



## Supplement of

## Do Southern Hemisphere tree rings record past volcanic events? A case study from New Zealand

Philippa A. Higgins et al.

Correspondence to: Philippa A. Higgins (philippa.higgins@unsw.edu.au)

The copyright of individual parts of the supplement might differ from the article licence.



Figure S1 – Correlation between beech ring widths and monthly New Zealand seven-station average monthly temperature from for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season: a) Mountain beech (*Fuscopora cliffortioides*), b) Silver beech (*Lophozonia menziesii*), c) Average of all mountain beech chronologies (NOSO\_av) and average of all silver beech chronologies (NOME\_av). Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 73 for mountain beech, n = 78 for silver beech) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance.



Figure S2 – Correlation between pink pine (*Halocarpus biformis*) ring widths and monthly New Zealand seven-station average monthly temperature for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season: a) Chronologies from the North Island, b) Chronologies from the western coast of the South Island, c) Chronologies south of latitude  $-45^{\circ}$  on the South Island, d) Pink pine master chronology (2Pink) and average of all chronologies (HABI\_av). Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 87) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance.



Figure S3 – Correlation between kauri (*Agathis australis*) ring widths and monthly New Zealand sevenstation average monthly temperature for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season: a) Chronologies north of latitude -36° on the North Island, b) Chronologies south of -36° but north of 37°, latitude c) Chronologies south of -37°, d) Kauri master chronology (1Kauri) and average of all chronologies (AGAU\_av). Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 80) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance. Chronologies 1HUI.r, 1MOE.r, and 1MWL.r are not significantly correlated with New Zealand average temperatures in any month. Chronology 1WFD.r does not overlap with instrumental temperature and is not plotted.



Figure S4 – Correlation between silver pine (*Manoao colensoi*) ring widths and monthly New Zealand seven-station average monthly temperature for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season. a) All silver pine chronologies, b) Silver pine master chronology (3Silver) and average of all chronologies (LACO\_av). Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 78) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance.



Figure S5 – Correlation between cedar (*Libocedrus bidwillii*) ring widths and monthly New Zealand sevenstation average monthly temperature for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season: a) Chronologies from the North Island, b) Chronologies from the South Island, c) average of all cedar chronologies. Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 84) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance.



Figure S6 – Correlation between *Phyllocladus* ring widths and monthly New Zealand seven-station average monthly temperature for the 20-month window extending from October of the previous growing season to May at the end of the current austral growing season: a) Toatoa (*Phyllocladus toatoa*), b) Tanekaha (*Phyllocladus trichomanoides*), c) Average of all toatoa chronologies (PHGL\_av) and average of all tanekaha chronologies (PHTR\_av). Horizontal lines indicate the approximate threshold for significance at p < 0.05 calculated for the average length of all chronologies intersecting with the temperature data (n = 68 for toatoa, n = 69 for tanekaha) although series have different lengths and thus thresholds for significance. Chronology 8WKT.r is not significantly correlated with New Zealand average temperatures in any month.



Figure S7 – Mean chronology departures five years before and after 21 eruption years with SAOD > 0.04 (year 0), separated by tree species. The chronologies contributing to the species-wide composite are shown in black, with the number of chronologies indicated in the round brackets. The sensitive chronology composite in shown in blue and the number of contributing chronologies is shown in the square brackets. Significance bands (dotted grey lines) are the 1st, 5th, 95th, and 99th percentile of 10,000 random samples of non-event years from the species-wide composite.



Figure S8 – Kernel density (violin) plots of the five-year post event anomaly for the standardised ring-width series contributing to the chronologies at six sites, three sites where cedar is co-located with pink pine (a-c) and three sites where cedar is co-located with silver pine (d-f). Dashed lines indicate the 25th, 50th, and 75th percentiles of the distributions of the response to the 21-volcanic event series, with the mean series response shown by the black dot. At some sites (a - Camp Creek, b - Mount French, f - Mangawhero River) neither species shows a significant volcanic response, indicating that the change in conditions following an eruption is not sufficient to be recorded. At the remaining three sites, significant responses are recorded by one or both species. Both pink pine and cedar recorded significant negative volcanic responses at Takapari (c), with a significantly larger response from cedar (Mann-Whitney U-test, p < 0.05). At Ahaura and Flagstaff Creek, only cedar recorded a significant positive growth response compared to a neutral silver pine response. At both these sites, the difference between the species' response is significant (Mann-Whitney U-test, p < 0.001; d-e).



Figure S9 – Verification statistics for the NZall temperature reconstruction: a) using the early calibration window and b) using the late calibration window. The 90% uncertainty interval around the verification period reduction of error (VRE; orange) and verification period coefficient of efficiency (VCE; green) were calculated from 300 maximum entropy bootstrap replications. The secondary axis shows the number of tree-ring chronologies contributing to the reconstruction over time.



Figure S10 – Verification statistics for the NZsens temperature reconstruction: a) using the early calibration window and b) using the late calibration window. The 90% uncertainty interval around the verification period reduction of error (VRE; orange) and verification period coefficient of efficiency (VCE; green) were calculated from 300 maximum entropy bootstrap replications. The secondary axis shows the number of tree-ring chronologies contributing to the reconstruction over time.



Figure S11 - New Zealand summer temperature reconstructions: a, b) DJF New Zealand average temperatures (this study) for all (a) and sensitive chronologies (b); c) January-March temperature at Hokitika, Westland, based on Oroko Swamp silver pine (Cook et al., 2002); d) Annual average New Zealand temperature based on pink pine chronologies (Duncan et al., 2010); e) February-March average New Zealand temperature based on cedar chronologies (Palmer & Xiong, 2004). Reconstructed temperature is shown in black, and the 20-year filtered series is in red. All series were transformed into anomalies using a baseline of reconstructed temperature over 1961-1990, except for the pink pine reconstruction which was calibrated directly against instrumental temperature anomalies for the same period and therefore not transformed.



Figure S12 – Comparison of SEA analysis of the NZall and NZsens temperature reconstructions use two sets of volcanic event years (Table S3): a) the ice core analysis of Toohey and Sigl (2017) using a regional threshold of SAOD > 0.04 or 0.08 averaged over the New Zealand latitudinal range (30-50°S), and b) the ice core analysis of Crowley and Unterman (2013) using a threshold of SAOD > 0.04 or 0.08 averaged over the Southern Hemisphere (0-90°S). Both datasets show that the New Zealand temperature reconstructions significantly respond to volcanic events in year t+1. However, there are some differences, most notably a larger response to the Toohey & Sigl event list in b). There are also some issues with the compositing in c), with values in the normalisation period not close to 0, and the volcanic response of NZall is not significant at p < 0.05 when tested against the event list of Crowley and Unterman (2013).



Figure S13 – Impact of removing volcanic events occurring simultaneously with a known El Niño event (1902, 1963, and 1982) from the key event list on the SEA results for kauri. All results are significant in year t+1 except for the 'All chronology composite' for the events with SAOD > 0.08 after the known El Niño events are removed (n = 10). For this series, only the t+2 anomaly is significant.



Figure S14 – Reconstructed temperatures in black and the same data with ENSO removed in red for a) reconstruction NZall and b) reconstruction NZsens. The eruption years for the four large volcanic eruptions occurring during the period for which instrumental ENSO indices are available (Southern Oscillation Index; 1778 CE to present) are also shown.



Figure S15 – Summary of the relationship between sensitivity to temperature and magnitude of the volcanic response for the eight species. Left: maximum temperature correlation in any month of the prior growing season against maximum volcanic response in the five years following an eruption for the 13 largest events. Right: Same plot but for the current growing season. Filled markers indicate that a site has a significant temperature correlation (p < 0.05) and a significant volcanic response ( $< 5^{th}$  or  $> 95^{th}$  percentile of bootstrapped responses). Open markers are not significant for either the temperature or volcanic response, or both.

| Site | Species | Start | End  | Longitude | Latitude | Altitude<br>(m asl) | ITRDB<br>Code | Notes                  |
|------|---------|-------|------|-----------|----------|---------------------|---------------|------------------------|
| 1CAS | AGAU    | 1559  | 1982 | -36.88    | 174.53   | 180                 | newz082       | Cascades               |
| 1HID | AGAU    | 1679  | 2002 | -36.20    | 175.43   | 220                 | newz083       | Hidden Valley          |
| 1HUI | AGAU    | 1720  | 1981 | -36.97    | 174.57   | 274                 | newz085       | Huia                   |
| 1HUP | AGAU    | 1483  | 1997 | -36.82    | 174.50   | 90                  | newz084       | Huapai                 |
| 1KAT | AGAU    | 1698  | 1996 | -37.60    | 175.87   | 350                 | newz091       | Katikati               |
| 1KAW | AGAU    | 1710  | 1996 | -37.92    | 174.92   | 80                  | newz087       | Kawhia                 |
| 1KON | AGAU    | 1770  | 1976 | -37.07    | 175.13   | 335                 | newz008       | Konini Forks           |
| 1LTB | AGAU    | 1790  | 1981 | -36.20    | 175.13   | 274                 | newz086       | Little Barrier Island  |
| 1MAS | AGAU    | 1269  | 1998 | -36.90    | 175.55   | 350                 | newz088       | Manaia Sanctuary       |
| 1MOE | AGAU    | 1360  | 1980 | -36.53    | 175.55   | 630                 | newz089       | Mount Moehau           |
| 1MWL | AGAU    | 1580  | 1981 | -37.22    | 175.03   | 350                 | newz090       | Mount William          |
| 1PBL | AGAU    | 1675  | 1981 | -35.18    | 173.75   | 305                 | newz078       | Puketi Bluff           |
| 1PKF | AGAU    | 1504  | 2002 | -35.27    | 173.73   | 290                 | newz079       | Puketi Forest          |
| 1TRO | AGAU    | 1408  | 2002 | -35.72    | 173.65   | 175                 | 2             | Trounson Kauri Park    |
| 1WFD | AGAU    | 1628  | 1903 | -35.65    | 173.57   | 180                 | newz022       | Waipoua Forest         |
| 1WWF | AGAU    | 1462  | 2002 | -35.37    | 173.28   | 468                 | newz081       | Warawara Plateau       |
| 2BON | HABI    | 1463  | 1999 | -43.08    | 170.65   | 850                 | 1             | Mount Bonar            |
| 2CCP | HABI    | 1410  | 1998 | -42.72    | 171.57   | 970                 | 1             | Camp Creek             |
| 2CRS | HABI    | 1483  | 1999 | -42.28    | 171.38   | 900                 | 1             | Croesus Track          |
| 2DBY | HABI    | 1457  | 2010 | -47.03    | 167.72   | 100                 | newz118       | Doughboy - Adams Hill  |
| 2ELD | HABI    | 1338  | 1999 | -45.75    | 167.47   | 750                 | 1             | Eldrig Peak            |
| 2GLS | HABI    | 1461  | 1999 | -41.62    | 172.03   | 950                 | 1             | Mount Glasgow          |
| 2HEL | HABI    | 1407  | 2013 | -46.98    | 167.75   | 100                 | newz119       | Hellfire Ruggedy Mt    |
| 2MAP | HABI    | 1567  | 1976 | -45.53    | 167.30   | 305                 | newz010       | Manapouri Dam          |
| 2MAT | HABI    | 1508  | 1999 | -41.57    | 172.32   | 1060                | 1             | Matiri Range           |
| 2MEL | HABI    | 1440  | 1999 | -42.50    | 171.83   | 1050                | 1             | Mount Elliot           |
| 2MGR | HABI    | 1400  | 1999 | -42.95    | 170.82   | 865                 | 1             | Mount Greenland        |
| 2MTF | HABI    | 1367  | 1999 | -42.67    | 171.33   | 750                 | 1             | Mount French           |
| 20MO | HABI    | 1578  | 1999 | -43.40    | 170.10   | 320                 | 1             | Omoeroa Saddle         |
| 2PEG | HABI    | 1667  | 1991 | -46.92    | 167.73   | 450                 | 2             | Pegasus Stewart Island |
| 2PUT | HABI    | 1646  | 1993 | -40.67    | 175.52   | 650                 | newz010       | Putara                 |
| 2SPD | HABI    | 1447  | 1999 | -46.37    | 169.05   | 560                 | 1             | Slopedown Hill         |
| 2TKG | HABI    | 1450  | 1999 | -42.65    | 171.50   | 950                 | 1             | Mount Tekinga          |
| 2TKP | HABI    | 1708  | 1995 | -40.08    | 176.00   | 800                 | newz076       | Takapari               |
| 2TOS | HABI    | 1590  | 1998 | -42.98    | 170.85   | 210                 | 1             | Totara Saddle          |
| 3AHA | LACO    | 1209  | 2000 | -42.38    | 171.80   | 244                 | newz005       | Ahaura                 |
| 3FLG | LACO    | 1230  | 2003 | -42.50    | 171.72   | 200                 | newz120       | Flagstaff Creek        |

Table S1 – Metadata for New Zealand chronologies used in the analysis. The ITRDB code is the searchable chronology identifier in the International Tree Ring Data Bank accessible at www.ncei.noaa.gov/.

| Site | Species | Start | End  | Longitude | Latitude | Altitude<br>(m asl) | ITRDB<br>Code | Notes                        |
|------|---------|-------|------|-----------|----------|---------------------|---------------|------------------------------|
| 3MWO | LACO    | 1464  | 1976 | -39.35    | 175.48   | 1000                | newz011       | Mangawhero River Bridge      |
| 3ORO | LACO    | 470   | 1999 | -43.23    | 170.28   | 110                 | newz121       | Oroko Swamp                  |
| 3SWF | LACO    | 1130  | 1969 | -43.13    | 170.40   | 200                 | newz122       | Saltwater Forest             |
| 4AHA | LIBI    | 1303  | 2009 | -42.38    | 171.80   | 244                 | newz127       | Ahaura                       |
| 4ARM | LIBI    | 1446  | 1958 | -43.83    | 173.00   | 731                 | newz007       | Armstrong Reserve            |
| 4CCC | LIBI    | 1064  | 2010 | -42.72    | 171.57   | 965                 | newz124       | Camp Creek                   |
| 4CLW | LIBI    | 1450  | 1991 | -39.63    | 176.10   | 1220                | newz064       | Clearwater                   |
| 4CRG | LIBI    | 1492  | 2010 | -45.83    | 170.53   | 576                 | newz128       | Mount Cargill                |
| 4CRK | LIBI    | 1460  | 1978 | -43.08    | 170.98   | 800                 | newz039       | Cream Creek                  |
| 4EMT | LIBI    | 1616  | 1990 | -39.25    | 174.08   | 1050                | newz003       | Mount Egmont                 |
| 4FLG | LIBI    | 1464  | 2004 | -42.50    | 171.72   | 200                 | newz125       | Flagstaff Creek              |
| 4FLH | LIBI    | 1683  | 1991 | -41.27    | 172.60   | 950                 | newz065       | Flanagans Hut                |
| 4HIT | LIBI    | 1431  | 1991 | -39.53    | 175.73   | 976                 | newz066       | Hihitahi                     |
| 4MOA | LIBI    | 1490  | 1991 | -40.93    | 172.93   | 1036                | newz067       | Moa Park                     |
| 4MTF | LIBI    | 1330  | 1999 | -42.67    | 171.33   | 855                 | newz126       | Mount French                 |
| 4MWO | LIBI    | 1662  | 1976 | -39.35    | 175.48   | 1000                | newz012       | Mangawhero River Bridge      |
| 4NET | LIBI    | 1625  | 1990 | -39.28    | 174.10   | 991                 | newz014       | North Egmont                 |
| 40HT | LIBI    | 1585  | 1991 | -39.62    | 176.12   | 1140                | newz068       | Ohutu Ridge                  |
| 40KA | LIBI    | 1732  | 1976 | -46.38    | 169.45   | 305                 | newz016       | Owaka                        |
| 4RAH | LIBI    | 1480  | 2012 | -42.32    | 172.12   | 672                 | newz129       | Rahu Saddle                  |
| 4RUC | LIBI    | 1473  | 1991 | -39.63    | 176.18   | 1200                | newz069       | Ruahine Corner               |
| 4STR | LIBI    | 1626  | 1990 | -39.32    | 174.12   | 860                 | newz071       | Stratford side - East Egmont |
| 4TKP | LIBI    | 1256  | 1992 | -40.07    | 175.98   | 838                 | newz062       | Takapari Road                |
| 4TOA | LIBI    | 1511  | 1992 | -39.23    | 175.43   | 1160                | newz072       | Hauhangatahi Site A          |
| 4TOB | LIBI    | 1332  | 1992 | -39.23    | 175.43   | 1100                | newz073       | Hauhangatahi Site B          |
| 4TOC | LIBI    | 1213  | 1992 | -39.23    | 175.43   | 1000                | newz074       | Hauhangatahi Site C          |
| 4TRK | LIBI    | 1526  | 1978 | -43.08    | 170.97   | 925                 | newz055       | Tarkus Knob                  |
| 4UWR | LIBI    | 1140  | 1992 | -38.68    | 177.20   | 854                 | newz063       | Urewera                      |
| 4WBF | LIBI    | 1674  | 1992 | -43.07    | 171.28   | 780                 | newz075       | Wilberforce                  |
| 5BOR | NOME    | 1389  | 2007 | -45.78    | 167.37   | 200                 | 2             | Borland                      |
| 5KEA | NOME    | 1580  | 1980 | -43.87    | 169.78   | 1150                | newz036       | Kea Flat                     |
| 5LKE | NOME    | 1676  | 1980 | -45.25    | 167.48   | 950                 | newz048       | Lake Eyles                   |
| 5LKO | NOME    | 1584  | 1980 | -45.30    | 167.68   | 1000                | newz051       | Lake Orbell                  |
| 5UHV | NOME    | 1710  | 1980 | -44.77    | 168.00   | 950                 | newz033       | Upper Hollyford Valley       |
| 5UTV | NOME    | 1622  | 1979 | -45.20    | 167.65   | 1000                | newz054       | Upper Takahe Valley          |
| 6GHC | NOSO    | 1795  | 2006 | -43.25    | 171.75   | 870                 | newz046       | Ghost Creek                  |
| 6HDC | NOSO    | 1730  | 1979 | -43.13    | 171.60   | 1350                | newz037       | Hidden Creek                 |
| 6LCV | NOSO    | 1730  | 1979 | -43.08    | 171.72   | 1350                | newz035       | Lower Cass Valley            |
| 6LGH | NOSO    | 1740  | 1979 | -43.08    | 171.70   | 1400                | newz031       | Logos Hill                   |
| 6LGS | NOSO    | 1760  | 1979 | -43.05    | 171.60   | 1300                | newz024       | Lagoon Saddle                |
| 6LKP | NOSO    | 1713  | 2006 | -43.12    | 171.78   | 970                 | newz049       | Lake Pearson                 |

| Site    | Species | Start | End  | Longitude | Latitude | Altitude<br>(m asl) | ITRDB<br>Code | Notes                       |
|---------|---------|-------|------|-----------|----------|---------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|
| 6MKW    | NOME    | 1730  | 1979 | -43.05    | 171.68   | 1275                | newz023       | Mirkwood                    |
| 6RTC    | NOSO    | 1787  | 2006 | -43.15    | 171.80   | 950                 | newz052       | Rata Creek                  |
| 6SSS    | NOSO    | 1760  | 1979 | -43.05    | 171.72   | 1250                | newz030       | Snowslide Stream            |
| 6TKV    | NOSO    | 1630  | 1979 | -45.30    | 167.68   | 1100                | newz031       | Takahe Valley               |
| 6TST    | NOSO    | 1840  | 1979 | -45.28    | 167.65   | 1000                | newz032       | Takahe Stream               |
| 6WND    | NOSO    | 1760  | 2006 | -43.08    | 171.58   | 1350                | newz053       | Windy Creek                 |
| 7PLC    | PHAL    | 1717  | 2015 | -42.90    | 171.57   | 915                 | newz130       | Pegleg Creek                |
| 8WER    | PHGL    | 1740  | 1976 | -38.57    | 175.70   | 518                 | newz020       | Waimanoa Ecological Reserve |
| 8WHS    | PHGL    | 1550  | 1986 | -38.65    | 175.63   | 780                 | newz056       | Waihora Stream              |
| 8WKT    | PHGL    | 1535  | 1976 | -38.70    | 177.20   | 853                 | newz009       | Lake Waikareiti             |
| 8WPA    | PHGL    | 1585  | 1976 | -35.68    | 173.55   | 244                 | newz022       | Waipoua Forest              |
| 90WI    | PHTR    | 1709  | 1976 | -41.12    | 173.67   | 15                  | newz015       | Okiwi                       |
| 9PAP    | PHTR    | 1779  | 1975 | -36.12    | 174.25   | 160                 | newz001       | Paparoa                     |
| 9WHH    | PHTR    | 1613  | 1986 | -38.70    | 175.60   | 575                 | newz058       | Waihaha Terrace             |
| 9WHL    | PHTR    | 1650  | 1985 | -38.65    | 175.67   | 640                 | newz057       | Waihora Lagoon              |
| 9WMU    | PHTR    | 1664  | 1976 | -37.03    | 175.53   | 61                  | newz021       | Waiomu                      |
| 1Kauri  | AGAU    | 0     | 2002 | na        | na       | na                  | 2             | Kauri network               |
| 2Pink   | HABI    | 1400  | 1999 | na        | na       | na                  | 2             | Pink pine network           |
| 3Silver | LACO    | 0     | 2003 | na        | na       | na                  | 2             | South Island silver pine    |

1 https://researcharchive.lincoln.ac.nz/handle/10182/2141

2 Private collection

Table S2 - Details of volcanic eruptions between 1400 and 1990 CE selected using the two thresholds of modelled SAOD over New Zealand (> 0.04 or > 0.08), and prior and secondary eruptions with SAOD > 0.01. Eruptions within 5 years prior to the target eruption were removed and the baseline period was selected as the closest non-volcanically disturbed period. Secondary eruptions occurring within 5 years of the target eruption were also removed prior to averaging the SEA ensemble (Büntgen et al., 2020).

| Eruption date<br>(month/year) | Eruption           | Locality         | Latitude         | SAOD<br>threshold | Prior<br>Eruption | Secondary<br>Eruption |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| 1452                          | Unknown            |                  | 16.8°S           | > 0.04            | 1448 (-4)         | 1457 (+5)             |
| 1457                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.08            | 1452 (-5)         |                       |
| 2/1477                        | Bárðarbunga        | Iceland          | 64.6°N           | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| 1595                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.08            | 1590 (-5)         | 1600 (+5)             |
| 2/1600                        | Huaynaputina       | Peru             | 16.6°S           | > 0.08            | 1595 (-5)         |                       |
| 1620                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| †12/1640                      | Parker             | Philippines      | 6.1°N            | > 0.08            |                   |                       |
| 1653                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| 1673                          | Gamkonora          | Indonesia        | 1.2°N            | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| 1694                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.08            |                   |                       |
| 1761                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| 5/1783                        | Grímsvötn<br>Asama | Iceland<br>Japan | 64.4°N<br>36.4°N | > 0.08            |                   |                       |
| 1809                          | Unknown            |                  |                  | > 0.08            |                   |                       |
| 4/1815                        | Tambora            | Sundas           | 8.3°S            | > 0.08            |                   |                       |
| 1831                          | Unknown*           | Philippines      | 19.5°N           | > 0.04            |                   | 1835 (+4)             |
| 1/1835                        | Cosigüina          | Nicaragua        | 13.0°N           | > 0.08            | 1831 (-4)         |                       |
| †12/1861                      | Makian             |                  | 0.3°N            | > 0.04            |                   |                       |
| 8/1883                        | Krakatau           | Indonesia        | 6.1°S            | > 0.08            |                   | 1886 (+3)             |
| 10/1902                       | Santa Maria        | Guatemala        | 14.8°N           | not modelled      |                   |                       |
| 3/1963                        | Agung              | Bali             | 8.3°S            | not modelled      |                   |                       |
| 3/1982                        | El Chichón         | México           | 17.4°N           | not modelled      |                   |                       |

<sup>†</sup>Eruptions occurring in December were assigned an eruption year of year+1 in the superposed epoch analysis event list for consistency with the designation of years in the temperature reconstruction (reconstruction year 1641 is Dec 1640-Feb 1641).

\* Location is disputed (Garrison et al., 2018).

Table S3 - Comparison of volcanic event years between 1400 and 1990 CE selected using two different datasets: a) the ice core analysis of Toohey and Sigl (2017) using a regional threshold of SAOD > 0.04 or 0.08 averaged over the New Zealand latitudinal range ( $30-50^{\circ}$ S), and b) the ice core analysis of Crowley and Unterman (2012) using a threshold of SAOD > 0.04 or 0.08 averaged over the Southern Hemisphere ( $0-90^{\circ}$ S). Event selection between the two datasets is largely consistent. Potential reasons for the differences, including the underlying ice core data and differences in methodology, are discussed by Toohey & Sigl (2017).

| Eruption date | Fruntion      | Toohey & Sigl | Crowley & Unterman |
|---------------|---------------|---------------|--------------------|
| (month/year)  | Егирион       | threshold     | threshold          |
| 1441          | Unknown       | Not selected  | > 0.04             |
| 1452          | Unknown       | > 0.04        | Not selected       |
| 1457          | Unknown       | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 2/1477        | Bárðarbunga   | > 0.04        | > 0.08             |
| 1588          | Unknown       | Not selected  | > 0.04             |
| 1595          | Unknown       | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 2/1600        | Huaynaputina  | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 1620          | Unknown       | > 0.04        | > 0.04             |
| 12/1640       | Parker        | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 1653          | Unknown       | > 0.04        | Not selected       |
| 1673          | Gamkonora     | > 0.04        | > 0.08             |
| 1694          | Unknown       | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 1761          | Unknown       | > 0.04        | Not selected       |
| 5/1783        | Grímsvötn     | > 0.08        | Not selected       |
|               | Asama         |               |                    |
| 1804          | Unknown       | Not selected  | > 0.04             |
| 1809          | Unknown       | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 4/1815        | Tambora       | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 1831          | Babuyan Claro | > 0.04        | Not selected       |
| 1/1835        | Cosigüina     | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 12/1861       | Makian        | > 0.04        | > 0.04             |
| 8/1883        | Krakatau      | > 0.08        | > 0.08             |
| 10/1902       | Santa Maria   | not modelled  | > 0.04             |
| 3/1963        | Agung         | not modelled  | > 0.08             |
| 3/1982        | El Chichón    | not modelled  | > 0.04             |

| Model         | No.<br>of<br>Ens | Solar   | Volcanic                  | GHG                      | Land Use               | Reference                 |
|---------------|------------------|---|---------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|
| GISS-E2-R 121 | 1                | Steinhilber et al                                 | Crowley & Unterman (2013) | Schmidt et al. (2012)    | Pongratz et al. (2008) | Schmidt et al. (2014)     |
| GISS-E2-R 124 | 1                | Viera et al. (2011)                               | Crowley & Unterman (2013) | Schmidt et al. (2012)    | Pongratz et al. (2008) | Schmidt et al. (2014)     |
| GISS-E2-R 127 | 1                | Viera et al. (2011)                               | Crowley & Unterman (2013) | Schmidt et al. (2012)    | Kaplan et al. (2010)   | Schmidt et al. (2014)     |
| FGOALS-gl     | 1                | Crowley (2000)                                    | Crowley (2000)            | Amman et al. (2007)      | -                      | Guo and Zhou<br>(2013)    |
| MRI-CGCM3     | 1                | Delaygue & Bard<br>(2011) + Wang et<br>al. (2005) | Gao et al. (2008)         | Schmidt et al. (2012)    | -                      | Yukimoto et al. (2012)    |
| MPI-ESM-P     | 3                | Viera et al. (2011)                               | Crowley & Unterman (2013) | Schmidt et al. (2012)    | Pongratz et al. (2008) | Jungclaus et al. (2014)   |
| MIROC-ESM     | 1                | Delaygue & Bard<br>(2011) + Wang et<br>al. (2005) | Crowley et al. (2008)     | Schmidt et al.<br>(2012) | -                      | Sueyoshi et al.<br>(2013) |

 Table S4 – Coupled Model Intercomparison Project 5 (CMIP5) models used in the analysis.

Table S5 – Pearson correlations between New Zealand summer temperature reconstructions over the common reconstruction interval (1720-1987 CE): a, b) DJF New Zealand average temperatures (this study) for (a) all and (b) sensitive chronologies; c) January-March temperature at Hokitika, Westland, based on Oroko Swamp silver pine (Cook et al., 2002); d) Annual average New Zealand temperature based on pink pine chronologies (Duncan et al., 2010); e) February-March average New Zealand temperature based on cedar chronologies (Palmer & Xiong, 2004). All correlations are significant at p < 0.001 except for pink pine and cedar, which are not significantly correlated.

|                | NZall | NZsens | Oroko swamp | Pink pine |
|----------------|-------|--------|-------------|-----------|
| a. NZall       | -     | 0.83   | 0.44        | 0.62      |
| b. NZsens      | 0.83  | -      | 0.33        | 0.52      |
| c. Oroko swamp | 0.44  | 0.33   | -           | 0.23      |
| d. Pink pine   | 0.62  | 0.52   | 0.23        | -         |
| e. Cedar       | 0.36  | 0.52   | 0.36        | 0.06      |