# Enhanced 20<sup>th</sup> century heat transfer to the Arctic simulated in the context of climate variations over the last millennium

3

## 4 J.H. Jungclaus, K. Lohmann, and D. Zanchettin

- 5
- 6 {Max Planck Institut für Meteorologie, Hamburg, Germany}
- 7
- 8 Correspondence to: J. H. Jungclaus (johann.jungclaus@mpimet.mpg.de)
- 9
- 10

#### 11 Abstract

12 Oceanic heat transport variations, carried by the northward flowing Atlantic Water, strongly influence Arctic sea-ice distribution, ocean-atmosphere exchanges, and pan-Arctic temperatures. 13 14 Paleoceanographic reconstructions from marine sediments near Fram Strait have documented a dramatic increase in Atlantic Water temperatures over the 20<sup>th</sup> century, unprecedented in the last 15 16 millennium. Here we present results from Earth system model simulations that reproduce and explain the reconstructed exceptional Atlantic Water warming in Fram Strait in the 20<sup>th</sup> century in 17 18 the context of natural variability during the last millennium. The associated increase in ocean heat 19 transfer to the Arctic can be traced back to changes in the ocean circulation in the sub-polar North Atlantic. An interplay between a weakening overturning circulation and a strengthening sub-polar 20 gyre as a consequence of 20<sup>th</sup> century global warming is identified as driving mechanism for the 21 22 pronounced warming along the Atlantic Water path toward the Arctic. Simulations covering the late 23 Holocene provide a reference frame that allows us to conclude that the changes during the last 24 century are unprecedented in the last 1150 years and that they cannot be explained by internal 25 variability or natural forcing alone.

#### 27 **1 Introduction**

28 The Arctic is one of the regions where climate change has been diagnosed most drastically in terms 29 of warming and sea-ice decline over the last decades. Direct temperature measurements are, 30 however, scarce and only available for the last century. Reliable observations of sea-ice evolution are 31 even more limited, covering only the satellite era. On decadal timescales, internal variations can 32 substantially contribute to Arctic climate variability (Bengtsson et al., 2004; Beitsch et al., 2014) and 33 the relative role of external drivers is still under debate (Booth et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2013). High-34 resolution reconstructions of paleoclimatic variables over the late Holocene provide a reference 35 frame and put recent changes in context with long-term natural variations. Ongoing efforts, such as 36 the Past Global Changes 2K network (PAGES2K, Ahmed et al. 2013) initiative, provide regional 37 syntheses of reconstructions that can be compared with model simulations. While most of the PAGES2K reconstructions rely on terrestrial proxies, high-quality marine paleodata become 38 39 increasingly available at annual to decadal resolution. Novel proxies have been developed to 40 reconstruct, for example, dynamical quantities such as near-bottom flow strength in the Nordic Seas 41 overflow regions (e.g., Mjell et al. 2014). Of particular value are reconstructions from key locations, 42 such as major conduits of the large-scale ocean circulation. Spielhagen et al. (2011) and Dylmer et al. 43 (2013) have published records from marine sediments off Svalbard that reflect temperature changes in the Atlantic Water (AW) in Fram Strait over the last 2000-3000 years. The time series show 44 centennial-scale modulations of the AW temperatures and, as a pronounced common feature, a 45 dramatic, unprecedented warming over the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The authors speculate that the observed 46 47 warming reflect considerable changes in the lateral heat transfer to the Arctic that might have contributed to the rapid warming and sea-ice decrease during the 20<sup>th</sup> century. 48

Earth system model simulations over the last millennium provide a tool to test such hypotheses, and to investigate the relative role of internal variability on the one hand, and natural and anthropogenic forcing on the other hand. Provided that the model adequately simulates regional-scale features, simulations also allow for attributing locally observed variations to changes in large-scale dynamics.

- 3 -

53 In general, the model results have to be confronted with observations and reconstructions to assess in how far they reproduce the real climate evolution, both in direct comparison (e.g., Fernandez-54 Donado et al. 2012) and in a statistical sense (Bothe et al., 2013). In this paper, we use the results of 55 Max Planck Institute Earth System Model (MPI-ESM) simulations for the last millennium and the 56 57 industrial period to address the following research questions:

58 1. Can the simulations reproduce important features of reconstructed climate indicators in high northern latitudes during the last millennium and in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, both on a continental 59 and local scale? 60

2. How exceptional is the observed 20<sup>th</sup> century AW warming in Fram Strait in the context of 61 the climate evolution during the last millennium, and what implications does it have for the 62 heat transfer to the Arctic? 63

3. What are the mechanisms behind the observed and reconstructed changes? 64

Regarding the latter, we concentrate in this paper on the 20<sup>th</sup> century changes in high northern 65 66 latitudes and the North Atlantic and devote a subsequent study to pre-industrial variations and their 67 relation to external forcing. The paper is organized as follows. In section 2, we describe the MPI-ESM 68 model set-up and the boundary conditions applied for the simulations covering the last millennium. Results for integrated high-northern latitude changes and the evolution of the Atlantic Water 69 70 transfer from the North Atlantic to the Arctic are given in section 3. In section 4, we formulate a dynamical interpretation of the results and discuss implications for 20<sup>th</sup> century climate change in the 71 72 North Atlantic realm in section 5. Main conclusions are given in section 6.

73

#### 74 2. The Model system and the experimental design of the last millennium simulations

75 The model employed in this study is the Max Planck Institute Earth System Model (MPI-ESM). MPI-76 ESM and its various configurations contributing to the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project, phase 5 (CMIP5), have been documented in a special issue of the Journal for Advances in Modeling 77 78 Earth Systems (JAMES). The configuration for Paleo applications (MPI-ESM-P) used here is identical

- 4 -

79 with the MPI-ESM-LR configuration described in the JAMES publications by Giorgetta et al. (2013) and Jungclaus et al. (2013) with two exceptions: First, the dynamic vegetation module is switched off 80 in order to allow for the implementation of land-cover change maps (Pongratz et al. 2008) as in the 81 82 earlier, lower-resolution model version described by Jungclaus et al. (2010). Second, the orbital 83 forcing is prescribed by a table providing annual values for eccentricity, obliquity and perihelion, 84 whereas the LR version uses a calendar-based orbit. The atmosphere model ECHAM6 (Stevens et al. 85 2013) is run at a horizontal resolution of spectral truncation T63 (1.875°) and 47 vertical levels, 86 resolving the stratosphere up to 0.01 hPa. The ocean/sea-ice model MPIOM (Marsland et al. 2003; 87 Jungclaus et al. 2013) features a conformal mapping grid with nominal 1.5° resolution and 40 vertical 88 levels (GR1.5L40). It is noteworthy for our study that the GR1.5L40 grid possesses one grid pole over 89 Antarctica and one grid pole over Greenland, which leads to considerably higher resolution in the 90 regions of interest for this study, i.e. the northern North Atlantic (Jungclaus et al. 2008). In Fram 91 Strait, for example, the grid size in cross-channel direction is about 30-40 km. The simulations over 92 the last millennium (past1000) follow the protocol of the Paleo Modeling Intercomparison Project, 93 phase 3 (PMIP3). As part of this protocol, Schmidt et al. (2011) summarize different choices for external forcing and boundary conditions and provide tables for well mixed-greenhouse gases (CO<sub>2</sub>, 94 95 CH<sub>4</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O), and orbital parameters. In contrast to the millennium simulations described in Jungclaus 96 et al. (2010), which featured an interactive carbon-cycle and prognostic CO<sub>2</sub>, we use prescribed CO<sub>2</sub> 97 in the past1000 runs analyzed here. We employed the Crowley and Unterman (2013) reconstruction 98 for volcanic aerosol optical depth and effective radius and the Pongratz et al. (2008) reconstruction 99 of global land-cover and agricultural areas. For solar radiation we have followed the approach 100 described in Schmidt et al. (2011) combining the Vieira et al. (2011) total solar irradiance (TSI) reconstruction over the Holocene with the Wang et al. (2005) data set that provides the 101 recommended solar forcing for the CMIP5 20<sup>th</sup> century (1850 – 2005) simulations. An artificial 11-yr 102 103 cycle of varying amplitude is imposed over the pre-industrial period (see Schmidt et al., 2011 for 104 details). Linear interpolation was used to calculate monthly TSI averages from the reconstructed

- 5 -

105 annual TSI values for the period 850-1849 scaled to Total Irradiance Monitor (TIM) data, except for 106 the flux at 180.5 nm. Spectral Solar Irradiance (SSI) for the 14 short-wave spectral bands of the 107 ECHAM6's radiation scheme was calculated so that the sum of SSI yields TSI. Energy in the part of the 108 spectrum below the shortest wavelength of the radiation scheme (200nm) and above the longest 109 (12195.1 nm) was added to the first and last band, respectively. Monthly average ozone 110 concentrations for the period 850-1849 are calculated using the 1850-1860 monthly climatology of 111 ozone concentrations from the AC&C/SPARC Ozone Database as a basis and representing the ozone 112 dependency on solar irradiance through regression coefficients between historical ozone 113 concentrations and the annual 180.5 nm solar flux. An 1155 year-long pre-industrial control 114 integration (PiCtrl) under fixed 1850 boundary conditions serves as a reference simulation for forced 115 experiments. To conduct the past1000 simulations we first ran a 400 year-long adaptation simulation 116 starting from the end of piCtrl to adjust to 850 boundary conditions and thereafter started the three 117 realizations past1000-r1, past1000-r2, and past1000-r3. The past1000-r1 and past1000-r2 118 experiments were initialized with the same ocean state, but differ in the standard deviation of the 119 assumed lognormal distribution of the volcanic aerosol size (1.2 µm in r1, 1.8 µm in r2 and r3). The 120 simulations past1000-r2 and past1000-r3 used the same parameter setting but were started from 121 different initial conditions. Furthermore, ozone concentration data used in past1000-r1 are affected 122 by use of a 1-month-shifted annual cycle in the AC&C/SPARC ozone climatology, an issue solved in 123 past1000-r2 and -r3. While the three simulations are therefore not an ensemble of three runs 124 carried out with an identical model and forcing/boundary conditions, we consider the effect of the 125 different setting small enough to regard the runs as three realizations of possible last millennium 126 climate evolution under parameter and forcing uncertainties. The PMIP3 protocol defines the 127 past1000 integration period as 850-1849. To relate the recent climate evolution to the late-Holocene 128 variability we continued the respective past1000 simulations over the historical period (1850 – 2005). 129 The applied boundary conditions follow the CMIP5 protocol, except for land-cover-changes, where 130 we continue the simulations with the Pongratz et al. (2008) data set. In the following, we refer to the

- 6 -

combined past1000 and historical simulations covering the period 850-2005 as pr1, pr2, and pr3, respectively. Since the emphasis of our present study is on the 20<sup>th</sup> century changes, we also include in some analyses in section 4 and 5 one additional MPI-ESM-P "historical" (hr1) simulation (1850-2005), which was initialized from the PiCtrl experiment.

135

### **3. Last millennium evolution of high northern latitude climate**

#### 137 **3.1 Pan-Arctic temperature and sea-ice extent**

138 We start the analyses with quantities that reflect the general climate evolution in high northern 139 latitudes. Reconstructing regional-scale temperature and other climate variables such as sea-ice 140 extent in sparsely-sampled areas is still challenging. Only recently pan-Arctic reconstructions for 141 temperature have been published (Kaufman et al., 2009; Shi et al. 2012), mostly based on terrestrial 142 proxies (tree-rings) and ice cores. The PAGES2K consortium reviewed reconstruction data and methods and constructed seven continental-scale temperature records, including the Arctic (Ahmed 143 144 et al. 2013). The reconstructed temperature records (black lines in Figure 1 a) have in common that 145 they show a gradual cooling during the last millennium, possibly reflecting the overall evolution from 146 a warmer Medieval Warm Period (MWP) to an anomalously cold Little Ice Age (LIA). Note that the 147 PAGES2K record reflects annual mean temperatures whereas the other two represent the summer 148 season. All reconstructions (and the instrumental data that they are matched to) show a strongly reversed trend during the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The Shi et al. (2012) and Kaufman et al. (2009) summer 149 150 temperature reconstructions disagree on the magnitude of the pre-industrial cooling. This reflects 151 differences in the proxies chosen, their geographical distribution, and the statistical methods used to 152 match the proxies to historical observations. We are not in a position to judge which of the two time 153 series reflects more appropriate the real climate evolution; we therefore regard the discrepancy as a measure of uncertainty in reconstructed climate. The simulated summer temperatures are 154 155 compatible with the reconstructions and match closely the Kaufman et al. (2009) data. Individual 156 simulations (colored lines in Figure 1 a) show relatively strong fluctuations and ensemble realizations

- 7 -

157 differ often quite strongly (about 0.5°C) for a given period. In contrast to global and hemispheric averages (not shown here, but see Figure 5 in Jungclaus et al. 2010), individual volcanic eruptions 158 (like the very strong 1258 or 1453 tropical eruption) or clusters of volcanic events are not clearly 159 160 discernible, with the exception of the 1809 and 1815 (Tambora) eruptions, where all simulations 161 show a similar cold excursion, in accordance with the Kaufman and Past2K reconstructions. The 162 resilience to volcanic forcing reflects the relatively small signal-to-noise ratio of Arctic summer 163 temperatures, due to both strong internal variability of the Arctic regional climate (e.g. Beitsch et al., 164 2014) and seasonal character of local response mechanisms, which are most prominent in boreal 165 winter (e.g., Zanchettin et al., 2012). Zanchettin et al. (2013) have also highlighted the role of 166 background conditions (e.g. during the closely following 1809 and 1815 eruptions) for the actual response patterns, in particular at high latitudes. The Arctic warming throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century is 167 168 also well reflected in the model simulations and the pronounced variations such as the warm phase 169 in the first half of the last century are well within the ensemble range of the historical experiments.

170 The summer sea-ice reconstruction by Kinnard et al. (2011) comes with a relatively large range of 171 uncertainty (dashed black lines in Fig. 1b) but the main characteristic is that of a mirror-image of the pan-Arctic surface temperature evolution: A gradual increase in sea-ice extent during the pre-172 industrial millennium is replaced by a drastic decline in the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Figure 1 b). The decline of 173 sea-ice extent sets in, however, more abruptly in the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century in contrast to the relatively 174 gradual warming. The past1000 simulations reproduce a similar long-term trend over the pre-175 industrial millennium and the 20<sup>th</sup> century simulations terminate at an extent that is equally low as 176 177 the observations. In the simulations, the sea-ice decline begins, however, earlier featuring a temporal 178 evolution more similar to the pan-Arctic temperature (Figure 1a). In fact, all four historical simulations show ice extent anomalies below the reconstruction's mean estimate between 1870 and 179 1950. The sea-ice reconstruction exhibits a pronounced relative minimum in the late 16<sup>th</sup> century, 180 181 which none of the three past1000 simulations reproduces. Notwithstanding questions regarding uncertainties in the reconstructions, it is difficult to relate the event to known volcanic or solar 182

forcing variations (e.g. the minimum around 1700 appears at the time of the Maunder minimum in solar variations). The anomalies in the 15<sup>th</sup> to 17<sup>th</sup> century exceed the 2-sigma range of control experiment variability significantly. We have detected events of similar magnitude in unforced control simulations, but they appear only rarely (once in a 1000-yr simulation). It is therefore possible that the model underestimates internal variability of the sea-ice extent.

188

#### 189 **3.2 Fram Strait Atlantic Water temperatures**

190 The reconstructions of AW temperatures stem from a marine core at site MSM5/5-712 at 191 78°54.94'N, 6°46.04'E (see Spielhagen et al. (2011) and Werner et al. (2011) for details). The authors 192 provide two temperature records, one based on a modern analogue technique (SIMMAX), and one 193 based on the Magnesium-Calcium (Mg/Ca) ratio of Neogloboquadrina pachyderma. Habitat and 194 plankton bloom estimates indicate that both proxies reflect mid-summer conditions in the upper part 195 of the AW layer. During pre-industrial times, the Mg/Ca-derived record exhibits much stronger 196 variability, which might reflect inaccuracies in recording the cold-water range (Spielhagen et al., 197 2011). Both reconstructions, however, fluctuate around very similar pre-industrial mean values (3.4° and 3.6°C) and indicate a warming of roughly 2°C during the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Figure 2). A similar 198 199 temperature increase is also found in continued measurements from Svalbard fjords from 1912 to 2005 (Pavlov et al., 2013) and agrees with previous estimates of 20<sup>th</sup> century evolution of AW 200 properties in the northern North Atlantic (Polyakov et al., 2004). Another late-Holocene sedimentary 201 202 record from Malangen Fjord in northern Norway (Hald et al. 2011) reflects local variations in the 203 influx of AW and shows a similar temperature evolution over the last 1200 years including an 204 unprecedented warming in modern times.

We compare the Spielhagen et al. (2011) reconstructions with simulated fluctuations of temperatures in the AW core at 50m depth in Fram Strait at about 78°N (Figure 2). The relatively low temporal resolution and the strong fluctuations in the Mg/Ca record prohibit a very detailed comparison in the pre-industrial millennium. The simulations and the SIMMAX data agree in a change

- 9 -

from slightly warmer-than-average temperatures in the first centuries and colder conditions in the 16<sup>th</sup> to 18<sup>th</sup> centuries, reflecting the general change from MWP to LIA conditions. Interestingly, all time-series show a cold spell in the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, likely recording the 1809 and 1815 eruptions. During the 20<sup>th</sup> century, simulations and the SIMMAX record agree in a 2°C warming. The simulations also exhibit considerable decadal to multidecadal variations that are not covered or sub-sampled by the reconstructions' resolution. The ensemble spread and the relatively large variability range obtained from the unforced control run (Figure 2), points to a large fraction of internal variability.

216 Clearly, the warming in the industrial period exceeds the  $2\sigma$ -range of the undisturbed simulation. 217 Spielhagen et al. (2011) speculate that the diagnosed warming infers a considerable increase in heat 218 transfer to the Arctic. In the model simulations, we can quantify the heat flux changes and display in 219 Figure 3a the combined total ocean heat transport (TOHTR) through Fram Strait and through the Barents Sea Opening (BSO), which both show the unprecedented increase in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Firstly, 220 we confirm that the AW temperature record reflects indeed changes in heat transfer through the 221 222 most important conduits towards the Arctic. The correlation coefficients between AW temperatures 223 and TOHTR (smoothed by a 31-yr running mean) exceed 0.9 at zero time-lag in all three past1000 224 simulations. Simulated TOHTR anomalies are shown with respect to (w.r.t.) the pre-industrial (850-1849) mean of about 80 TW (1 TW =  $10^{12}$  Watt). The simulated transports are compatible with 225 observations indicating a heat transport of 30-40 TW in Fram Strait (Schauer et al., 2008) and 30-76 226 TW in BSO (Årthun et al., 2012). Observations of heat transports are, however, only available for the 227 most recent decades and may be influenced by decadal-scale variability as well. During the pre-228 229 industrial period, there are TOHTR fluctuations of the order of 10-20 TW and the ensemble indicates 230 somewhat higher-than-normal TOHTR in the early part of the simulation and less TOHTR in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century. Large volcanic eruptions (1258, 1453, and 1815) leave an imprint on the heat 231 232 transports leading to reduction of heat transfer to the Arctic (Zanchettin et al., 2012). The most 233 pronounced feature of our smoothed time series from the simulations is, however, a consistent increase of up to 30 TW during the 20<sup>th</sup> century, reflecting a 40% increase over the pre-industrial
mean.

236 The modulation of the AW temperature could either be driven by local changes in the wind system 237 (Bengtsson et al., 2004) or be part of variations in the warm water path associated with the North 238 Atlantic Current or the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC), as has been suggested, 239 for example by Polyakov et al. (2004). However, recently Lozier (2010) and Lozier et al. (2010) have 240 demonstrated that overturning and gyre circulation in the North Atlantic are strongly linked and that 241 the image of a continuous conveyor belt associated with the AMOC may be misleading. Building on 242 earlier results analyzing Arctic warming events in an unperturbed control integration (Beitsch et al., 243 2014) we therefore decompose the (TOHTR) in the Atlantic basin into its overturning and gyre 244 components (MOHTR, and GOHTR, respectively). The first reflects the zonal average heat transport, the second the deviations of the zonal average (e.g. Eden and Jung, 2001; Drijfhout and Hazeleger, 245 246 2006). First, we calculate the correlations between the TOHTR at the entrance to the Arctic (Figure 247 3a) and the components of the basin-scale OHTRs for all latitudes. High correlations are found in 248 particular in the sub-polar North Atlantic between GOHTR and heat transfer to the Arctic (not 249 shown). At the entrance to the Nordic Seas at 60°-65°N (Figure 3b) we can see that most of the 250 modulation in the heat transfer to the Artic during the millennium can be traced back to downstream 251 fluctuations in GOHTR. The gyre heat transport features multi-centennial changes from strongerthan-normal conditions in the early centuries of the simulation to weaker conditions during the Little 252 Ice Age. The 20<sup>th</sup> century stands out again with its unprecedented increase in the TOHTR. Most of the 253 254 increase at 60-65°N is carried by an increase in the gyre component, but, interestingly, also the overturning component shows a clear positive trend over the 20<sup>th</sup> century and apparently 255 contributes to high-latitude warming despite the fact that AMOC is decreasing at 30°N over the 20<sup>th</sup> 256 257 century.

258

## **4.** Origin of the 20<sup>th</sup> century heat transfer increase

In the following, we focus on the changes in the 20<sup>th</sup> century and elucidate the relation between heat transfer changes in Fram Strait and the sub-polar North Atlantic. We consider simulated linear 100yr trends (1905-2005) and compare them with the expected range of internal variability as expressed in the 5-95 percentile range of the respective variables taken from the 1000 yr-long PiCtrl simulation.

The changes in the heat transport components over the 20<sup>th</sup> century reflect trends in the large-scale 264 ocean circulation. Figure 4 shows the centennial trends for the AMOC streamfunction (Figure 4a) as 265 266 function of latitude and for the barotropic horizontal streamfunction (Figure 4b) together with their 267 long-term means. The AMOC increases at higher-latitudes, but the most prominent feature is a 268 broad-scale weakening in subtropical and subpolar latitudes at depth below 1000m. As has been 269 described in previous studies (e.g. Latif et al., 2006), this weakening is associated with reduced deep-270 water formation, most prominently in the Labrador Sea (see below). On the other hand, the 271 circulation cell reaching into the Nordic Seas strengthens as more overturning occurs at higher latitudes. The barotropic streamfunction trends are characterized mainly by a pronounced 272 273 strengthening (the negative sign refers to more cyclonic circulation) in the central and eastern part of 274 the subpolar basin. In the central Labrador Sea, the gyre circulation weakens, which is, again, 275 compatible with reduced deep water formation in the main convection region. There is also 276 indication of a weakening of the gyre circulation in the Nordic Seas.

277 The change in TOHTR in the Atlantic basin reflects the trends in its components: in particular in sub-278 polar latitudes, a weaker overturning component is mostly compensated by a stronger gyre 279 component (Figure 5a), but the resulting TOHTR does not exceed the range of internal variability. 280 North of 55°N changes in both components are much smaller, but are constructively adding up to positive TOHTR trends. The trends are robust in the four simulations, and the 20<sup>th</sup> century TOHTR 281 trends exceed the 5-95% range deduced from the PiCtrl run in three of the four simulations. In 282 283 subtropical latitudes, overturning transports are also smaller, but not compensated by the gyre 284 transports. Thus the TOHTR here are considerably weaker and exceed the 5-95% range of trends in 285 the control simulation. Meridional divergence or convergence of TOHTR then causes regional cooling

- 12 -

286 or warming, if not compensated by surface heat fluxes. Therefore, positive slopes of the TOHTR 287 curves in Fig. 5a indicate cooling while negative slope indicate warming, as indicated by the red and 288 light-blue horizontal lines at the bottom of Figure 5aa. Regions, where divergence of advective lateral 289 heat transport cools the ocean (Figure 5a) are associated with positive atmosphere-ocean heat flux 290 trends, indicating that the colder ocean is cooling the atmosphere. Hence the atmosphere is damping 291 the ocean-induced changes rather than enforcing them. Trends in the upper-ocean temperatures are 292 negative roughly between 45° and 60°N and, since they are only partly compensated by freshening 293 (not shown), there are considerable changes in the density structure as is shown for the pr2 294 experiment in Figure 6 (results are similar for all simulations). Increased density in the center and 295 more pronounced doming of the subpolar isopycnals is typical for a strengthening gyre. The 296 increasing horizontal density gradients, on the other hand, indicate higher baroclinic pressure 297 gradients and further accelerate the gyre (Greatbatch et al., 1991; Levermann and Born, 2007).

298 A possible reason for the acceleration of the gyre circulation could be changes in the wind system. 299 Modulations of large-scale atmospheric pressure patterns like the North Atlantic Oscillation or the 300 East Atlantic Pattern leave their specific imprint on the wind-driven ocean circulation (Häkkinen and 301 Rhines, 2009) and may be important also on centennial time scales (e.g., Sedláček and Mysak, 2009). 302 In particular, the gyre would respond to changes in the wind-stress curl caused, for example, by a 303 poleward shift of the westerlies due to global warming (e.g. Saenko et al., 2005). The centennial 304 trends in the zonal wind stress component are indeed relatively coherent in the past1000 experiments and resemble those obtained by Saenko et al. (2005) in idealized CO2-doubling 305 306 experiments: stronger positive wind stress north of 40°N and slightly negative values in the sub-307 tropical region (Figure 7a). While consistent in three of the four experiments considered here, the 308 changes are well within the 5-95% tile range obtained from the unperturbed control experiment. 309 Moreover, trends in wind-stress curl (Figure 7b) indicate coherent changes only in the Southern 310 Hemisphere (not shown), which is, again, consistent with the findings by Saenko et al. (2005), who 311 applied somewhat stronger CO<sub>2</sub> forcing.

313

314 To further elucidate the origin of the circulation changes we identify first the reason for the 315 weakening of the AMOC in the subtropical and subpolar North Atlantic. A key ingredient modulating 316 the AMOC here is the strength of deep water formation in the Labrador Sea (Latif et al., 2006; 317 Lohmann et al., 2014). To quantify the latter we calculate the thickness of the Labrador Sea Water 318 (LSW) in the region (for details, see Lohmann et al., 2014). Normalizing the anomalies, we see a clear 319 co-variability with the AMOC at 30N and 1500m depth when AMOC lags by roughly 8-10 years. Next, 320 we establish a link between LSW thickness and surface properties by correlating LSW thickness with 321 the surface density field (not shown), which reveals the central Labrador Sea as convection hot-spot. 322 The evolution of surface density, temperature and salinity in the so-identified region reveals, as expected, that enhanced LSW formation comes together with positive density anomalies at the 323 324 surface that reduce the static stability and induce convection. Also shown in Figure 8a are the 325 corresponding temperature and salinity time series. Following the evolution through the last three 326 centuries indicate pronounced multi-decadal variability and pronounced differences between the 327 industrial period and the centuries before. The multidecadal variability is characterized by co-varying 328 temperature and salinity, where apparently, density is determined by the salinity changes (e.g., 329 fresher and lighter conditions lead to less dense surface waters, which is not compensated by colder 330 temperatures). The variations in the regional fresh-water budget is mainly caused by modulations of 331 the sea-ice and fresh water supply from higher latitudes (Jungclaus et al., 2005) and from redistribution of zonal salinity transport by the Irminger Current. During the 20<sup>th</sup> century, however, 332 333 this relation breaks down as somewhat fresher conditions (also caused by increasing sea-ice and fresh-water export through Denmark Strait, not shown) go along with a general warming, partly 334 335 caused by direct radiative forcing, partly be redistribution of heat by an enhanced Irminger Current. 336 As a result, AMOC weakens at latitudes downstream from the LSW formation region. The temporal evolution of the vertical density structure in the Labrador Sea indicates then generally less dense 337

conditions in the upper 2000m. Interestingly, the deepest layers are characterized by relatively colder temperatures and higher densities that are caused by the enhanced overturning in the Nordic Seas and associated changes in the strength and density of the Denmark Strait overflow. Changes in the vertical density structure are important for the east-west density gradient driving the AMOC (Lozier et al., 2010), but also affect the baroclinic structure of the gyre directly (Drijfhout and Hazeleger, 2006).

344

#### **5. Discussion**

346 Our analysis has demonstrated that the increasing heat transports to higher latitudes are mainly 347 caused by changes in the gyre and overturning circulation in the subpolar North Atlantic. These 348 changes are caused by a reduction in deep water formation in the Labrador Sea, which leads to 349 reduced overturning circulation in subtropical and subpolar latitudes. In addition, changes in the 350 vertical structure of water masses at the western boundary can modify the baroclinic gyre circulation 351 (Drijfhout and Hazeleger, 2006). The associated changes in MOHTR and GOHTR lead to enhanced 352 TOHTR towards higher latitudes and heat transport divergence (cooling) in the subpolar region.5 The 353 colder and denser SPG then spins up baroclinically, which further increases the GOHTR (dashed lines 354 in Figure 5a), which, in turn, extracts even more heat from the SPG center and further increases the 355 horizontal density gradient. Thus a positive feedback mechanism is initiated. The mechanism can be 356 compared to the one described by Levermann and Born (2007) and Born et al. (2013a). These 357 authors describe a positive feedback, where an (somehow) accelerated gyre leads to increasing east-358 west temperature and salt transports along its northern rim. Increasing salinity then leads to denser 359 surface waters in the Labrador Sea and to enhanced convective activity, which further spins up the gyre. In our simulations, we see also a redistribution of salinity during the 20<sup>th</sup> century change in gyre 360 361 circulation resulting in higher salinities in the western part of the basin. However, in contrast to the 362 mechanism described by Levermann and Born (2007), the positive temperature anomalies dominate the near-surface density evolution in the industrial period and Labrador Sea convection rather 363

- 15 -

364 decreases. Levermann and Born (2007) demonstrated that a bistability regime exists, where the transition between the two regimes can be triggered by small fluctuations in surface freshwater flux. 365 366 Born et al. (2013a) extended the study and found multiple circulation modes in PiCtrl experiments in 367 six out of 19 models (among them MPI-ESM-LR). Even though we find some differences to their 368 mechanism, it is possible that the relatively strong response of the SPG is an expression of such a 369 transition, here triggered by changes in the AMOC. Possibly also the wind-stress changes (Figure 7) 370 play a role in initiating the change in the gyre circulation by modified Ekman and/or Sverdrup 371 transports. Furthermore, gyre circulation changes can also directly be driven by changes in the 372 baroclinic structure at the western boundary as has been shown in the global warming simulations by 373 Drijfhout and Hazeleger (2006). At the western boundary near the exit of the Labrador Sea (Figure 374 8b), the density changes are consistent with a weakening of Labrador Sea Water production and an 375 increase in overflow-derived density, similar to what has been found by Drijfhout and Hazeleger (2006). It is difficult, however, to exactly detect which component is more important in initially 376 377 triggering the mechanism. For this, additional sensitivity experiments (e.g., partial-coupling 378 experiments) would be necessary, which is beyond the scope of this study. In any case, an important 379 ingredient is the weakening of the AMOC in subtropical and subpolar latitudes, caused by a decrease 380 in Labrador Sea Water formation as a response to global warming, while the deep water production 381 in the Nordic Seas is even slightly enhanced. The exact mechanisms of how gyre and overturning 382 circulations interact are also difficult to disentangle. In the historical simulations, changes in AMOC 383 and SPG circulation appear to happen more or less instantaneous, whereas analyses of the 384 unperturbed control simulation suggest that AMOC variations are leading by a few years.

Many CMIP5 models feature a reduction of the AMOC strength already in the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Drijfhout et al., 2012). A characteristic feature of these simulations is the "warming hole" above the sub-polar North Atlantic that can also be identified in observations (e.g. in the HadSST data set; Rayner et al., 2006). A cool surface temperature spot within the intensified SPG is also characteristic for our 20<sup>th</sup> century simulations (Figure 6) and related to the mechanism described above. Drijfhout et al. (2012) decompose the temperature pattern in a radiatively forced and an AMOC fingerprint and conclude
that the cold sub-polar North Atlantic is indeed related to an AMOC decline. Kim and An (2012) come
to a similar conclusion analyzing CO<sub>2</sub>-doubling experiments from the Coupled Model Intercomparison
Project Phase 3 data base.

394 Another indication that the mechanism described here is at work in reality comes from 395 paleoceanographic reconstructions for the late Holocene. Miettinen et al. (2012) compare the 396 temporal evolution of ocean temperatures at two locations, the Voering Plateu in the Norwegian Sea 397 and the SPG region south of the Reykjanes Ridge. They find that low-frequency fluctuations occur 398 out-of-phase: the Voering Plateau record features, for example, a cold anomaly during the Little Ice 399 Age (LIA), whereas the SPG is warmer than normal during this period. Such a behavior is compatible 400 with the findings described here: A weaker SPG in the LIA (Figure 3) would feature a less dense and 401 warmer center (opposite to what is seen for the strong-gyre anomaly in Figure 6) and would 402 transport less heat to the Nordic Seas. Such out-of-phase anomalies of the barotropic stream 403 function in the SPG region and the Nordic Seas can also be seen in Figure 4b. A detailed investigation 404 of the variations and processes during the pre-industrial millennium and their relation to natural 405 forcing will be subject of a subsequent study.

406 Obtaining a comprehensive view from long-term direct observations of temperature, salinity, or 407 transports remains challenging. There exist only a few long-term time series. Many continuous 408 records, such as those from weather ships (e.g. Østerhus and Gammelsrød, 1999) cover the last 409 decades and are characterized by multi-decadal variability. The temperature measurements over the 410 20<sup>th</sup> century near Svalbard by Pavlov et al. (2013) and one of the longest time-series available at all, 411 the Kola section in the Barents Sea (e.g., Skagseth et al., 2008) support the pronounced warming in the Atlantic Water branch in the industrial period. Polyakov et al. (2004) synthesized various 412 413 observational data sets to conclude that the intermediate Atlantic Water layer in the Arctic shows a 414 continuous warming trend that is superposed by multi-decal variability. Combining proxy data and observations, Cunningham et al. (2013) compiled a synthesis of SST changes in the north-eastern 415

- 17 -

North Atlantic and the Nordic Seas during the last millennium. For the 20<sup>th</sup> century (their Figure 1a), 416 they report that most of the records reflecting the Atlantic Water branch along Scotland and Norway 417 418 indicates a warming, while other records from the sub-polar North Atlantic indicate neutral or 419 cooling conditions. High-resolution proxies from the Iceland Basin (Hall et al., 2010) over the last 230 420 years indicate cooling of SSTs in the central subpolar gyre region, which would be consistent with our 421 findings. The available SST gridded data sets HadISST (Rayner et al., 2006) and ERSSTv3 (Smith and 422 Reynolds, 2004) as well as the Simple Ocean Data Assimilation (SODA) reanalysis (Carton and Giese, 423 2008) are all characterized by a cooling trend in the subpolar gyre region (Drijfhout et al., 2012; Kim 424 and An, 2012). Polyakov et al. (2010) have used historical data from the North Atlantic Ocean and 425 decomposed the changes between the 1920s and present into non-linear trend and multi-decadal variability patterns. The large-scale nonlinear trend pattern resembles the 20<sup>th</sup> century SST trend in 426 427 the HadISST and is characterized by cooling over the subpolar gyre (see their figure 5) and warming in the subtropical North Atlantic and on the northwestern European Shelf, again compatible with our 428 results for the 20<sup>th</sup> century simulations. On the other hand, the 20<sup>th</sup> century compilation of 429 430 temperature and salinity data from the subpolar gyre region by Reverdin (2010) compares less well with our study: the central SPG at about 60N is characterized by slightly positive temperature and 431 432 negative density trends.

433 Uncertainties in early observations and reconstructions preclude a definite answer to what degree the findings reported here can be verified by observations. While the dynamical mechanisms 434 435 proposed here to explain the enhanced heat transfer to the Arctic appear largely compatible with 436 observed features in the North Atlantic, they may depend on the particular model system. Moreover, 437 as many other CMIP5 models, MPI-ESM features large SST and circulation biases in the North Atlantic. In particular, the path of the Gulf Stream/North Atlantic Current is too zonal (Jungclaus et 438 439 al., 2013), which has direct consequences for the shape of the gyres. This may affect the warm water 440 path from the Subtropics to the Nordic Seas. Using observations and model simulations for the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Hatún et al. (2005) concluded that a weaker (and less zonally-441

extended) SPG would allow more warm and saline water to enter the Nordic Seas. Our simulations, but also other CMIP5 ESMs (Born et al., 2013a; Koenigk and Bradeau, 2014) and stand-alone ocean model simulations with the same ocean model as used here, but forced by reanalysis data (Müller et al., 2014) suggest that a stronger SPG carries more subtropical AW into the Nordic Seas and the Arctic. This discrepancy may be related to the specific situation of the late 20<sup>th</sup> century described by Hatún et al. (2005), where SPG changes were mainly related to the atmospheric forcing (Häkkinen and Rhines, 2009; see also Born et al., 2013b).

449 A 30 TW increase in heat transfer to the Arctic over 100 years as suggested by our simulations for the 450 20<sup>th</sup> century is an important contribution to the Arctic heat budget (Serreze et al., 2007). Dividing by the area of the Arctic, it corresponds to a substantial forcing of about 2 Wm<sup>-2</sup>. Jungclaus and Koenigk 451 452 (2010) and Beitsch et al. (2014) have shown that multidecadal variations in TOHTR to the Arctic 453 impact the Arctic climate. For positive TOHTR anomalies, the sea-ice cover decreases most 454 pronounced in the Barents Sea and causes considerable variations in ocean-atmosphere heat fluxes. 455 Although only a small fraction of the Arctic is affected, the associated warming leads to positive pan-456 Arctic temperature anomalies. Moreover, the heat-flux changes affect the atmospheric circulation. 457 An associated feedback mechanism is the Bjerknes Compensation (Bjerknes, 1964; Shaffrey and 458 Sutton, 2006; Jungclaus and Koenigk, 2010): on multidecadal time-scales, TOHTR and atmospheric 459 heat transports (AHTR, here derived from the components of moist and dry static energy advection 460 following Keith (1995)) are strongly coupled and may compensate each other. Thus, both TOHTR and 461 AHTR need to be considered for an assessment of the lateral heat transfer changes as part of the 462 Arctic heat budget. Comparing TOHTR and AHTR at 70°N (Figure 9) indicates considerable 463 multidecadal variability, where the respective TOHTR and AHTR tend to evolve out-of-phase. 464 However, there is no compensation of the strong positive trend in TOHTR during the last decades of 465 the simulation. Therefore we conclude that there is a net positive contribution from the lateral heat 466 fluxes to the Arctic heat budget and to the warming in recent decades. An assessment of all terms of 467 the Arctic heat budget and the feedback mechanisms leading to Arctic Amplification is, however,

- 19 -

468 beyond the scope of our paper. The magnitude of TOHTR changes appears to play a decisive role in 469 the amplitude of pan-Arctic warming, and sea-ice evolution in climate-change simulations (Mahlstein 470 and Knutti, 2011). These authors concluded that the TOHTR changes contribute significantly to Arctic 471 amplification, but they also identified considerable differences in the TOHTR magnitude in the 472 CMIP3-model suite as a cause for model uncertainty in projected Arctic warming.

473

#### 474 **6.** Conclusions

The MPI-ESM last-millennium simulations consistently reproduce enhanced 20<sup>th</sup> century warming of 475 476 AW at the boundary between the Nordic Seas and the Arctic compared with pre-industrial variability. 477 The warming of AW in Fram Strait is an indicator for a prominent (~40%) increase in oceanic heat transfer to the Arctic during the 20<sup>th</sup> century. In the simulations, we are able to trace back the heat 478 transport changes to a reorganization of the large-scale ocean circulation in the sub-polar North 479 Atlantic. The SPG and the associated northward heat transport are intensified by the global-warming-480 481 induced weakening of the AMOC and changes in the density structure associated with modified deep 482 water formation. The latter also lead to a slight intensification of the overturning in high northern latitudes. Together, the gyre and overturning-related heat transport changes lead to an increase in 483 the heat transfer to the Nordic Seas and the Arctic. Changes in wind-stress curl do not appear to be 484 485 significantly different from the unperturbed variability, but wind-stress changes may nonetheless play a role in triggering the mechanism. Transient simulations over the late Holocene provide a 486 valuable reference frame to discriminate unprecedented changes such as those observed in the 20<sup>th</sup> 487 488 century from natural or internal fluctuations.

489

Acknowledgements: This work was supported by the European Community's 7th framework program (FP7/2007-2013) under the grant agreements no. 308299 (NACLIM), and no. 243908 (Past4Future). D.Z. was supported by the German Federal Ministry for Education and Research (BMBF) Miklip project (FKZ: 01LP1158A). The MPI-ESM-P simulations were conducted at the German Climate Computing Center (DKRZ). The authors thank Chao Li and two anonymous reviewers for comments that helped improving the manuscript. The service charges for this open access publication have been covered by the Max Planck Society.

#### 499

#### 500 References:

- 501 Ahmed, M. and the PAGES 2k Consortium: Continental-scale temperature variability during the last 502 two millennia, Nature Geosci., 6, 339–346, doi:10.1038/ngeo1797, 2013.
- Årthun, M., Eldevik, T., Smedsrud, L.H., Skagseth, Ø., Ingvaldsen, R.B.: Quantifying the influence of
  Atlantic heat on Barents Sea ice variability and retreat, J. Climate, 25, 4736-4743,
  doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00466.1, 2012.
- 506 Beitsch, A., Jungclaus, J.H., and Zanchettin, D.: Patterns of decadal-scale Arctic warming events in 507 simulated climate. Clim. Dynam., 43, 1773-1789 doi:10.1007/s00382-013-2004-5, 2014.
- Bengtsson, L., Semenov, V.A., and Johannessen, O.M.: The early twentieth-century warming in the
  Arctic a possible explanation. J. Climate, 18, 4045-4057, doi:10.1175/15200442(2004)017<4045:TETWIT>2.0.CO;2, 2004.
- 511 Bjerknes, J.: Atlantic air-sea interaction, Adv. Geophys., 10, 1-82, 1964.
- Booth, B.B.B., Dunstone, N.J., Halloran, P.R., Andrews, T., and Bellouin, N.: Aerosols implicated as a
  prime driver of twentieth century North Atlantic climate variability, Nature, 484, 228-232,
  doi:10.1038/nature10946, 2012.
- Born, A., Stocker, T.F., Raible, C.C., and Levermann, A.: Is the Atlantic subpolar gyre bistable in
  comprehensive climate models? Clim. Dynam, 40, 2993-3007, doi:10.1007/s00382-012-1525-7,
  2013a.
- Born, A., Stocker, T.F., and Sandø, A.B.: Coupling of eastern and western subpolar North Atlantic: salt
   transport in the Irminger Current, Ocean Sci. Discuss., 10, 555-579, 2013b.
- 520 Bothe, O., Jungclaus, J.H., and Zanchettin, D.: Consistency of the multi-model CMIP5/PMIP3 521 ensemble, Clim. Past, 9, 2471-2487, doi:10.5194/cp-9-2471-2013201, 2013.
- 522 Carton, J.A., and Giese, B.S.: A reanalysis of ocean climate using Simple Ocean Data Assimilation
   523 (SODA). Mon. Weather Rev., 136, 2999-3017, doi: 10.1175/2007MWR1978.1, 2008.
- 524 Crowley, T.J., and Unterman, M.B.: Technical details concerning development of a 1200 yr proxy 525 index for global volcanism, Earth Syst. Sci. Data, 5, 187-197, doi:10.5194/essd-5-187-2013, 2013.
- Cunningham, L., Austin, W.E.N., Knudsen, K.L., Eiriksson, J., Scourse, J.D., Wanamaker, A.D. Jr., Butler,
  P.G., Cage, A.G., Richter, T. Husum, K., Hald, M., Andersson, C., Zorita, E., Linderholm, H.W.,
  Gunnarson, B.E., Sicre, M.-A., Sejruo, H.P., Jiang, H., and Wilson, R.: Reconstructions of surface
  ocean conditions from the northeast Atlantic and Nordic Seas during the last millennium. The
  Holocene, 23, 921-935, doi:10.1177/0959683613479677, 2013.
- Drijfhout, S.S., and Hazeleger, W.: Changes in MOC and gyre-induced Atlantic Ocean heat transport,
   Geophys Res. Lett., 33, L07707, doi:10.1029/2006GL025807, 2006.
- Drijfhout, S., van Oldenborgh, G.J., and Cimatoribus, A.: Is a decline of AMOC causing the warming
  hole above the North Atlantic in observed and modeled warming patterns? J. Climate, 25, 83738379, doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00490.1, 2012.
- Dylmer, C.V., Giradeau, J., Eynaud, F., Husum, K., De Vernal, A.: Northward advection of Atlantic
  water in the eastern Nordic Seas, Clim. Past, 9, 1505-1518, doi:10.5194/cp-9-1505-2013, 2013.
- Eden, C., and Jung, T.: North Atlantic interdecadal variability: oceanic response to the North Atlantic
   Oscillation (1865-1997), J. Climate, 14, 676-691, 2001.

- Fernández-Donado, L., González-Rouco, J.F., Raible, C.C., Ammann, C.M., Barriopedro, D., GarcíaBustamante, E., Jungclaus, J.H., Lorenz, S.J., Luterbacher, J., Phipps, S.J., Servonnat, J.,
  Swingedouw, D., Tett, S.F.B., Wagner, S., Yiou, P., and Zorita, E.: Large-scale temperature
  response to external forcing in simulations and reconstructions of the last millennium, Clim.Past,
  9, 393-421, doi:10.5194/cp-9-393-2013, 2013.
- Giorgetta, M. A., Jungclaus, J. H., Reick, C. H., Legutke, S., Brovkin, V., Crueger, T., Esch, M., Fieg, K.,
  Glushak, K., Gayler, V., Haak, H., Hollweg, H.-D., Ilyina, T., Kinne, S., Kornblueh, L., Matei, D.,
  Mauritsen, T., Mikolajewicz, U., Mueller, W. A., Notz, D., Raddatz, T., Rast, S., Redler, R., Roeckner,
  E., Schmidt, H., Schnur, R., Segschneider, J., Six, K., Stockhause, M., Wegner, J., Widmann, H.,
  Wieners, K.-H., Claussen, M., Marotzke, J., and Stevens, B.: Climate and carbon cycle changes from
  1850 to 2100 in MPI-ESM simulations for the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project phase 5, J.
  Adv. Model Earth Syst., 5, 1–26, doi:10.1002/jame.20038, 2013.
- 552 Greatbatch, R., Fanning, A., Goulding, A., and Levitus, S.: A diagnosis of interpentadal circulation 553 changes in the North Atlantic, J. Geophys. Res., 96, 22,009-22,023, 1991.
- Häkkinen, S., and Rhines, P.B.: Shifting surface currents in the northern North Atlantic, J. Geophys.
   Res., 114, C04005, doi:10.1029/2008JC004883, 2009.
- Hald, M., Salomonsen, G.R., Husum, K., and Wilson, L.J.: A 2000 year record of Atlantic Water
  temperature variability from Malangen Fjord, northeastern North Atlantic, The Holocene, 21,
  1049-1059, doi:10.1177/095968361140057, 2011.
- Hall, I.R., Boessenkool, K.P., Barker, S., McCave, N., and Elderfield, H.: Surface and deep ocean
  coupling in the subpolar North Atlantic during the last 230 years. Paleoceanography, 25, PA2101,
  doi:10.1029/2009PA001886, 2010.
- Hátún, H., Sandø, A.B., Drange, H., Hansen, B., and Valdimarsson, H.: Influence of the Atlantic
  subpolar gyre on the thermohaline circulation. Science, 309, 1841-1844,
  doi:10.1126/science.1114777, 2005.
- 565 Jungclaus, J.H., Haak, H., Mikolajewicz, U., and Latif, M.: Arctic-North Atlantic interactions and 566 multidecadal variability of the meridional overturning circulation. J.Climate, 18, 4016-4034, 2005.
- Jungclaus, J.H., Macrander, A., and Käse, R.H.: Modelling the overflow across the Greenland-Scotland
   Ridge, in: Arctic-subarctic ocean fluxes, edited by Dickson, R.R., Meincke, J., and Rhines, P.,
   Springer, Dordrecht, 527-549, 2008.
- Jungclaus, J.H., Lorenz, S.J., Timmreck, C., Reick, C.H., Brovkin, V., Six, K., Segschneider, J., Giorgetta,
  M.A., Crowley, T.J., Pongratz, J., Krivova, N.A., Vieira, L.E., Solanki, S.K., Klocke, D., Botzet, M.,
  Esch, M., Gayler, V., Haak, H., Raddatz, T.J., Roeckner, E., Schnur, R., Widmann, H., Claussen, M.,
  Stevens, B., and Marotzke, J.: Climate and carbon-cycle variability over the last millennium, Clim.
  Past, 6, 723-737, doi:10.5194/cp-6-723-2010, 2010.
- Jungclaus J.H., and Koenigk, T.: Low-frequency variability of the Arctic climate: the role of oceanic
  and atmospheric heat transport variations. Clim. Dynam., 34, 265-279, doi:10.1007/s00382-0090569-9, 2010.
- Jungclaus, J.H., Fischer, N., Haak, H., Lohmann, K., Marotzke, J., Matei, D., Mikolajewicz, U., Notz, D.,
  and von Storch, J.-S.: Characteristics of the ocean simulations in the Max Planck Institute Ocean
  Model (MPIOM) the ocean component of the MPI-Earth system model, J. Adv. Model Earth Syst.,
  5, 422-446, doi:10.1002/jame.20023, 2013.
- Kaufman, D.S., Schneider, D.P., McKay, N.P., Ammann, C.M., Bradley, R.S., Briffa, K.R., Miller, G.H.,
  Otto-Bliesner, B.L., Overpeck, J.T., Vinther, B.M., and Arctic Lakes 2K project members: Recent
  warming reverses long-term Arctic cooling. Science, 325, 1236-1239,
  doi:10.1126/science.1173983, 2009.

- 586 Keith, D.W.: Meridional energy transport: uncertainty in zonal means. Tellus, 47A, 30-44, 1995.
- 587 Kim, H., and S.-I. An: On the subarctic North Atlantic cooling due to global warming. Theor. Appl.
  588 Climatol., 114, 1-19, doi:10.1007/s00704-012-0805-9, 2012.
- Kinnard, C., Zdanowicz, C.M., Fisher, D.A., Isaksson, E., De Vernal, A., and Thompson, L.G.:
  Reconstructed changes in Arctic sea ice over the last 1,450 years. Nature, 479, 509-513,
  doi:10.1038/nature10581, 2011.
- 592 Koenigk, T., and Brodeau, L.: Ocean heat transport into the Arctic in the twentieth and twenty-first 593 century in EC-Earth, Clim. Dynam., 42, 3101-3120, doi:10.1007/s00382-013-1821-x ,2014.
- Latif, M., Böning, C., Willebrand, J., Biastoch, A., Dengg, J., Keenlyside, N., Schweckendiek, U., and
   Madec, G.: Is the Thermohaline Circulation Changing?. J. Climate, 19, 4631–4637, doi:
   <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/JCLI3876.1">http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/JCLI3876.1</a>, 2006.
- Levermann, A., and Born, A.: Bistability of the Atlantic subpolar gyre in a coarse-resolution climate
   model. Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, L24605, doi:10.1029/2007GL031732, 2007.
- Lohmann, K., Jungclaus, J.H., Matei, D., Mignot, J., Menary, M., Langehaug, H.R., Ba, J., Gao, Y.,
  Otterå, O.H., Park, W., and Lorenz, S.: The role of subpolar deep water formation and Nordic Seas
  overflows in simulated multidecadal variability of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation.
  Ocean Sci., 10, 227-241, doi:10.5194/os-10-227-2014, 2014.
- 603Lozier,M.S.:DeconstructingtheConveyorBelt,Science,328,1507-1511,604doi:10.1126/science.1189250, 2010.
- Lozier, M.S., Roussenov, V., Reed, M.S.C., and Williams, R.G.: Opposing decadal changes for the
  North Atlantic meridional overturning circulation. Nature Geosci., 3, 728-734,
  doi:10.1038/NGEO947, 2010.
- Mahlstein I., and Knutti, R.: Ocean heat transport as a cause for model uncertainty in projected Arctic
   warming, J. Climate, 24, 1451-1460, doi:10.1175/JCLI3713.1,2011.
- 610 Marsland, S.J., Haak, H., Jungclaus, J.H., Latif, M., and Roeske, F.: The Max- Planck- Institute global 611 ocean/sea-ice model with orthogonal curvilinear coordinates, Ocean Modelling, 5, 91-127, 2003.
- Miettinen, A., Divine, D., Koç, N., Godtliebsen, F., and Hall, I.R.: Multicentennial variability of the sea
  surface temperature gradient across the subpolar North Atlantic over the last 2.8kyr, J. Climate,
  25, 4205-4219, doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00581.1, 2012.
- Mjell, T.L., Ninnemann, H.F., H.F. Kleiven, and Hall, I.R.: Multidecadal changes in Iceland-Scotland
  overflow water vigori over the last 600 years and its relation to climate. Under review: Geophys.
  Res. Lett., 2014.
- Müller, W.A., Matei, D., Bersch, M., Jungclaus, J.H., Haak, H., Lohmann, K., Compo, G.P.,
  Sardeshmukh, P.D., and Marotzke, J.: A 20<sup>th</sup> century reanalysis-forced ocean model to reconstruct
  the North Atlantic climate variations during the 1920s. Clim. Dynam., in press: doi:
  10.1007/s000382-014-2267-5, 2014.
- Østerhus, S., and Gammelsrød, T.: The abyss of the Nordic Seas is warming. J. Climate, 12, 3297-3304,
  1999.
- Pavlov, A., Tverberg, V., Ivanov, B., Nilsen, F., Falk-Petersen, S., and Granskog, M.: Warming of
  Atlantic Water in two west Spitsbergen fjords over the last century (1912-2009). Polar Research,
  32, 11206, doi:10.3402/polar.v32i0.11206, 2013.
- Polyakov, I.V., Alekseev, G.V., Timokhov, L.A., Bhatt, U.S., Colony, R.L., Simmons, H.L., Walsh, D.,
  Walsh, J.E., Zakharov, V.F.: Variability of the Intermediate Atlantic Water of the Arctic Ocean over
  the last 100 years, J. Climate, 17, 4485-4497, 2004.

- Polyakov, I.V., Alexeev, V.A., Bhatt, U.S., Polyakova, E.I., and Zhang, X.: North Atlantic warming:
  patterns of long-term trend and multidecadal variability. Clim. Dynam., 34, 439-457,
  doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0522-3, 2010.
- Pongratz J., Reick, C.H., Raddatz, T., and Claussen, M.: A reconstruction of global agricultural areas
  and land cover for the last millennium, Glob. Biogeochem. Cycles, 22, GB3018,
  doi:10.1029/2007GB003153, 2008.
- Rayner, N.A., Brohan, P., Parker, D.E., Folland, C.K., Kennedy, J.J., Vanicek, M., Ansell, T.J., and Tett,
  S.F.B.: Improved analyses of changes and uncertainties in sea surface temperature measured in
  situ since the mid nineteenth century: the HadSST2 data set. J. Climate, 19, 446-469,
  doi:10.1175/jcli3637.1.
- Reverdin, G.: North Atlantic Subpolar Gyre Surface Variability (1895-2009). J. Climate, 23, 4571-4584,
   doi: 10.1175/2010JCLI3493.1, 2010.
- Saenko, O.A., Fyfe, J.C., and England, M.H.: On the response of the oceanic wind-driven circulation to
   atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> increase. Clim. Dynam., 25, 415-426, doi:10.1007/s00382-005-0032-5, 2005.
- Schauer, U., Beszynnka-Möller, A., Walczowski, W., Fahrbach, E., Piechura, J., and Hansen, E.
  Variations of measured heat flow through Fram Strait between 1997 and 2006, in: Arctic-subarctic
  ocean fluxes, edited by Dickson, R.R., Meincke, J. and Rhines, P., Springer, Dordrecht, 65-85, 2008.
- Schmidt, G.A., Jungclaus, J.H., Ammann, C.M., Bard, E., Braconnot, P., Crowley, T.J., Delaygue, G.,
  Joos, F., Krivova, N.A., Muscheler, R., Otto-Bliesner, B.L., Pongratz, J., Shindell, D.T., Solanki, S.K.,
  Steinhilber, F., Vieira, L.E.A.: Climate forcing reconstructions for use in PMIP simulations of the
  last millennium (v.1.0), Geosci. Model Dev., 4, 33-45, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-33-2011, 2011.
- 651 Serreze, M.C., Barnett, A.P., Slater, A.G., Steele, M., Zhang, J., and Trenberth, K. E.: The large-scale 652 energy budget of the Arctic. J. Geophys. Res., 112, D11122, doi:10.1029/2006JD008230, 2007.
- Sedláček, J., and Mysak, L.A. A model study of the Little Ice Age and beyond: changes in ocean heat
  content, hydrography and circulation since 1500. Clim. Dynam, 33, 461-475, doi: 10.1007/s00382008-0503-6, 2009.
- 656 Shaffrey, L., and Sutton, R.: Bjerknes compensation and the decadal variability of the energy 657 transports in a coupled climate model, J. Climate, 19, 1167-1448, doi:10.1175/JCLI3652.1, 2006.
- 658 Shi, F., Yang, B., Ljungqvist, F.C., and Yang, F.: Multi-proxy reconstruction of Arctic summer 659 temperatures over the past 1400 years, Clim. Res., 54, 113-128, doi:10.3354/cr01112, 2012.
- Skagseth, Ø., Furevik, T., Ingvaldsen, R., Loeng, H., Mork, K.A., Orvik, K.A., and Ozhigin, V.: Volume
  and heat transport to the Arctic Ocean via the Norwegian and Barents Sea, in: Arctic-subarctic
  ocean fluxes, edited by Dickson, R.R., Meincke, J., and Rhines, P., Springer, Dordrecht, 45-64,
  2008.
- Smith, T.M., and Reynolds, R.W.: Improved extended reconstruction of SST (1854-1997). J. Climate,
   17, 2466-2477, doi: 10.1175/1520-0442(2004)017<2466:IEROS>2.0.CO;2, 2004.
- Spielhagen, R.F., Wagner, K., Sørensen, S.A., Zamelczyk, K., Kandiano, E., Budeus, G., Husum, K.,
  Marchitto, T.M., and Hald, M.: Enhanced modern heat transfer to the Arctic by warm Atlantic
  Water, Science 331 450-453, doi:10.1126/science.1197397, 2011.
- Stevens, B., Giorgetta, M., Esch, M., Mauritsen, T., Crueger, T., Rast, S., Salzmann, M., Schmidt, H.,
  Bader, J., Block, K., Brokopf, R., Fast, I., Kinne, S., Kornblueh, L., Lohmann, U., Pincus, R., Reichler,
  T., and Roeckner, E.: Atmosphereric component of the MPI-M Earth system Model: Echam6, J.
  Adv. Model Earth Syst., 5, 146-172, doi:10.1002/jame.20015, 2013.
- Vieira, L.E.A., Solanki, S.K., Krivova, N.A., and Usoskin, I.: Evolution of the solar irradiance during the
  Holcene, Astron. Astroph., 531, A6, doi:10.1051/0004-6361/201015843, 2011.

- Wang, Y.-M., Lean, J.L., Sheeley Jr., N.R.: Modeling the Sun's magnetic field and irradiance since
  1713, Astrophys. J., 625, 522-538, doi:10.1086/429689, 2005.
- Werner, K., Spielhagen, R.F., Bauch, D., Hass, H.C., Kandiano, E., and Zamelcyk, K.: Atlantic water
  advection to the eastern Fram Strait multiproxy evidence for late Holocene variability,
  Paleogeography, Paleoclimatology, Paleoecology, 308, 264-276, doi:10.1016/j.paleo.2011.05.030,
  2011.
- Zanchettin, D., Timmreck, C., Graf, H.-F. Rubino, A., Lorenz, S., Lohmann, K., Krüger, K., and
  Jungclaus, J.H.: Bi-decadal variability excited in the coupled ocean-atmosphere system by strong
  tropical volcanic eruptions, Clim. Dynam., 39, 419-444, doi:10.1007/s00382-011-1167-1, 2012.
- Zanchettin, D., Timmreck, C., Bothe, O., Lorenz, S.J., Hegerl, G. Graf, H.-F., Luterbacher, J., and
  Jungclaus, J.H.: Background conditions influence the decadal climate response to strong volcanic
  eruptions. J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 118, doi:10.1002/jgrd50229, 2013.
- Zhang, R., Delworth, T.L., Sutton, R., Hodson, D.L.R., Dixon, K.W., Held, I.M., Kushnir, Y., Marshall, J.,
  Ming, Y., Msadek, R., Robson, J., Rosati, A.J., Ting, M.F., and Vecci, G.: Have aerosols caused the
  observed Atlantic multidecadal variability? J. Atm. Sci., 70, 1135-1144, doi:10.1175/JAS-D-120331.11, 2013.



694

695 Figure 1: Simulated time series (colored lines for experiments pr1, pr2, pr3) of high northern latitude 696 climate variables in comparison with reconstructions (black lines): a) 10-year averages of Arctic 697 summer (JJA) surface air temperatures as anomalies w.r.t. the 1960-1990 mean. Summer 698 temperature reconstructions are from: (solid black) Kaufman et al. (2009), and (dotted black) Shi et al. (2012). The PAGES2K reconstruction representing annual temperatures is also shown (dashed 699 black). b) late-summer (August) sea-ice extent (in 10<sup>6</sup> km<sup>2</sup>) as anomalies w.r.t. the pre-industrial 700 701 mean in comparison with the reconstruction by Kinnard et al. (2011): The thick black line denotes the 702 40-year smoothed reconstruction, the dashed black lines their 95% confidence interval; for the 703 simulations, a 41-yr running mean was applied for pre-industrial millennium and a 5-yr running mean 704 for 1850-2005 to better display 20th century variability. Thin horizontal lines bracketing the zero line 705 in **a**) and **b**) indicate the respective  $2\sigma$ -ranges derived from the 1000yr-long PiCtrl experiment.



**Figure 2:** Simulated time series (colored lines for experiments pr1, pr2, pr3) of Atlantic Water temperature anomalies w.r.t. the pre-industrial mean in Fram Strait (78°N, 50m depth) in comparison with the reconstruction by Spielhagen et al. (2011) obtained by the (solid black) SIMMAX, and (dashed black) Mg/Ca methods, respectively. The thin horizontal lines bracketing the zero line indicate the respective 2σ-ranges derived from the 1000yr-long PiCtrl experiment.

713



717 Figure 3: a) Simulated ocean heat transport (OHTR) to the Arctic (combined OHTR through Fram 718 Strait and Barents Sea Opening) as anomalies w.r.t. the pre-industrial mean; colored lines indicate 719 individual simulations pr1, pr2 and pr3, and the solid black line is the ensemble mean, thin horizontal 720 lines bracketing the zero line indicate the respective 2 $\sigma$ -ranges derived from the 1000yr-long PiCtrl 721 experiment. b) Total OHTR (black lines, TOHTR) averaged over 60-65°N, subdivided into gyre-related 722 OHTR (red, GOHTR), and overturning-circulation-related OHTR (blue, MOHTR). Thick lines represent 723 the ensemble means and the dashed lines the respective ensemble ranges. All time-series were smoothed by a 31-yr running mean. Units are TW (1 TW =  $10^{12}$  Watt). 724

725

726

727

- 28 -



729

**Figure 4:** Simulated 20th century linear trends (1905-2005) in the pr2 simulation (color shading) of a) meridional overturning circulation, and b) barotropic stream function in the North Atlantic. Units are Sverdrups per 100 yrs ( $1 \text{ Sv} = 10^6 \text{m}^3 \text{s}^{-1}$ ). Contour lines (contour intervals 2 SV for overturning and 10 Sv for barotropic stream function) describe the pre-industrial mean state. In both panels, only anomalies are shown that exceed the 5-95 percentile range of centennial trends derived from the PiCtrl simulations.

736

737



**Figure 5:** Simulated 20<sup>th</sup> century linear trends (1905-2005) as zonal averages over the Atlantic basin (experiments pr1, pr2, pr3, and hr1 as indicated by colored lines, black lines indicate ensemble means): (a) (solid lines) TOHTR, (dashed lines) GOHTR, and (dotted lines) MOHTR. Light-blue and red horizontal lines at the bottom of the plot indicate regions, where the ensemble-mean TOHTR divergence is positive (cooling by lateral advection: light-blue) or negative (warming by lateral advection: red). (b) atmosphere-ocean heat fluxes. Positive values indicate increased heat transfer from the atmosphere to the ocean or cooling of the atmosphere by the ocean. Colored lines are individual simulations and the black line is the ensemble mean. In (a) and (b), the grey-shaded regions indicate the 5-95 percentile ranges of centennial trends in the unperturbed PiCtrl experiment.





Figure 6: Simulated 20<sup>th</sup> century linear trends (1905-2005) as zonal averages over the Atlantic basin
 for potential temperature (color shading) and density (contours, contour interval 0.05 kgm<sup>-3</sup>) trends
 from the pr2 experiment.



770

**Figure 7:** Simulated (experiments pr1, pr2, pr3, and hr1)  $20^{th}$  century linear trends (1905-2005) as zonal averages over the Atlantic basin of **(a)** zonal wind stress (units  $10^{-2}$  Pa/100 yrs)and **(b)** wind stress curl (in  $10^{-9}$  Pa m<sup>-1</sup>/100yrs). Colored lines denote the experiments pr1, pr2, pr3, and hr1 and the grey-shaded regions bracketing the zero line show the 5-95 percentile range of centennial trends in the unperturbed PiCtrl experiment.

- 776
- 777

778

766

767



780 Figure 8: (a) Evolution of the Labrador Sea Water thickness (LSWTH, defined as the depth difference 781 between the isopycnals  $\sigma_2$ =36.74 and  $\sigma_2$ =36.82, averaged over 60W-45W, 50N-60N), AMOC stream function at 30N and 1500m depth (displayed here with a 10-year time lag), and surface water mass 782 783 properties in the region, where convection takes place in the Labrador Sea: Density (LS RHO), 784 temperature (LS T), and salinity (LS S). All time-series are smoothed using an 11-yr running mean and 785 are shown as normalized anomalies w.r.t. the pre-industrial means. (b) Evolution of potential density 786 (color shading) and potential temperature (contours, contour intervals 0.05 K) as function of depth 787 and time for the Labrador Sea in the pr2 simulation. An 11-yr running mean was applied to the data. 788



Figure 9: Time series of simulated (solid lines) atmospheric heat transports (AHTR) and (dashed lines)
 TOHTR at 70°N as anomalies w.r.t. the pre-industrial mean (colored lines for experiments pr1, pr2, pr3; time series shown as black dashed and solid lines denote the respective ensemble means).
 The horizontal black lines bracketing the zero lines are the respective 2-σ ranges derived from the PiCtrl experiment. An 11-yr running mean was applied to all data sets.