

1

2 **Early Paleogene variations in the calcite compensation depth: New**

3 **constraints using old borehole sediments across Ninetyeast Ridge**

4 **in the Indian Ocean**

5

6

7 Benjamin S. Slotnick<sup>1,‡</sup>, Vittoria Lauretano<sup>2</sup>, Jan Backman<sup>3</sup>, Gerald R. Dickens<sup>1,3</sup>,  
8 Appy Sluijs<sup>2</sup>, Lucas Lourens<sup>2</sup>

9

10 <sup>1</sup>*Department of Earth Sciences, Rice University, Houston, TX 77005, USA*

11 <sup>2</sup>*Department of Earth Sciences, Utrecht University, 3508 TA Utrecht, The Netherlands*

12 <sup>3</sup>*Department of Geological Sciences, Stockholm University, Stockholm SE-106 91,  
13 Sweden*

14

15

16

17

18 **Original Article**

19 *Climate of the Past Discussions, 10, 3163-3221*

20 *Submitted: June 25, 2014; Accepted: July 16, 2014; Published: August 8, 2014*

21 **Revised Article**

22 *Submitted: December 8, 2014; Resubmitted: February 19, 2015*

23

24

1    **Abstract.**

2       Major variations in global carbon cycling occurred between 62 and 48 Ma, very  
3       likely also the total carbon inventory of the ocean-atmosphere system. Based on carbon  
4       cycle theory, variations in the size of the ocean carbon inventory should be reflected in  
5       contemporaneous global ocean carbonate accumulation on the seafloor and, thereby  
6       the depth of the calcite compensation depth (CCD). Decent CCD reconstructions for this  
7       time interval are available from the Atlantic and some from the Pacific Ocean. However,  
8       information from the Indian Ocean is too limited to faithfully reconstruct global ocean  
9       CCD depth variations. We examine lithologic, nannofossil, carbon isotope, and  
10      carbonate content records for late Paleocene – early Eocene sediments recovered at  
11      three sites spanning Ninetyeast Ridge, to assess the depth of the CCD and the potential  
12      for renewed scientific drilling in the Indian Ocean: Deep Sea Drilling Project (DSDP)  
13      Sites 213 (deep, east), 214 (shallow, central), and 215 (deep, west). The disturbed,  
14      discontinuous sediment sections are not ideal, because they were recovered in single  
15      holes using rotary coring methods, but remain the best Paleogene sediments available  
16      along Ninetyeast Ridge. The  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records at Sites 213 and 215 are similar to those  
17      generated at several locations in the Atlantic and Pacific, including the prominent high in  
18       $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  across the Paleocene carbon isotope maximum (PCIM) at Site 215, and the  
19      prominent low in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  across the early Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO) at both Site  
20      213 and Site 215. The Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum (PETM) and the K/X event  
21      are found at Site 213 but not at Site 215, presumably because of coring gaps.  
22      Carbonate content at both Sites 213 and 215 drops to < 5% shortly after the first  
23      occurrence of *Discoaster lodoensis* and the early Eocene rise in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (~52 Ma). This  
24      reflects a rapid shoaling of the CCD, and likely a major decrease in the net flux of  $^{13}\text{C}$ -  
25      depleted carbon to the ocean. Our results support ideas that major changes in net  
26      fluxes of organic carbon to and from the exogenic carbon cycle occurred during the  
27      early Paleogene. Moreover, we conclude that excellent early Paleogene carbonate  
28      accumulation records might be recovered from the central Indian Ocean with future  
29      scientific drilling.

30

1 Key words: Paleocene, Eocene, hyperthermals, calcite compensation depth, carbon  
2 isotopes, nannofossils.

1      **1** Introduction

2           Pronounced changes in global carbon cycling characterize a 14 Myr window of  
3      the early Paleogene from 62 to 48 Ma. As perhaps best expressed in stable carbon  
4      isotope records of marine carbonate (Shackleton, 1986; Zachos et al., 2001, 2010;  
5      Slotnick et al., 2012), large magnitude  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  perturbations span both long (> 1 Myr) and  
6      short (< 0.2 Myr) time intervals (**Fig. 1**). A prominent rise in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  begins ca. 62 Ma and  
7      reaches a Cenozoic high ca. 58 Ma. From this Paleocene carbon isotope maximum  
8      (PCIM),  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  drops over ~5 Myr, culminating in a minimum near the start of the early  
9      Eocene Climatic Optimum (EECO) ca. 53 Ma. The  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  rises over the next 4 Myr, such  
10     that values at 49 Ma are nearly the same as at 62 Ma. Superimposed on this major  
11     oscillation were several brief carbon isotope excursions (CIEs), when the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
12     decreased significantly within 10 to 50 ka, and recovered within another 50 to 200 kyr  
13     (Cramer et al., 2003; Nicolo et al., 2007; Galeotti et al., 2010; Stap et al., 2010). The  
14     Paleocene–Eocene thermal maximum (PETM) ca. 56 Ma (Westerhold and Röhl, 2009;  
15     Charles et al., 2011), represents the extreme case (e.g., Kennett and Stott, 1991; Sluijs  
16     et al., 2007).

17        Both the long-term and short-term  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  perturbations (**Fig. 1**) have been  
18     attributed to major changes in organic carbon fluxes to and from the ocean–atmosphere  
19     system (Shackleton, 1986; Dickens et al., 1995; Kurtz et al., 2003; Sluijs et al., 2007;  
20     Komar et al., 2013). The rises in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  toward the PCIM and after the EECO reflect net  
21     removal of  $^{13}\text{C}$ -depleted carbon from the ocean-atmosphere, the drop in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  toward  
22     the EECO represents net addition of  $^{13}\text{C}$ -depleted carbon to the ocean-atmosphere; the  
23     CIEs, in turn, mark abrupt injections of  $^{13}\text{C}$ -depleted carbon followed by partial  
24     sequestration. Controversy surrounds the cause and magnitude of these carbon flux  
25     changes because they are difficult to reconcile with conventional models of global  
26     carbon cycling (e.g., Dickens, 2003; Komar et al., 2013).

27        Records of deep-sea carbonates may constrain perspectives of early Paleogene  
28     carbon cycling considerably (Dickens et al., 1997; Zeebe et al., 2009; Leon-Rodriguez  
29     and Dickens, 2010; Cui et al., 2011; Komar et al., 2013). Calcite solubility in the deep  
30     ocean generally increases with depth, principally because of greater pressure. At

1 constant calcium ion concentrations  $[\text{Ca}^{2+}]$ , higher carbonate ion concentrations  $[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$   
2 are therefore necessary to maintain calcite saturation. By contrast,  $[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$  generally  
3 decreases with depth. The combination of both factors leads to depth horizons in the  
4 ocean that impact calcite preservation on the seafloor (e.g., Broecker and Peng, 1982;  
5 Boudreau et al., 2010). From the perspective of the sedimentary record, the lysocline is  
6 the depth where calcite dissolution first becomes apparent (Kennett, 1982), and where  
7 calcite dissolution rates accelerate. By contrast, the calcite compensation depth (CCD)  
8 is the depth where calcite dissolution balances calcite “rain” from above. Although both  
9 terms come with caveats (Boudreau et al., 2010), the CCD generally lies hundreds of  
10 meters below the lysocline. For this study, we equate the CCD to where the weight  
11 percent of  $\text{CaCO}_3$  drops below <10% (Broecker, 2008; Boudreau et al., 2010). This is  
12 appropriate in most low-latitude, open-ocean settings where terrigenous or bio-siliceous  
13 dilution is not important.

14 On long-time frames,  $[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$  relates to the total mass of carbon in the ocean  
15 (Zeebe and Westbroek, 2003). The long-term rises and drops in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  across the early  
16 Paleogene should therefore respectively coincide with slow shoaling and slow  
17 deepening of the lysocline and CCD (Hancock et al., 2007; Kump et al., 2009; Komar et  
18 al., 2013). The CIEs should manifest as rapid rises in the lysocline and CCD, followed  
19 by rapid falls, the latter sometimes represented by excess calcite accumulation, coined  
20 “carbonate overcompensation” (e.g., Dickens et al., 1997; Zachos et al., 2005; Leon-  
21 Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010; Kelly et al., 2010). Crucially, on both long and short time  
22 frames, the magnitude and timing of such changes should relate to amounts and rates  
23 of carbon added to or removed from the ocean and atmosphere (Dickens et al., 1997;  
24 Cui et al., 2011; Komar et al., 2013). Early work regarding Cenozoic evolution of the  
25 CCD (Berger, 1972; van Andel, 1975) indicated limited variation during the early  
26 Paleogene. However, more recent records support significant changes in carbonate  
27 accumulation over this time, indicating a dynamic CCD on the million-year time scale  
28 (e.g., Rea and Lyle, 2005; Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010; Pälike et al., 2012), as  
29 well as across some of the CIEs (e.g., Zachos et al., 2005; Stap et al., 2009; Cui et al.,  
30 2011).

1 The long-term CCD record between 62 and 52 Ma remains poorly constrained  
2 (Pälike et al., 2012), especially for the Indian Ocean. Moreover, CCD records prior to 52  
3 Ma have not been tightly coupled to  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records. In this study, we aim to (1) generate  
4 early Paleogene carbonate content and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records at three Deep Sea Drilling Project  
5 (DSDP) sites in the Indian Ocean, (2) examine these records with current perspectives  
6 for global carbon cycling between 62 and 48 Ma, and (3) establish whether better  
7 records might be collected with future drilling.

8

## 9 2 The Central Indian Ocean and DSDP Leg 22

### 10 2.1 *Bathymetry and basement origin*

11 Three large-scale features characterize the bathymetry of the central Indian  
12 Ocean, loosely defined as the region between 5°S and 15°S latitude and 75°E and  
13 100°E longitude (**Fig. 2**). In the middle lies the north-south oriented Ninetyeast Ridge.  
14 This ~4600 km long (from ~10°N to ~31°S) parapet separates two abyssal plain regions:  
15 Wharton Basin and Cocos Basin to the east, and Mid-Indian Basin to the west. The  
16 ridge was generated by “hotspot volcanism” as the Indo-Australian Plate moved north  
17 over the Kerguelen plume; ages of basalt along the ridge systematically become  
18 younger to the south (**Fig. 2**) (Saunders et al., 1991; Frey et al., 2011).

19 The surrounding plains are floored by oceanic crust formed along the South  
20 Eastern Indian Ridge (SEIR) and Central Indian Ridge (CIR) during the late Cretaceous  
21 through middle Paleogene, as indicated by tholeiitic basalt recovered and dated at  
22 several DSDP sites (Frey et al., 1977). Reconstructing paleo-positions in these low lying  
23 abyssal plains is complicated because of broad diffusive plate boundaries, and because  
24 of multiple stages of rotation throughout much of the Cenozoic (Patriat and Achacha,  
25 1984; Cande et al., 2010). Nonetheless, ages of basalt throughout the plains and basins  
26 surrounding Ninetyeast Ridge generally become younger to the south (**Fig. 2**).  
27

### 28 2.2 *Sites 213, 214, and 215*

29 This study focuses on three Deep Sea Drilling Project (DSDP; Leg 22) sites  
30 straddling Ninetyeast Ridge (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974; **Fig. 2**). Site 213 is

1 located ~500 km east of Ninetyeast ridge at 10°12.71'S, 93°53.77'E, and 5601m below  
2 sea level (m b.s.l.). Site 214 lies on the crest of Ninetyeast Ridge at 11°20.21'S,  
3 88°43.08'E, and 1655 mb.s.l. Site 215 is located ~300 km west of Ninetyeast Ridge at  
4 8°07.30'S, 86°47.50'E, and 5309 mb.s.l.

5 All three sites cored basalt of early Paleogene age (**Fig. 2**). Igneous basement is  
6 approximately 56, 62, and 59 Ma at Sites 213, 214 and 215, respectively (MacDougall,  
7 1977; Peirce, 1978; Frey et al., 2011). Given the tectonic history for the region, all three  
8 sites were located further south and in shallower water during the early Paleogene.  
9 Plate reconstructions have the sites at ~30°S in the late Paleocene (ODSN 2011). Sites  
10 213 and 215 were located at the SEIR crest at the time of basalt emplacement,  
11 presumably ~2.75 km below sea level. Site 214 was near or above the sea surface until  
12 61 Ma. Lowermost sediment recovered at Site 214 contains glauconitic silt with  
13 gastropods and bivalves, as well as lignite and tuff.

14 Coring operations recovered 139 m of pelagic sediment at Site 213, 311 m of  
15 pelagic sediment and 35 m of neritic sediment at Site 214 (excluding lowermost  
16 volcaniclastic material), and 113 m of pelagic sediment at Site 215 (von der Borch and  
17 Sclater, 1974). Sediment age was determined primarily through calcareous  
18 biochronology. This study focuses on cores containing upper Paleocene and lower to  
19 middle Eocene sediment (**Figs. 3–5**), sediments that remain the best available  
20 Paleogene sediments recovered to date along Ninetyeast Ridge. Studied intervals  
21 comprise a range of lithologies, but especially nannofossil ooze and clay. Of primary  
22 interest are occasional clay-rich horizons within nannofossil ooze, and major shifts from  
23 nannofossil ooze to clay, such as within lower Eocene sediments at Site 213 (Core 14)  
24 and at Site 215 (Core 9).

25

### 26 *2.3 Previous work on early Paleogene sequences*

27 Previous investigations of lower Paleogene sediment at Sites 213, 214, and 215  
28 (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974; McGowran, 1974; Gartner, 1974; Bukry, 1974; Hovan  
29 and Rea, 1992; Zachos et al., 1992; Berggren and Norris, 1997; Ravizza et al., 2001;  
30 Tremolada and Bralower, 2004) provide age constraints. Much of this work concerns

1 nannofossil and foraminiferal biostratigraphy, and was conducted at low spatial  
2 resolution between samples, except for studies across the PETM at Site 213 (Ravizza  
3 et al., 2001; Tremolada and Bralower, 2004). Moreover, absolute ages on Paleogene  
4 time scales have changed significantly over the past 40 years. For proper comparison of  
5 various data sets, it is necessary to place results onto a common and current early  
6 Paleogene time scale.

7

### 8 3 Methods

#### 9 3.1 *Stratigraphic log and samples*

10 In contrast to most paleoceanographic expeditions over the last two decades,  
11 only one hole was drilled at each site. Furthermore, drilling employed the rotary coring  
12 method (Storms, 1990), in contrast to the preferred advanced hydraulic piston coring  
13 (APC) method. The combination almost necessarily leads to churned-up sediment and  
14 incomplete core recovery. This is confirmed for the sites of interest through photographs  
15 and logs that show some highly disturbed intervals (**Fig. 6**), as well as numerous cores  
16 less than 9.5 m in length, even though drilling generally advanced by this amount (von  
17 der Borch and Sclater, 1974). More problematic are “core gaps” that may exist between  
18 successive cores (Ruddiman et al., 1987; Hagelberg et al., 1992; Dickens and  
19 Backman, 2013). As discovered on drilling expeditions circa 1985–1987, typically about  
20 1 m (but up to 3 m or more) of sediment is missing between successive hydraulic piston  
21 cores, even when 9.5 m long cores are completely full of sediment. We assume that  
22 such core gaps, which result from several processes (Ruddiman et al., 1987; Lisiecki  
23 and Herbert, 2007), also occur between successive rotary cores in unlithified ooze and  
24 clay, such as at Sites 213, 214, and 215.

25 To account for incomplete recovery within cores and probable gaps between  
26 cores, we follow procedures consistent with those used on board more recent  
27 paleoceanography drilling expeditions. We assume incomplete core intervals always  
28 occur at the bottom of cores, and additional gaps between successive cores. We recast  
29 original depths onto a “meters composite depth” (mcd) scale. As we do not know the  
30 length of core gaps for Sites 213, 214, and 215, we assume they are 1 m. This means

1 there is always  $\geq 1$  m of sediment missing between successive cores (**Figs. 3–5 and 7–**  
2 **9**). Obviously, the 1 m length for the core gaps is arbitrary, but the inclusion of such  
3 gaps is important, as it identifies likely intervals of missing sediment. For further  
4 clarification on the matter of coring artifacts, Dickens and Backman (2013) present a  
5 lengthy discussion of the early Paleogene record at DSDP Site 577 on Shatsky Rise.

6 A total of 395, 10 cm<sup>3</sup>, early Paleogene sediment samples were taken from Sites  
7 213, 214, and 215.

8

### 9 3.2 Age Model

10 Throughout this work, we adhere to the astronomically tuned “Option-1” (WO-1)  
11 early Paleogene time scale (Westerhold et al., 2008). This is because multiple  
12 published and relevant data sets have been aligned to this time scale (**Table 1**).  
13 However, it is possible that the WO-1 time scale is offset by one 400 kyr eccentricity  
14 cycle near the late Paleocene (Hilgen et al., 2010; Vandenbergh et al., 2012).

15

### 16 3.3 Sample preparation

17 Each sample was freeze-dried, and split into two aliquots: one for nannofossil  
18 examination, the other for geochemistry. The geochemistry aliquot was ground and  
19 homogenized using a glass mortar and pestle. Ground material of each sample was  
20 placed into a tube with 18MΩ deionized water, mixed using a mini vortexer, and  
21 centrifuged for 10, 15, and 25 minutes sequentially to remove dissolved ions. Water was  
22 decanted after each interval of centrifuging. Centrifuged sample aliquots then were  
23 freeze-dried a second time.

24

### 25 3.4 Nannofossil assemblages

26 Calcareous nannofossils were investigated in 62 samples to refine the depths of  
27 biostratigraphic datums for chronological constraints. Smear slides were made following  
28 standard methods. Estimates of abundance and preservation follow the guidelines  
29 outlined by Pälike et al. (2010). For the abundance of total nannofossils: D=dominant  
30 (>90% of total sediment grains); A=abundant (50–90%); C=common (10–50%); F=few

1 (1–10%); R=rare (< 1%); B=barren. For the preservation of nannofossils: G=good (little  
2 evidence of dissolution or recrystallization, primary morphological characteristics only  
3 slightly altered, specimens identifiable to the species level); M=moderate (specimens  
4 exhibit some etching or recrystallization, primary morphological characteristics  
5 somewhat altered, most specimens identifiable to the species level); P=poor  
6 (specimens severely etched or overgrown, primary morphological characteristics largely  
7 destroyed, fragmentation has occurred, specimens often not identifiable at the species  
8 or genus level).

9 A well-established sequence of appearances and disappearances of calcareous  
10 nannofossil species and genera spans the early Paleogene. These Tops (T), Bases (B),  
11 and evolutionary Crossovers (X), have been calibrated to magnetic polarity chron  
12 boundaries at several sites (e.g., Agnini et al., 2007; Dickens and Backman, 2013).  
13 Some of these biohorizons have been used to construct calcareous nannofossil zonal  
14 schemes such as those of Okada and Bukry (1980) and Martini (1971), the latter which  
15 we mention in this work. However, some datums for some species are not  
16 straightforward. For example, *Discoaster lodoensis* has a pulsed onset at several sites  
17 (Agnini et al., 2007; Dickens and Backman, 2013). As such, this species has a true  
18 base (B) as well as a higher position when the species begins to occur consistently and  
19 with high relative abundance (Base common, or Bc).

20

### 21 3.5 Geochemistry

22 Dried splits of bulk sediment samples were analyzed for carbonate content and  
23 stable isotope ratios at Utrecht University. Carbonate content was determined from the  
24 amount of carbon dioxide generated during combustion using a LECO SC-632 analyzer.  
25 Each sample was weighed, and calculations incorporated these masses. Multiple  
26 analyses of the WEPAL-ISE 983 and in-house carbonate standards form the basis for  
27 accuracy and precision (0.8% at  $1\sigma$ ). Stable carbon and oxygen isotopes were  
28 determined using an ISOCARB common acid bath carbonate preparation device linked  
29 to a VG24 SIRA mass spectrometer. Instrumental calibrations were constrained using in  
30 house standards IAEA-CO-1 and NAXOS (Coplen et al., 2006). Ratios were converted

1 to standard delta notation relative to Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite (vPDB). Analytical  
2 precision was 0.05‰ at  $1\sigma$  and 0.10‰ at  $2\sigma$  for  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , respectively. Although  
3 all samples were analyzed for stable isotopes, 37 samples from Site 213 and 20  
4 samples from Site 215 did not give accurate values because they have very low (< 5%)  
5 carbonate contents.

6

## 7 4 Results

### 8 4.1 Nannofossil assemblages and age control

9 The intervals investigated span the Paleocene/Eocene boundary, from Zone  
10 NP7-8 to Zone NP12 (Site 213), Zone NP4-5 to Zone NP12 (Site 214) and Zone NP7-8  
11 to Zone NP12 (Site 215) in the biozonation of Martini (1971). The Paleocene/Eocene  
12 boundary, however, is lost in core gaps at all three sites. Gartner (1974) and Bukry  
13 (1974) originally investigated calcareous nannofossils at these sites. The data produced  
14 here is consistent with their findings. Assemblages are mostly poorly preserved (**Tables**  
15 **2-4**).

16 Based on presence and absence of selected taxa, a minimum and maximum age  
17 can be assigned to each sample. Age estimates of calcareous nannofossil biohorizons  
18 are from Agnini et al. (2006, 2007), placed on an updated time scale (Option 1,  
19 Westerhold et al., 2008; **Table 1**).

20 The following biochronologic constraints were used for determining age  
21 relationships at Site 213. A sample showing an overlap in the ranges of *Tribrachiatus*  
22 *orthostylus* and *Discoaster lodoensis* indicates that the sample must be older than 50.70  
23 Ma, which is the estimate for the Top of *T. orthostylus* (base of Zone NP13). This  
24 estimate thus represents the youngest possible (minimum) age for the sample.  
25 Similarly, the oldest possible age for the sample must be the Base of *D. lodoensis* (base  
26 of Zone NP12), occurring at 53.24 Ma.

27 Samples below the range of *D. lodoensis* and showing presence of *Sphenolithus*  
28 *radians* indicate Zone NP 11, and a minimum age of 53.24 Ma (sample older than base  
29 *D. lodoensis*) and a maximum age of 53.85 Ma (sample is younger than appearance  
30 age of *S. radians*). Samples below the range of *T. orthostylus* and showing presence of

1 *Discoaster diastypus* indicate Zone NP10, a minimum age of 54.00 Ma and a maximum  
2 age of 54.48 Ma. Samples showing an overlap in range between *Zygrhablithus*  
3 *bijugatus* and *Fasciculithus tympaniformis*, and in which the former dominates in  
4 abundance over the latter, range in age from 55.11 Ma to 55.47 Ma.

5 Gartner (1974) has marked an overlap in range between *Ericsonia robusta* and  
6 *Discoaster multiradiatus* in Sample 213-17-1, 120 cm, indicating Zone NP9 and an age  
7 range from 56.66 Ma (Top *E. robusta*) to 56.76 Ma (Base *D. multiradiatus*, and the base  
8 of NP9). This suggests that the onset of the PETM (i.e., the Paleocene/Eocene  
9 boundary) is missing within a gap between Cores 213-16 and 213-17.

10 Similar information was used to constrain ages at Site 214. The simultaneous  
11 presence of *D. lodoensis* and *S. radians* was observed in a single sample (214-35-4,  
12 140–142 cm), and indicates an age between 53.24 and 53.85 Ma. The next deeper  
13 sample (214-36-2, 120–122 cm) holds an upper Paleocene assemblage including  
14 *Heliolithus kleinpelli*. The appearance of this species defines the base of Zone NP6  
15 (59.02 Ma), and its disappearance is calibrated to 58.33 Ma, which is within the  
16 combined Zone NP7/NP8 (see Agnini et al., 2007). Absence of *H. kleinpelli* and  
17 presence of *Heliolithus cantabriae* suggests Zone NP5 and an age range between  
18 59.02 Ma (older than Base *H. kleinpelli*) and 59.37 Ma (younger than Base *H.*  
19 *cantabriae*). Absence of *H. cantabriae* and presence of *F. tympaniformis* indicates an  
20 age range from 59.37 Ma (older than Base *H. cantabriae*) to 60.90 Ma (younger than  
21 Base *F. tympaniformis*). Preservation is too poor in lower Core 214-38 and Core 214-39  
22 to judge whether or not *F. tympaniformis* is present. However, rare specimens of  
23 *Fasciculithus* spp. were present, indicating a maximum age of 61.21 Ma (younger than  
24 Base *Fasciculithus* spp.).

25 Based on these data, Site 214 has a significant hiatus. Although the duration  
26 cannot be precisely determined (because of missing sediment), the hiatus probably  
27 represents time from 53.85 Ma to 58.33 Ma.

28 Biostratigraphic data used to provide age ranges of samples at Site 215 are as  
29 above in the NP10 through NP12 interval. The Paleocene/Eocene boundary is missing  
30 within a gap between Cores 215-11 and 215-12. In cores below, diverse and abundant

1 *Fasciculithus* spp. indicate an age older than 55.53 Ma. Absence of *E. robusta* indicates  
2 an age younger than than 56.66 Ma. Overlap in the ranges between *E. robusta* and  
3 *Discoaster multiradiatus* indicates a minimum age of 56.66 Ma (Top *E. robusta*) and a  
4 maximum age of 56.76 Ma (Base *D. multiradiatus*). Absence of *D. multiradiatus* and  
5 presence of *E. robusta* indicates a minimum age of 56.76 Ma (Base *D. multiradiatus*)  
6 and a maximum age of 57.04 Ma (Base *E. robusta*). These biostratigraphic data  
7 suggest the upper part of the combined Zone NP7/NP8. Absence of *E. robusta* and  
8 presence of *Discoaster mohleri* indicates a minimum age of 57.04 Ma (Base *E. robusta*)  
9 and a maximum age of 58.55 Ma (Base *D. mohleri*), within the lower part of combined  
10 Zone NP7/NP8.

11

#### 12 4.2 Carbonate content

13 Carbonate content measurements at Site 213 (**Table 5**) render a complex curve  
14 (**Fig. 7**). Values are <2% and average 1% from the top of section 13-1 through the  
15 bottom of section 14-4 (113.8–129.8 mcd). Starting near the top of section 14-5,  
16 carbonate contents increase significantly, reaching 73% by 132.8 mcd. A prominent low  
17 in carbonate content, where values drop to about 2% marks the top of Core 15 (134.5–  
18 135.5 mcd). Over the next 7.6 m, carbonate content generally increases, although with  
19 two short intervals of relatively low values, centered at 135.6 mcd and 139.5 mcd. From  
20 139.9 mcd to 149.3 mcd, carbonate content is generally high, ranging between 85 to  
21 91%. Importantly, moderate nannofossil preservation spans this interval of high  
22 carbonate content. The core-catcher of section 16 has very low carbonate content.

23 Carbonate content data at Site 214 (**Table 6**) also results in a complex profile  
24 (**Fig. 8**). Values are >91% and average 93% from the top of section 34-1 through the  
25 top of section 35-1 (314.6–324.5 mcd). Starting near the top of section 35-1, carbonate  
26 contents decrease slightly, reaching 85% by 329.6 mcd. A further decrease in  
27 carbonate contents spans the base of sections 35-4 and 35-cc, where values drop to  
28 74% at 330.7 mcd. Beginning at 336.1 mcd and for the next 34.7 m downcore,  
29 carbonate contents generally fluctuate between 4 and 65%, and average 37%.

30 Carbonate content measurements at Site 215 (**Table 7**) contrast with the other

1 two sites: except for a transition interval, they are either very low or very high,  
2 depending on paleo water depth (**Fig. 9**). Values are <3% and average 1% from the top  
3 of section 8-1 through the middle of section 9-3 (65.4–78.6 mcd). Starting in section 9-3,  
4 carbonate contents increase significantly reaching 93% by 87.9 mcd. Over the next 48.5  
5 m, carbonate content is universally high, ranging between 82 and 97%. As at Site 213,  
6 moderate nannofossil preservation spans the interval of particularly high carbonate  
7 content, although in general, carbonate content at Site 215 is higher than at Site 213.  
8 The lowest values within this interval are centered at 119.6 mcd.

9 Prior to our work, several analyses of carbonate content were conducted at these  
10 sites as part of DSDP Leg 22 operations (Pimm, 1974). Most samples from the two  
11 studies appear to be within 5% (**Figs. 7–9**), although a rigorous comparison cannot be  
12 made because of slight differences in depth between samples.

13

#### 14 *4.3 Carbon isotopes*

15 Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values at Site 213 (**Table 5**) have a complicated profile (**Fig.**  
16 **7**). Samples at the top of the studied section (113.8–130.1 mcd) have too little  
17 carbonate for reliable stable isotope analyses. From the top of section 14-5 through the  
18 base of section 14-6 (130.1–132.8 mcd), values range between 1.50 and 2.18‰ and  
19 average 1.87‰. A prominent low in bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ , with values reaching 1.17‰,  
20 marks the top of Core 15 (134.7–135.3 mcd). Over the next 3.8 m, bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
21 generally decreases, culminating in a pronounced low between 139.1 and 139.8 mcd.  
22 This is followed below by a general rise through the base of section 15-6. From 145.8 to  
23 149.5 mcd, bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  is generally high, but decreases gradually from 2.27 to  
24 2.02‰. This drop in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  intensifies through sections 16-4 and 16-cc, as also found by  
25 Ravizza et al. (2001), such that a prominent negative CIE of at least 1.4‰ exists.

26 Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values at Site 214 (**Table 6**) generally decrease with greater  
27 depth (**Fig. 8**). However, the low  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values measured in cores 36 through 39-3 are  
28 noteworthy, because they cannot represent primary pelagic carbonate. These samples  
29 accumulated during the middle Paleocene (as some contain *H. kleinpellii* or *H.*  
30 *cantabriae*), but clearly contrast with the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  composition of pelagic carbonate from this

1 time interval. The anomalous  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  may be consistent with neritic carbonate. Shallow  
2 marine carbonate exhibits a wide range in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  composition (cf. Swart and Eberli,  
3 2005), and can be significantly depleted in  $^{13}\text{C}$  when they precipitate in exchange with  
4 pore waters having a high contribution of  $\Sigma\text{CO}_2$  from organic carbon respiration  
5 (Patterson and Walter, 1994a, 1994b; Sanders, 2003). We have not investigated this  
6 possibility further, but the interval at Site 214 provides an interesting example of where  
7 carbon isotope stratigraphy does not work.

8 Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  measurements at Site 215 (**Table 7**) give a fairly  
9 straightforward curve (**Fig. 9**). As at Site 213, uppermost samples (65.4 to 78.6 mcd)  
10 contain too little carbonate to yield reliable bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values. Near the base of  
11 section 9-3, values range between 1.71 and 2.03‰. Values then drop to 1.08‰ at the  
12 top of section 10-1. Over the next 28.8 m, bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  generally rises, reaching  
13 ~3.5‰ in the base of section 12-6 (115.4 mcd). From 118.2 to 136.4 mcd, bulk  
14 carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  is generally high. Except for a few relatively slight drops in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ , one  
15 located within section 13-2, from 119.1–119.6 mcd, values exceed 3‰ in lower cores at  
16 Site 215.

17

#### 18 4.4 Oxygen isotopes

19 Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  measurements (**Tables 5–7**) yield records with noteworthy  
20 trends (**Figs. 7–9**). At Site 213, from the top of section 14-5 to the base of section 15-6,  
21 values vary between  $-2.5$  and  $-0.8\text{\textperthousand}$ . Below, bulk carbonate  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  rises slightly from  
22  $-1.2$  to  $-0.6\text{\textperthousand}$ , and then drops significantly, reaching  $-1.9\text{\textperthousand}$  at 157.7 mcd. At Site 214,  
23 values range between  $-1.5$  and  $0.1\text{\textperthousand}$ . There is a general decrease with depth through  
24 cores 34 and 35. In underlying sediment, bulk carbonate  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  increases to  $0.0\text{\textperthousand}$  in core  
25 37 and then decreases. At Site 215, values vary between  $-2.1$  and  $1.3\text{\textperthousand}$ . There is a  
26 slight overall increase in bulk carbonate  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  with increasing depth.

27

### 28 5 Discussion

#### 29 5.1 Overview

30 The reconstruction of a “paleo-CCD curve” for an ocean basin requires key

1 information from multiple sites (e.g., van Andel, 1975; Pälike et al., 2012). At a given  
2 site, these are: (1) the age of the sediment deposited, (2) the depth trajectory through  
3 time, and (3) the carbonate accumulation overlain upon this trajectory.

4

### 5 *5.2 Revised age models*

6 Our calcareous nannofossil biostratigraphic data provide internally consistent age  
7 constraints at all three sites and support the presence of core gaps. Although moderate  
8 to poor preservation impacts precise placement of key nannofossil datums (tops and  
9 bases of index species), depth horizons can be assigned age ranges (**Figs. 3–5**). Such  
10 age constraints are broadly compatible with previous literature concerning microfossils  
11 in Lower Paleogene sediment from these sites, as long as datums are placed on current  
12 time-scales (**Table 1**). This includes work on calcareous nannofossils (Gartner, 1974;  
13 Bukry, 1974; Tremolada and Bralower, 2004), as well as planktic foraminifera  
14 (McGowran, 1974; Berggren and Norris, 1997; Hovan and Rea, 1992).

15 Using biostratigraphic information presented here (**Figs. 3–5**), million-year  
16 sedimentation rates across carbonate-rich intervals at Sites 213 and 215 (the abyssal  
17 sites) averaged between 0.4 and 0.9 cm/kyr. Those at Site 214 (the shallow ridge crest  
18 location) may have approached 2 cm/kyr for intervals of the early Paleogene, but the  
19 overall record contains a major hiatus. We note that such calculated rates pertain to  
20 sediment that has been compacted, albeit minimally given the modest burial depth (and  
21 this lowers sedimentation rates relative to those at the seafloor); on the other hand,  
22 such rates pertain to an mcd depth scale (and this raises sedimentation rates relative to  
23 those at the seafloor). In any case, early Paleogene sedimentation in the region was  
24 very slow, particularly at Sites 213 and 215. Such rates are consistent with those at  
25 sites on the flanks of the east Pacific Rise during the early Paleogene (Leon-Rodriguez  
26 and Dickens, 2010).

27 The occurrence of *E. robusta* at Site 215 warrants brief discussion. This  
28 calcareous nannoplankton species existed for approximately 0.4 Myr (Agnini et al.,  
29 2007). Given long-term sedimentation at Site 215 (0.9 m/Myr), *E. robusta* should span  
30 about 3.6 m. According to our data, however, this nannofossil occurs over about 9.1

1 mcd (**Table 4**), which includes at least 3 m of missing section and a presumed 1 m gap  
2 between the bottom of core 13 and the top of core 14 (**Fig. 5**). We do not know if this  
3 signifies that core is missing from the top of core 13 (rather than the bottom), that the  
4 gap between cores is less than 1 m, that the interval had a high sedimentation rates, or  
5 some combination of these.

6 Characteristic features of early Paleogene  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  curves can be used for  
7 stratigraphic purposes (e.g., Shackleton, 1986; Slotnick et al., 2012). Although the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
8 records at Sites 213, 214 and 215 are not ideal, because of core gaps, drilling  
9 disturbance and hiatuses, key features can be identified. The prominent high in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
10 during the PCIM and the subsequent 5 Myr decrease in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  toward the EECO is found  
11 at Site 215. The  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  rise during and following the EECO is found at Site 214. At least  
12 two short-term CIEs can be found at Site 213. Indeed, once the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records at the  
13 three sites are spliced together in the time domain, and once intervals of missing  
14 sediment are accounted for, reasonable alignment with other marine  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records  
15 emerges (**Fig. 10**).

16

### 17 5.3 Site subsidence trajectories

18 The water depth of tholeiitic basalt formed at a mid-ocean ridge younger than 70  
19 Ma can be predicted using subsidence curves (Sclater et al., 1971; Berger, 1972; van  
20 Andel, 1975). For Sites 213 and 215, basalt emplacement clearly occurred at a ridge  
21 axis <70 Ma (most likely the SEIR), as also indicated by metalliferous ooze mixed with  
22 pelagic calcareous organisms in basal sediments (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974). A  
23 generic subsidence equation for such sites is (Parsons and Sclater, 1977):

$$24 z = z_{(o)} + C t^{1/2}, \quad [\text{Eq. 1}]$$

25 where  $z$  is the present meters below sea level (mbsl),  $z_{(o)}$  is depth of the ridge at initial  
26 time (mbsl),  $C$  is the subsidence rate ( $\text{m Myr}^{-1}$ ), and  $t$  is time since formation (Ma).  
27 Because porous sediment adds mass on top of the basalt but is about half the density, it  
28 should be accounted for (Rea and Lyle, 2005). A simple correction is (Berger, 1973;  
29 Rea and Lyle, 2005):

$$30 z = (z_{(o)} + C t^{1/2}) - 0.5 z_{(s)}, \quad [\text{Eq. 2}]$$

1 where  $z_{(s)}$  is the thickness of overlying sediment (m).

2 As noted for CCD reconstructions in the Eastern Pacific (Leon-Rodriguez and  
3 Dickens, 2010; Pälike et al., 2012), two problems exist in such depth reconstructions.  
4 First, water depths range significantly along the crest of modern mid-ocean ridges (e.g.,  
5 Cochran, 1986; Calcagno and Cazenave, 1994). For the crest of the modern SEIR, they  
6 range from 2500 to 3300 mbsl, and generally deepen to the southeast (Cochran, 1986;  
7 Mahoney et al., 2002). This range of “zero-age” depths probably reflects differences in  
8 mantle properties below the ridge crest, perhaps including a drop in upper mantle  
9 temperatures to the east (Cochran, 1986; Klein et al., 1991; Mahoney et al., 2002).  
10 Second, subsidence rates along mid-ocean ridges vary significantly (e.g., Cochran,  
11 1986; Calcagno and Cazenave, 1994). For the SEIR, they vary from 200–460 m Myr<sup>-1/2</sup>,  
12 with some of this variance related to the presence of fracture zones (Cochran, 1986).  
13 Together, these heterogeneities add uncertainty to subsidence curve estimates (Leon-  
14 Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010). It is important to recognize, though, that the maximum  
15 uncertainty in past depth generally occurs when the site is at or near the ridge crest,  
16 because subsidence decays exponentially over time (**Eq. 1**).

17 When discussing crustal subsidence in the southern Indian Ocean, Cochran  
18 (1986) noted a generally symmetric bathymetric profile along the SEIR between 90° and  
19 96°E latitude. He further suggested a subsidence rate of 363 m/Myr<sup>1/2</sup> for the north  
20 flank, which is comparable to the average for mid ocean ridges (Parsons and Sclater,  
21 1977). This information, along with an average ridge crest depth (2750 m), can be used  
22 as a starting point for Sites 213 and 215, such that:

$$z = (2750 + 363 t^{1/2}) - 0.5 z_{(s)} . \quad [\text{Eq. 3}]$$

23 If seafloor depths at Sites 213 and 215 adhered to **Equation 3**, they should now  
24 lie at 5391 mbsl (Site 213) and 5463 mbsl (Site 215). The predicted depths are close,  
25 but slightly off from actual depths (-210m, Site 213; +154m, Site 215). Previous work  
26 regarding subsidence at Sites 213 and 215 (van Andel, 1975) recognized this  
27 discrepancy, and thus gave different and deeper starting depths for Site 213 (~3300  
28 mbsl) and Site 215 (~3100 mbsl). These alternative “zero-age” depths imply slower  
29 subsidence rates, and ultimately deeper depth trajectories for both sites. There is no  
30

1 simple means to arrive at the correct depth trajectories over time, and different  
2 age/depth points along plausible curves should be taken as a reflection of uncertainty.  
3 For Sites 213 and 215, absolute depths for the early Paleogene may be off by 300–600  
4 m, depending on time since basalt emplacement. We do note, though, that at Sites 213  
5 and 215, inclusion of the thin sedimentary packages (~150 m) has minimal impact on  
6 the subsidence curve.

7 Site 214 on the crest of Ninetyeast Ridge has a much different depth trajectory  
8 than that at Sites 213 and 215. Aseismic ridges subside following the underlying plate  
9 as cooling and contraction progress, and at rates proportional to the square root of age  
10 (Detrick et al., 1977). However, if crustal age is significantly older than the hot spot  
11 (arbitrarily set at 3 Myr at Site 214), cooling and contraction already will have initiated,  
12 which should result in slower subsidence (Detrick et al., 1977). For Site 214, we set a  
13 starting “depth” at 50 m above sea level, a height broadly consistent with lignites and  
14 volcanics in lowermost cores, and neritic carbonate in subsequent cores. Thus,  
15 portions of Ninetyeast Ridge were once emergent volcanic islands, as inferred by others  
16 (Saunders et al., 1991; Frey et al., 1991; Carpenter et al., 2010). Using this starting  
17 height, we forced the subsidence (286 m/Myr<sup>1/2</sup>) so the location of Site 214 slowly sank  
18 to 600 mbsl by 48 Ma, and to 1655 mbsl at present-day.

19 The significant and unexpected hiatus we document at Site 214 might be  
20 explained in multiple ways. The location could have been in shallow water (<500 mbsl)  
21 between 58.33 and 53.85 Ma, and continually swept clean of sediment. Alternatively, it  
22 could represent a time of temporary uplift of underlying oceanic crust through  
23 compression (McKenzie and Sclater, 1971).

24

#### 25 *5.4 CCD reconstruction for the early Paleogene central Indian Ocean*

26 The above age constraints and subsidence models permit records of carbonate  
27 content to be placed over time and depth to reconstruct the CCD (**Fig. 10**). As noted  
28 previously, the carbonate records at Site 214 generally can be ignored for this exercise,  
29 because this site was always much shallower than the CCD. However, the carbonate  
30 records at Sites 213 and 215 provide important information.

1        High carbonate contents, typically exceeding 80%, characterize sediment over  
2 most of the lower portion of studied intervals at Site 213 and 215. For much of the late  
3 Paleocene and early Eocene, more specifically from 59 through 51 Ma, the CCD was  
4 significantly deeper than these locations. However, at both locations, carbonate  
5 contents dropped precipitously (to <5%) within calcareous nannofossil zone NP12. We  
6 suggest this transition from carbonate ooze to clay corresponds to a rapid rise in the  
7 CCD, which occurred between 52 and 50 Ma.

8        Moderate preservation of nannofossils spans most of the interval of high  
9 carbonate content at Sites 213 and 215. This observation suggests dissolution of  
10 microfossil assemblages, albeit relatively minor, and a seafloor location at or just below  
11 the lysocline. Such a setting would be expected along flanks of mid-ocean ridges, even  
12 in the earliest Eocene, as carbonate saturation horizons were probably shallower than  
13 at present-day (van Andel, 1975; Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010). Prior to the  
14 major drop in carbonate content and near the NP10/NP11 zonal boundary (i.e., about  
15 54 Ma), preservation of nannofossils becomes poor at both Sites 213 and 215 (**Tables**  
16 **5 and 7**). This suggests the sites were further below the lysocline, either through  
17 subsidence or the rising of carbonate saturation horizons.

18       The generally lower carbonate contents at Site 213 compared to those at Site  
19 215 requires explanation. This is because, with a standard crustal subsidence model,  
20 Site 213 should have been shallower than Site 215, especially during the early  
21 Paleogene (**Fig. 10**), and consequently should have better carbonate preservation. An  
22 obvious possibility is that crustal depths at time zero ( $z_{(0)}$ , **Eq. 1**) were significantly  
23 different, and Site 213 was deeper than Site 215 by several hundred meters (van Andel,  
24 1975). An intriguing alternative is that a very shallow Ninetyeast Ridge, as exemplified  
25 by the sediment record at Site 214, impeded east–west flow of water at intermediate to  
26 deep ocean depths. More specifically, the CCD may have been shallower east of  
27 Ninetyeast Ridge for much of the early Paleogene.

28       Five brief drops in carbonate content span the thick interval of high carbonate at  
29 Site 213 (**Fig. 7**). Based on nannofossil datums and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  measurements, these  
30 carbonate lows may correspond to known hyperthermal events. From bottom to top, the

1 first carbonate low (to 3%) occurs within NP9 and definitely marks the PETM  
2 (Tremolada and Bralower, 2004), although sometime after the initial onset. The next  
3 three lows (to 40%, 26%, 38%) follow near and above the NP11/12 Zonal boundary.  
4 These likely represent some combination of the H, I and J events, as the stratigraphic  
5 placement is approximately correct. However, it is difficult to make clear assignment  
6 because of major core disturbance. The uppermost carbonate low (to 2%) lies near the  
7 Bc of *D. lodoensis*, and may represent the K/X event. The K/X event occurs near the Bc  
8 of *D. lodoensis* at other locations (Agnini et al., 2007; Dickens and Backman, 2013).  
9 The potential problem here is that the interval lies at the top of a core, where sediment  
10 is often admixed with younger material.

11 The PETM and the K/X event (assuming correctly identified) at Site 213 warrant  
12 special attention, because carbonate contents drop close to zero. This suggests the  
13 CCD rose significantly during these hyperthermals, effectively passing above the depth  
14 of the location. High carbonate contents immediately after the PETM (i.e., the two  
15 samples at 149.55 and 149.98 mcd), further suggest a carbonate “overshoot”, where  
16 the CCD dropped to below that before massive carbon injection (e.g., Dickens et al.,  
17 1997; Kelly et al., 2012). A possible overshoot for the supposed K/X event would lie in a  
18 core gap. Presumably similar signals exist at Site 215, but were not recovered because  
19 of core gaps.

20

## 21 *5.5 Comparison to previous work*

22 The reconstructed late Paleocene-early Eocene CCD for the central Indian  
23 Ocean (**Fig. 10**) is broadly consistent with that determined at several sites in the eastern  
24 Indian Ocean (Hancock et al., 2007) and Equatorial Pacific Ocean (Leon-Rodriguez and  
25 Dickens, 2010; Pälike et al., 2012) (**Fig. 1**). In these works, the CCD was relatively deep  
26 in the latest Paleocene and earliest Eocene (~58 to 52 Ma) but shoaled considerably in  
27 the late early Eocene (~52 to 50 Ma). The magnitude of this shoaling remains poorly  
28 constrained, but probably exceeded several hundreds of meters. Importantly, at Sites  
29 213 and 215 and other locations, the time when the CCD was relatively deep coincided  
30 with the long-term early Paleogene drop in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (**Figs. 1 and 10**).

1 Previous reconstructions of the CCD (Berger, 1972; von der Borch and Sclater,  
2 1974; van Andel, 1975; Rea and Lyle, 2005) had this horizon relatively shallow and flat  
3 through the early Eocene. This may have resulted from poorly resolved stratigraphy at a  
4 few key sites, including Sites 213 and 215. Initial reports of Leg 22 sediment cores  
5 identified the early Eocene shift from calcareous ooze to clay, but suggested it  
6 happened at Site 215 about 3 Myr after it occurred at Site 213 (MacDougall, 1977;  
7 Peirce, 1978). This is not the case because the transition occurred within calcareous  
8 biozone NP12 at both sites (**Fig. 10**). The error seems to have led Gartner (p. 582,  
9 1974) to suggest a significant difference in starting ridge depth ( $z_{(o)}$ ) between the two  
10 sites and a stationary CCD across the early Eocene, an interpretation that subsequently  
11 became incorporated into early CCD curves (van Andel, 1975).

12 The reconstructed CCD records at Sites 213 and 215 are somewhat similar to  
13 that at Site 1215 in the Equatorial Pacific, which drilled into tholeitic basalt of 58 Ma  
14 age. At this location, the PETM and K/X event also are marked by particularly strong  
15 carbonate dissolution (Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010). Interestingly, at Site 1215,  
16 a good argument can be made for a long-term deepening of the lysocline beginning  
17 around 57 Ma: the site was subsiding rapidly but, excepting hyperthermal events, the  
18 preservation of foraminifera tests generally remains similar or improves for several Myr  
19 upcore (Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010). The available carbonate content and  
20 preservation records at Sites 213 and 215 neither support nor refute this concept. Site  
21 215 would be helpful in this regard, as the sedimentary record begins at 59 Ma.  
22 However, in this discontinuous record, it is not obvious the CCD or lysocline was  
23 particularly shallow at 58 Ma, nor that either horizon generally deepened between 58  
24 and 53 Ma. There is only a slight drop in carbonate content between 58 and 57 Ma  
25 (section 13-2).

26 Amongst existing Indian Ocean drill sites, at least nine contain early Paleogene  
27 sediment sequences (**Fig. 10**). None of these sequences were recovered with multiple  
28 drill holes, and are, therefore, discontinuous. Moreover, most of these sequences lack  
29 updated and revised stratigraphy, as well as sufficiently resolved carbonate content and  
30 stable isotope records. With available data, other locations in the Indian Ocean

1 generally support the CCD record presented here, but also highlight a lack of detail and  
2 poor depth constraints.

3

4 *5.6 Significance toward early Paleogene carbon cycling*

5 Although our latest CCD reconstruction for the Indian Ocean remains poorly  
6 constrained, the coupled carbonate content and bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records at Sites  
7 213 and 215 support basic ideas and modeling efforts regarding early Paleogene  
8 carbon cycling. In particular and over multiple time scales, the highs and lows in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
9 seemingly relate to changes in net fluxes of organic carbon to and from the exogenic  
10 carbon cycle (e.g., Shackleton, 1986; Dickens et al., 1997; Kurtz et al., 2003; Zeebe et  
11 al., 2009; Cui et al., 2011; Komar et al., 2013). Long-term intervals with higher  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
12 should correspond to less carbon in the ocean and atmosphere, and a shallower CCD;  
13 the opposite is also true. The CCD defined from records at Sites 213 and 215 generally  
14 tracks the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  of bulk carbonate, especially the rise in both records at  $\sim$ 52.5 Ma. The  
15 short-term CIEs are a different matter, as they represent massive injections of organic  
16 carbon, each which should result in a rapid rise in the CCD and lysocline, followed by  
17 overcompensation of these horizons. At Site 213, intense dissolution of carbonate  
18 occurs across the CIEs, especially the PETM and K/X.

19 Perhaps the two biggest issues currently confronting the scientific community in  
20 regards to early Paleogene carbon cycling are: what are the source or sources of  
21 organic carbon behind the long-term and short-term carbon cycle perturbations? Are the  
22 long-term and short-term perturbations somehow related? As emphasized by several  
23 authors, much can be explained if the shallow geosphere has a large and dynamic  
24 organic carbon capacitor (Dickens, 2003; Kurtz et al., 2003; Dickens, 2011; Komar et  
25 al., 2013). Effectively, some reservoir connected to the combined ocean–atmosphere–  
26 biosphere can store massive amounts of organic carbon over long time intervals, and  
27 can return this carbon over both long and short time scales. In theory, potential organic  
28 carbon sources can be distinguished with combined records of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and carbonate  
29 saturation horizons (e.g., Dickens et al., 1997; Zeebe et al., 2009; Cui et al., 2011;  
30 Komar et al., 2013), because the magnitude of changes in both parameters should

1 relate to variations in carbon mass fluxes.

2 Even with the additional records presented here, causes for early Paleogene  
3 carbon cycle perturbations remain open to interpretation. For example, our Indian  
4 Ocean CCD curve can be compared to simulated “long-term” early Paleogene CCD  
5 curves predicted for the Atlantic and Pacific oceans (Komar et al., 2013; **Fig. 11**), which  
6 presumably should straddle the response in the Indian Ocean. Whilst changes in the  
7 CCD curves have similar timing, they have different magnitudes, by several hundreds of  
8 meters. This suggests the overall carbon cycling framework is correct, but either that  
9 mass flux variations in the modeling are too small, or that depth constraints on CCD  
10 remain poorly characterized. Additional sites drilled on oceanic crust with ages between  
11 75 and 55 Ma are needed to resolve the problem.

12

### 13 *5.7 Recommendations for future drilling in the Indian Ocean*

14 The Indian Ocean is particularly relevant to studies of early Paleogene carbon  
15 cycling. This is because portions of three mid-ocean ridge segments and several  
16 aseismic ridges (e.g., Kerguelen Plateau, Ninetyeast Ridge, Broken Ridge, Chagos-  
17 Laccadive Ridge, Mascarene Plateau) are underlain by basalt of late Cretaceous or  
18 Paleocene age (i.e., 75 and 55 Ma). As such, there exist multiple locations where  
19 targeted drilling could recover depth or latitude transects of early Paleogene deep-sea  
20 sediment, and from which detailed carbonate accumulation records might be generated.

21 Cores examined in this study suggest that high-quality early Paleogene CCD  
22 records might be generated in the central Indian Ocean. Certainly, relatively thick lower  
23 Paleogene sediment sections exist, and microfossil, carbonate content and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
24 variations within these sequences can be correlated to other locations. Missing are sites  
25 with multiple drill holes where sediment recovery occurs through advanced piston coring  
26 (APC) techniques.

27 In the last 15 years or so, two drilling strategies have been employed in the  
28 Atlantic and Pacific oceans to reconstruct early Paleogene oceanographic conditions,  
29 including carbonate saturation horizons (Zachos et al., 2004; Pälike et al., 2010). The  
30 “Walvis Ridge strategy” drills a series of sites down the flank of an aseismic ridge to

1 obtain a depth transect (e.g., Zachos et al., 2004). This might be done on Ninetyeast  
2 Ridge, although ideally several hundred kilometers north of Site 214. The flanks of  
3 Ninetyeast Ridge in the vicinity of Site 214 have very little sediment (Veevers, 1974). By  
4 contrast, Site 216, also on the crest of Ninetyeast Ridge but 1550 km to the north, has a  
5 457 m thick sediment section that terminates into Maastrichtian basalt (Shipboard  
6 Scientific Party, 1974); the flanks of the ridge in this location also have moderately thick  
7 sediment sections (Veevers, 1974). (We note that sediment recovery was particularly  
8 poor at Site 216, so we omitted this location from our study and from **Figure 10**).

9 The “Pacific Equatorial Age Transect” (PEAT) strategy drills multiple locations at  
10 a nominally fixed position perpendicular to a ridge axis (Pälike et al., 2010). With this  
11 approach, specific short time slices can be recovered along ancient ridge flanks.  
12 Transects could be drilled parallel to Ninetyeast Ridge, which might include re-drilling of  
13 Sites 213 and 215, as well as targeting sediment sequences to the north, which should  
14 hold variably thick carbonate intervals above tholeiitic basalt emplaced during the late  
15 Cretaceous and Paleocene.

16

## 17 6 Summary and Conclusions

18 The early Paleogene was characterized by major changes in global carbon  
19 cycling as attested to by large amplitude variations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records of carbonate and  
20 organic carbon. A full understanding of these changes necessitates detailed records of  
21 contemporaneous carbonate accumulation on the seafloor. The early Paleogene CCD  
22 was poorly constrained prior to our work. Moreover,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records and carbonate  
23 accumulation records rarely have been coupled together over Myr time intervals. We  
24 have revised the stratigraphy and generated new carbonate content and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records at  
25 three sites in the central Indian Ocean – Sites 213, 214, and 215, in an effort to fill this  
26 knowledge gap.

27 A detailed early Paleogene CCD curve for the central Indian Ocean, while crucial  
28 to understanding carbon cycling during this time (Zeebe et al., 2009; Cui et al., 2011;  
29 Komar et al., 2013), cannot be generated with sedimentary records at available drill  
30 sites. This problem arises from several basic problems, as highlighted by the chosen

1 sites.

2 First, the tectonic history of the central Indian Ocean is complex and poorly  
3 constrained (Fisher and Sclater, 1983; Cande et al., 2010; Chatterjee et al., 2013).  
4 Reasonable estimates for initial depths and time trajectories can be derived for sites in  
5 the eastern Equatorial Pacific (Leon-Rodriguez and Dickens, 2010), the region from  
6 which the most detailed early Paleogene CCD records have emerged (Pälike et al.,  
7 2012). Such estimates are not so clear for Sites 213, 214 and 215 in the central Indian  
8 Ocean.

9 Second, outdated drilling techniques have left us with tantalizing cores of poor  
10 quality. The sediment material from available central Indian Ocean sites is suitable for  
11 generating detailed carbonate accumulation and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records. Although Site 214 is too  
12 shallow in the early Paleogene to provide constraints on carbonate saturation horizons,  
13 Sites 213 and 215 appear ideally located. However, only one hole was drilled at each  
14 site, and sediment coring occurred through rotary methods. Consequently, the  
15 recovered sections are incomplete and contain intervals with major sediment  
16 disturbance.

17 Third, new sites are needed to fully address the problem. Even if Sites 213 and  
18 215 were re-drilled with modern techniques, including APC, companion sites would  
19 have to be drilled to the north, where crustal ages are older. This is because the CCD  
20 likely shoaled in the middle to late Paleocene, and deepened in the late Paleocene to  
21 early Eocene.

22 Despite the above problems, the new records of carbonate content and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
23 generated at Sites 213 and 215 add to our understanding of early Paleogene carbon  
24 cycling. The highs and lows in carbonate content and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  appear related, and thus  
25 support ideas that major changes in net fluxes of organic carbon to and from the  
26 exogenic carbon cycle occurred during the early Paleogene.

27

28

1   ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

2   This study used samples and data provided by the International Ocean Discovery  
3   Program. We thank workers from the Kochi Core Repository in Nankoku, Kochi, Japan  
4   for all the time they put into sampling DSDP Leg 22 Sites on our behalf. We thank G.  
5   Snyder for overseeing and managing sample preparation in the geochemistry laboratory  
6   at Rice University, and A. van Dijk for helping with stable isotope analyses at Utrecht  
7   University. Two anonymous reviewers, Andrea Dutton, and Thorsten Kiefer provided  
8   constructive comments that greatly improved the quality of the manuscript. Funding for  
9   this work principally came from NSF-FESD-OCE-1338842 awarded to C. T. Lee, G. R.  
10   Dickens and colleagues, and a Vici grant of the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific  
11   Research (NWO) awarded to L. J. Lourens. A. Sluijs thanks the European Research  
12   Council for ERC starting grant #259627 and the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts  
13   and Sciences for a visiting professors grant for G. R. Dickens.

14

15   **References**

16   Agnini, C., Muttoni, G., Kent, D.V., and Rio, D.: Eocene biostratigraphy and magnetic  
17   stratigraphy from Possagno, Italy: The calcareous nannofossil response to climate  
18   variability, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 241, 815-830, 2006.

19

20   Agnini, C., Fornaciari, E., Raffi, I., Rio, D., Rohl, U., and Westerhold, T.: High-resolution  
21   nannofossil biochronology of middle Paleocene to early Eocene at ODP Site 1262:  
22   Implications for Calcareous nannoplankton evolution, *Marine Micropaleontology*, 64,  
23   215-248, 2007.

24

25   Berger, W.H.: Deep sea carbonates: Dissolution facies and age-Depth constancy,  
26   *Nature*, 236, 392-395, 1972.

27

28   Berger, W. H.: Cenozoic sedimentation in the eastern tropical Pacific, *Geological  
29   Society of America Bulletin*, 84, 1941–1954, 1973.

30

1 Berggren, W.A., and Norris, R.D.: Biostratigraphy, Phylogeny, and Systematics of  
2 Paleocene Trochospiral Planktic Foraminifera, New York, NY (Micropaleontology Press,  
3 American Museum of Natural History), i-ii, 1-116, 1997.

4

5 Berggren, W.A., and Pearson, P.N.: A revised tropical Paleogene planktonic  
6 foraminiferal zonation, *Journal of Foraminiferal Research*, 35, 279-298, 2005.

7

8 Boudreau, B.P., Middelburg, J.J., and Meysman, F.J.R.: Carbonate compensation  
9 dynamics, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37, L03603, 2010.

10

11 Broecker, W.S.: A need to improve reconstructions of the fluctuations in the calcite  
12 compensation depth over the course of the Cenozoic, *Paleoceanography*, 23, PA1 204,  
13 doi: 10.1029/2007PA001456, 2008.

14

15 Broecker, W. S., Peng, T.-H.: Tracers in the Sea, Eldigio, Palisades, N. Y, 1-690, 1982.

16

17 Bukry, D.: Coccolith and silicoflagellate stratigraphy, Eastern Indian Ocean, Deep Sea  
18 Drilling Project, Leg 22, in: Initial Reports DSDP Leg 22, edited by: von der Borch, C.C.,  
19 and Sclater, J.G., Washington (U.S. Government Printing Office), 601-607, 1974.

20

21 Calcagno, P., and Cazenave, A.: Subsidence of the seafloor in the Atlantic and Pacific  
22 Oceans: Regional and large-scale variations. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 126,  
23 473-492, 1994.

24

25 Cande, S.C., Patriat, P., and Dyment, J.: Motion between the Indian, Antarctic, and  
26 African plates in the early Cenozoic: *Geophysical Journal International*, 183, 127-149,  
27 2010.

28

1 Carpenter, R.J., Truswell, E.M., and Harris, W.K.: Lauraceae fossils from a volcanic  
2 Palaeocene oceanic island, Ninetyeast Ridge, Indian Ocean: ancient long-distance  
3 dispersal?, *Journal of Biogeography*, 37, 1202-1213, 2010.

4

5 Charles, A.J., Condon, D.J., Harding, I.C., Pälike, H., Marshall, J.E.A., Cui, Y., Kump,  
6 L., and Croudace, I.W.: Constraints on the numerical age of the Paleocene-Eocene  
7 boundary, *Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems*, 12/6, Q0AA17, 2011.

8

9 Chatterjee, S., Goswami, A., and Scotese, C.R.: The longest voyage: Tectonic,  
10 magmatic, and paleoclimatic evolution of the Indian plate during its northward flight from  
11 Gondwana to Asia, *Gondwana Research*, 23, 238-267, 2013.

12

13 Cochran, J.R.: Variations in subsidence rates along intermediate and fast spreading  
14 mid-ocean ridges, *Geophysical Journal of the Royal Astronomical Society*, 87, 421-454,  
15 1986.

16

17 Coplen, T.B., Brand, W.A., Gehre, M., Gröning, M., Meijer, H.A.J., Toman, B., and  
18 Verkouteren, M.: New Guidelines for  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  measurements, *Analytical Chemistry*, 78,  
19 2439-2441, 2006.

20

21 Cramer, B.S., Wright, J.D., Kent, D.V., and Aubry, M.-P.: Orbital climate forcing of d13C  
22 excursion in the late Paleocene-early Eocene (chrons C24n-C25n), *Paleoceanography*,  
23 18, 1097, doi: 10.1029/2003PA000909, 2003.

24

25 Cui, Y., Kump, L.R., Ridgwell, A.J., Charles, A.J., Junium, C.K., Diefendorf, A.F.,  
26 Freeman, K.H., Urban, N.M., and Harding, I.C.: Slow Release of fossil carbon during the  
27 Palaeocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, *Nature Geoscience*, 4, 481-485, 2011.

28

29 Detrick, R.S., Slater, J.G., and Thiede, J.: The subsidence of aseismic ridges, *Earth*  
30 and *Planetary Science Letters*, 34, 185-196, 1977.

1

2 Dickens, G.R.: Rethinking the global carbon cycle with a large, dynamic and microbially

3 mediated gas hydrate capacitor, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 213, 169-183,

4 2003.

5

6 Dickens, G.R.: Down the Rabbit Hole: toward appropriate discussion of methane

7 release from gas hydrate systems during the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum and

8 other past hyperthermal events, *Climate of the Past*, 7, 831-846, 2011.

9

10 Dickens, G.R., and Backman, J.: Core alignment and composite depth scale for the

11 lower Paleogene through uppermost Cretaceous interval at Deep Sea Drilling Project

12 Site 577, *Newsletters on Stratigraphy*, 46/1, 47-68, 2013.

13

14 Dickens, G.R., Castillo, M.M., and Walker, J.C.G.: A blast of gas in the latest

15 Paleocene: Simulating first-order effects of massive dissociation of oceanic methane

16 hydrate, *Geology*, 25, 259-262, 1997.

17

18 Dickens, G.R., O'Neil, J.R., Rea, D.K., and Owen, R.M.: Dissociation of oceanic

19 methane hydrate as a cause of the carbon isotope excursion at the end of the

20 Paleocene, *Paleoceanography*, 10, 965-971, 1995.

21

22 Expedition 329 Scientists: Site U1370, in: *Proc. of the IODP, Volume 329*, edited by:

23 D'Hondt, S., Inagaki, F., Alvarez Zarikian, C.A., and the Expedition 329 Scientists,

24 Tokyo (Integrated Ocean Drilling Program Management International, Inc.),

25 doi:10.2204/iodp.proc.329.108.2011, 2011.

26

27 Fisher, R.L., and Sclater, J.G.: Tectonic evolution of the Southwest Indian Ocean since

28 the Mid-Cretaceous: plate motions and stability of the pole of Antarctica/Africa for at

29 least 80 Myr, *Geophysical Journal of the Royal Astrological Society*, 73, 553-576, 1983.

30

1 Frey, F.A., Dickey, J.S., Jr., Thompson, G., and Bryan, W.B.: Eastern Indian Ocean  
2 DSDP sites: Correlations between petrography, geochemistry and tectonic setting, in: A  
3 synthesis of deep sea drilling in the Indian Ocean, edited by: Heirtzler, J.R., and Sclater,  
4 J.G., Washington, D.C., U.S. Government Printing Office, 189-257, 1977.  
5

6 Frey, F.A., Jones, W.B., Davies, H., and Weis, D.: Geochemical and petrologic data for  
7 basalts from Site 756, 757, and 758: implications for the origin and evolution of  
8 Ninetyeast Ridge, in: Proc. ODP Sci. Results, volume 121, edited by: Weis, J.,  
9 Peirce, J., Taylor, E., Alt, J., et al., College Station, TX (Ocean Drilling Program), 611–  
10 659, 1991.

11

12 Frey, F.A., Pringle, M., Meleney, P., Huang, S., and Piotrowski, A.: Diverse mantle  
13 sources for Ninetyeast Ridge magmatism: Geochemical constraints from basaltic  
14 glasses, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 303, 215-224, 2011.

15

16 Galeotti, S., Krishnan, S., Pagani, M., Lanci, L., Gaudio, A., Zachos, J.C., Monechi, S.,  
17 Morelli, G., and Lourens, L.: Orbital chronology of Early Eocene Hyperthermals from the  
18 Contessa Road Section, central Italy, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 290, 192–  
19 200, 2010.

20

21 Gartner, S.: Nannofossil biostratigraphy, Leg 22. Deep Sea Drilling Project, in: Initial  
22 Reports, DSDP Leg 22, edited by: von der Borch, C.C., and Sclater, J.G., Washington  
23 (U.S. Government Printing Office), 577-599, doi: 10.2973/dsdp.proc.22.126.1974, 1974.

24

25 Hagelberg, T., Shackleton, N., et al.: Development of Composite Depth Sections for  
26 Sites 844 through 854, in: *Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Initial Reports*, V.  
27 138, edited by: Mayer, L., Pisias, N., Janecek, T., et al., College Station, TX (Ocean  
28 Drilling Program), 79-85, 1992.

29

1 Hancock, H.J.L., Dickens, G.R., Thomas, E., and Blake, K.L.: Reappraisal of early  
2 Paleogene CCD curves: foraminiferal assemblages and stable carbon isotopes across  
3 the carbonate facies of Perth Abyssal Plain, *Int J Earth Sci (Geol Rundsch)*, 96, 925-  
4 946, 2007.

5

6 Hilgen, F.J., Kuiper, K.F., Lourens, L.J.: Evaluation of the astronomical time scale for  
7 the Paleocene and earliest Eocene, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 300, 139-151,  
8 2010.

9

10 Hovan, S.A., and Rea, D.K.: Paleocene/Eocene boundary changes in atmospheric and  
11 oceanic circulation: A Southern Hemisphere record, *Geology*, 20, 15-18, 1992.

12

13 Kelly, D.C., Nielsen, T.M.J., McCarren, H.K., Zachos, J.C., and Röhl, U.: Spatiotemporal  
14 patterns of carbonate sedimentation in the South Atlantic: Implications for carbon  
15 cycling during the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum, *Palaeogeography,  
16 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 293, 30-40, 2010.

17

18 Kelly, D.C., Nielsen, T.M.J., and Schellenberg. S.A.: Carbonate saturation dynamics  
19 during the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum: Bathyal constraints from ODP sites  
20 689 and 690 in the Weddell Sea (South Atlantic), *Marine Geology*, 303-306, 75-86,  
21 2012.

22

23 Kennett, J.P.: *Marine Geology*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ (Prentice-Hall, Inc.), 1-813, 1982.

24

25 Kennett, J.P., Stott, L.D.: Abrupt deep-sea warming, palaeoceanographic changes and  
26 benthic extinctions at the end of the Palaeocene, *Nature*, 353 (6341), 225-229.

27

28 Klein, E.M., Langmuir, C.H., and Staudigel, H.: Geochemistry of Basalts from the  
29 Southeast Indian Ridge, 115°E-138°E, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 96, 2089-  
30 2107, 1991.

1

2 Komar, N., Zeebe, R.E., and Dickens, G.R.: Understanding long-term carbon cycle

3 trends: The late Paleocene through the early Eocene, *Paleoceanography*, 28, 650-662,

4 2013.

5

6 Kump, L.R., Bralower, T.J., and Ridgwell, A.: Ocean acidification in deep time.

7 *Oceanography*, 22, 94-107, 2009.

8

9 Kurtz, A. C., Kump, L. R., Arthur, M. A., Zachos, J. C., and Paytan, A.: Early Cenozoic

10 decoupling of the global carbon and sulfur cycles, *Paleoceanography*, 18, 1090,

11 doi:10.1029/2003PA000908, 2003.

12

13 Leon-Rodriguez, L., and Dickens, G.R.: Constraints on ocean acidification associated

14 with rapid and massive carbon injections: The early Paleogene record at ocean drilling

15 program site 1215, equatorial Pacific Ocean, *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*

16 *Palaeoecology*, 298, 409-420, 2010.

17

18 Lisiecki, L.E., and Herbert, T.D.: Automated composite depth scale construction and

19 estimates of sediment core extension, *Paleoceanography*, 22, PA4213, doi:10.1029/

20 2006PA001401, 2007.

21

22 MacDougall, J.D.: Uranium in Marine Basalts: Concentration, Distribution and

23 Implications, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 35, 65-70, 1977.

24

25 Mahoney, J.J., Graham, D.W., Christie, D.M., Johnson, K.T.M., Hall, L.S., and

26 Vonderhaar, D.L.: Between a Hotspot and a Cold Spot: Isotopic Variation in the

27 Southeast Indian Ridge Asthenosphere, 86°E-118°E, *Journal of Petrology*, 43, 1155-

28 1176, 2002.

29

30 Martini, E.: Standard Tertiary and Quaternary calcareous nannoplankton zonation, in:

1 Proceedings of the 2<sup>nd</sup> International Conference of Planktonic Microfossils Roma, edited  
2 by: Farinacci, A., Rome (Ed. Tecnosci.), 2, 739-785, 1971.

3

4 McGowran, B.: Foraminifera, Leg 22. Deep Sea Drilling Project, in: Initial Reports,  
5 DSDP Leg 22, edited by: von der Borch, C.C., and Sclater, J.G., Washington (U.S.  
6 Government Printing Office), 577-599, 1974.

7

8 McKenzie, D., and Sclater, J.G.: The Evolution of the Indian Ocean since the Late  
9 Cretaceous, Geophysical Journal of the Royal Astronomical Society, 25, 437-528, 1971.

10

11 Nicolo, M. J., Dickens, G. R., Hollis, C.J., and Zachos, J.C.: Multiple early Eocene  
12 Hyperthermals: Their sedimentary expression on the New Zealand continental margin  
13 and in the deep sea, Geology, 35, 699-702; doi: 10.1130/G23648A.1, 2007.

14

15 Ocean Drilling Stratigraphic Network, Website: <http://www.odsn.de>, 2011.

16

17 Pälike, H., Lyle, M.W., Nishi, H., et al.: A Cenozoic record of the equatorial Pacific  
18 carbonate compensation depth, Nature, 488, 609-615, 2012.

19

20 Pälike, H., Nishi, H., Lyle, M., et al.: Expedition 320/321 summary, in: Proceedings of  
21 the Integrated Ocean Drilling Program, 320/321, edited by: Pälike, H., Lyle, M., Nishi,  
22 H., Raffi, I., Gamage, K., Klaus, A., and the Expedition 320/321 Scientists, Tokyo  
23 (Integrated Ocean Drilling Program Management International, Inc.), doi:  
24 10.2204/iodp.proc.320321.101.2010, 2010.

25

26 Parsons, B., and Sclater, J.G.: An Analysis of the Variation of Ocean Floor Bathymetry  
27 and Heat Flow with Age, Journal of Geophysical Research, 82, 803 – 827, 1977.

28

29 Patriat, P., and Achache, J.: India-Eurasia collision chronology has implications for  
30 crustal shortening and driving mechanisms of plates, Nature 311, 615-621, 1984.

1

2 Patterson, W.P., and Walter, L.M.: Syndepositional diagenesis of modern platform

3 carbonates: Evidence from isotopic and minor element data, *Geology*, 22, 127-130,

4 1994a.

5

6 Patterson, W.P., and Walter, L.M.: Depletion of  $^{13}\text{C}$  in seawater  $\Sigma\text{CO}_2$  on modern

7 carbonate platforms: Significance for the carbon isotopic record of carbonates, *Geology*,

8 22, 885-888, 1994b.

9

10 Peirce, J.W.: The northward motion of India since the Late Cretaceous, *Geophys. J. R.*

11 *astr. Soc.*, 52, 277-311, 1978.

12

13 Pimm, A.C.: Sedimentology and History of the Northeastern Indian Ocean from Late

14 Cretaceous to Recent, in: *Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project, Volume 22*,

15 edited by: von der Borch, C.C., Sclater, J.G., et al., Washington (U.S. Government

16 Printing Office), 119-191, 1974.

17

18 Ravizza, G., Norris, R.N., Blusztajn, J., and Aubry, M-P.: An osmium isotope excursion

19 associated with the late Paleocene thermal maximum: Evidence of intensified chemical

20 weathering, *Paleoceanography*, 16, 155-163, doi: 10.1029/2000PA000541, 2001.

21

22 Rea, D.K., and Lyle, M.W.: Paleogene calcite compensation depth in the eastern

23 subtropical Pacific: Answers and questions, *Paleoceanography*, 20, PA1012,

24 doi:10.1029/2004PA001064, 2005.

25

26 Ruddiman, W.F., Cameron, D., and Clement, B.M.: Sediment Disturbance and

27 Correlation of Offset Holes Drilled with the Hydraulic Piston Corer, Leg 94, in: *Initial*

28 *Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project Leg 94*, edited by: Ruddiman, W.F., Kidd, R.B.,

29 Thomas, E., et al., 1987, Washington (U.S. Government Printing Office), 1987.

30

1 Sanders, D.: Syndepositional dissolution of calcium carbonate in neritic carbonate  
2 environments: geological recognition, processes, potential significance, *Journal of*  
3 *African Earth Sciences*, 36, 99-134, 2003.

4

5 Saunders, A.D., Storey, M., Gibson, I.L., Leat, P., Herdt, J., and Thompson, R.N.:  
6 Chemical and Isotopic Constraints on the origin of basalts from Ninetyeast Ridge, Indian  
7 Ocean: Results from DSDP Legs 22 and 26 and ODP Leg 121, in: *Proceedings of the*  
8 *Ocean Drilling Program, Scientific Results, Volume 121*, edited by: Weissel, J., Peirce,  
9 J., Taylor, E., Alt, J., et al., College Station, TX (Ocean Drilling Program), 559-590,  
10 1991.

11

12 Sclater, J.G., Anderson, R.N., and Lee Bell, M.: Elevation of Ridges and Evolution of the  
13 Central Eastern Pacific, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 76, 7888- 7915, 1971.

14

15 Shackleton, N.J.: Paleogene Stable Isotope Events, *Palaeogeography,*  
16 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 57, 91-102, 1986.

17

18 Shackleton, N. J., Hall, M. A., and Bleil, U.: Carbon-isotope stratigraphy, site 577, in:  
19 *Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project, Volume 86*, edited by: Turner, K.L.,  
20 Washington (US. Government Printing Office), 503–511, 1985.

21

22 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 216, in: *Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project,*  
23 Volume 22, edited by: von der Borch, C.C., Sclater, J.G., et al., Washington (US.  
24 Government Printing Office), 213-265, 1974a.

25

26 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 236, in: *Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project,*  
27 Volume 24, edited by: Fisher, R.L., Bunce, E.T., et al., Washington (US. Government  
28 Printing Office), 327-389, 1974b.

29

30 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 245, in: *Initial Reports of the Deep Sea Drilling Project,*

1 Volume 25, edited by: Simpson, E.S.W., Schlich, R., et al., Washington (US.  
2 Government Printing Office), 187-236, 1974c.  
3  
4 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 756, in: ODP Init. Reps, 121, edited by: Peirce, J.,  
5 Weissel, J., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program, 259–303, 1989a.  
6  
7 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 757, in: Proc. ODP Init. Reps, 121, edited by: Peirce, J.,  
8 Weissel, J., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program, 305–358, 1989b.  
9  
10 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 758, in: Proc. ODP Init. Reps, 121, edited by: Peirce, J.,  
11 Weissel, J., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program, 359–453, 1989c.  
12  
13 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 766, in: Proc. ODP Init. Reps, 123, edited by: Gradstein,  
14 F.M., Ludden, J.N., Adamson A.C., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program,  
15 269–352, 1990.  
16  
17 Shipboard Scientific Party: Leg 179 summary, in: *Proc. ODP, Init. Reps.*, 179, edited by:  
18 Pettigrew, T.L., Casey, J.F., Miller, D.J., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling  
19 Program, 1–26, 1999.  
20  
21 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 1219, in: Proc. ODP Init. Reps, 199, edited by: Lyle, M.,  
22 Wilson, P.A., Janecek T.R., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program, 1–129,  
23 2002a.  
24  
25 Shipboard Scientific Party: Site 1220, in: Proc. ODP Init. Reps, 199, edited by: Lyle, M.,  
26 Wilson, P.A., Janecek T.R., et al., College Station, TX, Ocean Drilling Program, 1–93,  
27 2002b.  
28  
29 Slotnick, B.S., Dickens, G.R., Nicolo, M.J., Hollis, C.J., Crampton, J.S., and Zachos,  
30 J.C., Sluijs, A.: Numerous large amplitude variations in carbon cycling and terrestrial

1 weathering throughout the latest Paleocene and earliest Eocene, *The Journal of*  
2 *Geology*, 120, 487-505, 2012.

3

4 Sluijs, A., Bowen, G., Brinkhuis, H., Lourens, L. J., and Thomas, E.: The Palaeocene-  
5 Eocene Thermal Maximum super greenhouse: biotic and geochemical signatures, age  
6 models and mechanisms of global change, in: *Deep-Time Perspectives on Climate*  
7 *Change: Marrying the Signal from Computer Models and Biological Proxies*, edited by:  
8 Williams, M., Haywood, A.M., Gregory, J., and Schmidt, D.N., *The Micropaleontological*  
9 *Society, Special Publications*, London, 323–349, 2007.

10

11 Stap, L., Lourens, L.J., Thomas, E., Sluijs, A., Bohaty, S., and Zachos, J.C.: High  
12 resolution deep-sea carbon and oxygen isotope records of Eocene Thermal Maximum 2  
13 and H2, *Geology*, 38, 607-610, 2010.

14

15 Stap, L., Sluijs, A., Thomas, E., and Lourens, L.: Patterns and magnitude of deep sea  
16 carbonate dissolution during Eocene Thermal Maximum 2 and H2, *Walvis Ridge*,  
17 southeastern Atlantic Ocean, *Paleoceanography*, 24, PA1211, doi:  
18 10.1029/2008PA001655, 2009.

19

20 Storms, M.A.: Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Deep Sea Coring Techniques, *Marine*  
21 *Geophysical Researches*, 12, 109-130, 1990.

22

23 Swart, P.K., and Eberli, G.: The nature of the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  of periplatform sediments:  
24 Implications for stratigraphy and the global carbon cycle, *Sedimentary Geology*, 175,  
25 115-129, 2005.

26

27 Tremolada, R., and Bralower, T.J.: Nannofossil assemblage fluctuations during the  
28 Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum at Sites 213 (Indian Ocean) and 401 (North  
29 Atlantic Ocean): palaeoceanographic implications, *Marine Micropaleontology*, 52, 107-  
30 116, 2004.

1  
2 van Andel, T.H.: Mesozoic/Cenozoic Calcite Compensation Depth and the global  
3 distribution of calcareous sediments, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 26, 187-194,  
4 1975.  
5  
6 Vandenberghe, N., Hilgen, F.J., Speijer, R.P.: The Paleogene Period, in: *The Geologic*  
7 *Time Scale 2012*, Gradstein, F., Ogg, J., Schmitz, M., Ogg, G., Amsterdam, The  
8 *Netherlands* (Elsevier BV), 855-922, 2012.  
9  
10 Veevers, J.J.: 10. Seismic profiles made underway on Leg 22, in: *Initial Reports, DSDP*  
11 *Leg 22*, edited by: von der Borch, C.C., and Sclater, J.G., Washington (U.S.  
12 *Government Printing Office*), 351-367, 1974.  
13  
14 von der Borch, C.C., and Sclater, J.G.: *Initial Reports, DSDP Leg 22*, Washington (U.S.  
15 *Government Printing Office*), 1-599. doi: 10.2973/dsdp.proc.22.126.1974, 1974.  
16  
17 Westerhold, T., and Röhl, U.: High resolution cyclostratigraphy of the early Eocene –  
18 new insights into the origin of the Cenozoic cooling trend, *Climate of the Past*, 5, 309-  
19 327, 2009.  
20  
21 Westerhold, T., Röhl, U., Raffi, I., Fornaciari, E., Monechi, S., Reale, V., Bowles, J., and  
22 Evans, H.F.: Astronomical calibration of the Paleocene time, *Palaeogeography,*  
23 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 257, 377-403, 2008.  
24  
25 Zachos, J.C., Kroon, D., Blum, P., Bowles, J., Gaillot, P., Hasegawa, T., Hathorne,  
26 E.C., et al.: *Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Initial Reports, Volume 208*,  
27 doi: 10.2973/odp.proc.ir.208.2004, 2004.  
28  
29 Zachos, J.C., McCarren, H., Murphy, B., Röhl, U., and Westerhold, T.: Tempo and scale  
30 of late Paleocene and early Eocene carbon isotope cycles: Implications for the origin of

1 hyperthermals, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 299, 242-249, doi:  
2 10.1016/j.epsl.2010.09.004, 2010.

3

4 Zachos, J. C., Pagani, M., Sloan, L., Thomas, E., and Billups, K.: Trends, rhythms, and  
5 aberrations in global climate 65 Ma to present, *Science*, 292, 686–693,  
6 doi:10.1126/science.1059412, 2001.

7

8 Zachos, J.C., Rea, D.K., Seto, K., Nomura, R., and Niitsuma, N.: Paleogene and Early  
9 Neogene Deep Water Paleoceanography of the Indian Ocean as Determined from  
10 Benthic Foraminifer Stable Carbon and Oxygen Isotope Records, *Geophysical*  
11 *Monograph Series*, 70, 351-385, 1992.

12

13 Zachos, J.C., Röhl, U., Schellenberg, S.A., Sluijs, A., Hodell, D.A., Kelly, D.C., Thomas,  
14 E., Nicolo, M., Raffi, I., Lourens, L.J., McCarren, H., and Kroon, D.: Rapid Acidification  
15 of the Ocean During the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, *Science*, 208, 1611-  
16 1615, 2005.

17

18 Zeebe, R.E., and Westbroek, P.: A simple model for the  $\text{CaCO}_3$  saturation state of the  
19 ocean: The “Strangelove,” the “Neritan,” and the “Cretan” Ocean, *Geochemistry*  
20 *Geophysics Geosystems*, 4, 1104, doi:10.1029/2003GC000538, 2003.

21

22 Zeebe, R.E., Zachos, J.C., and Dickens, G.R.: Carbon dioxide forcing along insufficient  
23 to explain Palaeocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum warming, *Nature Geoscience*, 2, 576-  
24 580. doi: 10.1038/NGE0578, 2009.

25

26

1 Figure Captions

2 Figure 1. Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records and calcareous intervals for several locations

3 placed onto a current time scale (Option 1, Westerhold et al., 2008). Stable isotope

4 records include those at DSDP Site 577 (North Pacific, Shackleton et al., 1985), ODP

5 Site 1262 (Central Atlantic, Zachos et al., 2010) and Mead Stream (South Pacific,

6 Slotnick et al., 2012). The subsidence curve for Site 259 (East Indian, blue) was

7 adapted from (van Andel, 1975), while subsidence curves for Sites 1215, U1370,

8 U1331, 1219, and 1220 (Equatorial Pacific, purple) were adapted from various sources

9 (Rea and Lyle, 2005; Leon-Rodriguez et al., 2010; Pälike et al., 2010). Plotted curves,

10 when solid, indicate carbonate contents  $>10\%$ , but when dashed, indicate carbonate

11 contents  $<10\%$ . Importantly, curves are lightly dotted when no data is available (such as

12 for much of the early Eocene at Sites 1219 and 1220, as noted by Hancock et al.,

13 2007). Dark brown solid line denotes reconstructed and predicted CCD, consistent with

14 carbonate content data and subsidence curves of sites from previous studies. The

15 biozonal scheme adopted is that of Martini (1971). Blue and red triangles represent

16 base and top occurrences of key calcareous nannofossils. Ages of calcareous

17 nannofossil biohorizons are those proposed by Agnini et al. (2006, 2007) recalibrated

18 using Option 1 of Westerhold et al. (2008). Hyperthermals, including PETM, H, I, and

19 K/X, and longer-duration intervals (PCIM and EECO) derived from  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records.

20

21 Figure 2. Modern bathymetric map of the northeast Indian Ocean. Locations of Sites

22 213, 214, 215 labeled by boxes of various green shades. Five additional site locations

23 are denoted in blue boxes along the western and northwest Australian margin (DSDP

24 Site 259 – Hancock et al., 2007; ODP Site 766 – Shipboard Scientific Party, 1990), and

25 Ninetyeast Ridge (ODP Sites 756 and 757 – Shipboard Scientific Party, 1989a, 1989b;

26 ODP Site 1107 – Shipboard Scientific Party, 1999). Ages marked along Ninetyeast

27 Ridge derived from Frey et al. (2011). All ages marked by yellow-greenish numbers

28 follow a Myr time scale. The open white rectangle indicates the specific area of focus.

29

30 Figure 3. The depths of key nannofossil datums (bases – blue triangles, tops – red

1 triangles) identified at Site 213. To and DI indicate presence of both *T. orthostylus* and  
2 *D. lodoensis*. DI and Sr indicate absence of *D. lodoensis* and presence of *S. radians*. To  
3 and Dd indicate presence both of *T. orthostylus* and *D. diastypus*. Three samples  
4 marked Ft and Zb shows presence of both *F. tympaniformis* and *Z. bijugatus*, and  
5 dominance in abundance of *Z. bijugatus* over *F. tympaniformis*. Dm and Er indicate  
6 absence of *D. multiradiatus* and presence of *E. robusta*, according to Gartner (1974);  
7 data derived from sediment coated on basalt. Age estimates from Agnini et al. (2006,  
8 2007) and calcareous nannofossil NP biozones from Martini (1971). Solid, black,  
9 vertical lines denote precisely known NP biozone boundaries but dashed if boundary  
10 not precisely known. Lithological facies key of core sections examined in this study  
11 located at top of figure.

12

13 Figure 4. The depths of key nannofossil datums (bases – blue triangles, tops – red  
14 triangles) identified at Site 214. To and DI indicate presence of both *T. orthostylus* and  
15 *D. lodoensis*. DI and Sr indicate absence of *D. lodoensis* and presence of *S. radians*. Hk  
16 indicates presence of *H. kleinpellii*. Hk and Hc indicate absence of *H. kleinpellii* and  
17 presence of *H. cantabriae*. Hc and Ft indicate absence of *H. cantabriae* and presence of  
18 *F. tympaniformis*. Hc and F indicate absence of *H. cantabriae* and presence of  
19 *Fasciculithus* spp. (poor preservation only permit recognition at the genus level). Age  
20 estimates from Agnini et al. (2006, 2007) and calcareous nannofossil NP biozones from  
21 Martini (1971). Solid, black, vertical lines denote precisely known NP biozone  
22 boundaries but dashed if boundary not precisely known. Note lithological facies key in  
23 Figure 3.

24

25 Figure 5. The depths of key nannofossil datums (bases – blue triangles, tops – red  
26 triangles) identified at Site 215. To and DI indicate presence of both *T. orthostylus* and  
27 *D. lodoensis*. DI and Sr indicate absence of *D. lodoensis* and presence of *S. radians*. Tc  
28 and Dd indicate presence of both *T. contortus* and *D. diastypus*. Dd and Ft indicate  
29 absence of *D. diastypus* and presence of few to rare *F. tympaniformis*. The two samples  
30 marked Ft and Zb indicates presence of both *F. tympaniformis* and *Z. bijugatus*, and

1 dominance in abundance of *Z. bijugatus* over *F. tympaniformis*. The four samples  
2 marked F and Er shows presence of diverse and abundant *Fasciculithus* spp. and  
3 absence of *E. robusta*. Er and Dm indicate presence of both *E. robusta* and *D.*  
4 *multiradiatus*. Dm and Er indicate absence of *D. multiradiatus* and presence of *E.*  
5 *robusta*. The five samples marked Er and Dmo indicate absence of *E. robusta* and  
6 presence of *D. mohleri*. Age estimates from Agnini et al. (2006, 2007) and calcareous  
7 nannofossil NP biozones from Martini (1971). Solid, black, vertical lines denote  
8 precisely known NP biozone boundaries but dashed if boundary not precisely known.  
9 Note lithological facies key in Figure 3.

10

11 Figure 6. Core photos of disturbed sediment intervals recovered at each of the sites  
12 examined. When drilled in 1972, the sites were cored using rotary methods. As a result,  
13 there is considerable drilling disturbance over certain intervals.

14

15 Figure 7. Early Paleogene sequences at DSDP Site 213. Biostratigraphy and lithology  
16 have been modified from the DSDP Leg 22 volume (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974).  
17 Core photos are sourced from the online database ([www.iodp.org](http://www.iodp.org)). Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$   
18 and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  records near the base of Core 16 include data from previous work spanning  
19 the PETM recovery (grey – Ravizza et al., 2001). Carbonate content records include  
20 data from previous work (grey – Pimm, 1974). Consistent with the K/X-event occurring  
21 near the NP11/NP12 zonal boundary (Agnini et al., 2007), the H, J, and onset of K/X  
22 events occur in Core 15 sections 15-4, 15-3, and 15-1, respectively. The H and I events  
23 may have been mixed together since rotary coring was used for core collection. The  
24 upper portion of core 15 and all of core 14 likely spans the EECO, as indicated by  
25 depleted  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and key zonal boundaries. Calcareous nannofossil NP biozones from  
26 Martini (1971) and foraminiferal P biozones from Berggren et al. (1995). Note  
27 lithological facies key in Figure 3.

28

29 Figure 8. Early Paleogene sequences at DSDP Site 214. Biostratigraphy and lithology  
30 have been modified from the DSDP Leg 22 volume (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974).

1 Core photos are sourced from the online database ([www.iodp.org](http://www.iodp.org)). Carbonate content  
2 records include data from previous work (grey – Pimm, 1974). Numerous  
3 hyperthermals, including the PETM, H events, I events, and K/X, are missing in the  
4 hiatus in the core gap between cores 36-35. It is possible that the uppermost recovery  
5 interval of the K/X-event spans the base of core 35 where already elevated carbonate  
6 contents increase slightly. Calcareous nannofossil NP biozones from Martini (1971) and  
7 foraminiferal P biozones from Berggren et al. (1995). Note lithological facies key in  
8 Figure 3.

9

10 Figure 9. Early Paleogene sequences at DSDP Site 215. Biostratigraphy and lithology  
11 have been modified from the DSDP Leg 22 volume (von der Borch and Sclater, 1974).  
12 Core photos are sourced from the online database ([www.iodp.org](http://www.iodp.org)). Carbonate content  
13 records include data from previous work (grey – Pimm, 1974). Enriched  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  
14 biozonations enabled the identification of the PCIM in cores 14-13. Calcareous  
15 nannofossil NP biozones from Martini (1971) and foraminiferal P biozones from  
16 Berggren et al. (1995). The PETM is in the core gap between cores 12-11, consistent  
17 with the presence of the P5 foraminiferal biozone. The H events are either in the core  
18 gap between cores 11-10 or represented by  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  drop from 88.787-88.29 mcd. The  
19 NP11, and NP12 biozones and depleted  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  enabled the EECO identification in upper  
20 portion of core 10. The K/X event is in the core gap between cores 10-9. Note  
21 lithological facies key in Figure 3.

22

23 Figure 10. Bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  records and calcareous intervals for several locations  
24 placed onto a current time scale (Option 1, Westerhold et al., 2008). Stable isotope  
25 records include those at DSDP Site 577 (North Pacific, Shackleton et al., 1985), ODP  
26 Site 1262 (Central Atlantic, Zachos et al., 2010) and Mead Stream (South Pacific,  
27 Slotnick et al., 2012). Subsidence curves for Sites 213 and 215 (various shades of  
28 green) and for Sites 236, 245, and 766 (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1974b; Shipboard  
29 Scientific Party, 1974c; Shipboard Scientific Party, 1990, light blue) were calculated  
30 using a slightly modified version of the mid-ocean ridge subsidence curve from Rea and

1 Lyle (2005). Subsidence curves for Site 214 (green) and for Sites 216 and 758  
2 (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1974a; Shipboard Scientific Party, 1989c, light blue) follow  
3 established guidelines for aseismic ridges (Detrick et al., 1977). Plotted curves, when  
4 solid, indicate carbonate contents >10%, but when dashed, indicate carbonate contents  
5 <10%. Importantly, curves are lightly dotted when no data is available. Dark brown solid  
6 line denotes reconstructed CCD following new carbonate content data. The biozonal  
7 scheme adopted is that of Martini (1971). Ages of calcareous nannofossil biohorizons  
8 are those proposed by Agnini et al. (2006, 2007) recalibrated using Option 1 of  
9 Westerhold et al. (2008).

10

11 Figure 11. Comparison of data-derived-CCD changes (brown; this study) to modeled  
12 CCD changes predicted for the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans (green, purple, blue, and  
13 red) from 62–48 Ma (Komar et al., 2013). Records and models indicate a long-term (>1  
14 Myr) CCD deepening from 58–52 Ma separated two intervals of CCD shoaling from 62–  
15 58 Ma and 52–48 Ma. CCD curves have different magnitudes, by several hundreds of  
16 meters, suggesting the overall carbon cycling framework is correct but with a major  
17 caveat; either mass flux variations in the modeling are too small, or CCD depth  
18 constraints require additional characterization.