Resolution of this question will provide constraints on the likely source of the carbon and
19 | advance our understanding of disturbances of the Earth's carbon cycle and their effect on
20 | [ocean chemistry and](#) life.

21 | Although hitherto a minority view, an instantaneous onset of the PETM and associated CIE
22 | would have profound implications [for our understanding of the event](#). For example, it would
23 | have caused sudden and substantial acidification of the upper layers of the ocean in contact
24 | with the atmosphere, whereas a slower rate of carbon release would have caused a less sharp
25 | acidification response because shallow and surface waters ~~which~~ are continually mixed into
26 | the much larger deep ocean reservoir [over time scales of the circulation of the deep ocean, i.e.](#)
27 | [millennia](#) (Ridgwell and Schmidt, 2010; Hönisch et al., 2012). There was no mass extinction
28 | of calcareous plankton ([Gibbs et al., 2006; Zachos et al., 2006, 2007; Bown and Pearson,](#)
29 | [2009; Self-Trail et al., 2012](#)) and shallow-water smaller benthic foraminifera ([Gibson et al.,](#)
30 | [1993; Stassen et al., 2012](#)) at the ~~PEB~~[Paleocene/Eocene boundary](#), hence a quasi-
31 | instantaneous onset to the event would imply that these organisms adapted to rapid
32 | acidification. More generally, the lack of a global mass extinction on land and in the oceans
33 | (except among deep-sea benthic foraminifera) would indicate unexpected, and perhaps

1 reassuring, resilience of life to profound and abrupt global warming (e.g., [Thomas, 2004](#);
2 [Thomas et al., 2004](#); McInerney and Wing, 2011).

4 2 Previous discussion

5 Significant new evidence relating to the pattern and timing of the CIE onset was presented by
6 Wright and Schaller (2013) from a drill site at Millville, New Jersey (Ocean Drilling Program
7 [ODP] Leg 174X; Sugarman et al., 2005). Their data show one of the clearest and best
8 resolved onsets yet published (reproduced here as Fig. 1) with a run of 'intermediate' bulk
9 sediment $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values showing a somewhat stepped appearance, including intervals of little
10 change or possibly even reversals in the trend. Critically, Wright and Schaller (2013)
11 described the Marlboro Clay formation at Millville and the nearby Wilson Lake B core (as yet
12 unpublished, but a re-drill of a Wilson Lake core studied at high resolution by Gibson et al.,
13 1993; Zachos et al., 2006; Gibbs et al., 2006; ~~and~~ [Sluijs et al., 2007a](#), and [Stassen et al.,](#)
14 [2012b](#)) as "characterized by rhythmic couplets of silty kaolinitic clay distinguished by 1- to 2-
15 mm layers of swelling smectite clays and micaceous silt, recurring every 1-3 cm through the
16 entirety of the unit". They ~~also~~ referred to similar layers in the same formation in the nearby
17 Ancora Core (ODP Leg 174X; Harris et al., 2010), the South Dover Bridge Core (Maryland,
18 Self-Trail et al., 2012), and an exposure at Medford, the latter without citation. At Millville
19 they counted ~750 such couplets over approximately 12.5 m of Marlboro Clay, ~~with~~ just
20 13 couplets spanning the CIE onset, potentially providing a precise timing.

21 The interpretation that the couplets are annual rests first on demonstrating that they are
22 ~~climatic-seasonal~~ in origin. Wright and Schaller (2013) argued for this partly on the
23 sedimentology (especially the rhythmicity of the layering), and partly on the basis of a high
24 resolution bulk oxygen isotope record through two sections (approximately 25 cm and 10 cm
25 respectively) of the Wilson Lake B core. These sections were claimed to show cyclic
26 variability in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values, with maxima corresponding to the thin smectitic layers. The
27 variability was interpreted as corresponding to temperature and / or salinity fluctuations, ~~and~~
28 ~~hence likely seasonal~~ ~~climatic~~. Wright and Schaller (2013) rejected the possibility of an
29 orbital control or other long period cycles because the Marlboro clay lies entirely within
30 magnetochron C24r (which has a duration of 2.6 Myr; Cande and Kent, 1995). Therefore they
31 proposed that the couplets must be annual and the variability seasonal, arguing that the
32 implied very rapid sedimentation rate (1-3 cm/yr) is within the bounds of measured rates in

1 fast-depositing mud-belt areas of modern shelf regions, e.g., close to the Amazon River
2 outflow. If the CIE onset occurred in just 13 years in the sediment, ~~it would seem to show that~~
3 the atmospheric perturbation must have been effectively instantaneous which ~~in turn~~ rules out
4 all of ~~the~~ proposed sources of carbon as significant contributors to the CIE onset except comet
5 impact or possibly emissions from massive volcanism (Wright and Schaller, 2013).

6 These claims elicited responses from Pearson and Nicholas (2014) who argued that the
7 supposed annual layers were artifacts of drilling disturbance; from Stassen et al. (2014), who
8 ~~argued that disagreed with~~ the estimated paleodepths ~~were too shallow~~, and included the
9 argument that planktonic foraminiferal assemblages could not have been deposited in as little
10 as 13 years; and from Zeebe et al. (2014) who argued against an instantaneous event based on
11 geochemical modeling.

12

13 3 Core discing

14 There are many ways in which a rock or sediment can be disturbed during the drilling
15 process, depending on the type of coring (e.g., rotary versus piston coring) and the mechanical
16 properties of the formation. Drilling disturbance encompasses various types of plastic and
17 brittle deformation, and the effects can vary from subtle to severe. Core-discing (or
18 biscuiting) is a form of drilling disturbance that occurs when the torque induced by rotary
19 drilling is transferred to the sedimentary formation as it enters the core barrel, inducing
20 repetitive mechanical failure (e.g., Kidd, 1978; Leggett, 1982; Graber et al., 2002; Hubbard,
21 2007.

22). It was frequently encountered when rotary coring of sediments was the norm during the
23 days of the Deep Sea Drilling Project (DSDP). The first detailed description was made by
24 Kidd (1978) on DSDP Leg 42A, who described found that cores:

25 "are found to be broken horizontally into pieces. At the breaks, the upcore
26 surfaces of the pieces are convex while the undersurface of those above are
27 concave. This is the result of the individual pieces rotating upon one another
28 inside the core barrel as the core is being cut. Often, the break is along a change in
29 lithology such as a sandy horizon or a silt or shell lamina, although just as
30 frequently no lithological change is apparent. ... This is referred to as core-discing,
31 a process familiar to rig geologists in the drilling industry, and is found when

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, Not Italic, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, Not Italic, English (U.K.)

1 weight on the bit required to core stiff lithologies (especially waxy clays) causes a
2 hammer or bounce effect." (Kidd 1978, p. 1133-1134).

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

3 It is not clear to us whether a hammer effect is necessary to induce core discing, but we
4 reproduce the suggestion as a consideration. An example of a core disturbed in this way is
5 reproduced from Kidd (1978) in Fig. 2A, including an illustration of the ~~tell tale~~ concentric
6 grooves ~~that are found~~ on the upper and lower surfaces of the core discs, ~~which are~~ caused by
7 spinning and abrasion in the core barrel. Kidd (1978) also described micro-faulting as
8 ~~another~~ a common kind of drilling disturbance.

9 Similar observations were provided by Leggett (1982), who described and categorized a series
10 of disturbance features seen on DSDP Leg 66 in ascending order of severity, namely "bowed
11 laminations" (where original sedimentary laminations are deflected downward), "drilling
12 laminations" which are not sedimentary but caused by maceration of the rock and "are
13 generally spaced with extreme regularity (2-4 cm)" (Leggett 1982, p. 531), "drilling biscuits"
14 which are discrete blocks of sediment of ~~unequivocal mechanical origin~~ with injected mud in
15 between ~~of unequivocal mechanical origin~~ and which show circular striae on their tops and
16 bottoms, "core discs" which are similar but more severely disturbed with eroded edges, and
17 "drilling breccia" where chunks of broken up and disoriented core sit in a soupy matrix. An
18 example of a disced core from Leggett (1982) is reproduced in Fig. 2B, and Leggett's
19 classification of disturbance effects is reproduced in Fig. 3. We prefer the term "'core discing:"
20 to encompass both the "'biscuits"' and "'core discs"' of Leggett's classification to reflect Kidd's
21 (1978) prior usage, and because biscuits are known as cookies in some parts of the English-
22 speaking world. Note that the phenomenon has also been called 'core dicing' by Aziz et al.
23 (2008b).

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

24 As noted by Kidd (1978) and Leggett (1982), ~~d~~Drilling slurry can be injected between the
25 ~~biscuits~~core discs, resulting in thin partings and hence layering. ~~Biscuiting is especially~~
26 ~~a~~ problem when swelling clays are drilled because these expand in contact with water and can
27 ~~cause high pressure around the bit. Pearson and Nicholas (2014) pointed out that overpressure~~
28 ~~in the hole at Millville had been reported at the time by the drilling engineer, that the~~
29 ~~recovered sediment was more than the interval drilled, and that injection of slurry into the~~
30 ~~formation had been noted (see "Operations" in Sugarman et al., 2005). Moreover, sediment~~
31 ~~loggers repeatedly suggested that the layering in the cores might be artificial (see core~~
32 ~~description sheets 91, 103, 108, 121, and 139 in Sugarman et al., 2005).~~

1 Fig. 2-4 (reproduced from Pearson and Nicholas, 2014) shows ~~an~~ their explanation of the
2 biscuiting core discing (which they called biscuiting), as observed in a ~~compared with another~~
3 ~~disced core obtained by Pearson et al. (2004) from Eocene clays of Tanzania~~ (Tanzania
4 Drilling Project Site 2; Pearson et al., 2004). The same interval was later re-drilled and proved
5 to be massive mudstone with no layers (Tanzania Drilling Project Site 20; Nicholas et al.,
6 2006). ~~They~~ Pearson and Nicholas (2014) argued that the observed discs in these Tanzanian
7 core are very similar to the layering in ~~and the appearance of~~ Millville and Wilson Lake B
8 cores, which, hence they suggested those cores too, are also discd as compared with another
9 biscuitd core obtained by Pearson et al. (2004) from Eocene clays of Tanzania.

10 Core discing is especially a problem when swelling clays are drilled, because these expand in
11 contact with water and can cause high pressure around the bit. Pearson and Nicholas (2014)
12 pointed out that overpressure in the hole at Millville had been reported at the time by the
13 drilling engineer, that the recovered sediment was more than the interval drilled, and that
14 injection of slurry into the formation had been noted (see "Operations" in Sugarman et al.,
15 2005). Moreover, sediment loggers repeatedly suggested that the layering in the cores might
16 be artificial (see core description sheets 91, 103, 108, 121, and 139 in Sugarman et al., 2005).
17 Pearson and Nicholas (2014) suggested that close observation of the core Millville and Wilson
18 Lake B might resolve the issue confirm that the layers are core discs, specifically that a "tell-
19 tale feature of this kind of disturbance is that spinning of the biscuits can leave concentric
20 grooves on the contacts with the partings" (Pearson and Nicholas, 2014; ~~see also Hubbard,~~
21 ~~2007, for a description and photograph of this phenomenon and other signs of biscuiting~~).

22 In response to Pearson and Nicholas (2014) and the other comments (Stassen et al., 2014;
23 Zeebe et al., 2014), Wright and Schaller (2014) acknowledged that mud injection may have
24 occurred at Millville but rejected it as a general explanation for the layers in the Marlboro
25 clay on two main grounds: that no overpressure had been reported when Wilson Lake B was
26 drilled, and that layering had also been observed at the Medfordan outcrop exposure at
27 Medford, new Jersey (which we discuss further below), for which they provided a field
28 photograph in support (reproduced here as our Fig. 35). They suggested in addition that
29 injection and biscuiting discing during coring "generally follow preexisting zones of
30 weakness, here provided by rhythmic sandy-silt beds observed in outcrop".

32 **34 New observations on the drill cores**

1 In order to resolve this debate, one of us (PNP) made new observations on the cores at a visit
2 to the Rutgers core repository on 19-21 March 2014. At that time he ~~was able to discuss~~ed the
3 issues constructively with J.D. Wright and M.F. Schaller.

4 The Millville core (Fig. 465) has ~~oxidized~~, desiccated and broken up (Fig. 4B65B), but the
5 layering is still very clear, as are areas of superficial drilling mud. The latter is slightly darker
6 in color even after desiccation, and has a swirly texture under a hand lens. Various features
7 confirm that the prominent layering is drilling disturbance. Notable among these are ~~i) the~~
8 ~~characteristic length scale and regularity of the discing~~, ii) widening of the partings toward the
9 outer edge ~~consistent with abrasion of the core discs~~ (Fig. 4D65D), iii) physical continuity
10 between the partings and external drilling mud of identical color and texture (Fig. 4D65D),
11 and ~~iv) concentric grooves on the surface of biseuits-core discs~~ (Fig. 4F65F).

12 Unlike Millville, the Wilson Lake B cores have been split into sampling and archive halves.
13 New observations were made on the latter, including an interval of polished core surface
14 originally made by Wright and Schaller (2013). Similar features to those in the Millville cores
15 are evident, especially the concentric grooves on the surface of the ~~biseuits-core discs~~ where
16 they are in contact with the soft, injected drilling mud (Fig. 576, which compares closely with
17 ~~the example illustrated by Kidd, 1978, and reproduced in Fig. 1A~~). Also clearly visible on the
18 polished surface is evidence for micro-fracturing of the formation at the edges of several of
19 the ~~biseuits-core discs~~ (Fig. 687). The thin layers divide around these fractures, giving proof
20 of intrusion. Hence, we conclude that Wilson Lake B was subject to the same type of drilling
21 disturbance as Millville, even if overpressure in the hole was not recorded at the time ~~of~~
22 ~~drilling~~.

23 Both Millville and Wilson Lake B cores were scrutinized carefully for signs of bedding.
24 Unfortunately, cores from both holes are now quite oxidized and their surfaces are covered
25 with small gypsum crystals (presumably following oxidation of pyrite in contact with air), so
26 that no clear evidence of bedding could be observed in cores from either hole.

27 The thicknesses of the ~~drilling-biseuitscore discs~~ at Millville and Wilson Lake B are
28 remarkably regular (for Millville, $1.9 \text{ cm} \pm 0.8 \text{ cm}$ at 1σ as measured by Wright and Schaller,
29 2013), and similar to the Tanzanian core (~~Figure-see Fig. 14A~~). We suggest that the regularity
30 ~~(as also observed by Kidd, 1978 and Leggett, 1982)~~ has a mechanical origin related to the
31 strength of the formation and the torque induced by the rotating bit, which in turn is related to
32 the core diameter which determines the distance vector component of the torque. Failure of

1 the core likely occurs at some threshold level of torque, and regular ~~disc~~biseuiting will result
2 provided that the drilling rate is constant and the formation homogeneous. ~~Good examples of~~
3 ~~regular drilling biscuits can be found in various cores, including those from ODP Sites 925~~
4 ~~and 926 (Curry, Shackleton, Richter et al., 1999) and IODP Site U1334 (Pälike, Nishi, Lyle,~~
5 ~~Raffi, Gamage, Klaus et al., 2010), although the New Jersey cores provide the most regular~~
6 ~~examples of the phenomenon of which we are aware.~~

7 The existence of ~~drilling core discs biscuits~~ at Wilson Lake B provides a possible explanation
8 for apparent cyclicity in the bulk sediment oxygen isotope ratios indicated by Wright and
9 Schaller (2013): If some of the samples were contaminated by drilling slurry with a distinct
10 isotopic signature, non-climatic variability in the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ might conceivably have been
11 measured. However we also note that the time series are relatively short and statistically
12 significant cyclicity has not ~~yet~~ been demonstrated.

14 **45 Re-interpretation of the field photograph from Medford**

15 ~~The Wright and Schaller's (2014)~~ field photograph from Medford (~~which we reproduce here~~
16 ~~assee Fig. 358) shows~~ part of a small exposure at stream level that had been cleaned using
17 vertical strikes of a cutting tool. The photograph was never intended as definitive evidence by
18 itself (Wright and Schaller, personal communication 2014), and further observations on the
19 locality will hopefully shed more light on the sedimentology. The supposedly rhythmic
20 layering in the photograph is picked out by quasi-horizontal features running across the
21 surface of the exposure characterized in places by orange staining, small ledges, and subtle
22 variations in the lightness of the clay. The vertical blows of the cutting tool have to some
23 extent smeared features in the sediment downward, as picked out especially by vertical
24 streaks in the orange staining.

25 We dispute that the photograph shows evidence of rhythmic ~~sedimentary~~ layering comparable
26 to that observed in the cores. Instead, we interpret the quasi-horizontal layers as joint surfaces
27 along which oxidizing fluids have passed, causing the orange iron oxide staining and
28 potentially introducing or concentrating silt particles along the joints. Oxidation may also
29 have affected the immediately adjacent clay, lightening the color, although smearing on the
30 vertical surface complicates the interpretation. Evidence that the layers are joints and not
31 sedimentary partings is that they curve downward in places, intersecting one another. This

1 interpretation is consistent with previous descriptions of the Marlboro Clay as being massive
2 in both outcrop and cores, with evidence of some irregular sedimentary layers (sand laminae
3 and 'pods') or thin, sometimes discontinuous clay laminae in some intervals, but no reported
4 rhythmicity (e.g., Clark and Miller, 1906; Reinhardt et al., 1980; Gibson and Bybell 1991;
5 Kopp et al., 2009; Self-Trail et al., 2012).

6

7 **56 Foraminifer accumulation rates**

8 Pearson and Nicholas (2014) stressed that, notwithstanding the drilling disturbance, the
9 Millville cores might provide some broad constraints on the duration of the CIE onset from
10 foraminifer accumulation rates. Stassen et al (2014) pointed out that sediment "accumulation
11 rates of ~2 cm/y are highly improbable because of the microfossil content", especially the
12 presence of symbiont-bearing planktonic foraminifera which only thrive in relatively open
13 ocean environments with sufficient light intensity. To this can be added the observation that
14 photosynthesizing calcareous nannofossils are also common at all New Jersey PETM drill
15 sites (e.g., Gibson et al., 1993; Gibbs et al., 2006; [Self-Trail et al., 2012](#)). A possible modern
16 analogue of the sort of environmental setting proposed by Wright and Schaller (2014) for the
17 Marlboro Clay is the muddy and fast-sedimenting Long Island Sound estuary ([Lopezatimer](#)
18 [et al., 2014](#)), with water depths of ~ 40 m. But here light penetration is less than 5 m and both
19 photosymbiotic planktonic foraminifera and calcareous nannoplankton are absent ([Lopez](#)
20 [Latimer et al., 2014](#)). In general, planktonic foraminifera are absent in mud belt sediments
21 deposited on the shelf (Cattaneo et al., 2004) including on the Amazon River shelf at depths
22 <100 m, where benthic but no planktonic foraminifera have been recorded (Vilela, 2003).

23 Wright and Schaller (2014) reported concentrations of total (benthic plus planktonic)
24 foraminifera in the > 100 µm size range for the Wilson Lake B core ranging from ~150-350
25 individuals per gram of sediment. The percentage of planktonic foraminifera in PETM
26 sediments in various New Jersey core sites is generally 65-80% (Gibson et al., 1993; Stassen
27 et al., 2012). If the layers are annual this figure would imply extremely high rates of
28 accumulation of both benthic and planktonic foraminifera. Wright and Schaller (2014) stated
29 that this reflects a production of about 1×10^6 specimens per m^2 per year but did not
30 document how they arrive at this estimate. We offer the following approximate calculation: If
31 we take a roughly average figure of 200 specimens per gram ([Stassen et al., 2012](#); [Wright and](#)
32 [Schaller, 2014](#)) and a dry bulk density of 1.4 (typical for mudrocks at the quoted burial depth;

1 Bryant et al., 1981), this equates to 280 specimens per cm³. The supposedly annual layers are
2 2.5 cm thick, hence this indicates 700 specimens per cm² per year, or 7 x 10⁶ specimens per m²
3 per year. This is much higher than Wright and Schaller's (2014) estimate, but even that
4 exceeds known accumulation rates for both planktonic and benthic foraminifera (Zaric et al.,
5 2006). Hence we suggest that the micropaleontology (both the abundance of specimens and
6 the ~~abundance presence~~ of photosymbiotic foraminifera and calcareous nannoplankton) shows
7 the onset of the CIE at Millville likely represents thousands of years, not years, which would
8 effectively rule out an instantaneous cause such as comet impact.

9

10 **7 Conclusion**

11 New observations confirm that the prominent rhythmic couplets in the Millville and Wilson
12 Lake B cores are caused by drilling disturbance and are not original sedimentary features. We
13 cannot rule out the possibility that some of the fracturing may have occurred along pre-
14 existing bedding planes, although we found no evidence of that having occurred, despite
15 careful observation of the cores. Hence ~~(T~~There is no ~~solid~~ evidence that the Marlboro Clay is
16 rhythmically layered, ~~hence and~~ no support for the short chronology of the onset to the PETM
17 suggested by Wright and Schaller (2013). Nevertheless, the record presented by Wright and
18 Schaller (2013) from Millville is clearly important, potentially the best-resolved marine
19 record of the CIE onset yet published, with ~~potential~~ fine detail including possible pulses and
20 even a hint of cyclicity. In our interpretation, foraminifer accumulation rates point to a long-
21 duration onset lasting > 1 kyr, but because the Millville core is much disturbed by injected
22 drilling slurry and the critical interval has been heavily sampled, re-drilling and renewed
23 investigation of the locality should be a high priority.

24

25 **Acknowledgements**

26 We thank K. Miller for access to the as-yet unpublished Wilson Lake B core. We are very
27 grateful to J.D. Wright and M.F. Schaller for the open and constructive manner in which they
28 have cooperated with our research. We expected nothing less but it was very gratifying
29 nonetheless, and to J. Browning for providing assistance to our investigation at the Rutgers
30 core laboratory. Thanks also to Wright, Schaller, and C. Lombardi for organizing and
31 participating in a constructive day in the field. This research, including rapid response travel

1 funds, was supported by the UK Ocean Acidification Research Program and NERC grant
2 NE/H017518/1 to PNP.

3

4 **References**

5 [Aze, T., Pearson, P. N., Dickson, A. J., Badger, M. P. S., Bown, P. R., Pancost, R. D., Gibbs,](#)
6 [S. J., Huber, B. T., Leng, M. J., Coe, A. L., Cohen, A. S., and Foster, G. L.: Extreme warming](#)
7 [of tropical waters during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, *Geology*, 42, 739–742,](#)
8 [2014.](#)

9 Aziz, H. A., Hilgen, F. J., van Luijk, G. M., Sluijs, A., Kraus, M. J., ~~et al~~ Pares, J. M., and
10 Gingerich, P. D.: Astronomical climate control on paleosol stacking patterns in the upper
11 Paleocene-lower Eocene Willwood Formation, Bighorn Basin, Wyoming, *Geology*, 36, 531–
12 534, 2008a.

13 [Aziz, H. A., Di Stefano, A., Foresi, L. M., Hilgen, F. J., Iaccarino, S. M., Kuiper, K. F., Lirer,](#)
14 [F., Salvatorini, G., and Turco, E.: Integrated stratigraphy and \$^{40}\text{Ar}/^{39}\text{Ar}\$ chronology of early](#)
15 [Middle Miocene sediments from DSDP Leg 42A, Site 372 \(Western Mediterranean\).](#)
16 [*Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 257, 123–138, 2008b.](#)

17 [Bown, P. R., and Pearson, P. N.: Calcareous plankton evolution and the Paleocene/Eocene](#)
18 [thermal maximum event; new evidence from Tanzania, *Mar. Micropal.*, 71, 60–70, 2009.](#)

19 Bralower, T. J., Thomas, D. J., Zachos, J. C., Hirschmann, M. M., Röhl, U., Sigurdsson, H.,
20 Thomas, E. and Whitney, D. L.: High-resolution records of the late Paleocene thermal
21 maximum and circum-Caribbean volcanism: is there a causal link? *Geology*, 25, 963–966,
22 1997.

23 Bryant, W. R., Bennett, R., and Katherman, C.: Shear strength, consolidation, porosity, and
24 permeability of oceanic sediments, p. 1555-1616 in Emiliani, C. (ed.) *The Sea*, vol. 7, John
25 Wiley, New York, 1981.

26 Cande, S. C., and Kent, D. V.: Revised calibration of the geomagnetic polarity timescale for
27 the Late Cretaceous and Cenozoic, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 100, 6093-6095, 1995.

28 Cattaneo, A., Trincardi, F., Langone, L., Asioli, A., and Ouig, P.: Clinoform generation on
29 Mediterranean margins, *Oceanography*, 17, 105–117, 2004.

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Adjust space between Asian text and numbers

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font:

1 Clark, W. B., and Miller, B. L.: Clay deposits of the Virginia coastal plain. Virginia Geol.
2 Surv. Bull., 2, 11–24, 1906.

3 Cramer, B. S. and Kent, D. V.: Bolide summer: The Paleocene/Eocene thermal maximum as a
4 response to an extraterrestrial trigger, Palaeogeog., Palaeoclimatol., Palaeoecol., 224, 144–
5 166, 2005.

6 ~~Cui, Y., Kump, L. R., Ridgwell, A. J., Charles, A. J., Junium, C. K., Diefendorf, A. F.,
7 Freeman, K. H., Urban, N. M., and Harding, I. C.: Slow release of fossil carbon during the
8 Palaeocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum, Nat. Geosci., 4, 481–485, 2011. Cui, Y., et al.: Slow
9 release of fossil carbon during the Palaeocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum, Nat. Geosci., 4,
10 481–485, 2011.~~

11 ~~Curry, W. B., Shackleton, N. J., Richter, C., et al.: Ceara Rise, Proc. ODP, Initial Reports, 154,
12 1995.~~

13 Deconto, R. M., Galeotti, S., Pagani, M., Tracy, D., Schaefer, K., Zhang, T., Pollard, D., and
14 Beerling, D. J.: Past extreme warming events linked to massive carbon release from thawing
15 permafrost, Nature, 485, 87–92, 2012.

16 Dickens, G. R., O’Neil, J. R., Rea, D. K. and Owen, R. M.: Dissociation of oceanic methane
17 hydrate as a cause of the carbon isotope excursion at the end of the Paleocene,
18 Paleoclimatology, 10, 965–971, 1995.

19 Dunkley Jones, T., Ridgwell, A., Lunt, D. J., Maslin, M. A., Schmidt, D. N., and Valdes, P. J.:
20 A Paleogene perspective on climate sensitivity and methane hydrate instability, Phil. Trans.
21 Roy. Soc. A, 368, 2395–2415, 2010.

22 Eldholm, E., and Thomas, E.: Environmental impact of volcanic margin formation, Earth and
23 Planetary Science Letters, 117, 319–329, 1993.

24 Gibbs, S. J., Bralower, T. J., Bown, P. R., Zachos, J. C. and Bybell, L. M.: Shelf and open-
25 ocean calcareous phytoplankton assemblages across the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal
26 Maximum: Implications for global productivity gradients, Geology, 34, 233–236, 2006.

27 Gibson, T. G., and Bybell, L. M. (eds): Paleocene–Eocene Boundary sedimentation in the
28 Potomac River Valley, Virginia and Maryland, I.G.B.P. Project 308, Field Trip Guidebook,
29 1–13, 1991.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt, Don't adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Don't adjust space between Asian text and numbers

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font color: Auto

- 1 Gibson, T. G., Bybell, L. M. and Owens, J. P.: Latest Paleocene lithologic and biotic events in
2 neritic deposits of southwestern New-Jersey, *Paleoceanography*, 8,: 495–514, 1993.
- 3 Graber, K. K., Pollard, E., Jonasson, B., and Schulte, E. (eds): Overview of Ocean Drilling
4 Program engineering tools and hardware, Proc. ODP, Technical Note, 31,
5 10.2973/odp.tn.31.2002, 2002. Available at
6 www.odp.tamu.edu/publications/tnotes/tn31/INDEX.HTM.
- 7 Harris, A. D., Miller, K. G., Browning, J. V., Sugarman, P. J., Olsson, R. K., Cramer, B. S.,
8 and Wright, J. D.: Integrated stratigraphic studies of Paleocene–lowermost Eocene sequences,
9 New Jersey Coastal Plain: Evidence for glacioeustatic control, *Paleoceanography*, 25,
10 PA3211, doi: 10.1029/2009PA001800, 2009.
- 11 Higgins, J. A. and Schrag, D. P.: Beyond methane: towards a theory for the Paleocene–
12 Eocene thermal maximum. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 245, 523–537, 2006.
- 13 ~~[Hönisch, B., Ridgwell, A., Schmidt, D., Thomas, E., Gibbs, S. J., Sluijs, A., Zeebe, R., Kump,](#)~~
14 ~~[L., Martindale, R. C., Greense, S. E., Kiessling, W., Ries, J., Zachos, J. C., Royer, D., Barker,](#)~~
15 ~~[S., Marchitto, T. M., Moyer, R., Pelejero, C., Ziveri, P., Foster, G. L., and Williams, B.: The](#)~~
16 ~~[Geological Record of Ocean Acidification, *Science*, 335, 1058–1963, 2012.](#)~~
- 17 ~~[Hönisch, B. et al.: The Geological Record of Ocean Acidification, *Science*, 335, 1058–1963,](#)~~
18 ~~[2012.](#)~~
- 19 Hubbard, J.: Biscuit with your tea? ARISE (Andrill Research Immersion for Science
20 Educators) blog post. [http://arise-in-antarctica.blogspot.co.uk/2007/11/biscuit-with-your-](http://arise-in-antarctica.blogspot.co.uk/2007/11/biscuit-with-your-tea.html)
21 [tea.html](http://arise-in-antarctica.blogspot.co.uk/2007/11/biscuit-with-your-tea.html), 2007. Accessed 30 April 2014.
- 22 Huber, M.: A hotter greenhouse? *Science*, 321, 353–354, 2008.
- 23 Katz, M. E., Pak, D. K., Dickens, G. R. and Miller, K. G.: The source and fate of massive
24 carbon input during the latest Paleocene thermal maximum, *Science*, 286, 1531–1533, 1999.
- 25 Kemp, A., E. S.: Evidence for abrupt climate changes in annually laminated sediments, *Phil.*
26 *Trans. R. Soc. Lon. A.*, 361, 1851–1870, 2003.
- 27 Kennett, J. P. and Stott, L. D.: Abrupt deep-sea warming, palaeoceanographic changes and
28 benthic extinctions at the end of the Paleocene, *Nature*, 353, 225–229, 1991.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

1 Kent, D. V., Cramer, B. S., Lanci, L., Wang, D., Wright, J. D. ~~&and~~ van der Voo, R.: A case
2 for a comet impact trigger for the Paleocene/Eocene thermal maximum and carbon isotope
3 excursion, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 211, 13–26, 2003.

4 ~~[Kidd, R. B.: Core-discing and other drilling effects in DSDP Leg 42A Mediterranean
5 sediment cores. Init. Repts. DSDP, 42, 1143–1149, 1978.](#)~~

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

6 Kopp, R. E., Schumann, D., Raub, T. D., Powars, D. S., Godfrey, L. V., Swanson-Hysell,
7 N.L., Maloof, A.C., and Vali, H.: An Appalachian Amazon? Magnetofossil evidence for the
8 development of a tropical river-like system in the mid-Atlantic United States during the
9 Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum, Paleoceanography, 24, PA4211, doi:
10 10.1029/2009PA001783, 2009.

11 Kurtz, A. C., Kump, L. R., Arthur, M. A., Zachos, J. C. and Paytan, A.: Early Cenozoic
12 decoupling of the global carbon and sulfur cycles, Paleoceanography, 18, PA1090,
13 doi:10.1029/2003PA000908, 2003.

14
15 ~~[Leggett, J. K.: 1982-Drilling induced structures in Leg 66 sediments. Init. Repts. DSDP 66,
16 531-535, 1982.](#)~~

Formatted: Font: 12 pt, English (U.K.)

17 ~~[Lopez, G., Carey, D., Carlton, J.T., Cerrato, R., Dam, H., DiGiovanni, R., Elphick, C., Frisk,
18 M., Gobler, C., Hice, L., Howell, P., Jordaan, A., Lin, S., Liu, S., Lonsdale, D., McEnroe, M.,
19 McKown, K., McManus, G., Orson, R., Peterson, B., Pickerell, C., Rozsa, R., Shumway, S.,
20 Siuda, A., Streich, K., Talmage, S., Taylor, G., Thomas, E., Van Patten, M., Vaudrey, J.,
21 Yarish, C., Wikfors, G., and Zajac, R., 2014. Chapter 6: Biology and Ecology of Long Island
22 Sound. In: Long Island Sound, Prospects for the Urban Sea, Springer Series on Environmental
23 Management, 285–479; doi: 10.1007/978-1-4614-6126-5_6](#)~~

Formatted: English (U.K.)

Formatted: Don't adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Don't adjust space between Asian text and numbers

24 ~~[Latimer, J., Tedesco, M. A., Swanson, R L., Yarish, C., Stacey, P. E. and Garza, C. \(eds.\):
25 Long Island Sound: prospects for the Urban Sea. Springer, 558 p., 2014.](#)~~

Formatted: English (U.K.)

Formatted: Font:

26 McInerney, F. A., and Wing, S. L.: The Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum: A perturbation
27 of the carbon cycle, climate, and biosphere with implications for the future, Ann. Rev. Earth
28 Plan. Sci., 39, 489–516, 2011.

29 ~~[Nicholas, C. J., Pearson, P. N., Bown, P. R., Dunkley Jones, T., Huber, B. T., Karega, A.,
30 Lees, J. A., McMillan, I. K., O'Halloran, A., Singano, J. M., and Wade, B. S.: Stratigraphy](#)~~

1 [and sedimentology of the Upper Cretaceous to Paleogene Kilwa Group of Tanzania, *J. Afr.*](#)
2 [Earth Sci., 45, 431–466, 2006.](#)

3 [Nisbet, E. G., Jones, S.M., MacLennan, J., Eagles, G., Moed, J., Warwick, N., Bekki, S.,](#)
4 [Braesicke, P., Pyle, J. A., and Fowder, C. M. R., Kick-starting ancient warming. *Nature*](#)
5 [Geoscience, 2: 156–159, 2009.](#)

6 ~~[Pälike, H., Nishi, H., Lyle, M., Raffi, I., Gamage, K., Klaus, A. et al.: Expedition 320/321](#)~~
7 ~~[summary, *Proc. IODP*, 320/321, 2010, doi:10.2204/iodp.proc.320321.101.2010](#)~~

8 Pearson, P. N. and Nicholas, C. J.: Layering in the Paleocene/Eocene boundary of the
9 Millville core is drilling disturbance, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 111, E1064–E1065, 2014.

10 ~~[Pearson P. N., Nicholas C. J., Singano J. M., Bown P. R., Coxall H. K., van Dongen B. E.,](#)~~
11 ~~[Huber B. T., Karega A., Lees J. A., Msaky, E., Pancost, R.D., Pearson, M., and Roberts,](#)~~
12 ~~[10 A. P.: Paleogene and Cretaceous sediment cores from the Kilwa and Lindi areas of coastal](#)~~
13 ~~[Tanzania: Tanzania Drilling Project Sites 1–5, *J. Afri Earth Sci.*, 39, 25–62, 2004.](#)~~

14 ~~[Pearson, P.N., Nicholas, C.J., et al.: Paleogene and Cretaceous sediment cores from the Kilwa](#)~~
15 ~~[and Lindi areas of coastal Tanzania: Tanzania Drilling Project Sites 1–5, *J. Afri Earth Sci.*,](#)~~
16 ~~[39, 25–62, 2004.](#)~~

17 Reinhardt, J., Newell, W. L. and Mixon, R. B.: Geology of the Oak Grove core, Virginia
18 Division of Mineral Resources Publication 20, 1–13, 1980.

19 Ridgwell A., and Schmidt, D. N.: Past constraints on the vulnerability of marine calcifiers to
20 massive CO₂ release, *Nat. Geosci.*, 3, 196–200, 2010.

21 Self-Trail, J. M., Powars, D. S., Watkins, D. K., and Wandless, G. A.: Calcareous nannofossil
22 assemblage changes across the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum: Evidence from a shelf
23 setting, *Mar. Micropaleo.*, 92–93, 61–80, 2012.

24 ~~[Sluijs, A. et al.: Environmental precursors to rapid light carbon injection at the](#)~~
25 ~~[Palaeocene/Eocene boundary, *Nature*, 450, 1218–1225, 2007.](#)~~

26 ~~[Sluijs, A., Brinkhuis, H., Schouten, S., Bohaty, S. M., John, C. M., Zachos, J. C., Reichert,](#)~~
27 ~~[G.-J., Sinninge Damsté, J. S., Crouch, E. M., and Dickens, G. R.: Environmental precursors to](#)~~
28 ~~[rapid light carbon injection at the Palaeocene/Eocene boundary, *Nature*, 450, 1218–1225,](#)~~
29 ~~[2007a.](#)~~

Formatted: Spanish (International Sort)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt, Spanish (International Sort)

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt, Bold

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

1 [Sluijs, A., Bowen, G. J., Brinkhuis, H., Lourens, L. J., and Thomas, E.: The Palaeocene-Eocene](#)
2 [Thermal maximum super greenhouse: biotic and geochemical signatures, age models and](#)
3 [mechanisms of climate change. 'Deep Time Perspectives on Climate Change: Marrying the](#)
4 [Signal from Computer Models and Biological Proxies', eds. M. Williams, A. M. Haywood, F. J.](#)
5 [Gregory, and D. N. Schmidt, The Micropalaeontological Society, Special Publications, The](#)
6 [Geological Society, London, 323–351, 2007b.](#)

7 Stassen, P., Thomas, E., and Speijer, R. P.: Integrated stratigraphy of the Paleocene-Eocene
8 Thermal Maximum in the New Jersey Coastal Plain: towards understanding the effects of
9 global warming in a shelf environment, *Paleoceanography*, 27: PA4210, 2012.

10 Stassen, P., Speijer, R. P., and Thomas, E.: Unsettled puzzle of the Marlboro clays. *Proc.*
11 *Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 111, E1066–E1067, 2014.

12 Storey, M., Duncan, R. A. and Swisher, C. C.: Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum and the
13 opening of the northeast Atlantic, *Science*, 316, 587–589, 2007.

14 [Sugarman, P. J., Miller, K. G., Browning, J. V., McLaughlin, P. P., Brenner, G. J., Buttari,](#)
15 [B., Cramer, B. S., Harris, A., Hernandez, J., Katz, M. E., Lettini, B., Misintseva, S.,](#)
16 [Monteverde, D. H., Olsson, R. K., Patrick, L., Roman, E., Wojtko, M. J., Aubry, M.-P.,](#)
17 [Feigenson, M. D., Barron, J. A., Curtin, S., Cobbs, G., Bukry, D., and Huffman, B. A.:](#)
18 [Millville Site. Proc ODP, Init Repts.174AX \(Suppl.\): College Station, TX \(Ocean Drilling](#)
19 [Program\), 1–94, doi:10.2973/odp.proc.ir.174axs.106.2005, 2005.](#)

20 ~~Sugarman P.J., et al.: Millville Site. Proc ODP, Init Repts, eds. Miller KG, et al. 174AX~~
21 ~~(Suppl.): College Station, TX (Ocean Drilling Program): 1–94,~~
22 ~~10.2973/odp.proc.ir.174axs.106.2005, 2005.~~

23 Svensen, H., Planke, S., Malthe-Sorensen, A., Jamtveit, B., Myklebust, R., Eidem, T. R. and
24 Rey, S. S.: Release of methane from a volcanic basin as a mechanism for initial Eocene global
25 warming, *Nature*, 429, 542–545, 2004.

26 Thomas, C. D., Cameron, A, Green, R. E., Bakkenes, M, Beaumont L. J., et al.: Extinction
27 risk from climate change, *Nature*, 427, 145–48, 2004.

28 Thomas, D. J., Zachos, J. C., Bralower, T. J., Thomas, E. and Bohaty, S.: Warming the fuel
29 for the fire: evidence for the thermal dissociation of methane hydrate during the Paleocene–
30 Eocene thermal maximum, *Geology*, 30, 1067–1070, 2002.

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman, English (U.K.)

Formatted: Right: -0.19"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt, Font color: Black

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: Font color: Auto

1 Thomas E, and Shackleton N.J.: The Paleocene-Eocene benthic foraminiferal extinction and
2 stable isotope anomalies. In Knox, R.W.O.B., Corfield, R. and Dunay, E.E. (eds), Correlation
3 of the Early Paleogene in Northwest Europe, Geol. Soc. London, Spec. Pub. 101, pp. 401–41,
4 1996.

5 Vilela, C.G.: Taphonomy of benthic foraminiferal tests of the Amazon shelf, Journal of
6 Foraminiferal Research, 33, 132–143, 2003.

7 Wang, H., Kent, D.V., and Jackson, M.J.: Evidence for abundant isolated magnetic
8 nanoparticles at the Paleocene-Eocene boundary, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 110, 25–430,
9 2013.

10 Wright, J.D., and Schaller, M.F.: Evidence for a rapid release of carbon at the Paleocene-
11 Eocene thermal maximum, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 110, 15908–15913, 2013.

12 Wright, J.D., and Schaller, M.F.: Reply to Pearson and Nicholas, Stassen et al., and Zeebe et
13 al.: Teasing out the missing piece of the PETM puzzle, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 111,
14 E1068–E1071, 2014.

15 ~~Zachos, J. C., Rohl, U., Schellenberg, S. A., Sluijs, A., Hodell, D. A., Kelly, D. C., Thomas,
16 E., Nicolò, M., Raffi, I., Lorens, L. J., McCarren, H., and Kroon D.: Rapid acidification of the
17 ocean during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, Science, 308, 1611–1615, 2005.~~

18 ~~Zachos, J.C., Rohl, U., Schellenberg, S.A., Sluijs, A., Hodell, D.A., et al.: Rapid acidification
19 of the ocean during the Paleocene Eocene Thermal Maximum, Science, 308, 1611–1615,
20 2005.~~

21 ~~Zachos, J. C., Schouten, S., Bohaty, S., Quattlebaum, T., Sluijs, A., Brinhuis, H., Gibbs, S. J.,
22 and Bralower, T. J.: Extreme warming of mid-latitude coastal ocean during the Paleocene-
23 30 Eocene Thermal Maximum: Inferences from TEX86 and isotope data, Geology, 34, 737–
24 740, 2006.~~

25 Zachos, J. C., Bohaty, S. M., John, C. M., McCarren, H., Kelly, D. C., and Nielsen, T.: The
26 Palaeocene-Eocene carbon isotope excursion: constraints from individual shell planktonic
27 foraminifera records, Phil. Trans. R. Soc. A., 365, 1829–1842, 2007.

28 ~~Zachos, J. C., Schouten, S., Bohaty, S., Quattlebaum, T., Sluijs, A., Brinhuis, H., Gibbs, S. J.,
29 and Bralower, T. J.: Extreme warming of mid latitude coastal ocean during the Paleocene-
30 30 Eocene Thermal Maximum: Inferences from TEX86 and isotope data, Geology, 34, 737–
31 740, 2006.~~

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt, Don't adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Don't adjust space between Asian text and numbers

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Left, Space Before: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: Font color: Auto

1 ~~Zachos, J. C. et al.: Extreme warming of mid latitude coastal ocean during the Paleocene-~~
2 ~~Eocene Thermal Maximum: Inferences from TEX86 and isotope data, *Geology*, 34: 737-740,~~
3 ~~2006.~~

4 Zeebe, R. E., Dickens, G. R., Ridgwell, A., Sluijs, A., and Thomas, E.: Onset of carbon
5 isotope excursion at the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum took millennia, not 13 years,
6 *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 111, E1062-E1063, 2014.

7
8

Formatted: English (U.K.)

1 Figure captions

2

3

4 Figure 1. Onset of the carbon isotope excursion at Millville (data replotted from Wright and
5 Schaller, 2013).

6

7 Figure 2. A. "Core-discing" as illustrated by Kidd (1978) from DSDP Site 376 (Florence Rise,
8 Mediterranean Sea west of Cyprus). B. Similar example illustrated by Leggett (1982) from
9 DSDP Site 488 (middle America Trench off Mexico, eastern Pacific Ocean).

10

11 Figure 3. "Types of drilling deformation in Leg 66 cores" reproduced with caption from
12 Leggett (1982~~86~~).

Formatted: Underline, Font color: Black

13

14 Figure ~~24~~. "A. Conceptual model of biscuiting caused by drilling disturbance. B. Detail of
15 Tanzania Drilling Project Site 2 (Pearson et al., 2004). C. Detail of the Millville core
16 (modified from Wright and Schaller, 2013). D. Detail of the Wilson lake B core (modified
17 from Wright and Schaller, 2013). White arrows indicate continuity between the external
18 drilling mud, now mostly scraped off in the Tanzania and Millville cores, and the thin
19 partings between the biscuits. Dark arrows point at possible bedding at an angle to biscuiting."
20 Reproduced with caption from Pearson and Nicholas (2014).

Formatted: English (U.K.)

21

22 ~~Figure 35. Photograph of Marlboro Clay exposure reproduced and modified (arrows added)~~
23 ~~from Wright and Schaller (2014): "Photograph of the rhythmic bedding in the Marlboro Clay~~
24 ~~exposed in the Ranconas Creek, Medford, NJ. Pencil is ~ 15 cm. The blue/gray clay is~~
25 ~~interrupted at regular (~2 cm intervals) by very thinly bedded silts and very fine sands. These~~
26 ~~areas also provide zones of weakness along which fractures will form when hand samples~~
27 ~~from the exposures are dried in the laboratory" (caption from Wright and Schaller, 2014). In~~
28 ~~our interpretation, the photograph shows several examples where joint surfaces curve and~~
29 ~~intersect one another in a fish scale type arrangement. This is seen, for example, in the surface~~

1 | ~~that forms a ledge behind the pencil (highlighted with arrows). No clear sedimentary bedding~~
2 | ~~is apparent.~~

Formatted: English (U.K.)

3 |
4 | Figure 465. Evidence for drilling disturbance in the Millville Core from the interval 890-910
5 | feet subsurface (1 foot = 0.3048 m). A: Part of the core when freshly recovered (modified
6 | from Wright and Schaller, 2013, arrows added). The horizontal layers were described by
7 | Wright and Schaller (2013) as rhythmically bedded couplets, but were interpreted by Pearson
8 | and Nicholas (2014) as alternations of ~~drilling-biseuitcore discs~~ and injected slurry. External
9 | drilling mud has been scraped off, but patches remain (as highlighted by arrows). Note that
10 | the thin internal partings are reflective like the external mud, and appear contiguous with it in
11 | places. B: Part of the same core as viewed on 19 March 2014 after desiccation during nearly a
12 | decade of storage. Note that the core has fractured in many places along the slurry partings. C:
13 | Detail of upper highlighted area in B, showing a thick layer of external drilling mud still
14 | attached to the right hand side. D: Part of the same interval now cut in half-round and viewed
15 | under the microscope. The drilling slurry (darker color) forms a thin parting through the
16 | centre of the core (highlighted with arrow) which is contiguous with the external mud. E: Top
17 | surface of the ~~drilling-biseuitcore disc~~ from the lower highlighted area in B, showing an
18 | external coating of drilling mud around the upper half from the back of the core where it was
19 | not originally scraped off. F: Microscopic detail of highlighted area in E showing the top
20 | surface of the ~~biseuit-core disc~~ with concentric grooves, evidence of spinning in the core
21 | barrel. Similar observations were made at other levels in the core.

Formatted: English (U.K.)

22 | ▲
23 | Figure 576. Concentric grooves in various parts of the Wilson Lake B core, as seen in half -
24 | round specimens from the archive half. A: top of a ~~biseuit-core disc~~ with patches of adhering
25 | injected slurry and concentric grooves (highlighted with arrow). B: base of a ~~biseuit-core disc~~
26 | with patches of adhering injected slurry and concentric grooves (highlighted with arrow). C:
27 | top of a ~~biseuit-core disc~~ with patches of adhering injected slurry and concentric grooves. D:
28 | Microscopic detail of highlighted area in C showing a patch of remaining slurry (to the left)
29 | unconformably overlying the surface of a ~~drilling-biseuitcore disc~~ which shows concentric
30 | grooves. Similar observations were made at other levels in the core.

Formatted: English (U.K.)

1 | Figure 687. Evidence for drilling disturbance in the Wilson Lake B core; new photographs of
2 | part of a polished half-round interval prepared originally by Wright and Schaller (2013). A:
3 | Alternating ~~drilling~~biseuitscore discs and injected slurry, thickening to the edges
4 | (highlighted) with deformation features at the edge of the core. B: Microscopic detail of
5 | highlighted area in A showing fractured core injected with drilling slurry (darker color,
6 | highlighted with arrow). Very similar fracturing features occur in the three overlying ~~biseuits~~
7 | core discs in A.

8 |
9 | Figure 85. Photograph of Marlboro Clay exposure reproduced and modified (arrows added)
10 | from Wright and Schaller (2014): "Photograph of the rhythmic bedding in the Marlboro Clay
11 | exposed in the Ranconas Creek, Medford, NJ. Pencil is ~ 15 cm. ... The blue/gray clay is
12 | interrupted at regular (~2 cm intervals) by very thinly bedded silts and very fine sands. These
13 | areas also provide zones of weakness along which fractures will form when hand samples
14 | from the exposures are dried in the laboratory" (caption from Wright and Schaller, 2014). In
15 | our interpretation, the photograph shows several examples where joint surfaces curve and
16 | intersect one another in a fish-scale type arrangement. This is seen, for example, in the surface
17 | that forms a ledge behind the pencil (highlighted with arrows). No clear sedimentary bedding
18 | is apparent.

Formatted: German (Germany)