Climate of the Past Discussions, 1, S66–S67, 2005
www.climate-of-the-past.net/cpd/1/S66/
European Geosciences Union

Climate of the Past Discussions

Interactive comment on "Tree-ring width wavelet and spectral analysis of solar variability and climatic effects on a Chilean cypress during the last two and a halfmillennia" *by* N. R. Rigozo et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 1 October 2005

In this paper some conclusions are proposed on the effect of solar activity on climate in Chile based on the analysis of a tree-ring width series. I agree with the comments expressed by the Anonimus referee #1, moreover the emphasis on influence by ENSO events on tree growth (see Abstract and chapters 1. introduction and 6. conclusion) seems to me not to be justified by the results: the study on the subject should be deepened. The paper needs some improvements also in the dendrochronological parts in my opinion. It is too much succinct and difficult to follow: for example, even if the reference by Lara et al. is now quoted, I suggest to illustrate the climate/growth relationship defined in cypress, with respect to intensity and months involved (see chapter 2. methodology). Some specific remarks from a dendrochronological point of view: 1. the characteristics of the dendro series should be more clearly described: is it a series

from a single old living tree cut down in 1991, as we can argue from the text? How many radius did they measure? 2. no information is given about tests on the correct dating of the series and on the exact correspondence between each ring and year of formation, i.e. cross-dating with other cypress series of the region: these data are important to test the new method developed for measurement too. 3. the results lack comparison with other dendroclimatological studies carried out on very old cypress trees in Southern America. Figures 3 and 4 are difficult to read in black and white.

Interactive comment on Climate of the Past Discussions, 1, 121, 2005.